# Revisiting the Intersection Problem for Maximum Packings of $K_{6 n+5}$ with Triples 

by<br>Amber B. Holmes<br>A thesis submitted to the Graduate Faculty of Auburn University in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Degree of Master of Science<br>Auburn, Alabama<br>May 07, 2017

Keywords: maximum packing, intersection number

Copyright 2017 by Amber B. Holmes

## Approved by

Charles C. Lindner, Advisor, University Distinguished Professor
Dean G. Hoffman, Professor
Chris A. Rodger, Professor, Don Logan Endowed Chair in Mathematics George Flowers, Dean of Graduate School


#### Abstract

In 1989, Gaetano Quattrocchi gave a complete solution of the intersection problem for maximum packings of $K_{6 n+5}$ with triples when the leave (a 4-cycle) is the same in each maximum packing. Quattrocchi showed that $I[2]=2$ and $I[n]=\left\{0,1,2, \ldots, \frac{\binom{n}{2}-4}{3}=\right.$ $x\} \backslash\{x-1, x-2, x-3, x-5\}$ for all $n \equiv 5(\bmod 6) \geq 11$. We extend this result by removing the exceptions $\{x-1, x-2, x-3, x-5\}$ when the leaves are not necessarily the same. In particular, we show that $I[n]=\left\{0,1,2, \ldots, \frac{\binom{n}{2}-4}{3}\right\}$ for all $n \equiv 5(\bmod 6)$.


## Table of Contents

Abstract ..... ii
1 Maximum Packings on $K_{n}, n \equiv 5(\bmod 6)$ ..... 1
References ..... 10

## Chapter 1

Maximum Packings on $K_{n}, n \equiv 5(\bmod 6)$

## 1. Introduction

A Steiner Triple System of order $n, \operatorname{STS}(n)$, is a pair $(S, \mathcal{T})$, where $\mathcal{T}$ is a set of edge-disjoint triangles (or triples) which partitions the edge set of $K_{n}$ (the complete undirected graph on $n$ vertices) with vertex set $S$. It is well known that the spectrum for Steiner triple systems is precisely the set of all $n \equiv 1$ or $3(\bmod 6)$, and that if $(S, \mathcal{T})$ is a triple system of order $n$ then $|\mathcal{T}|=\frac{n(n-1)}{6}$. Define $I(n)$ and $J(n)$ as follows:

$$
\left\{\begin{aligned}
I(n) & =\left\{0,1,2, \ldots, x=\frac{n(n-1)}{6}\right\} \backslash\{x-1, x-2, x-3, x-5\}, \text { and } \\
J(n) & =\{k \mid \text { there exists a pair of triple systems of order } n \text { having exactly } k \text { triples } \\
& \text { in common }\} .
\end{aligned}\right.
$$

A natural question to ask is the following: for which $k \in\left\{0,1,2, \ldots, \frac{n(n-1)}{6}\right\}$ does there exist a triple system of order $n$ having $k$ triples in common? The following theorem gives a complete solution of the intersection problem for triple systems.

Theorem 1.1 (C.C. Lindner, A. Rosa[3]). Let $n \equiv 1$ or $3(\bmod 6)$. Then $J(n)=I(n)$, if $n \neq 9$ and $J(9)=I(9) /\{5,8\}$.

Now when $n \equiv 1$ or $3(\bmod 6)$ there does not exist a triple system and so the intersection problem for maximum packings of $K_{n}$ with triples is immediate. A packing of $K_{n}$ with triples in a pair $(S, P)$ where $P$ in a collection of edge disjoint triples of $K_{n}$ with vertex set $S$. If $P$ is as large as possible, then $(S, P)$ is said to be a maximum packing of $K_{n}$ with triples.

The set of unused edges is called the leave. The following easy to read table gives the leave for a maximum packing of $K_{n}$ with triples for each $n \equiv 0,1,2,3,4,5(\bmod 6)$.

| $n \equiv \bmod 6)$ |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |

Theorem 1.1 gives a complete solution for Steiner Triple Systems $(n \equiv 1$ or $3(\bmod 6))$. The intersection problem for maximum packings of $K_{n}$ with triples has been completely solved for $n \equiv 0,2,4,5$ when the leave is the SAME in the following two papers (best described with a table).

