

Transformative Learning in Counseling Programs through International Experiences: A 25-Year Qualitative Content Analysis of the Counseling Literature

by

Steven David Wright

A dissertation submitted to the Graduate Faculty of
Auburn University
in partial fulfillment of the
requirements for the Degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

Auburn, Alabama

August 5, 2017

Keywords: multicultural counseling competency, immersion, international service learning, international travel, study abroad, transformative learning

Copyright 2017 by Steven David Wright

Approved by

Amanda Evans, Chair, Associate Professor of Special Education, Rehabilitation, and Counseling

Jamie Carney, Humana-Germany-Sherman Distinguished Professor of Special Education, Rehabilitation, and Counseling

Thomas Smith, Associate Professor of Marriage and Family Therapy

Jessica Fripp, Assistant Clinical Professor of Special Education, Rehabilitation, and Counseling

Abstract

For decades the counseling profession has emphasized the importance of multicultural competence when working effectively with diverse populations (Arredondo et al., 1996; Korman, 1974; Pederson, 1991; Ratts, Singh, Nassar-McMillan, Butler & McCullough, 2016; Sue et al., 1982; Sue, Arredondo, & McDavis, 1992) however, multicultural competency tends to focus more on people within the United States, as immigrants and other cultural minorities are underserved by healthcare services and receive inadequate care as a result (Abe-Kim et al., 2007; David, 2010; Holden et al., 2012; LaVeist et al., 2000; Shea & Yeh, 2008). One method to prepare counseling professionals to work with individuals from an ever-growing international population is to incorporate transformative learning experiences through international travel exposure in counseling graduate programs (Barden & Cashwell, 2014; Choi et al., 2015; Shannonhouse et al., 2015; Smith et al., 2014). Currently, there is a paucity of professional counseling literature pertaining to the utilization of international experiences in counselor training programs. To aid in counselor preparation, I conducted a qualitative content analysis to explore literature in the field of counseling from 1991-2016 to determine how the profession has addressed international experiences for counselors in the development and facilitation of multicultural counseling competencies through transformative learning. An exhaustive search of the top twenty-two American Counseling Association (ACA) and division's journals resulted in a total of eight

publications. Examination of the resulting counseling literature revealed six predominate themes: (1) disorienting dilemmas, (2) critical reflection, (3) critical consciousness, (4) cultural interaction, (5) relationships, and (6) cultural sensitivity. These six themes reflect all ten stages of Jack Mezirow's (2000) transformative learning process.

Acknowledgments

It is incredibly difficult for me to accurately express the gratitude and appreciation I have towards the countless people who have impacted me throughout my life, particularly over the past three years. It's important for me to begin with my family and friends. Mom, Dad, Grandmother(s), Emily, and Mark – thank you for teaching me how to live my life. You all have encouraged and supported me through the good and the bad and I wouldn't be finishing this without you. I don't know where or who I would be without your love and guidance. To my friends: I couldn't be more blessed to know you all. Whether growing up back home or living in Auburn, I don't think I could have come to know and spend time with a better group of people. Thank you all for keeping me active, making me happy, providing opportunities for fun and laughter, and preserving my sanity as I completed school. I can only hope I've reciprocated the level of friendship you all have provided because I think it's impossible to exceed it. Sarah – thank you for being with me. You have set the standard for patience, understanding, support, and encouragement over the past two years. You make me a better person and I'm lucky to spend my time with you.

I can't write an acknowledgments section without setting aside space to thank my incredible Chair, Dr. Evans. Knowing you for five years has been the best thing I could have asked for in regards to my professional development as a counselor educator. Your ability to challenge and provide encouragement simultaneously is impeccable. I

appreciate that you never let me become too comfortable with where I stood as a student. You provided me with opportunities to learn and grow as a counselor, educator, supervisor and researcher but you allowed me to take ownership of my growth and develop a sense of autonomy. Additionally, you knew when I was overwhelmed and needed support, which you always offered at the drop of a hat. I knew if I could trust someone to go to bat for me or offer encouragement when I needed it the most, I could trust you. I'll miss sitting with you to plan out my professional future and just talk about life in general, but I'm thrilled to become your colleague and I look forward to continuing our relationship for a long time. You are an ideal mentor and I hope you know how valued and appreciated you are by all of the students you invest in.

I have also been fortunate to learn from other incredible faculty members at Auburn. Dr. Carney, you have practically been our cohort mother, as all but a handful of our classes were with you! Aside from being your student, your approach to teaching has impacted me tremendously. Thank you for encouraging me to be myself in the classroom and not to forget the value of humor when working with people. I'm so grateful to have known and worked with you. Dr. Iarussi, I have benefitted immensely from your leadership and teaching. You are one of the most knowledgeable and driven teachers I've ever had and I attribute much of my development as a professional counselor to you. Finally, Dr. Tyler – working with you clinically and learning from you in supervision has been some of the most valuable time of my professional and academic experiences. You will continue to impact students for a very long time. Also, what is learning without learning with special people? To my cohort – thank you so much for riding this train with me. I am better off for having known all of you, a few of which I've had the pleasure of

knowing for longer than our doctoral program. I appreciate your friendship and I know all of you will continue to be phenomenal.

Finally and quickly, I have to mention how grateful I am for the collective six months I spent in the little town of Ariccia, Italy. The experiences impacted my professional interests and the people impacted my life. These special people taught me to value the importance of the relationships we make with others and moreover, appreciate our cultural differences. I have been incredibly blessed and I am forever grateful for all of those I've mentioned. I wish I could write more but I needed to save room for the actual dissertation, so this will have to do.

Table of Contents

Abstract.....	ii
Acknowledgments	iv
List of Tables	ix
Chapter 1	1
Multicultural Counseling Competency	6
Counselor Education and Multicultural Counseling Competencies	12
International Travel	17
Transformative Learning	17
Transformative Learning through International Travel	19
Chapter 2	22
Content Analysis	22
Purpose	23
Data Collection	24
Trustworthiness	28
Data Analysis	30
Chapter 3	35
Keywords	36
Excluded Publications	37
Journal Affiliation	39

Research Design	40
Authorship and Affiliation	41
Emergent Themes	50
Implications	55
Recommendations	57
Chapter 4	62
Transformative Learning through International Experiences	63
Implications for Counselor Educators	68
Limitations	70
Recommendations	71
Chapter 5	75
References	107
Appendix A	122
Appendix B	126

List of Tables

Table 1	39
Table 2	41
Table 3	48
Table 4	49
Table 5	50
Table 6	53

Chapter 1

Over the years, the United States has experienced a dramatic shift in population demographics. It is projected that by 2050, more than half of the U.S population will consist of individuals representing diverse racial and ethnic backgrounds (Colby & Ortman, 2015; Humbert, Burket, Deveney, & Kennedy, 2012) and there will be an increase in foreign-born residents that will exceed native born residents (Colby & Ortman, 2015). According to the Migration Policy Institute (MPI, 2016), “foreign born” and “immigrant” are used interchangeably and refer to individuals without U.S. citizenship at birth. This population includes naturalized citizens, lawful permanent residents, refugees and asylees, individuals on certain temporary visas, and unauthorized visas. Literature has shown that immigrants underutilize mental health services due to language barriers, a lack of information on how to obtain services and navigate the U.S. healthcare system, limited financial resources (e.g., slightly more than one-fourth of immigrants do not have insurance coverage), cultural mistrust towards mental health professionals, and cultural values that contradict the mental health profession (Abe-Kim et al., 2007; David, 2010; MPI, 2016; Shea & Yeh, 2008). Underutilization of mental health services and inadequate care amongst the population is problematic for a host of reasons. Mental health distress experienced by immigrants is likely linked to acculturative stress such as leaving friends, family and familiar cultural norms, adjusting to a new cultural environment, and in some cases prejudices and discrimination (Rogers-Siren, Melendez, Refano, & Zegarra, 2015). According to Alegria, Sribney, Woo,

Torres, and Guarnaccia (2007), this acculturative stress has been associated with a higher risk of psychiatric symptoms.

Although the counseling profession professes multicultural counseling competency (Arredondo et al., 1996; Korman, 1974; Pederson, 1991; Ratts, Singh, Nassar-McMillan, Butler & McCullough, 2016; Sue et al., 1982; Sue, Arredondo, & McDavis, 1992), it tends to focus more on people within the United States. One method to prepare counseling professionals to work with individuals from an ever-growing diverse population is to incorporate transformative learning experiences through international travel exposure in counseling graduate programs. Transformative learning is a process where one changes their perspectives or mindsets into a more open or inclusive way of thinking in order to develop more justified beliefs to guide one's actions (Hubbs & Brand, 2005). Several prominent counseling programs in the U.S. have instituted travel programs to increase counselor competency; however, there is a paucity of literature on the effectiveness or prevalence of these programs. Through exposure and transformative learning experiences, counselors-in-training can become exposed to policies and standards outside of the U.S. to treat international people, thus increasing their self-awareness and efficacy (Barden & Cashwell, 2014; Cunningham, Caldwell, & Geltner, 2011; DeRicco & Sciarra, 2005; McDowell, Goessling, & Melendez, 2012; Prosek & Michel, 2016; Ribeiro & Ribeiro, 2005.) The purpose of this study is to examine the literature through a qualitative content analysis of the top counseling journals to determine if and how the counseling profession is using transformative learning experiences in counselor preparation and multicultural counseling competency. Additionally, this study aims to develop a foundation of the research conducted as it

relates to counselor education programming. Recommendations for counselor educators and researchers will be included to better address the needs of international clients.

Diverse Populations in the United States

According to the United States Census Bureau (2001), from 1990 to 2000, the U.S. population grew to over 281 million people. Most of this growth was due to an increase of racial/ethnic minority groups. The Asian American/Pacific Islander population increased by almost 50%, the Latino/Hispanic population increased by over 58%, African Americans by 16%, and American Indians/Alaska Natives by 15.5%. These increases supersede the 7.3% increase of White Americans. As of 2010, the United States Census Bureau (2010) reported that over one-third of the U.S. population is made up of non-white persons. Approximately 73% of the U.S. population was composed of European Americans in 2000; however, this percentage is expected to decline to 53% by 2050 (Abreu, Chung, & Atkinson, 2000).

The shift in U.S. demographics is also a result of increasing immigration rates (i.e., documented immigrants, undocumented immigrants, refugees) whose numbers are currently the largest in U.S. history (Sue & Sue, 2008). In 2014, the U.S. immigrant population stood at approximately 42 million people, or 13% of the total U.S. population. Immigrants in the United States and their U.S.-born children now number approximately 81 million people, or 26% of the overall U.S. population. Since 1970, the number of U.S. immigrants more than quadrupled, rising from 9.6 million to 42.4 million in 2014. In 2014, around 47 percent of immigrants (20 million) were naturalized U.S. citizens (6 percent of the total U.S. population). The remaining 53 percent (22.4 million) included lawful permanent residents, unauthorized immigrants, and legal residents on temporary

visas (i.e., students and temporary workers; U.S. Census Bureau American Community Surveys [ACS], 2014; U.S. Census Bureau, 2010, as cited by the Migration Policy Institute [MPI], 2016). The Migration Policy Institute (2016) reported that an estimated 11 million unauthorized immigrants resided in the United States in 2013. The process of becoming a U.S. citizen has grown increasingly complicated for foreign-born residents. Visa applications for permanent immigration (i.e., green cards) may be backlogged for two reasons: visa availability and processing delays (MPI, 2016). According to the U.S. Department of Homeland Security (DHS, 2016), in April 2016, the U.S. government was still processing some family-sponsored visa applications dating from September 1992, and employment-related visa applications from August 2004. The changing U.S. demographics are anticipated to continue, as projections suggest that the non-White population will constitute a numerical majority in the U.S. between 2030 and 2050 (Sue & Sue, 2008).

Counseling Underserved Populations

In the current era, as a result of continual demographic changes in the United States, how the counseling profession identifies and addresses cultural differences has become a priority. This is further compounded by the acknowledgement that immigrants and other cultural minorities are underserved by healthcare services and receive inadequate services as a result (Abe-Kim et al., 2007; David, 2010; Holden, McGregor, Blanks, & Mahaffey, 2012; LaVeist, Nickerson, & Bowie, 2000; Shea & Yeh, 2008). Snowden and Cheung (1990) reported that the utilization of community mental health services by ethnic minority populations (e.g., African Americans, Asian Americans, Hispanics) are underrepresented compared to European Americans. Additionally, those

of diverse populations who do utilize counseling services tend to drop out prematurely. For example, racial and ethnic minorities discontinue counseling services at a rate of more than 50% after only one session compared to less than 30% for White clients (Sue & Sue, 2008).

It has been hypothesized (Fraga, Atkinson, & Wampold, 2004; Kearney, Draper, & Baron, 2005) that one reason diverse populations tend to underutilize counseling services is that they do not perceive counselors to be competent in addressing their culturally related issues. This hypothesis is supported, in that counseling graduates have reported feeling ill-prepared in their graduate programs to offer sufficient and effective services to diverse populations (Arthur & Achenbach, 2002; Barden & Cashwell, 2014). Although access to health care and mental health care is the largest contributor to the disparity in health care between dominant groups and non-dominant groups (i.e., people of color, the working poor and women; Merluzzi & Hegde, 2003), cultural variables in the counseling relationship could also contribute to underutilization and inadequate care (Kohn-Wood & Hooper, 2014). According to the American Psychological Association (2015), the vast majority of mental health providers in the United States are White (83.6%). In comparison, only 5.3% are Black, 5% are Hispanic, 4.3% are Asian, and 1.7% consist of other racial/ethnic groups. Cabral and Smith (2011) found that, in general, individuals tend to prefer having a therapist of their own race or ethnicity.

Underutilization of mental health services and inadequate care amongst diverse populations are problematic for a host of reasons. Underrepresented individuals are more likely than white European-Americans to experience higher levels of culturally driven stress, including but not limited to poverty, racism, prejudice, discrimination, traumatic

stress and a sense of belonging (Cokely, McClain, Enciso, & Martinez, 2013; Kim & Lyons, 2003; Sue & Sue, 2008). Mental health distress experienced by immigrants is likely linked to acculturative stress such as leaving friends, family and familiar cultural norms, adjusting to a new cultural environment, and in some cases prejudices and discrimination (Rogers-Siren et al., 2015). The aforementioned factors (i.e., acculturative stress) have been associated with a higher risk of psychiatric symptoms (Alegria et al., 2007; Sue & Sue, 2016). Additionally, Eack and Newhill (2012) report that minority populations, specifically African Americans, are often misdiagnosed with severe mental illnesses, prescribed more psychotropic medications at higher doses, more likely to receive injections, and more likely to be hospitalized compared to European Americans. Cultural attitudes, beliefs and behaviors impact the utilization of health services of the culturally diverse and, in turn, influence the morbidity and mortality of diverse populations (Merluzzi & Hegde, 2003). Although underrepresented individuals face a number of barriers in relation to the utilization of mental health services, it would greatly benefit these underserved populations to receive culturally competent services, given the association between acculturative stress and mental health symptoms (Rogers-Siren et al., 2015).

Multicultural Counseling Competency

As a result of these changing demographics and a recognition that individuals representing cultural diversity are underserved, counseling professionals have identified multicultural competence (MCC) as the 4th force of counseling (Pederson, 1991). In July of 1973, psychology professionals gathered in Vail, Colorado for the National Conference on Levels and Patterns of Professional Training, also known as the Vail

Conference. In reviewing this conference, Korman (1974) referred to cultural competence as an ethical matter within the field of psychology and recommended that graduate training programs should focus on preparing culturally competent professionals. Years later, Sue and Sue (1977) published an article entitled, “Barriers to Effective Cross-Cultural Counseling,” which contributed to the early discussion of multicultural counseling competence. This article reported that culturally diverse populations terminate from counseling services prematurely, citing ineffective interpersonal interactions (i.e., language barriers, class and culture-bound values, nonverbal communication) between counselors and the diverse client population as a cause. Sue and Sue (1977) hypothesized that no one mode of counseling would be appropriate for all populations or all situations.

In 1982, Sue et al.’s influential work cited a need for clearly defining “cross-cultural counseling.” Sue et al. (1982) defined cross-cultural counseling as “any counseling relationship in which two or more of the participants differ with respect to cultural background, values and lifestyle.” This position paper recommended the adoption of specific cross-cultural counseling competencies by the American Psychological Association (APA) for training and accreditation criteria. The initial framework for these competencies included beliefs/attitudes, knowledge and skills. In the mid-1980’s, publications related to training issues (i.e., multiculturally competent training practices, training programs and supervision) began to emerge, followed by literature regarding multicultural counseling competency assessment (instruments for training, practice and supervision) in the early 1990’s (Ridley & Kleiner, 2003).

Sue et al.'s (1992) "Multicultural Counseling Competencies and Standards: A Call to the Profession" refined previous work and created a model of 31 specific multicultural counseling competencies. The MCC model (1992) had three characteristics that included: (I) counselor awareness of own assumptions, values and biases, (II) understanding the worldview of the culturally diverse client and (III) developing appropriate techniques or interventions. Three dimensions accompany the MCC characteristics: *beliefs and attitudes*, *knowledge* and *skills*. According to Sue et al. (1992), *beliefs and attitudes* refer to the mindset of counselors about ethnic and racial minorities, as well as the responsibility counselors have to check their biases and stereotypes, develop a positive orientation toward multicultural perspectives, and recognize ways in which personal biases and values can affect cross-cultural counseling relationships. *Knowledge* refers to an understanding counselors have of their own worldview, their specific knowledge of cultural groups, and their understanding of sociopolitical influences on cross-cultural relationships. Finally, *skills* refer to specific abilities necessary to work with ethnic and racial minorities.

Aside from providing a specific framework for implementing MCCs, Sue et al. (1992) provided rationale for multicultural perspectives in counseling assessment, practice, training and research, proposed specific standards for a culturally competent counselor, and advocated for the integration of these standards in the American Association for Counseling and Development (AACD). The necessity for multicultural perspectives in the counseling profession was due to the aforementioned dramatic increase in the non-White population within the U.S., which required mental health professionals to be prepared to provide culturally appropriate services to all people.

Psychologists recognized and affirmed the need for culturally competent services, thus supported Sue et al.'s (1992) model for MCCs (Allison, Echemendia, Crawford, & Robinson, 1996; Sadowsky, Taffe, Gutkin, & Wise, 1994). By the late 1990's, 89% of all doctoral programs in counseling psychology and counselor education reported having a multicultural course requirement (Abreu et al., 2000). In addition, operationalization of the MCCs occurred in Arredondo et al.'s (1996) work, "Operationalization of the Multicultural Counseling Competencies," which provided a framework for integrating the MCCs into organizations.

Over the past 30 years, professional organizations (e.g., American Counseling Association [ACA], American Psychological Association [APA], Council for Accreditation of Counseling and Related Educational Programs [CACREP]) have integrated multicultural competency into ethical guidelines for practice and competency standards for accreditation (Jones, Sander, & Booker, 2013). A study conducted by Pieterse, Evans, Risner-Butner, Collins, and Mason (2009) showed that 96% of syllabi observed from required multicultural courses in CACREP and APA-accredited programs were using Sue et al.'s (1992) MCC model to frame content within their courses. This endorsement has marked the psychological and counseling professions' commitment to MCC services and training (Ridley & Kleiner, 2003).

Multicultural and Social Justice Counseling Competencies

Although progress was made in regards to counseling diverse populations, it became apparent that intersections of identities (e.g., racial, ethnic, gender, sexual, socioeconomic, age, religious, spiritual, disability) greatly impact mental health outcomes and health disparities (Ratts et al., 2016). To address the growing needs of an ever-

evolving society, Carlos P. Hipolito-Delgado (2014-15 president of the Association for Multicultural Counseling and Development), commissioned a committee to revise the MCCs developed by Sue et al. (1992). The Association for Multicultural Counseling and Development (AMCD) MCC revision committee's charge was "to update the MCC (a) to reflect a more inclusive and broader understanding of culture and diversity that encompasses the intersection of identities and (b) to better address the expanding role of professional counselors to include individual counseling and social justice advocacy" (Ratts et al., 2016). As a revision to Sue et al.'s (1992) model of *Multicultural Counseling Competencies*, Ratts, Singh, Nassar-McMillan, Butler, and McCullough (2015) developed the *Multicultural and Social Justice Counseling Competencies* (MSJCC), which were endorsed by the AMCD Executive Council and by the ACA Governing Council in 2015.

The MSJCCs provide a framework to implement multicultural and social justice competencies into counseling theories, practices and research. According to Ratts et al. (2016), the MSJCC framework "acknowledges the following as important aspects of counseling practice for both counselors and clients: (a) understanding the complexities of diversity and multiculturalism on the counseling relationship; (b) recognizing the negative influence of oppression on mental health and well-being; (c) understanding individuals in the context of their social environment; and (d) integrating social advocacy into the various modalities of counseling (e.g., individual, family, partners, and group)."

In the *Multicultural and Social Justice Counseling Competency* model, four quadrants are used to represent the intersection of identities between counselors and clients in regards to privileged and marginalized statuses. According to Ratts et al.

(2016), those who are privileged hold power and privilege in society and those who are marginalized are oppressed and lack the advantages in society that benefit the privileged. The first quadrant is the *privileged counselor-marginalized client*. This quadrant represents counseling relationships in which the counselor holds power and privilege over their client (e.g., white counselor working with a client of color, a heterosexual counselor working with a gay, lesbian, bisexual client, etc.). The second quadrant is the *privileged counselor-privileged client relationship* (e.g., white counselor working with a white client, male counselor working with a male client, etc.). The third quadrant is the *marginalized counselor-privileged client*. This relationship represents a client holding social power and privilege over the counselor, such as an able-bodied client working with a counselor who has a disability or a male client working with a female counselor. The fourth and final quadrant represents a *marginalized counselor-marginalized client* relationship. This relationship would be present in counselors and clients who share the same marginalized identity such as counselors and clients of color. Due to fluidity of identity over time and situations, these quadrants represent snapshots of time between the counselor and the client in a counseling relationship (Ratts et al., 2016).

Each of the MSJCC quadrants (i.e., *privileged counselor-marginalized client*, *privileged counselor-privileged client*, *marginalized counselor-privileged client*, *marginalized counselor-marginalized client*) contains four development domains (i.e., counselor self-awareness, client worldview, the counseling relationship, and counseling and advocacy interventions) that contribute to multicultural and social justice competence (Ratts et al., 2015). The model's domains insist that counselors must first become aware of their own values and beliefs in order to understand their client's worldviews and how

privilege and marginalization affect the counseling relationship. This process allows counselors and clients to work collaboratively to develop counseling approaches that are both multiculturally responsive and promote social justice through advocacy (Ratts et al., 2016).

Ideally, counseling professionals would engage in behaviors that ensure the protection of human and civil rights and opportunities for all (Jones et al., 2013). With this in mind, in addition to the traditional competencies of *attitudes and beliefs*, *knowledge* and *skills*, the MSJCCs call for an additional competency of *action* (AKSA). The addition of the action competency emphasizes the need to operationalize attitudes and beliefs, knowledge and skills (Ratts et al., 2016). The MSJCC provides *all* counseling professionals a framework to deliver multicultural and social justice competent counseling practice, supervision and training, research, and advocacy. In regards to counselor educators and supervisors, Ratts et al. (2016) recommends the use of the MSJCC model as a framework for providing multicultural and social justice competent counselor training and supervision with an emphasis on the implementation of education and supervision that encourages counselors-in-training to establish a safe, supportive and affirming counseling relationship with culturally diverse clients and communities.

Counselor Education and Multicultural Counseling Competencies

Although there is a need for an increased emphasis on the development of multicultural counseling competence in counseling trainees and professionals, there is little information available describing how to attain multicultural counseling competency skills (Chao, 2012). This recognition of the importance of culturally responsive treatment

has led the counseling profession to examine how counselors are prepared in training programs to work with diverse populations while addressing the Multicultural Counseling Competencies (Arredondo & Toporek, 2004; Fawcett, Briggs, Maycock, & Stine, 2010; Zalaquett, Foley, Tillotson, Dinsmore, & Hof, 2008). A multiculturally competent counselor can be defined as one who possesses the awareness, knowledge and skills necessary to work effectively and sensitively with clients from various cultural and ethnic backgrounds (Holcomb-McCoy & Meyers, 1999; Sue et al., 1992).

Multicultural Training Models

Unfortunately, many counselors have been trained to implement therapeutic interventions designed primarily for European Americans (Abreu et al., 2000). As a result, much more attention is being paid to multicultural training (MCT) in counselor preparation programs. According to Rogers and O'Bryon (2014), four models were traditionally used alone or in combination to help guide multicultural training in counselor education programs. These models included (a) *separate course*, (b) *area of concentration*, (c) *interdisciplinary* and (d) *integration*.

In a *separate course* model, a single course is added on to existing curriculum. The emphasis of this model is addressing one ethnic group representative of the larger geographic setting and on including didactic and skill development activities about that group in the course. The separate course model not only appears to be the most studied and implemented MCT model, but it has also been found effective in increasing multicultural counseling competencies, according to self-reported results from counselors-in-training (D'Andrea, Daniels, & Heck, 1991; Rogers & O'Bryon, 2014). The *area of concentration* model extends the separate course model by offering in-depth

specialization through a combination of interconnected courses, skill development activities and applied training experiences (Rogers & O’Byron, 2014). This model allows for specialization for working with one specific ethnic minority group, different minority groups, or groups representing a specific geographic region. In an *interdisciplinary* model, counselors-in-training participate in MCT by taking a multicultural course from a related discipline (e.g., anthropology, social work, etc.). Lastly, an *integration* model infuses the entire curriculum and applied training experiences with multicultural perspectives, research and theories. It is the only of the four models to provide in-depth, comprehensive, didactic and applied (practicum and internship) training. Infusing these multicultural considerations throughout training experiences addresses increasing student knowledge, skills and awareness related to multicultural development (ACA, 2014; CACREP, 2016; Sue et al., 1992). The integration model is considered to be the most ideal approach for MCT (Rogers & O’Byron, 2014). Ridley, Mendoza, and Kanitz (1994) discussed two additional models – *traditional* and *workshop*. The *traditional* model makes no effort to incorporate multicultural issues into the training curriculum and the *workshop* model implements the use of workshops being added to the curriculum for the purpose of including multicultural content in the training environment.

MCT and Counselor Education

D’Andrea et al. (1991) reported that multicultural training courses typically emphasis three areas, which include the (I) acquisition of cross-cultural communication skills, (II) increasing awareness of attitudes and beliefs towards ethnic minorities, and (III) increasing knowledge about minority populations. The point of emphasis in a MCT

course dictates the approach counselor educators take in designing learning outcomes, objectives and in-class experiences. For example, multicultural courses that emphasize the acquisition and development of skills may be designed in such a way that provides students opportunities for direct involvement through action-oriented activities (e.g., role-playing, behavioral modeling, observation of video or tape recordings). Training focused on increasing awareness of attitudes or beliefs (i.e., biases, prejudices, misconceptions) towards diverse groups may be less structured and focused on class discussion. Finally, training that emphasizes increasing knowledge about ethnically diverse populations may be more didactic by nature (e.g., assigned readings, lectures, and presentations focused on data pertaining to various diverse populations; D'Andrea et al., 1991). To guide counseling training program multicultural efforts, Ponterotto, Alexander, and Grieger (1995) constructed a 22-item Multicultural Competency Checklist. This highly regarded guide for multicultural program development was organized into six different themes that included: minority representation, curriculum issues, counseling practice and supervision, research considerations, student and faculty competency evaluation, and physical environment.

Although traditional methods have been regarded effective to an extent, Kim and Lyons (2003) suggested that didactic teaching methods alone might not be effective in developing MCC. Vazquez and Vazquez (2003) claim two requirements must be met in teaching a multicultural course: it must be experientially based and process oriented, both of which serve as the foundation for self-exploration and self-awareness. Experiential learning, described as a cyclical process having two stages – action and reflection, has been recommended as a pedagogical method that can bridge multicultural counseling

theory and practice (Arthur & Achenbach, 2002; Roholt & Fisher, 2013). Jones et al. (2013) recommend experiential techniques (e.g., advocacy activities, small or large in-class group exercises, culturally-focused literature and films, case conceptualizations, diverse speaking panels, etc.) to address trainee awareness of self and others. Experiential learning (e.g., reflective journal writing, cultural-examination papers and interviews with members of a different cultural group) has also been incorporated into MCT courses and, as Arthur and Achenbach (2002) concluded, experiential learning can encourage students to consider what cultural contexts may influence their own attitudes, behaviors, and beliefs which potentially leads to students being more reflective about the impact on their professional role.