| $n \equiv(\bmod 6)$ | Intersection spectrum |
| :---: | :---: |
| 0 or 2 | D. Hoffman and C. C. Lindner[2] $\begin{gathered} I(6)=\{0,4\}, I(8)=\{0,2,8\} \text { and for all } n \equiv 0 \text { or } 2 \geq 12, \\ I(n)=\left\{0,1,2, \ldots, \frac{n(n-2)}{6}=x\right\} \backslash\{x-1, x-2, x-3, x-5\} \end{gathered}$ |
| 4 | G. Quattrocchi[4] $\begin{gathered} I(4)=\{1\} \text { and for all } n \equiv 4(\bmod 6) \geq 10, \\ I(n)=\left\{0,1,2, \ldots, \frac{\left.\binom{n}{2}-\frac{(n+2)}{2}\right)}{3}=x\right\} \backslash\{x-1, x-2, x-3, x-5\} \end{gathered}$ |
| 5 | G. Quattrocchi[4] <br> $I(5)=2$ and for all $n \equiv(\bmod 6) \geq 11$, $I(n)=\left\{0,1,2, \ldots, \frac{\binom{n}{2}-4}{3}=x\right\} \backslash\{x-1, x-2, x-3, x-5\}$ |

As mentioned, the leaves in the above table are always the same. The object of this thesis in the extension of the intersection problem for maximum packings of $K_{6 n+5}$ with triples when the leaves (=4-cycles) are not necessarily the same. In particular we remove all of the exceptions for $K_{6 n+5}$ by showing that $I(n)=\left\{0,1,2, \ldots,\left(\binom{n}{2}-4\right) / 3\right\}$ for all $n \equiv 5(\bmod 6)$.

## 2. Three Examples

In everything that follows $\left.J^{*}(n)=\left\{0,1,2, \ldots,\binom{n}{2}-4\right) / 3\right\}$. We will need examples for $n=5,11$, and 17. In each case we will show that $I(n)=J^{*}(n)$, thereby removing the exceptions in Quatrocchi's constructions for $n \equiv 5(\bmod 6)$.

Example $2.1(n=5)$ Define three maximum packings of order $5\left(X, P_{1}\right),\left(X, P_{2}\right)$, and $\left(X, P_{3}\right)$ as follows:
$\left\{\begin{array}{l}\text { 1. } X=\{1,2,3,4,5\}, P_{1}=\{\{1,2,3\},\{1,4,5\}\} \text { with leave }(2,4,3,5) ; \\ \text { 2. } X=\{1,2,3,4,5\}, P_{2}=\{\{1,4,5\},\{2,3,4\}\} \text { with leave }(1,2,5,3) ; \\ \text { 3. } X=\{1,2,3,4,5\}, P_{3}=\{\{1,2,4\},\{1,5,3\}\} \text { with leave }(2,3,4,5) .\end{array}\right.$

Then $\left|P_{1} \cap P_{3}\right|=0,\left|P_{1} \cap P_{2}\right|=1$, and $\left|P_{1} \cap P_{1}\right|=2$. It follows that $I(5)=J^{*}(5)=$ $\{0,1,2\}$.

Example $2.2(n=11)$ Let $(X, F)$ be a 1-factorization of $K_{6}$ with vertex set $X$ and ( $Y, P_{1}$ ) and $\left(Y, P_{2}\right)$ any two maximum packings of $K_{5}$ with triples in Example 2.1. Define a pair of maximum packings $C_{1}$ and $C_{2}$ of $K_{11}$ with triples with vertex set $X \cup Y$ as follows:

$F=$| $F_{0}$ | $F_{1}$ | $F_{4}$ | $F_{2}$ | $F_{3}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 8,9 | 9,10 | 7,10 | 8,10 |
| 7,8 |  |  |  |  |
|  | 7,10 | 6,8 | 6,9 | 6,7 |
| 5,6 | 5,7 | 5,8 | 5,9 | 5,10 |


| $\mathrm{F}=$ | $\mathrm{F}_{0}$ | $\mathrm{F}_{1}$ | $\mathrm{F}_{4}$ | $\mathrm{F}_{2}$ | $\mathrm{F}_{3}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 8,9 | 9, 10 | 7,10 | 8,10 | 7, 8 |
|  | 7,10 | 6, 8 | 6,9 | 6,7 | 6,9 |
|  | 5,6 | 5,7 | 5,8 | 5,9 | 5,10 |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |

$\left\{\begin{array}{l}\text { 1. }\{i, x, y\} \in C_{1} \text { and } C_{2} \text { for each } i \in\{0,1,2,3,4\} \text { and }\{x, y\} \in F_{i}, \\ \text { 2. } P_{1} \subseteq C_{1} \text { and } P_{2} \subseteq C_{2} \text {. The leave in each case are the leaves in } P_{1} \text { and } P_{2} .\end{array}\right.$

By permuting the columns of $F$ and using the examples in 2.1 independently we obtain the intersection numbers $0,1,2, \ldots, 9,10,11,15,16,17$. So it remains to obtain the
intersection numbers $12,13,14$. Let $\mathcal{Z}_{1}$ and $\mathcal{Z}_{2}$ be the following two mutually balanced configurations consisting of a 4 -cycle and 3 -triples.