The counselor education literature often refers to in-class experiential exercises to expand student worldviews (Arthur & Achenbach, 2002; Jones et al., 2013; Roholt & Fisher, 2013), however, the limitations of in-class work are numerous. Oftentimes, for example, books and articles assigned in single course experiences that provide evidence-based treatment or multicultural best practice suggestions are methods primarily used when exposing counselors to cultural differences. These methods don't provide sufficient opportunities for counselors-in-training to practice or assess their own cultural competence due to limited contact with those of diverse populations (Kagnici, 2014). Rogers and O'Bryon (2014) recommend that MCT of future counselors needs to be focused on clients in a holistic way and focus on providing services that are contextually relevant, culturally congruent and evidenced-based. Due to the limitations in-class experiential exercises may have on multicultural development, it would be beneficial for

counselor educators to explore incorporating transformative learning experiences through international travel in counselor preparation programs.

International Travel

Over the past 20 years, the number of U.S. students participating in international experiences has increased substantially and, according to Boateng and Thompson (2012), almost every institution of higher learning is involved with study abroad in some capacity. The reasons for the desirability of increasing international experiences vary, both from student and institutional perspectives. Students feel as though studying abroad increases employment opportunities in regards to securing job interviews, receiving job offers, and increasing the likelihood of career progression (Franklin, 2010; Stroud, 2010). Students have also reported interest in examining cultural heritage, globalizing their worldview, experiencing personal enrichment and immersing themselves in a host country to improve their foreign language skills (Boateng & Thompson, 2012). From an institutional perspective, student recruitment and financial gain are benefits for developing, implementing and encouraging student participation in study abroad opportunities (Anderson, Hubbard, & Lawton, 2015; Boateng & Thompson, 2012). Employers and institutions alike have come to expect students to possess strong global competencies, which have led to a greater emphasis on students developing global and intercultural communication skills (Stebbleton, Soria, & Cherney, 2013).

Transformative Learning

The *Transformative Model of Learning* was originally developed by Jack Mezirow (1997) to serve adult learners in higher education (Guiffrida, 2005).

Transformative learning is a process where one changes their perspectives or mindsets

into a more open or inclusive way of thinking in order to develop more justified beliefs to guide one's actions (Hubbs & Brand, 2005). Mezirow (2000) described the ten phases of the transformative process as: (1) experiencing a disorienting situation; (2) undergoing self-examination with feelings of fear, anger, guilt or shame; (3) conducting a critical assessment of internalized assumptions; (4) recognizing others have had similar experiences; (5) exploration of options for new roles, relationships and actions; (6) planning a course of action; (7) acquiring knowledge and skills for implementing one's plans; (8) provisional trying of one's roles; (9) building competence and self-confidence in new roles and relationships; and (10) reintegrating into society with a newly defined perspective (as cited by Nohl, 2015).

Based off Mezirow's approach to the individual transformative process, Addleman, Nava, Cevallos, Brazo, and Dixon (2014) described the major elements of the transformative process in three stages: *triggering experiences*, *frame of reference examination*, and *transformative change*. *Triggering experiences*, or (1) disorienting experiences, are described as an event that identifies a discrepancy between what an individual has always thought to be true and what has just been experienced (Cranton, 2002). Frame of reference can be described as a structure of expectations and assumptions that shape an individual's view of the world (Mezirow, 2012). *Frame of reference examination* is characterized by an awareness and assessment of frames of reference through critical reflection and dialogue (Addleman et al., 2014). Three of Mezirow's (2000) phases are included in this stage: (2) undergoing self-examination with feelings of fear, anger, guilt or shame; (3) conducting a critical assessment of internalized assumptions; and (4) recognizing others have had similar experiences. The third stage,

transformative change, includes the remaining phases identified by Mezirow (2000): (5) exploration of options for new roles, relationships and actions; (6) planning a course of action; (7) acquiring knowledge and skills for implementing one's plans; (8) provisional trying of one's roles; (9) building competence and self-confidence in new roles and relationships; and (10) reintegrating into society with a newly defined perspective. For transformative learning to occur in educational settings, strategies must be implemented that facilitate a greater sense of awareness within learners and allow them to make meaning of their experiences in order to guide future action (Guiffrida, 2005; Kuennen 2015).

Transformative Learning through International Travel

Over the past decade, the impact international experiences have on multicultural learning has received increased attention. According to Guth, McAuliffe, and Michalak (2012), international experiences such as study abroad result in a type of learning that may not occur in a standard cultural counseling course. There is growing evidence of the role international experiences have in providing transformative learning opportunities and facilitating multicultural learning, development, and competency in those who spend time abroad (Barden & Cashwell, 2014; Cunningham et al., 2011; DeRicco & Sciarra, 2005; McDowell, Goessling, & Melendez, 2012; Prosek & Michel, 2016; Ribeiro & Ribeiro, 2005).

Benefits of studying abroad for students include increased cultural sensitivity, increased self-awareness of one's own cultural values, increased self-confidence, and increased communication skills (Smith & Curry, 2011). Jurgens and McAuliffe (2004) found that students who studied abroad were able to increase their knowledge of the host

country through experiential learning and interactions, as well as increase their tolerance of others by living abroad with fellow travelers. According to a study conducted at the University of Delaware, individuals who spent even a short time abroad felt more confident in their levels of intercultural awareness and functional knowledge than those who stayed on campus (Chieffo & Griffiths, 2004). Stebleton et al. (2013) suggests that international experiences intentionally designed to foster deeper engagement among students (e.g., pre-departure workshops, embedded journal reflections, involvement in community service and local cultural events, and interactions with community members) are positively associated with development in student's global and intercultural competencies.

Those who participate in international experiences are able to develop cultural views that are more inclusive and less ethnocentric by challenging their own point of view through critical reflection and reframing perceptions (Smith, McAuliffe, & Rippard 2014). Tomlinson-Clarke and Clarke (2010) report that immersion in another culture heightens one's cultural awareness and encourages examining thoughts, feelings and behaviors that might be ignored in a familiar context. Through cultural immersion, participants are allowed to have meaningful, direct cross-cultural interactions, increasing the likelihood of developing cultural understanding and empathy (Tomlinson-Clarke & Clarke, 2010).

Chapter 2

The current study proposed to use qualitative content analysis to explore literature in the field of counseling from 1991-2016 to determine how the profession has addressed international experiences for counselors in the development and facilitation of multicultural counseling competencies. The literature related to the development of multicultural counseling competencies is vast, given the greater emphasis of it's importance over the past 25 years, however, the focus of this research is specifically related to how the literature has addressed international experiences (i.e., international immersion, study abroad) in it's relation to the development of these competencies (i.e., multicultural development, transformative learning) for those in the counseling profession (Barden & Cashwell, 2014; Burnett, Hamel, & Long, 2004; Cunningham et al., 2011; DeRicco & Sciarra, 2005; McDowell, Goessling, & Melendez, 2012; Prosek & Michel, 2016; Ribeiro & Ribeiro, 2005; Smith-Augustine, Dowden, Wiggins, & Hall, 2014; Stebleton et al., 2013; Tomlinson-Clarke & Clarke, 2010). The purpose of this content analysis was to determine if and how the counseling profession uses transformative learning experiences in counselor preparation. In this section, I have described content analysis as the research design method for examining the impact international experience has on transformative learning and the development of MCCs. This section includes a presentation of the research methodology emphasizing the data collection process, inclusionary criteria and the process of data analysis.

Content Analysis

This study implemented the use of qualitative content analysis, as it is an effective approach in exploring important content within a variety of texts (Buboltz, Miller, & Williams, 1999). According to Barrio-Minton, Morris, and Yaites (2014), content analysis provides a method of illuminating developments within a discipline. In addition, objectives of content analysis include examining professional trends, gaps in the literature, and recommendations for future research (Berrios & Lucca, 2006). More specifically, content analysis can be used to examine trends and patterns in documents (Stemler, 2001), which was the intended use of this design for the current study. Content analysis was appropriate for this study, as the objectives were to examine trends, gaps in the literature, and recommendations for future research within the counseling literature as they relate to the transformative learning process associated with international experiences and the development of multicultural counseling competencies.

Purpose

The aim of this content analysis was to examine: the extent to which the counseling literature focuses on international experiences in counselor education programs; the extent to which the outcomes of literature on international travel are applicable to multicultural development; and the nature of the implications and proposed recommendations for future research regarding international experiences and the development of multicultural counseling competencies through transformative learning. It's important to understand how international experiences, which have been found to facilitate multicultural learning, development and competency (Barden & Cashwell, 2014; Cunningham et al., 2011; DeRicco & Sciarra, 2005; McDowell, Goessling, & Melendez, 2012; Prosek & Michel, 2016; Ribeiro & Ribeiro, 2005) have been addressed

in literature related to the counseling profession, especially if these experiences can lead to increasing the efficacy in which counselors-in-training develop these competencies.

Data Collection

This study was conducted to provide data from a thorough content analysis of top counseling journals to determine trends in the professional counseling literature that addressed multicultural counseling development through international experiences in counselor education programs. The initial step in this content analysis was to decide an appropriate timeframe for collecting data. 1991 was chosen as a starting point due to the an increase in awareness and focus on the importance of multiculturalism in the counseling profession as the result of Pederson's (1991) work referring to multicultural practice as the 4th force of counseling. Following the identification of a timeframe for data collection, journals were selected for targeted inclusion. Using Berrios and Lucca's (2006) data collection method, the criteria for inclusion requires that articles must (a) have a diverse scope (i.e., general, specialized, clinical, academic) and (b) have a wide circulation. Journals were selected because of their influence and accessibility to counseling professionals. The following twenty-two journals are available online to current American Counseling Association (ACA) and ACA division members through the Wiley Online Library. Journal content is digitized back to Volume 1, Issue 1, for each of the twenty-two journals. Current ACA and division members have free electronic access to these journals, as well as the digital archive.

Journal of Counseling & Development (JCD) is the official publication of the American Counseling Association (ACA) and is disseminated to all ACA members. *JCD* is published four times a year and includes practice, theory and research articles across 20

various specialty areas and work settings. Circulation for *JCD* began in 1984 and the acceptance rate is 14% (Cabell's Directory, 2014).

Adulthood Journal is the official journal of the Association for Adult Development and Aging (AADA). *Adulthood Journal* is published twice a year and is disseminated to all AADA members. Circulation for *Adulthood Journal* began in 1999 and the acceptance rate for is 45% (Cabell's Directory, 2014).

The Career Development Quarterly (CDQ) is the official journal of the National Career Development Association (NCDA). *CDQ* is published four times a year and is disseminated to all NCDA members. Circulation for *CDQ* began in 1986 and the acceptance rate is 20% (Cabell's Directory, 2014).

Counseling and Values (CVJ) is the official journal of the Association for Spiritual, Ethical, and Religious Values in Counseling (ASERVIC). *CVJ* is published twice a year and is disseminated to all ASERVIC members. Circulation for *CVJ* began in 1973 and the acceptance rate is 15% (Cabell's Directory, 2014).

Counselor Education and Supervision (CES) is the official publication of the Association for Counselor Education and Supervision (ACES). *CES* is published four times a year and is disseminated to all ACES members. Circulation for *CES* began in 1961 and the acceptance rate is 20% (Cabell's Directory, 2014).

Journal of Addictions & Offender Counseling (JAOC) is the official journal of the International Association of Addictions and Offender Counselors (IAAOC). *JAOC* is published twice a year and is disseminated to all IAAOC members. Circulation for *JAOC* began in 1990 and the acceptance rate is 35% (Cabell's Directory, 2014).

Journal of College Counseling (JCC) is the official journal of the American College Counseling Association (ACCA). *JCC* is published three times a year and is disseminated to all ACCA members. Circulation for *JCC* began in 1998 and the acceptance rate is 18% (Cabell's Directory, 2014).

Journal of Employment Counseling (JEC) is the official journal of the National Employment Counseling Association (NECA). *JEC* is published four times a year and is disseminated to all NECA members. Circulation for *JEC* began in 1964 and the acceptance rate is 40% (Cabell's Directory, 2014).

Journal of Humanistic Counseling (JHC) is the official journal of the Association of Humanistic Counseling (AHC). *JHC* is published three times a year and is disseminated to all AHC members. Circulation for *JHC* began in 2011 and the acceptance rate is 15% (Cabell's Directory, 2014).

Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development (JMCD) is the official journal of the Association for Multicultural Counseling and Development (AMCD). *JMCD* is published four times a year and is disseminated to all AMCD members. Circulation for *JMCD* began in 1985 and the acceptance rate is 13% (Cabell's Directory, 2014).

Counseling Outcome Research and Evaluation (CORE) and *Measurement and Evaluation in Counseling and Development (MECD)* are the official journals of the Association for Assessment and Research in Counseling (AARC). *CORE* is published twice a year and provides counseling professionals with outcome research and program evaluation practices for work with individuals across the lifespan. Circulation for *CORE* began in 2010 and the acceptance rate is not reported. *MECD* is published four times a

year and provides implications for the counseling field and practitioners in assessment, measurement, and evaluation. Circulation for *MECD* began in 1968 and the acceptance rate is 14-15% (Cabell's Directory, 2014). Both journals are disseminated to all AARC members.

The Family Journal (TFJ) is the official journal of the International Association of Marriage and Family Counselors (IAMFC). *TFJ* is published four times a year and is disseminated to all IAMFC members. Circulation for *TFJ* began in 1993 and the acceptance rate is 38% (Cabell's Directory, 2017).

Journal of Child and Adolescent Counseling (JCAC) is the official journal of the Association for Child and Adolescent Counseling (ACAC). *JCAC* is published twice a year and is disseminated to all ACAC members. Circulation for *JCAC* began in 2015 and the acceptance rate is not reported.

Journal of Creativity in Mental Health (JCMH) is the official journal of the Association for Creativity in Counseling (ACC). *JCMH* is published four times a year and is disseminated to all ACC members. Circulation for *JCMH* began in 2005 and the acceptance rate is 50% (Cabell's Directory, 2014).

Journal of LGBT Issues in Counseling is the official journal of the Association for Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual and Transgender Issues in Counseling (ALGBTIC). The *Journal of LGBT Issues in Counseling* is published four times a year and is disseminated to all ALGBTIC members. Circulation for the *Journal of LGBT Issues in Counseling* began in 2006 and the acceptance rate is 50% (Cabell's Directory, 2014).

Journal of Mental Health Counseling (JMHC) is the official journal of the American Mental Health Counselors Association (AMHCA). *JMHC* is published four

times a year and is disseminated to all AMHCA members. Circulation for *JMHC* began in 1979 and the acceptance rate is 20% (Cabell's Directory, 2014).

Journal of Military and Government Counseling (JMGC) is the official journal of the Military and Government Counseling Association (MGCA). *JMGC* is published three times a year and is disseminated to all MGCA members. Circulation for *JMGC* began in 2013 and the acceptance rate is not reported.

Journal for Social Action in Counseling and Psychology (JSACP) is the official journal of Counselors for Social Justice (CSJ). *JSACP* is published up to three times a year and is disseminated to all CSJ members. Circulation for *JSACP* began in 2007 and the acceptance rate is not reported.

Journal for Specialists in Group Work (JSGW) is the official journal of the Association for Specialists in Group Work (ASGW). *JSGW* is published four times a year and is disseminated to all ASGW members. Circulation for *JSGW* began in 1981 and the acceptance rate is 53% (Cabell's Directory, 2014).

Professional School Counseling is the official journal of the American School Counselor Association (ASCA). *Professional School Counseling* is published four times a year and is disseminated to all ASCA members. Circulation for *Professional School Counseling* began in 1998 and the acceptance rate is 11-13% (Cabell's Directory, 2014).

Rehabilitation Counseling Bulletin (RCB) is the official publication of the American Rehabilitation Counseling Association (ARCA). *RCB* is published four times a year and is disseminated to all ARCA members. Circulation for *RCB* began in 1999 and the acceptance rate is 21-30% (Cabell's Directory, 2014).

Trustworthiness

As the primary researcher for this study, I contacted my university's institutional review board and was informed that I did not need to submit a protocol for review in this study, as human subjects were not included. It is, however, important to note my previous personal history with international experiences, where I have been both a student participant in a three-month study abroad program and a graduate teaching assistant in a three-month study abroad program. A number of procedures were implemented in order to establish trustworthiness for this study.

According to Neuendorf (2002), reliability is paramount to a content analysis research study. When human coders are used in content analysis, reliability is translated to intercoder reliability, or the level of agreement between two or more coders. Stability (i.e., intra-rater reliability) and reproducibility (i.e., inter-rater reliability) are two distinct types of designs for reliability tests used in content analysis and both were used for this study. Stability is the degree to which a process is unchanging over time and requires a test-retest procedure (Potter & Levine-Donnerstein, 1999). To achieve stability (i.e., intra-rater reliability), the primary researcher coded the data collected using the identified coding procedure for this study and two weeks after the initial coding procedure, recoded 25% of the data collected. If later coding judgments matched earlier coding judgments, the coding for this study can be considered stable (Mackey & Gass, 2005; Potter & Levine-Donnerstein, 1999). Reproducibility is the degree to which a process can be recreated under varying circumstances using different coders and requires a test-retest procedure where the same content is analyzed by different coders, each coding the set of content once (Potter & Levine-Donnerstein, 1999). To achieve reproducibility (i.e., inter-rater reliability), an Auburn University Counselor Education and Supervision doctoral

student was recruited to analyze 25% of the data collected, selected at random, using the study's identified coding procedure. The criteria for agreement between coders was established using the percentage agreement formula of $PA = A/n \times 100$, where PA = percentage agreement, A = number of agreements, and n = number of segments coded. Scores above 80% is generally acceptable in establishing reproducibility but allows for more disagreement for lower values (Neuendorf, 2002). If the recruited coder and primary researcher's coding patterns met the 80% level of agreement, the coding for this study can be considered reproducible (Potter & Levine-Donnerstein, 1999).

In research methodology, validity refers to the extent to which an empirical measure adequately reflects what can be agreed upon as the real meaning of the study (Neuendorf, 2002). To ensure validity of a content analysis coding process, the use of an external auditor can be implemented (Creswell, 2012). For this study, I recruited an Auburn University Counselor Education and Supervision doctoral student to serve as an external auditor. This student was a different individual from the doctoral student recruited to serve as an additional coder for establishing reproducibility. The external auditor was asked to provide feedback on the inclusionary criteria and appropriateness of the data collected for this study. This student also reviewed the codebook to ensure that coding was not the result of personal research bias. All feedback and correspondence between the primary researcher and recruited individuals is recorded in the appendices of this study.

Data Analysis

This content analysis reviewed the twenty-two ACA and ACA division-published counseling journals, as available on counseling.org. As previously mentioned, the final

list of journals included *JCD*, *Adultspan Journal*, *CDQ*, *CVJ*, *CES*, *JAOC*, *JCC*, *JEC*, *JHC*, *JMCD*, *CORE*, *MECD*, *TFJ*, *JCAC*, *JCMH*, *Journal of LGBT Issues in Counseling*, *JMHC*, *JMGC*, *JSACP*, *JSGW*, *Professional School Counseling*, and *RCB*. In addition to selecting these 22 counseling journals, a list of keywords related to international experiences and multicultural development were developed using an a priori design. Neuendorf (2002) recommended the use of research questions to create and operationalize definitions or keywords through an a priori framework. For the purpose of this study, “international experiences” was defined by four keywords that include: *immersion*, *international service learning*, *international travel*, and *study abroad*.

To understand the extent to which the counseling literature has focused on international experiences in counselor education programs, it is important to add specificity to the term “international experiences.” *Immersion* can be defined as opportunities that engage individuals in meaningful, direct cross-cultural interactions with others (Tomlinson-Clarke & Clarke, 2010). *International service learning* combines classroom instruction and community service in a foreign environment through collaboration with indigenous individuals (Burnett et al., 2004; Smith-Augustine et al., 2014). *International travel* can be defined as individuals or groups traveling abroad for reasons that may include formal and informal educational, work-related, volunteer, religious, cross-cultural, and/or recreational experiences (Stebbleton et al., 2013). *Study abroad* is the participation in a college or university travel program in which students participate alongside individuals from their native country, host country, both native and host country, or that involves a thematic focus, training or study project (Williamson, 2008).

These identified keywords were searched in the online database of all 22 counseling journals using Academic Search Premier, Education Resources Information Center (ERIC), and Wiley-Blackwell Journals. These databases contain extensive literature in the fields of counseling and counselor education. The usefulness of these resources allowed for accessible means to collect literature from the aforementioned counseling journals. If a journal could not be found through the utilization of Auburn University's online database, the missing journal's publication abstracts from 1991 to 2016 were reviewed through the journal's website. If journal publications could not be accessed electronically, the publication was requested through Auburn University's interlibrary loan program.

After counseling articles were identified, criteria were developed to determine the relevance of the articles to international experiences and multicultural development. Articles that did not include international experiences in counselor education programs as the primary focus were excluded from further review. For example, articles that focused on immersion or service learning experiences in counselor education programs within the United States did not meet the identified inclusionary criteria.

For this content analysis, only full-length articles were included. Results that included book reviews, interviews or announcements were excluded from this study. When publications were selected, they were identified as *research* or *nonresearch* (i.e., theoretical or conceptual article). For this content analysis, a research article is identified as an empirical article in which data were actively collected and analyzed. Further analysis of identified research articles relevant to international experiences and multicultural development was conducted for research design and categorized as

qualitative, quantitative or mixed methods. For this study, a qualitative design is one in which descriptive textual analysis was present, whereas a quantitative design is one in which data analysis relied on statistics. A *mixed methods* design is one in which both qualitative and quantitative approaches were used in research analysis. Additionally, the identified publications were analyzed for journal affiliation, authorship, and author affiliation. Finally, identified articles were analyzed for content and emerging themes. An audit trail is recorded in the appendices section to document all procedural steps of the data collection and analysis of this study. The use of an audit trail provides an accurate reflection of the quality of a qualitative research study and allows for a clear understanding of the procedures, decision-making, and findings of the researcher (Akkerman, Admiraal, Brekelmans, & Oost, 2006; Koch, 2006). Additionally, a record will be kept of excluded articles in the appendices section of this study.

Summary

This content analysis aimed to explore how the counseling profession has addressed international travel for counselors as a transformative learning experience in developing multicultural counseling competencies. Additionally, if the literature discussed the components of international travel that impact a counselor trainees' learning and development of multicultural competences, this study examined implications for counselor educators and the recommendations made for future research regarding international experiences in counselor education and the development of MCCs through transformative learning. As mentioned throughout this section, the selection, examination, review and analysis of the literature relevant to this study was accomplished through a qualitative design of content analysis. Not only was the literature reviewed to

understand how the counseling profession has addressed international experiences as a transformative learning process, but through content analysis, gaps in the literature were identified, which allowed for the proposal of recommendations for future research regarding this topic in the counseling profession.

Chapter 3

This study consisted of a qualitative content analysis of the top twenty-two American Counseling Association (ACA) and division's journals from the years 1991-2016. The purpose of this content analysis was to examine: the extent to which the counseling literature has focused on international experiences in counselor education programs; the extent to which the outcomes of literature on international travel were applicable to multicultural development; and the nature of the implications and proposed recommendations for future research regarding international experiences and the development of multicultural counseling competencies through transformative learning. Following an exhaustive search of the counseling literature, findings of this content analysis suggested that there are few published articles ($n = 8$) that address international experiences for counselors in the development and facilitation of multicultural counseling competencies. Only 18.2% ($n = 4$) of the top counseling journals contained published content on international experiences in counselor education over the past 25 years. Six themes were identified during the analysis of publication content: (1) critical reflection, (2) cultural interaction, (3) cultural sensitivity, (4) relationships, (5) disorienting dilemma, and (6) critical consciousness. All eight publications analyzed for this study encompassed at least one of the six themes. Furthermore, implications and proposed recommendations for future research regarding international experiences and the development of multicultural counseling competencies through transformative learning were examined and identified.

Keywords

Utilizing an a priori design, four keywords were developed from the study's research questions to better encapsulate international experiences. Keywords included: *immersion*, *international service learning*, *international travel*, and *study abroad*. *Immersion* can be defined as opportunities that engage individuals in meaningful, direct cross-cultural interactions with others (Tomlinson-Clarke & Clarke, 2010). *International service learning* combines classroom instruction and community service in a foreign environment through collaboration with indigenous individuals (Burnett et al., 2004; Smith-Augustine et al., 2014). *International travel* can be defined as individuals or groups traveling abroad for reasons that may include formal and informal educational, work-related, volunteer, religious, cross-cultural, and/or recreational experiences (Stebbleton et al., 2013). Finally, *study abroad* is the participation in a college or university travel program in which students participate alongside individuals from their native country, host country, both native and host country, or that involves a thematic focus, training or study project (Williamson, 2008).

The key words *immersion*, *international service learning*, *international travel*, and *study abroad* were utilized to conduct a thorough content analysis of the top twenty-two American Counseling Association (ACA) and division's journals from the years 1991-2016. The ACA and division's journals included: *The Journal of Counseling & Development (JCD)*, *Adultspan Journal*, *The Career Development Quarterly (CDQ)*, *Counseling and Values (CVJ)*, *Counselor Education and Supervision (CES)*, *The Journal of Addictions & Offender Counseling (JAOC)*, *The Journal of College Counseling (JCC)*, *The Journal of Employment Counseling (JEC)*, *The Journal of Humanistic Counseling*

(JHC), *The Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development (JMCD)*, *Counseling Outcome Research and Evaluation (CORE)*, *Measurement and Evaluation in Counseling and Development (MECD)*, *The Family Journal (TFJ)*, *The Journal of Child and Adolescent Counseling (JCAC)*, *The Journal of Creativity in Mental Health (JCMH)*, *The Journal of LGBT Issues in Counseling*, *The Journal of Mental Health Counseling (JMHC)*, *The Journal of Military and Government Counseling (JMGC)*, *The Journal for Social Action in Counseling and Psychology (JSACP)*, *The Journal for Specialists in Group Work (JSGW)*, *Professional School Counseling*, and *The Rehabilitation Counseling Bulletin (RCB)*.

Three journals (i.e., *Journal of Child and Adolescent Counseling*, *Journal of Military and Government Counseling*, and *Journal for Social Action in Counseling and Psychology*) were not available using the selected online databases, therefore, were surveyed through the journal's respective online websites. The researcher thoroughly examined each journal article's title and abstract from 1991-2016 and no publications relevant to international experiences in counselor education programs resulted from *JCAC*, *JMGC*, or *JSACP*.

In total, utilizing *immersion*, *international service learning*, *international travel*, and *study abroad* as keywords to investigate the counseling literature from 1991-2016 resulted in 39 peer-reviewed publications. Of the 39 resulting publications, 76.9% (n = 30) resulted from the keyword *immersion*, 2.6% (n = 1) resulted from the keyword *international service learning*, 2.6% (n = 1) resulted from the keyword *international travel*, and 28.2% (n = 11) resulted from the keyword *study abroad*.

Excluded Publications

Criteria were developed to determine the relevance of resulting publications to international experiences in counselor education programs. Publications were excluded if the primary focus did not include international experiences in counselor education programs. Additionally, only full-length articles met inclusionary criteria. For example, results that included book reviews, interviews, or announcements were excluded from this study. Following examination of each resulting publication's abstract and content for exclusionary criteria, 79.5% (n = 31) were excluded. 64.1% (n = 25) of the resulting publications were excluded because the primary focus did not include an international experience (e.g., implementation of immersion experiences within the United States, racial identity development, etc.). 12.8% (n = 5) of resulting publications were excluded, as the focal point did not pertain to international experiences in counselor education programs (e.g., international immersion experiences amongst a general student population, international immersion experiences amongst adult learners across disciplines, etc.). Finally, 2.6% (n = 1) of the resulting publications were excluded because it was not a full-length article (e.g., book review). Excluded publications are noted in the appendices of this study. Rationale for exclusion is also included.

For the purpose of this study, no articles that addressed international experiences in counselor education programs were published in the *Journal of Counseling & Development (JCD)*, *Adultspan Journal*, *Career Development Quarterly (CDQ)*, *Counseling & Values (CVJ)*, *Journal of Addictions and Offenders Counseling (JAOC)*, *Journal of College Counseling (JCC)*, *Journal of Employment Counseling (JEC)*, *Journal of Humanistic Counseling (JHC)*, *Counseling Outcome Research and Evaluation (CORE)*, *Measurement and Evaluation in Counseling and Development (MECD)*,

Journal of Child and Adolescent Counseling (JCAC), Journal of Creativity in Mental Health (JCMH), Journal of LGBT Issues in Counseling, Journal of Mental Health Counseling (JMHC), Journal of Military and Government Counseling (JMGC), Journal for Social Action in Counseling and Psychology (JSACP), Professional School Counseling, and the Rehabilitation Counseling Bulletin (RCB).