$$
Z_{1}=\left\{\begin{array}{cccc}
(1, & 2, & 3, & 4
\end{array}\right) \quad\left\{\begin{array}{cccc}
(1, & 4, & 8, & 2) \\
& \{2, & 8, & 10\} \\
& \{3, & 5, & 10\} \\
& \{4, & 5, & 8\}
\end{array} \quad Z_{2}=\left\{\begin{array}{ccc}
\{2, & 3, & 10\} \\
& \{5, & 8, \\
\hline
\end{array}\right.\right.
$$

None of the triples in $\mathcal{Z}_{1}$ and $\mathcal{Z}_{2}$ belong to $P_{1}$ or $P_{2}$. So removing $\mathcal{Z}_{1}$ from $C_{1}$ and replacing it with $Z_{2}$ reducing the number of type (1) triples by 3 . Taking $P_{1}$ and $P_{2}$ to have 0,1 , or 2 triples in common gives intersection numbers 12,13 , and 14 .

Example $2.3(n=17)$ Let $\mathcal{Q}=\{1,2,3,4,5\}$ and let $\left(\mathcal{Q}, \circ_{1}\right)$ and $\left(\mathcal{Q}, \circ_{2}\right)$ be two quasigroups such that $1 \circ_{1} 1=1 \circ_{2} 1=1$. Set $\mathcal{S}=\left\{\infty_{1}, \infty_{2}\right\} \cup(\{1,2,3,4,5\} \times\{1,2,3\})$ and define $\operatorname{PBDs}\left(\mathcal{S}, B_{1}\right)$ and $\left(\mathcal{S}, B_{2}\right)$ of order 17 as follows:


| $O_{1}$ | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 1 | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  |  |  | 2 |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5 |  |  |  |  |  |



| $\mathrm{O}_{2}$ | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 1 | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4 |  | 3 |  |  |  |
| 5 |  |  |  |  |  |

1. $f_{1}=f_{2}=\left\{\infty_{1}, \infty_{2}, 11,12,13\right\} \in B_{1} \cap B_{2}$. We can define copies of Example 2.1 independently on $f_{1}$ and $f_{2}$ so that $\left|f_{1} \cap f_{2}\right| \in\{0,1,2\}$.
2. For each $i, j \in\{1,2,3,4,5\}$, let $\left\{i 1, j 2,\left(i \circ_{1} j, 3\right)\right\} \in B_{1}$ and $\left\{i 2, j 2,\left(i \circ_{2} j, 3\right)\right\} \in$ $B_{2}$. (Note that $\{11,12,13\} \in B_{1} \cap B_{2}$.) Since the intersection numbers for quasigroups of order 5 are $\{0,1,2, \ldots, 25\} \backslash\{24,23,22,20\}[1]$ and since in each of the quasigroups $\left(\mathcal{Q}, \circ_{1}\right)$ and $\left(\mathcal{Q}, \circ_{2}\right) 1 \circ_{1} 1=1 \circ_{2} 1=1$ and the triple $\{11,21,31\} \in$ $f_{1} \cap f_{2}$ the type (2) intersection numbers are $\{0,1,2, \ldots, 17,18,20,24\}$.
3. For each $i \in\{1,2,3\}$ set $X(i)=\left\{\infty_{1}, \infty_{2}\right\} \cup\{\{1,2,3,4,5\} \times\{i\}\}$ and define a triple system $(X(i), T(i))$ where $\left\{\infty_{1}, \infty_{2}, 1 i\right\} \in T(i)$. Since the intersection numbers for triple systems of order 7 are $0,1,3,7$; the intersection numbers for $T(i) \backslash\left\{\infty_{1}, \infty_{2}, 1 i\right\}, T(j) \backslash\left\{\infty_{1}, \infty_{2}, 1 j\right\}$ for each $i$ and $j$ are 0,2 , and 6 .