Table 1

Keyword Frequency In Collected Publications Before Exclusion (N=39)

Keyword	Total articles (N=39)	Excluded Publications	Remaining 8 Publications
Immersion	N=30 (76.9%)	N=23	N=7 (87.5%)
International Service Learning	N=1 (2.6%)	N=0	N=1 (12.5%)
International Travel	N=1 (2.6%)	N=1	N=0
Study Abroad	N=11 (28.2%)	N=8	N=3 (37.5%)

Note. Some publications were yielded as the result of more than one keyword during data collection, thus percentages exceed 100%

Journal Affiliation

Eight publications met inclusionary criteria for further content analysis. 37.5% (n = 3) of the resulting articles were published in *Counselor Education and Supervision (CES)*. *CES* is the official publication of the Association for Counselor Education and Supervision (ACES). *CES* is published four times a year and is disseminated to all ACES members. The acceptance rate for *CES* is 20% (Cabell’s Directory, 2014). 37.5% (n = 3) of the resulting articles were published in the *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development (JMCD)*. *JMCD* is the official journal of the Association for Multicultural Counseling and Development (AMCD). *JMCD* is published four times a year and is disseminated to all AMCD members. The acceptance rate for *JMCD* is 13% (Cabell’s

Directory, 2014). 12.5% (n = 1) of the resulting articles were published in *The Family Journal (TFJ)*. *TFJ* is the official journal of the International Association of Marriage and Family Counselors (IAMFC). *TFJ* is published four times a year and is disseminated to all IAMFC members. The acceptance rate for *TFJ* is 38% (Cabell's Directory, 2017). Finally, 12.5% (n = 1) of the resulting articles were published in the *Journal for Specialists in Group Work (JSGW)*. *JSGW* is the official journal of the Association for Specialists in Group Work (ASGW). *JSGW* is published four times a year and is disseminated to all ASGW members. The acceptance rate for *JSGW* is 53% (Cabell's Directory, 2014).

Of the eight publications that met inclusionary criteria for the purpose of this qualitative content analysis, none of the resulting journal articles were published before the year 2005. 12.5% (n = 1) of the resulting articles were published in 2005, 12.5% (n = 1) were published in 2009, 12.5% (n = 1) were published in 2010, 25% (n = 2) were published in 2014, and 37.5% (n = 3) were published in 2015.

Research Design

Further analysis for this study included analysis of the resulting publication's research design. Of the eight resulting publications, 62.5% (n = 5) of publications were coded as research articles (i.e., quantitative, qualitative, or mixed methods). More specifically, 50% (n = 4) of the resulting publications were coded as qualitative research studies and 12.5% (n = 1) were coded as a quantitative research study. The remaining 37.5% (n = 3) of the resulting publications were coded as nonresearch articles (i.e., theoretical or conceptual). More specifically, the three publications coded as nonresearch articles were coded as conceptual publications.

Table 2

Overview of Counseling Journals That Addressed International Experiences in Counselor Education

Journal; Acceptance Rate	Year	Author(s)	Design
CES; 20%	2015	Shannonhouse, Barden, & Mobley	Research (Qualitative)
CES; 20%	2014	Smith, McAuliffe, & Rippard	Research (Qualitative)
CES; 20%	2005	Alexander, Kruczek, & Ponterotto	Conceptual
JMCD; 13%	2015	Choi, VanVoorhis, & Ellenwood	Research (Qualitative)
JMCD; 13%	2014	Barden & Cashwell	Research (Qualitative)
JMCD; 13%	2010	Tomlinson-Clarke & Clarke	Conceptual
JSGW; 53%	2015	Barden, Shannonhouse, & Mobley	Research (Quantitative)
TFJ; 38%	2009	Canfield, Low, & Hovestadt	Conceptual

Note. CES = Counselor Education and Supervision; JMCD = Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development; TFJ = The Family Journal; JSGW = Journal for Specialists in Group Work

Authorship and Affiliation

Of the eight research studies and conceptual articles included in this qualitative content analysis, 25% (n = 2) of the publications were co-authored by two researchers and 75% (n = 6) of the publications were co-authored by three researchers. At the time of publication, authors held ten various professional designations (i.e., doctoral student, adjunct assistant professor, clinical professor, assistant professor, associate professor, full

professor, program coordinator, program director, senior director of strategic alliances and outreach, and vice president of student affairs). Additionally, at the time of publication, authors were affiliated with 13 various institutions.

Laura Shannonhouse was co-author for 25% ($n = 2$) of the publications included in this qualitative content analysis. She was first author for the publication, “Qualitative outcomes of a homestay immersion with critical reflection,” (2015). At the time of publication, Shannonhouse served as an assistant professor at Georgia State University in the Department of Counseling and Psychological Services. For the publication with which Shannonhouse served as second author, “International cultural immersion: Assessing the influence of a group intervention on intercultural sensitivity for counselor trainees,” (2015), she served as an assistant professor at the University of Maine in the Department of Teaching and Counselor Education. Shannonhouse currently remains at Georgia State University as an assistant professor.

Sejal M. Barden was co-author for 37.5% ($n = 3$) of the publications included in this study. She was first author for two publications: “International immersion in counselor education: A consensual qualitative research investigation,” (2014), and “International cultural immersion: Assessing the influence of a group intervention on cultural sensitivity for counselor trainees,” (2015). Barden served as second author for the publication, “Qualitative outcomes of a homestay immersion with critical reflection,” (2015). At the time of publication for all three articles, she served as an assistant professor at the University of Central Florida in the Department of Child, Family, and Community Sciences. Barden currently remains at the University of Central Florida as an assistant professor.

Keith A. Mobley was co-author for 25% (n = 2) of the publications included in this study. He was third author for two publications, “Qualitative outcomes of a homestay immersion with critical reflection,” (2015), and “International cultural immersion: Assessing the influence of a group intervention on cultural sensitivity for counselor trainees,” (2015). At the time of both publications, Mobley served as a clinical professor at the University of North Carolina at Greensboro in the Department of Counseling and Educational Development. Mobley currently remains at the University of North Carolina at Greensboro as a clinical professor and is the clinic director of the Nicholas A. Vacc Counseling and Consulting Clinic.

Charlene M. Alexander was co-author for 12.5% (n = 1) of the publications included in this study. She was first author for the publication, “ Building multicultural counseling competencies in school counselor trainees: An international immersion experience,” (2005). At the time of publication, Alexander served as an associate professor at Ball State University in the Department of Counseling Psychology and Guidance Services. Alexander currently remains at Ball State University and serves as the associate provost for diversity and full professor of counseling psychology.

Theresa Kruczek was co-author for 12.5% (n = 1) of the publications included in this study. She was second author for the publication, “ Building multicultural counseling competencies in school counselor trainees: An international immersion experience,” (2005). At the time of publication, Kruczek served as an associate professor at Ball State University in the Department of Counseling Psychology and Guidance Services. Kruczek currently serves as the interim chairperson of the Department of Educational Studies at Ball State University.

Joseph G. Ponterotto was co-author for 12.5% (n = 1) of the publications included in this study. He was third author for the publication, “ Building multicultural counseling competencies in school counselor trainees: An international immersion experience,” (2005). At the time of publication, Ponterotto served as mental health counseling program coordinator at Fordham University in the Department of Counseling and Counseling Psychology. Ponterotto remains at Fordham University, serving as the program coordinator for mental health counseling.

Jayne E. Smith was co-author for 12.5% (n = 1) of the publications included in this study. She was first author for the publication, “Counseling students’ transformative learning through a study abroad curriculum,” (2014). At the time of publication, Smith served as an adjunct assistant professor at Old Dominion University in the Department of Counseling and Human Services. Smith currently serves as the director of counseling services at John Muir Charter Schools in Grass Valley, California.

Garrett McAuliffe was co-author for 12.5% (n = 1) of the publications included in this study. He was second author for the publication, “Counseling students’ transformative learning through a study abroad curriculum,” (2014). At the time of publication, McAuliffe served as a full professor at Old Dominion University in the Department of Counseling and Human Services. McAuliffe currently remains at Old Dominion University as a full professor.

Kelly S. Rippard was co-author for 12.5% (n = 1) of the publications included in this study. She was third author for the publication, “Counseling students’ transformative learning through a study abroad curriculum,” (2014). At the time of publication, Rippard was a doctoral student at Old Dominion University in the Department of Counseling and

Human Services. Rippard currently remains at Old Dominion University and serves as a teaching and learning lecturer.

Kyoung Mi Choi was co-author for 12.5% (n = 1) of the publications included in this study. She was first author for the publication, “Enhancing critical consciousness through a cross-cultural immersion experience in south africa,” (2015). At the time of publication, Choi served as an assistant professor at California State University, Fresno in the Department of Counselor Education and Rehabilitation. Choi currently remains at Fresno State University as an assistant professor.

Richard W. VanVoorhis was co-author for 12.5% (n = 1) of the publications included in this study. He was second author for the publication, “Enhancing critical consciousness through a cross-cultural immersion experience in south africa,” (2015). At the time of publication, VanVoorhis served as the school psychology graduate program coordinator at Youngstown State University in the Department of Counseling, Special Education, and School Psychology. VanVoorhis currently remains at Youngstown State University.

Audrey E. Ellenwood was co-author for 12.5% (n = 1) of the publications included in this study. She was third author for the publication, “Enhancing critical consciousness through a cross-cultural immersion experience in south africa,” (2015). At the time of publication, Ellenwood served as the school psychology graduate program director at Youngstown State University in the Department of Counseling, Special Education, and School Psychology. Ellenwood has retired from Youngstown State University and currently serves as the director of a 5013c charity, *Project Learning Around the World*.

Saundra M. Tomlinson-Clarke was co-author for 12.5% (n = 1) of the publications included in this study. She was first author for the publication, “Culturally focused community-centered service learning: An international cultural immersion experience,” (2010). At the time of publication, Tomlinson-Clarke served as a full professor at Rutgers, The State University of New Jersey in the Department of Educational Psychology. Tomlinson-Clarke currently remains at Rutgers University as a full professor.

Darren Clarke was co-author for 12.5% (n = 1) of the publications included in this study. He was second author for the publication, “Culturally focused community-centered service learning: An international cultural immersion experience,” (2010). At the time of publication, Clarke served as senior director of strategic alliances and outreach at Rutgers, The State University of New Jersey in the Rutgers Continuing Education and Global Programs. Clarke currently remains at Rutgers University as senior director of strategic alliances and outreach.

Craig S. Cashwell was co-author for 12.5% (n = 1) of the publications included in this study. He was second author for the publication, “International immersion in counselor education: A consensual qualitative research investigation,” (2014). At the time of publication, Cashwell served as a full professor at the University of North Carolina at Greensboro in the Department of Counseling and Educational Development. Cashwell currently remains at the University of North Carolina Greensboro, serving as a full professor.

Brian S. Canfield was co-author for 12.5% (n = 1) of the publications included in this study. He was first author for the publication, “Cultural immersion as a learning

method for expanding intercultural competencies,” (2009). At the time of publication, Canfield served as the vice president for academic affairs at Southern Arkansas University. Canfield currently runs the Louisiana Couples Institute, a practice that specializes in marriage counseling and couples therapy.

Lori Low was co-author for 12.5% (n = 1) of the publications included in this study. She was second author for the publication, “Cultural immersion as a learning method for expanding intercultural competencies,” (2009). At the time of publication, Low served as an assistant professor at the University of San Diego in the Department of Counseling.

Alan Hovestadt was co-author for 12.5% (n = 1) of the publications included in this study. He was third author for the publication, “Cultural immersion as a learning method for expanding intercultural competencies,” (2009). At the time of publication, Hovestadt served as the program coordinator of marriage, couple and family counseling at Western Michigan University in the Department of Counselor Education and Counseling Psychology. Hovestadt currently remains at Western Michigan University as the program coordinator of marriage, couple and family counseling.

Table 3

Authorship

Author	Lead	Second	Third	Total
Sejal M. Barden	N = 2	N = 1	N = 0	N = 3
Keith A. Mobley	N = 0	N = 0	N = 2	N = 2
Laura Shannonhouse	N = 1	N = 1	N = 0	N = 2
Charlene M. Alexander	N = 1	N = 0	N = 0	N = 1
Brian S. Canfield	N = 1	N = 0	N = 0	N = 1
Kyoung Mi Choi	N = 1	N = 0	N = 0	N = 1
Jayne E. Smith	N = 1	N = 0	N = 0	N = 1
Saundra M. Tomlinson-Clarke	N = 1	N = 0	N = 0	N = 1
Craig S. Cashwell	N = 0	N = 1	N = 0	N = 1
Darren Clarke	N = 0	N = 1	N = 0	N = 1
Theresa Kruczek	N = 0	N = 1	N = 0	N = 1
Lori Low	N = 0	N = 1	N = 0	N = 1
Garrett McAuliffe	N = 0	N = 1	N = 0	N = 1
Richard W. VanVoorhis	N = 0	N = 1	N = 0	N = 1
Audrey E. Ellenwood	N = 0	N = 0	N = 1	N = 1
Alan Hovestadt	N = 0	N = 0	N = 1	N = 1
Joseph G. Ponterotto	N = 0	N = 0	N = 1	N = 1
Kelly S. Rippard	N = 0	N = 0	N = 1	N = 1

In summary, examination of the author's professional designation at the time of publication revealed that 5.6% (n = 1) of the authors were a doctoral student, 5.6% (n = 1) of the authors were an adjunct assistant professor, 5.6% (n = 1) of the authors were a clinical professor, 22.2% (n = 4) of the authors were assistant professors, 11.1% (n = 2) of the authors were associate professors, 16.7% (n = 3) of the authors were full professors, 16.7% (n = 3) of the authors were program coordinators, 5.6% (n = 1) of the authors were a program director, 5.6% (n = 1) of the authors were a senior director for strategic alliances and outreach, and 5.6% (n = 1) of the authors were a vice president of student affairs.

Table 4

Author Designation

Rank	Total Authors	Designation
1	N = 4	Assistant Professor
2	N = 3	Full Professor
	N = 3	Program Coordinator
3	N = 2	Associate Professor
4	N = 1	Adjunct Assistant Professor
	N = 1	Clinical Professor
	N = 1	Doctoral Student
	N = 1	Program Director
	N = 1	Senior Director of Strategic Alliances and Outreach
	N = 1	Vice President of Academic Affairs

Note. Designation is identified for each author at the time of publication

Additionally, in regards to professional affiliation at the time publication, examination revealed that 5.6% (n = 1) of the authors were affiliated with the University of Central Florida, 11.1% (n = 2) of the authors were affiliated with the University of North Carolina at Greensboro, 11.1% (n = 2) of the authors were affiliated with Ball State University, 5.6% (n = 1) of the authors were affiliated with Fordham University, 16.7% (n = 3) of the authors were affiliated with Old Dominion University, 5.6% (n = 1) of the authors were affiliated with California State University, Fresno, 11.1% (n = 2) of the authors were affiliated with Youngstown State University, 11.1% (n = 2) of the authors were affiliated with Rutgers University, 5.6% (n = 1) of the authors were affiliated with Southern Arkansas University, 5.6% (n = 1) of the authors were affiliated with the University of San Diego, 5.6% (n = 1) of the authors were affiliated with the University of Maine, and 5.6% (n = 1) of the authors were affiliated with Western Michigan University.

Table 5

Author Affiliation

Rank	Total Authors	Affiliation
1	N = 3	Old Dominion University
2	N = 2	Ball State University
	N = 2	Rutgers University
	N = 2	University of North Carolina at Greensboro
	N = 2	Youngstown State University
3	N = 1	California State University, Fresno
	N = 1	Fordham University
	N = 1	Southern Arkansas University
	N = 1	University of Central Florida
	N = 1	University of Maine
	N = 1	University of San Diego
	N = 1	Western Michigan University

Note. Affiliation is identified for each author at the time of publication

Emergent Themes

Four of eight (50%) publications included in this qualitative content analysis were coded as qualitative research articles. The qualitative studies addressed: (a) the impact of a 3-week cultural immersion course in Central America on counselor trainees (Shannonhouse, Barden, & Mobley, 2015); (b) counseling student learning during and after a study abroad curriculum in Ireland (Smith et al., 2014); (c) the phenomenological experiences of cross-cultural immersion in South Africa among counseling master’s-level students (Choi, VanVoorhis, & Ellenwood, 2015); and (d) the impact of international immersion on counselor education students’ development and growth (Barden & Cashwell, 2014). One of eight (12.5%) publications was coded as a quantitative research article. The quantitative study (Barden, Shannonhouse, & Mobley, 2015) addressed the differences in cultural sensitivity between counselor trainees that have experienced

international immersion compared to those who have not. Three of eight (37.5%) publications were coded as conceptual articles. Alexander, Kruczek, and Ponterotto (2005) described an international cultural immersion field experience program model implemented in Trinidad and Tobago and made recommendations for counselor educators who wish to establish a similar program; Tomlinson-Clarke and Clarke (2010) described an immersion model implemented in South Africa that incorporates culturally focused community-centered service as an experiential approach; and Canfield, Low, and Hovestadt (2009) provided an overview of the development and utilization of a cultural immersion experience assignment focused on counselor trainee multicultural development through multiple formats (i.e., study abroad, traditional on-campus, and online).

Six themes were identified during the analysis of publication content: (1) critical reflection, (2) cultural interaction, (3) cultural sensitivity, (4) relationships, (5) disorienting dilemma, and (6) critical consciousness. All eight publications analyzed for this study encompassed at least one of the six themes. Frequencies of themes in order from most frequently coded to least frequently coded is as follows: (1) critical reflection (n = 202), (2) cultural interaction (n = 176), (3) cultural sensitivity (n = 84), (4) relationships (n = 72), (5) disorienting dilemma (n = 47), and (6) critical consciousness (n = 18). Themes were coded 599 times throughout the eight publications included in this qualitative content analysis.

Critical reflection describes strategies used to develop a new way of interpreting the meaning of one's experiences in order to guide future actions (Kuennen, 2015). Critical reflection was coded 202 times (33.7%) and was identified as a theme in all eight

publications (n = 8). Coding of the theme “critical reflection” was considered present with the occurrence of the following terms: reflect, reflection, process, processing, and continued thinking.

Cultural interaction describes direct engagement with local people from diverse backgrounds (Choi et al., 2015). Cultural interaction was coded 176 times (29.4%) and was identified as a theme in all eight publications (n = 8). Coding of the theme “cultural interaction” was considered present with the occurrence of the following terms: cultural engagement, engagement, interact, interaction, visits, initiated dialogue, dialogue, direct encounters, in vivo contact, communicate, and communication.

Cultural sensitivity describes being aware that cultural differences and similarities exist and have an effect on values, learning and behavior (Robinson, Bowman, Ewing, Hanna, & Lopez-De Fede, 1997). Cultural sensitivity was coded 84 times (14%) and was identified as a theme in 87.5% (n = 7) of publications. Coding of the theme “cultural sensitivity” was considered present with the occurrence of the following term: intercultural sensitivity.

Relationships describe the building of genuine connections between individuals who differ from one another as it relates to culture (Shannonhouse et al., 2015). Relationships were coded 72 times (12%) and were identified as a theme in 87.5% (n = 7) of publications. Coding of the theme “relationships” was considered present with the occurrence of the following terms: friendships, partnerships, and connections.

Disorienting dilemma describes an event where one changes their perspectives or mindsets into a more open or inclusive way of thinking in order to develop more justified beliefs to guide one’s actions (Hubbs & Brand, 2005). Disorienting dilemma was coded

47 times (7.8%) and was identified as a theme in 87.5% (n = 7) of publications. Coding of the theme “disorienting dilemma” was considered present with the occurrence of the following terms: culture shock, being “other,” discomfort, outsider, and minority.

Critical consciousness describes the core ability to reflect on one’s biases to gain a deeper understanding of complex social issues and to take action to advocate for social justice in multicultural learning (Choi et al., 2015). Critical consciousness was coded 18 times (3%) and was identified as a theme in 25% (n = 2) of publications. Critical consciousness was considered a theme due to its frequency (n = 16) in Choi et al.’s (2015) research study.

Table 6

Overview of Publications That Addressed International Experiences in Counselor Education: Content and Themes

Author(s)	Content Area	Themes	Type
Shannonhouse, Barden, & Mobley	Cultural immersion in Central America	Critical reflection, Relationships, Cultural interaction, Disorienting dilemma, and Cultural Sensitivity	Consensual Qualitative Research
Alexander, Kruczek, & Ponterotto	An international cultural immersion model	Cultural interaction, Critical reflection, Relationships, and Cultural Sensitivity	Conceptual
Smith, McAuliffe, & Rippard	Student learning during and after study abroad in Ireland	Critical reflection, Cultural interaction, Relationships, and Disorienting dilemma	Grounded Theory
Choi, VanVoorhis, & Ellenwood	Cross-cultural immersion in South Africa	Cultural interaction, Critical consciousness,	Phenomenological

		Critical reflection, Disorienting dilemma, and Cultural Sensitivity	
Tomlinson-Clarke & Clarke	A community- centered service immersion model	Cultural interaction, Critical reflection, Relationships, Disorienting dilemma, and Intercultural sensitivity	Conceptual
Barden & Cashwell	The impact of international immersion on counselor development	Critical reflection, Relationships, Cultural interaction, Disorienting dilemma, Cultural sensitivity, and Critical consciousness	Consensual Qualitative Research
Canfield, Low, & Hovestadt	A cultural immersion experience assignment	Cultural interaction, Critical reflection, Cultural sensitivity, Disorienting dilemma, and Relationships	Conceptual
Barden, Shannonhouse, & Mobley	Cultural sensitivity from international immersion	Intercultural sensitivity, Critical reflection, Cultural interaction, Relationships, and Disorienting dilemma	Quasi-Experimental

Implications

Each publication (n = 8) provided professional implications for the counseling profession. For example, two publications (25%) addressed the impracticality of international immersion for many counselor trainees and programs. Shannonhouse et al. (2015) implied that although international immersion is not realistic for all counselor trainees and programs, the multicultural development experienced by counselor-trainees in a 3-week cultural immersion course in Central America can be replicated in locally based immersion activities that are intentionally structured and provides opportunities for comprehensive, sustained immersion. Additionally, Canfield et al. (2009) not only supported the utilization of a cultural immersion experience (CIE) activity as an effective strategy to increase cultural awareness and sensitivity in counselor trainees, but also implied that a structured CIE assignment can be used across formats (i.e., traditional, study abroad and online).

Two publications (25%) addressed the importance of critical reflection in conjunction with the implementation of international experiences in counseling training programs. Shannonhouse et al. (2015) suggested that multicultural growth is fostered when facilitators make conditions favorable for students to critically reflect on their immersion experiences. Smith et al. (2014) suggested that study abroad programs with an intentional focus on social conflict, resolution, and time for reflection has the potential to strengthen counselor professional identity in terms of being social change agents.

Three publications (37.5%) emphasized the importance of direct engagement with individuals of the host country during international experiences for counseling programs. Choi et al. (2015) implied that cultural knowledge was gained through engagement with

communities and Tomlinson-Clarke and Clarke (2010) implied that these direct cross-cultural interactions expose students to cultural realities of everyday life, which facilitates the development of multicultural counseling competencies. Furthermore, Smith et al. (2014) implied that although daily seminars, cultural and historical visits, and establishing partnerships with host individuals and organizations enriches an environment that fosters transformative growth and multicultural development, they strongly emphasized the importance of opportunities for engagement with others that occurs through international experiences.

Three publications (37.5%) addressed the importance of counseling programs and trainees building meaningful relationships with members of the host country's community. Shannonhouse et al.'s (2015) study noted the impact of forming relationships with members of the host country on counselor trainee multicultural development, and Barden and Cashwell's (2014) study provided support for the sustained influence of international immersion experiences on counselor development over time. Additionally, Alexander et al.'s (2005) study supported the efficacy of a multifaceted approach that enhances the awareness of counselor trainees and has them examine how their assumptions guide their actions in clinical work. Furthermore, the authors supported the importance of developing a relationship with the host country at both personal and programmatic levels.

Finally, Barden et al. (2015) utilized a quasi-experimental research design implementing the use of the Intercultural Development Inventory (IDI) with four groups of counselor trainees ($n = 37$) who had and had not participated in an international cultural immersion course in Costa Rica. Although findings from pre- and post-

administration of the IDI between experimental and comparison groups showed little significance in intercultural development of counselor trainees, the authors noted the importance of keeping group dynamics at the forefront when planning, implementing, and debriefing from cultural immersion experiences, specifically as it relates to attending to safety issues when facilitating multicultural experiential learning.

Recommendations

Each publication (n = 8) provided recommendations for counseling professionals. For instance, five publications (62.5%) recommended that future research focus on a variety of cultural immersion components and critical factors (e.g., duration, lodging, language immersion, group size, previous experiences) that lead to multicultural development and sustained change (i.e., cultural empathy, self-awareness of biases and assumptions, and increased self-efficacy) for counselor trainees. Specifically, Shannonhouse et al. (2015) recommended exploring the most effective means of reflecting, how MCC acquisition develops throughout a cultural immersion experience, and how the relationship component impacts counselor trainee development. Barden and Cashwell (2014), Canfield et al. (2009), Barden et al. (2015), and Smith et al. (2014) all recommended that future research focus on the impact of specific transformative learning activities that are most efficient in enhancing cultural sensitivity and increasing multicultural awareness and competencies, claiming this would be useful in the development of future counselor training programs.

Six publications (75%) made programmatic recommendations for educators utilizing international travel experiences in counselor training. Shannonhouse et al. (2015), and Smith et al. (2014) recommended that counselor educators should coordinate

activities that catalyze emotional reactions and intimate communication, sustain contact with members of the host community, and strategically allocate time for guided reflection activities (e.g., journaling, group processing) and unplanned time for engagement with others. For example, daily large group guided reflections can be used to reflect on student engagement with the host community and the resulting shifts in perception of culture, changes in self-awareness, and deeper understanding of worldviews.

Additionally, the authors recommended that counselor educators facilitate large and small group activities that engage students in deepening self-knowledge about culture, privilege, power, oppression, social justice and advocacy. Barden and Cashwell (2014) suggested that counselor educators consider developing instructional strategies that allow students the feeling of being an outsider and being immersed in a culture where cultural norms are different than their own. According to the authors, creating activities where counselor trainees are outsiders and engage with diverse populations for extended periods provide them with the feeling of being outside the majority population as an important step to developing cultural empathy. Alexander et al.'s (2005) study noted that although there are no clear guidelines on how and when to implement international immersion opportunities, the authors suggested implementation after the first year of basic counseling courses but most importantly, there has to be an integrative commitment to multicultural counseling practice, even when institutional barriers exist. Choi et al.'s (2015) programming recommendations included implementing a multi-method approach (e.g., traditional courses, group discussion, cross-cultural immersion trips, community service activities) to help students learn about MCC concepts and theories in the classroom and participate in experiential learning activities so students can maximize the

learning outcomes of multicultural learning. Finally, Tomlinson-Clarke and Clarke made a number of suggestions in their conceptual article about an immersion model implemented in South Africa that incorporates culturally focused community-centered service as an experiential approach. The authors' suggestions regarding implementation of similar immersion experiences include: (a) the development of meaningful relationships and maintaining consistent contact with the host country; (b) the duration of the immersion experience must be long enough to allow for adjustment to culture shock; (c) the importance of diversity in the racial-ethnic composition of participants and group facilitators; (d) implementing pre-departure multicultural training workshops and seminars that encourage active learning and the use of reflective journaling throughout the process; and (e) debriefing throughout the international experience utilizing guided reflection, which includes allowing adequate time for the processing of feelings, thoughts and behaviors related to the experience.

Two publications (25%) made recommendations for implementing immersion activities at a local level. Choi et al. (2015) recommended that it might be beneficial for counselor educators to coordinate affordable cross-cultural immersion opportunities such as community involvement with a local subcultural group for an extended period of time, given the costly and time-consuming nature of internationally focused programs. Similarly, Alexander et al. (2005) suggested that communities within the United States could be involved in ensuring that counselor trainees have an opportunity to receive a culturally diverse practicum experience that differs significantly from the university's environment. The authors emphasized the importance of counseling students being

allowed sufficient time to be exposed to all aspects of the host community (e.g., work and leisure) during an immersion experience.

Finally, all eight (100%) publications recommended and noted the benefits of using more rigorous methodological designs in future research studies. Examples of future quantitative and mixed methods research foci included: comparison of critical factors (e.g., demographics, duration, group dynamics, previous experiences, developmental levels of cultural sensitivity) that lead to counselor trainee development (Barden et al., 2015; Shannonhouse et al., 2015); comparisons and outcome data of learning through a variety of course formats (i.e., study abroad, traditional, and online; Alexander et al., 2005; Canfield et al., 2009; Smith et al., 2014); the extent to which international immersion enhances empathy, listening skills, political-awareness, and self-awareness (Choi et al., 2015); comparison between groups who have and have not had international cultural immersion experiences (Tomlinson-Clarke & Clarke, 2010); and pre- and post-experimental designs to increase generalizability and assess the short- and long-term impact of international immersion for counselor trainees (Barden & Cashwell, 2014).