The intersection numbers in (1), (2), and (3) are independent of each other and so the intersection numbers for $\left(S, B_{1}\right)$ and $\left(S, B_{2}\right)$ consists of $x+y+z$, where $x=\left|f_{1} \cap f_{2}\right| \in$ $\{0,1,2\}, y \in\{0,1,2, \ldots, 17,18,20,24\}$, and $z \in\{0,2,6\}+\{0,2,6\}+\{0,2,6\}$. A
straightforward computation shows that $x+y+z \in\{0,1,2, \ldots, 44\} \backslash\{41\}$. So all that remains is to show that $41 \in J^{*}(17)=\{0,1,2, \ldots, 44\}$ (no exceptions). Take ( $S, B_{1}$ ) and $\left(S, B_{2}\right)$ to be the same. Define $T(1)$ in $B_{1}$ to be

$$
T(1)=\left\{\begin{array}{ccc}
\infty_{1} & \infty_{2} & 11 \\
11 & 21 & 31 \\
11 & 41 & 51 \\
\infty_{1} & 21 & 51 \\
\infty_{1} & 31 & 41 \\
\infty_{2} & 21 & 41 \\
\infty_{2} & 31 & 51
\end{array}\right.
$$

We can assume in $f_{1}$ that the leave is the 4 - cycle $\left(\infty_{1}, \infty_{2}, 11,12\right)$. Then the configuration

$$
Z_{1}=\left\{\begin{array}{llll}
\left(\infty_{1},\right. & \infty_{2}, & 11, & 12
\end{array}\right)\left\{\begin{array}{lll} 
& \{21, & 31, \\
& 11
\end{array}\right\}
$$

belongs to $B_{1}$. If we replace $Z_{1}$ in $B_{1}$ with

$$
Z_{2}=\left\{\begin{array}{cccc}
\left(\infty_{1},\right. & 12, & 11, & 31
\end{array}\right)
$$

we reduce the intersection number between $B_{1}$ and $B_{2}$ from 44 to 41 . This completes Example 2.3.

## 3. The $6 n+5$ Construction

With the three examples in Section 2 in hand we can proceed to the main construction showing that $I(6 n+5)=J^{*}(6 n+5)=\left\{0,1,2, \ldots, \frac{\left(\binom{n}{2}-4\right.}{3}\right\}$ for all $n$.

The $6 n+5$ Construction: Let $6 n+5 \geq 23$ and let $(X, G, B)$ be a $G D D(2 n, 2,3)$ or $G D D\left(2 n,\left\{2,4^{*}\right\}, 3\right)$, where $\left\{2,4^{*}\right\}$ means there is exactly one group of size 4 and the rest have size 2. Set $S=\left\{\infty_{1}, \infty_{2}, \infty_{3}, \infty_{4}, \infty_{5}\right\} \cup(X \times\{1,2,3\})$ and define a maximum packing, $P$ of $K_{6 n+5}$ as follows:

1. Place an example of order 11 or 17 on $\left\{\infty_{1}, \infty_{2}, \infty_{3}, \infty_{4}, \infty_{5}\right\} \cup(g \times\{1,2,3\})$ where $g$ is a block of size 2 if all blocks have size 2 ; or 4 if $g$ in the unique block of size 4.
2. For all other blocks (which necessarily have size 2) place a copy of Example 2.2 or 2.3 on $\left\{\infty_{1}, \infty_{2}, \infty_{3}, \infty_{4}, \infty_{5}\right\} \cup(g \times\{1,2,3\})$ minus the block $\left\{\infty_{1}, \infty_{2}, \infty_{3}, \infty_{4}, \infty_{5}\right\}$ of size 5 .

3. For each triple $\{a, b, c\} \in B$ decompose $K_{3,3,3}$ into 9 triples with parts $a \times\{1,2,3\}$, $b \times\{1,2,3\}$ and $c \times\{1,2,3\}$.

Then $(S, P)$ is a maximum packing of $K_{6 n+5}$ with triples with leave a 4-cycle. Now take two copies of $(S, P)$. We need construct only the intersection numbers $x-1, x-2, x-3$, and $x-5$ since Quattrocchi has taken care of everything else. But this is easily done by defining a pair of maximum packings of order 11 or 17 on $\left\{\infty_{1}, \infty_{2}, \infty_{3}, \infty_{4}, \infty_{5}\right\} \cup(g \times$ $\{1,2,3\}$ ) intersecting in $x-1, x-2, x-3$, or $x-5$ triples, where $x=17$ or 44 as the case may be. This completes the proof. We have the following theorem:

Theorem 3.1. $I(6 n+5)=J^{*}(6 n+5)$ for all $6 n+5$.

## References

[1] Fu, Hung-Lin. "Construction of Certain Types of Latin Squares Having Prescribed Intersections," Dissertation Abstracts International Part B: Science and Engineering, 41(1981), 1981.
[2] Hoffman, D.G. and Lindner, C.C.. "The flower intersection problem for Steiner triple systems," North-Holland Mathematics Studies, 149(1987), 243-248.
[3] Lindner, C.C. and Rosa, Alexander. "Steiner triple systems having a prescribed number of triples in common," Canad. J. Math, 27(1975), 1166-1175.
[4] Quattrocchi, G.. "Intersections among maximum partial triple systems," J. Combin. Inform. System Sci, 14(1989), 192-201.