Summary

A thorough content analysis of top twenty-two American Counseling Association (ACA) and division's journals from the years 1991-2016 resulted in a total of eight publications related to international experiences for counselors in the development and facilitation of multicultural counseling competencies. Only 18.2% (n = 4) of the top 22 counseling journals contained published content on international experiences in counselor education over the past 25 years. Six overarching themes emerged in the data analysis,

including: Critical Reflection, Cultural Interaction, Cultural Sensitivity, Relationships, Disorienting Dilemma, and Critical Consciousness. Additionally, publications were examined for implications and proposed recommendations for future research regarding international experiences and the development of multicultural counseling competencies through transformative learning.

Chapter 4

This qualitative content analysis was conducted to examine: the extent to which the counseling literature has focused on international experiences in counselor education programs; the extent to which the outcomes of literature on international travel were applicable to multicultural development; and the nature of the implications and proposed recommendations for future research regarding international experiences and the development of multicultural counseling competencies through transformative learning. The results of this study indicate that there is a paucity of literature in the top counseling journals that address international experiences for counselors in the development and facilitation of multicultural counseling competencies through transformative learning. Although the literature available pertaining to international experiences in the American Counseling Association (ACA) and ACA division's journals over the past 25 years is limited, emerging themes from this study's content analysis imply that transformative learning is an impactful component of multicultural development in counselor trainees.

International Experiences in Counselor Education

As the demographics in the United States begin to reflect a population of individuals representing diverse and racial ethnic backgrounds, it is imperative that the counseling profession utilizes approaches that better prepare counselors to work effectively with those of diverse backgrounds, specifically those of an international population. The underutilization of mental health services and inadequate care provided to international populations by professional counselors beckons an increased attention

towards more effective approaches in training counseling students to work more effectively with individuals of an underserved international population. This is why the examination of how the literature has focused on international experiences in counselor education programs as a training approach is imperative to the advancement of multicultural pedagogy and practice.

In response to this inquiry, this content analysis study indicated that there is a paucity of literature in the counseling profession that focuses on international experiences for counseling students in the development and facilitation of multicultural counseling competencies through transformative learning. Of the multitude of literature produced in the top 22 ACA and ACA division's journals from the years 1991-2016, only eight publications focused on international experiences for counseling students. The literature notes the benefits of international experiences in the development of counselor trainee multicultural growth (Alexander et al., 2005; Barden & Cashwell, 2014; Barden et al., 2015; Canfield et al., 2009; Choi et al., 2015; Shannonhouse et al., 2015; Smith et al., 2014; Tomlinson-Clarke & Clarke, 2010) and it is clear that an increased attention on these international experiences in counselor training programs is needed in future publications in the counseling literature.

Transformative Learning through International Experiences

Transformative learning has been defined as a process where one changes their perspectives or mindsets into a more open or inclusive way of thinking in order to develop more justified beliefs to guide one's actions (Hubbs & Brand, 2005). Mezirow (2000) described the ten phases of the transformative process as: (1) experiencing a disorienting situation; (2) undergoing self-examination with feelings of fear, anger, guilt

or shame; (3) conducting a critical assessment of internalized assumptions; (4) recognizing others have had similar experiences; (5) exploration of options for new roles, relationships and actions; (6) planning a course of action; (7) acquiring knowledge and skills for implementing one's plans; (8) provisional trying of one's roles; (9) building competence and self-confidence in new roles and relationships; and (10) reintegrating into society with a newly defined perspective (as cited by Nohl, 2015).

The literature that focuses on international experiences in counselor training programs reflects every phase of Mezirow's (2000) transformative learning process. The six themes identified in the counseling literature through this content analysis study included: (1) disorienting dilemma, (2) critical reflection, (3) critical consciousness, (4) cultural interaction, (5) relationships and (6) cultural sensitivity.

Disorienting Dilemma

Cranton (2002) described a disorienting experience as an event that identifies a discrepancy between what an individual has always thought to be true and what has just been experienced. More specifically, a disorienting dilemma describes an event that leads to an individual changing their perspective or mindset into a more open or inclusive way of thinking in order to develop more justified beliefs to guide their actions (Hubbs & Brand, 2005). The emergence of disorienting dilemma as a theme for this study reflects the first stage of Mezirow's (2000) transformative process, *(1) experiencing a disorienting situation*. This study revealed that disorienting dilemmas experienced during an international experience, or "being an other" for sustained periods of time challenged counselor trainees' core beliefs about themselves and how they have come to view the world (Choi et al., 2015; Shannonhouse et al., 2015). Furthermore, disorienting

experiences allowed counselor trainees to transform their perspectives, which would enable them to better conceptualize their work with diverse and marginalized clients in future practice (Barden & Cashwell, 2014; Shannonhouse et al., 2015).

Critical Reflection

The emergence of critical reflection as a theme for this study reflects stages two through four of Mezirow's (2000) transformative process: *(2) undergoing self-examination with feelings of fear, anger, guilt or shame; (3) conducting a critical assessment of internalized assumptions; and (4) recognizing others have had similar experiences*. Critical reflection describes strategies used to develop a new way of interpreting the meaning of one's experiences in order to guide future actions (Kuennen, 2015). Facilitating critical reflection is an experiential approach that is often used in multicultural training (MCT) courses and encourages students to consider what cultural contexts may influence their own attitudes, behaviors, and beliefs which potentially leads to students being more reflective about the impact on their professional role (Arthur & Achenbach, 2002). Throughout the literature pertaining to international experiences in counselor training programs, critical reflection through journaling and processing activities were noted as an important experience for trainees, as it relates to multicultural development (Alexander et al., 2005; Barden & Cashwell, 2014; Barden et al., 2015; Canfield et al., 2009; Choi et al., 2015; Shannonhouse et al., 2015; Smith et al., 2014; Tomlinson-Clarke & Clarke, 2010). Intentionally structured reflection impacts student learning and allows counselor trainees opportunities to observe changes in themselves that result from international immersion experiences (Barden & Cashwell, 2014; Shannonhouse et al., 2015).

Critical Consciousness

Critical consciousness has been defined as the core ability to reflect on one's biases to gain a deeper understanding of complex social issues and taking action to advocate for social justice in multicultural learning (Choi et al., 2015). The emergence of critical consciousness as a theme for this study reflects stages five through seven of Mezirow's (2000) transformative process: *(5) exploration of options for new roles, relationships and actions; (6) planning a course of action; and (7) acquiring knowledge and skills for implementing one's plans*. According to Choi et al. (2015), an essential component of developing critical consciousness requires individuals to integrate their newfound cultural awareness into action-oriented experiences such as building cross-cultural relationships and direct cultural interactions. Barden and Cashwell (2014) claim that international immersion experiences in counselor training programs provide opportunities for students to connect with diverse cultures and explore, learn, and practice new cross-cultural skills that promote their intrapersonal development.

Cultural Interaction

For the purpose of this study, a cultural interaction describes direct engagement with local people from diverse backgrounds (Choi et al., 2015). The emergence of cultural interaction as a theme reflects the eighth stage of Mezirow's (2000) transformative process, *(8) provisional trying of one's roles*. The literature noted not only of the importance of cultural interactions in creating opportunities for disorienting experiences, critical reflection and increasing critical consciousness (Alexander et al., 2005; Shannonhouse et al., 2015; Smith et al., 2014), but how direct engagement with local people from diverse backgrounds created opportunities for counselor trainees to

engage in social action and increase cultural understanding and empathy (Choi et al., 2015; Tomlinson-Clarke & Clarke, 2010). Additionally, Barden and Cashwell (2014) claimed that the holistic experience of international immersion (i.e., cultural dissonance, critical reflection, direct engagement with diverse individuals) influences counselor trainees' future interactions with people from diverse backgrounds.

Relationships

Shannonhouse et al. (2015) described relationships as the building of genuine connections between individuals who differ from one another as it relates to culture. The identification of relationships as a theme in this study reflects the ninth stage of Mezirow's (2000) transformative learning process, *(9) building competence and self-confidence in new roles and relationships*. Similarly to cultural interactions, the development of meaningful relationships between counselor trainees and those of the international community created opportunities for experiencing cultural dissonance and undergoing critical reflection. Forming meaningful relationships with community members was also identified as the most positive critical incident for counselor trainees in Barden and Cashwell's (2014) study. Making connections with local members of the international community not only aided in the development of multicultural growth, but also encouraged counselor trainees to practice their newly formed perspectives and roles in the development of future relationships with culturally diverse individuals.

Cultural Sensitivity

The theme that reflects the final stage of Mezirow's (2000) transformative learning process, *(10) reintegrating into society with a newly defined perspective*, is cultural sensitivity. Cultural sensitivity describes the ability of being aware that cultural

differences and similarities exist and have an effect on values, learning and behavior (Robinson et al., 1997). Cultural sensitivity is an important ability for counselors to possess in order to work effectively across cultural boundaries. Literature pertaining to international experiences in counseling programs reveals that international immersion is an effective pedagogical tool in increasing cultural sensitivity (Barden & Cashwell, 2014; Barden et al., 2015; Canfield et al., 2009).

Guiffrida (2005) and Kuennen (2015) claim that for transformative learning to occur in educational settings, strategies must be implemented that facilitate a greater sense of awareness within learners and allow them to make meaning of their experiences in order to guide future action. It can be hypothesized that if international experiences in counselor training programs enable students to experience cultural dissonance, examine their frame of reference through critical reflection, and undergo transformative change, counselor trainees will reintegrate into society following their international experience with a newly defined perspective that impacts their future personal and professional actions as counselors.

Implications for Counselor Educators

Counseling graduates have reported feeling underprepared in their graduate programs to offer sufficient and effective services to diverse populations (Arthur & Achenbach, 2002; Barden & Cashwell, 2014). As demographics in the United States continue to trend towards an increase in ethnic and racial diversity (Colby & Ortman, 2015; Humbert et al., 2012), it is imperative that counselor educators continue to explore more effective approaches in training counseling students to become culturally competent professionals.

The eight articles examined in this study noted the efficacy of utilizing international experiences in counselor training programs to increase multicultural counseling competency (MCC) in counselor trainees (Alexander et al., 2005; Barden & Cashwell, 2014; Barden et al., 2015; Canfield et al., 2009; Choi et al., 2015; Shannonhouse et al., 2015; Smith et al., 2014; Tomlinson-Clarke & Clarke, 2010). International experiences for counselor trainees is effective in increasing awareness, knowledge, and reflectivity about their own cultural identity (Choi et al., 2015; Shannonhouse et al., 2015) and has been found to facilitate a process that allows trainees to move from ethnocentric viewpoints to more culturally relative conceptualizations, as international immersion experiences encourage trainees to examine their assumptions that guides their actions, attitudes and insights (Alexander et al., 2005). These international experiences have implications for clinical practice in terms of strengthening counselor self-efficacy, empathy, awareness and cultural sensitivity of contextual factors relevant to working with diverse clients (Barden & Cashwell, 2014; Canfield et al., 2009). Furthermore, Barden and Cashwell (2014) provide support that international immersion for counselor trainees have a sustained influence on multicultural development over time.

Additionally, the literature examined in this study supports that a transformative learning process is achieved through international experiences in counseling programs (Barden & Cashwell, 2014; Choi et al., 2015; Shannonhouse et al., 2015; Smith et al., 2014). Various cognitive and emotional processes (e.g., excitement, openness, connection, confusion, anxiety, etc.) experienced through international immersion play significant roles in multicultural transformative learning (Choi et al., 2015). During international experiences for counselor trainees, engaging with others and building

relationships served critical roles in fostering transformative learning. For example, building relationships through direct engagement with international community members provided opportunities for counselor trainees to personalize their understanding of ethnocentrism and emphasize the importance of becoming more culturally relativistic (Smith et al., 2014). Transformative learning is an effective method of moving students from a simple desire to serve ethnic minorities to a deeper commitment to social action and human rights (Barden & Cashwell, 2014). Without utilizing the most effective methodologies in multicultural training, counselors will continue feeling ill-prepared to work with the culturally diverse and as a result, members of international and other diverse populations will continue to receive inadequate mental health services.

Limitations

One of the primary limitations to this study is that a single researcher who had previously participated in international experiences conducted it. Although, this sole researcher was responsible for all of the data collection and analysis for the study, steps were taken to limit researcher bias. A doctoral student at Auburn University whom had had no previous history with international experiences was recruited to serve as an external auditor. The external auditor was used to ensure validity of the content analysis coding procedure. The recruited external auditor provided feedback on the inclusionary criteria and appropriateness of the data collected for this study and reviewed the codebook to ensure that coding was not the result of personal research bias. Additionally, another doctoral student at Auburn University was selected to analyze 25% ($n = 2$) of the collected data using the identified coding procedure for this study to achieve

reproducibility and ensure trustworthiness. Despite attempts to limit research bias, some may still remain.

It is important to note that the terms *immersion*, *international service learning*, *international travel*, and *study abroad* were selected for this review; it is possible that other terminology not used in this study may have yielded additional relevant publications. Furthermore, these keywords yielded 39 publications, however, the study's inclusionary criteria resulted in the exclusion of 31 (79.5%) articles. It should be noted that a number of these excluded publications likely contained information pertinent to the purpose of this study but were not examined because the participants were not identified as counseling students (e.g., adult education learners, nutritionists, etc.).

Although only eight publications related to international experiences in counselor education programs were collected by examining the top 22 ACA and ACA division's journals from 1991-2016, it is probable that the counseling profession has addressed transformative learning through international experiences in counselor training experiences in other journals related to the counseling profession, specifically internationally-focused counseling journals. Examining the literature of various counseling journals and across disciplines may have impacted and further informed the results of this study. The aforementioned limitations may have had a substantial impact on the data presented in this study.

Recommendations

The findings of this study reveal that there is a paucity of research available in the most influential and accessible journals of the counseling profession, as it relates to the utilization of transformative learning through international experiences in counselor

education programs to facilitate multicultural development. However, the available literature provides consistent recommendations across publications in regards to effectively utilizing transformative learning through international experiences to facilitate multicultural development in counselor trainees.

The literature notes the impact of transformative learning experiences through international travel on counselor trainee multicultural development (Alexander et al., 2005; Barden & Cashwell, 2014; Barden et al., 2015; Canfield et al., 2009; Choi et al., 2015; Shannonhouse et al., 2015; Smith et al., 2014; Tomlinson-Clarke & Clarke, 2010). Although international immersion is not practical for all counselor trainees and programs (Canfield et al., 2009; Shannonhouse et al., 2015), the multicultural development experienced by counselor trainees as the result of international immersion can be replicated in locally-based immersion activities that are intentionally structured and provide opportunities for comprehensive, sustained immersion (Alexander et al., 2005; Canfield et al., 2009; Choi et al., 2015). Counselor educators should consider coordinating affordable cross-cultural immersion opportunities such as community involvement with a local subcultural group for an extended period of time, given the costly and time-consuming nature of internationally focused programs. Alexander et al. (2005) supports increased involvement between counselor education programs and local communities, which would provide counselor trainees an opportunity to receive a culturally diverse experience that differs significantly from the university's environment.

Additionally, structured cultural immersion experience assignments that reflect the critical components of international immersion experiences could be utilized in various pedagogical formats (i.e., traditional on-campus courses and online courses).

Activities that catalyze emotional reactions and intimate communication, sustain contact with members of the host community, and strategically allow time for guided reflection activities (e.g., journaling, group processing) would be beneficial (Shannonhouse et al., 2015; Smith et al., 2014). Another example, supported by Choi et al. (2015), is to implement a multi-method approach (e.g., traditional courses, group discussion, cross-cultural immersion trips, community service activities) to help students learn about MCC concepts and theories in the classroom and participate in experiential learning activities to maximize the learning outcomes of multicultural learning.

Future research should utilize more rigorous methodological designs when examining the efficacy of international experiences in counselor education programming, as it relates to multicultural development for counselor trainees. 87.5% (n = 7) of identified publications in this study were classified as either qualitative research or conceptual articles. Future quantitative and mixed methods research studies should focus on identifying and comparing the impact of critical factors (e.g., demographics, duration, group dynamics, previous experiences, developmental levels of cultural sensitivity) that lead to counselor trainee development. It would also be beneficial for future research to explore the impact previous international experiences have had on the multicultural development of counselor trainees who are participating in an additional international immersion experience compared to those whom have never traveled abroad. Finally, future research should examine multicultural learning through immersion experiences across pedagogical formats (i.e., study abroad, traditional course, online course).

Summary

As a result of continual demographic changes in the United States, how the counseling profession identifies and addresses cultural differences has become a priority. This is further compounded by the acknowledgement that immigrants and other cultural minorities are underserved by healthcare services and receive inadequate care as a result (Abe-Kim et al., 2007; David, 2010; Holden et al., 2012; LaVeist et al., 2000; Shea & Yeh, 2008). Transformative learning is a pedagogical process that can greatly impact multicultural development for counselor trainees and can be accomplished through the utilization of international experiences in counselor education programs (Barden & Cashwell, 2014; Choi et al., 2015; Shannonhouse et al., 2015; Smith et al., 2014). There is a dearth of available literature pertaining to the utilization of international experiences in counselor training programs. Examination of the counseling literature revealed six predominate themes: (1) disorienting dilemmas, (2) critical reflection, (3) critical consciousness, (4) cultural interaction, (5) relationships, and (6) cultural sensitivity. These six themes reflect all ten stages of Mezirow's (2000) transformative learning process. If counseling professionals are going to meet the needs of the ever-growing international population within the United States, it is imperative to further explore how counselor education programs can effectively integrate these critical components of transformative learning throughout various pedagogical formats in order for counselors-in-training to effectively develop multicultural counseling competencies.

Chapter 5

Over the years, the United States has experienced a dramatic shift in population demographics. It is projected that by 2050, nearly 50% of the U.S population will consist of individuals representing diverse racial and ethnic backgrounds (Humbert, Burket, Deveney, & Kennedy, 2012) and there will be an increase in foreign-born residents that will exceed native born residents (Colby & Ortman, 2015). According to the Migration Policy Institute (MPI, 2016), “foreign born” and “immigrant” are used interchangeably and refer to individuals without U.S. citizenship at birth. This population includes naturalized citizens, lawful permanent residents, refugees and asylees, individuals on certain temporary visas, and unauthorized visas. Literature has shown that immigrants underutilize mental health services due to language barriers, a lack of information on how to obtain services and navigate the U.S. healthcare system, limited financial resources (e.g., slightly more than one-fourth of immigrants do not have insurance coverage), cultural mistrust towards mental health professionals, and cultural values that contradict the mental health profession (Abe-Kim et al., 2007; David, 2010; MPI, 2016; Shea & Yeh, 2008). Underutilization of mental health services and inadequate care amongst the population is problematic for a host of reasons. Mental health distress experienced by immigrants is likely linked to acculturative stress such as leaving friends, family and familiar cultural norms, adjusting to a new cultural environment, and in some cases prejudices and discrimination (Rogers-Siren, Melendez, Refano, & Zegarra, 2015).

According to Alegria, Sribney, Woo, Torres, and Guarnaccia (2007), this acculturative stress has been associated with a higher risk of psychiatric symptoms.

Although the counseling profession professes multicultural counseling competency (Arredondo et al., 1996; Korman, 1974; Pederson, 1991; Ratts, Singh, Nassar-McMillan, Butler & McCullough, 2016; Sue et al., 1982; Sue, Arredondo, & McDavis, 1992), it tends to focus more on people within the United States. One method to prepare counseling professionals to work with individuals from an ever-growing diverse population is to incorporate transformative learning experiences through international travel exposure in counseling graduate programs. Transformative learning is a process where one changes their perspectives or mindsets into a more open or inclusive way of thinking in order to develop more justified beliefs to guide one's actions (Hubbs & Brand, 2005). Several prominent counseling programs in the U.S. have instituted travel programs to increase counselor competency; however, there is a paucity of literature on the effectiveness or prevalence of these programs. Through exposure and transformative learning experiences, counselors-in-training can become exposed to policies and standards outside of the U.S. to treat international people, thus increasing their self-awareness and efficacy (Barden & Cashwell, 2014; Cunningham, Caldwell, & Geltner, 2011; DeRicco & Sciarra, 2005; McDowell, Goessling, & Melendez, 2012; Prosek & Michel, 2016; Ribeiro & Ribeiro, 2005.)

Multicultural Counseling Competency

As a result of the changing demographics within the U.S. and a recognition that individuals representing cultural diversity are underserved, counseling professionals have identified multicultural competence (MCC) as the 4th force of counseling (Pederson,

1991). The initial framework (Sue et al., 1982) for MCCs included counselor beliefs/attitudes, knowledge and skills but was later refined to include a model of 31 specific multicultural counseling competencies (Sue et al., 1992). Aside for providing a specific framework for implementing MCCs, Sue et al. (1992) provided rationale for multicultural perspectives in counseling assessment, practice, training and research, proposed specific standards for a culturally competent counselor, and advocated for the integration of these standards in the American Association for Counseling and Development (AACD). The necessity for multicultural perspectives in the counseling profession was due to the aforementioned dramatic increase in the non-White population within the U.S., which required mental health professionals to be prepared to provide culturally appropriate services to all people. How the counseling profession has conceptualized and developed the utilization of multicultural practice has continued to progress (Arredondo et al., 1996; Ponterotto, Alexander, & Grieger, 1995; Ratts, Singh, Nassar-McMillan, Butler, & McCullough, 2015) and over the past 30 years, professional organizations (e.g., American Counseling Association [ACA], American Psychological Association [APA], Council for Accreditation of Counseling and Related Educational Programs [CACREP]) have integrated multicultural competency into ethical guidelines for practice and competency standards for accreditation (Jones, Sander, & Booker, 2013).

Multicultural Training in Counselor Education

Although there is a need for an increased emphasis on the development of multicultural counseling competence in counseling trainees and professionals, there is little information available describing how to attain multicultural counseling competency skills (Chao, 2012). This recognition of the importance of culturally responsive treatment

has led the counseling profession to examine how counselors are prepared in training programs to work with diverse populations while addressing the Multicultural Counseling Competencies (Arredondo & Toporek, 2004; Fawcett, Briggs, Maycock, & Stine, 2010; Zalaquett, Foley, Tillotson, Dinsmore, & Hof, 2008). A multiculturally competent counselor can be defined as one who possesses the awareness, knowledge and skills necessary to work effectively and sensitively with clients from various cultural and ethnic backgrounds (Holcomb-McCoy & Meyers, 1999; Sue et al., 1992). Unfortunately, many counselors have been trained to implement therapeutic interventions designed primarily for European Americans (Abreu et al., 2000). As a result, much more attention is being paid to multicultural training (MCT) in counselor preparation programs. Traditional training methods (e.g., separate course, area of concentration, interdisciplinary, and integration) have been regarded effective to an extent (Rogers & O'Bryon, 2014), however, Kim and Lyons (2003) suggested that didactic teaching methods alone might not be effective in developing MCC. Vazquez and Vazquez (2003) claim two requirements must be met in teaching a multicultural course: it must be experientially based and process oriented, both of which serve as the foundation for self-exploration and self-awareness. Experiential learning, described as a cyclical process having two stages – action and reflection, has been recommended as a pedagogical method that can bridge multicultural counseling theory and practice (Arthur & Achenbach, 2002; Roholt & Fisher, 2013). Although experiential learning is seen as an effective approach to address trainee awareness of self and others and expand student worldviews (Jones et al., 2013), the limitations of in-class work are numerous. Oftentimes, for example, books and articles assigned in single course experiences that provide evidence-based treatment or

multicultural best practice suggestions are methods primarily used when exposing counselors to cultural differences. These methods don't provide sufficient opportunities for counselors-in-training to practice or assess their own cultural competence due to limited contact with those of diverse populations (Kagnici, 2014). Due to the limitations in-class experiential exercises may have on multicultural development, it would be beneficial for counselor educators to explore incorporating transformative learning experiences through international travel in counselor preparation programs.

Transformative Learning

The *Transformative Model of Learning* was originally developed by Jack Mezirow (1997) to serve adult learners in higher education (Guiffrida, 2005).

Transformative learning is a process where one changes their perspectives or mindsets into a more open or inclusive way of thinking in order to develop more justified beliefs to guide one's actions (Hubbs & Brand, 2005). Mezirow (2000) described the ten phases of the transformative process as: (1) experiencing a disorienting situation; (2) undergoing self-examination with feelings of fear, anger, guilt or shame; (3) conducting a critical assessment of internalized assumptions; (4) recognizing others have had similar experiences; (5) exploration of options for new roles, relationships and actions; (6) planning a course of action; (7) acquiring knowledge and skills for implementing one's plans; (8) provisional trying of one's roles; (9) building competence and self-confidence in new roles and relationships; and (10) reintegrating into society with a newly defined perspective (as cited by Nohl, 2015).

Based off Mezirow's approach to the individual transformative process, Addleman, Nava, Cevallos, Brazo, and Dixon (2014) described the major elements of the

transformative process in three stages: *triggering experiences*, *frame of reference examination*, and *transformative change*. *Triggering experiences*, or (1) disorienting experiences, are described as an event that identifies a discrepancy between what an individual has always thought to be true and what has just been experienced (Cranton, 2002). Frame of reference can be described as a structure of expectations and assumptions that shape an individual's view of the world (Mezirow, 2012). *Frame of reference examination* is characterized by an awareness and assessment of frames of reference through critical reflection and dialogue (Addleman et al., 2014). Three of Mezirow's (2000) phases are included in this stage: (2) undergoing self-examination with feelings of fear, anger, guilt or shame; (3) conducting a critical assessment of internalized assumptions; and (4) recognizing others have had similar experiences. The third stage, *transformative change*, includes the remaining phases identified by Mezirow (2000): (5) exploration of options for new roles, relationships and actions; (6) planning a course of action; (7) acquiring knowledge and skills for implementing one's plans; (8) provisional trying of one's roles; (9) building competence and self-confidence in new roles and relationships; and (10) reintegrating into society with a newly defined perspective. For transformative learning to occur in educational settings, strategies must be implemented that facilitate a greater sense of awareness within learners and allow them to make meaning of their experiences in order to guide future action (Guiffrida, 2005; Kuennen 2015).

Transformative Learning through International Travel

Over the past decade, the impact international experiences have on multicultural learning has received increased attention. According to Guth, McAuliffe, and Michalak

(2012), international experiences such as study abroad result in a type of learning that may not occur in a standard cultural counseling course. There is growing evidence of the role international experiences have in providing transformative learning opportunities and facilitating multicultural learning, development, and competency in those who spend time abroad (Barden & Cashwell, 2014; Cunningham et al., 2011; DeRicco & Sciarra, 2005; McDowell, Goessling, & Melendez, 2012; Prosek & Michel, 2016; Ribeiro & Ribeiro, 2005).

Benefits of studying abroad for students include increased cultural sensitivity, increased self-awareness of one's own cultural values, increased self-confidence, and increased communication skills (Smith & Curry, 2011). Jurgens and McAuliffe (2004) found that students who studied abroad were able to increase their knowledge of the host country through experiential learning and interactions, as well as increase their tolerance of others by living abroad with fellow travelers. According to a study conducted at the University of Delaware, individuals who spent even a short time abroad felt more confident in their levels of intercultural awareness and functional knowledge than those who stayed on campus (Chieffo & Griffiths, 2004). Stebleton et al. (2013) suggests that international experiences intentionally designed to foster deeper engagement among students (e.g., pre-departure workshops, embedded journal reflections, involvement in community service and local cultural events, and interactions with community members) are positively associated with development in student's global and intercultural competencies.

Those who participate in international experiences are able to develop cultural views that are more inclusive and less ethnocentric by challenging their own point of

view through critical reflection and reframing perceptions (Smith, McAuliffe, & Rippard 2014). Tomlinson-Clarke and Clarke (2010) report that immersion in another culture heightens one's cultural awareness and encourages examining thoughts, feelings and behaviors that might be ignored in a familiar context. Through cultural immersion, participants are allowed to have meaningful, direct cross-cultural interactions, increasing the likelihood of developing cultural understanding and empathy (Tomlinson-Clarke & Clarke, 2010).

Need for the Study

According to the United States Census Bureau (2001), from 1990 to 2000, the U.S population grew to over 281 million people. Most of this growth was due to an increase of racial/ethnic minority groups but the shift in demographics is also a result of increasing immigration rates (i.e., documented immigrants, undocumented immigrants, refugees) whose numbers are currently the largest in U.S. history (Sue & Sue, 2008). In 2014, the U.S. immigrant population stood at approximately 42 million people, or 13% of the total U.S. population. In the current era, as a result of continual demographic changes in the United States, how the counseling profession identifies and addresses cultural differences has become a priority. This is further compounded by the acknowledgement that immigrants and other cultural minorities are underserved by healthcare services and receive inadequate services as a result (Abe-Kim et al., 2007; David, 2010; Holden, McGregor, Blanks, & Mahaffey, 2012; LaVeist, Nickerson, & Bowie, 2000; Shea & Yeh, 2008). It has been hypothesized (Fraga, Atkinson, & Wampold, 2004; Kearney, Draper, & Baron, 2005) that one reason diverse populations tend to underutilize counseling services is that they do not perceive counselors to be competent in addressing their

culturally related issues. This hypothesis is supported, in that counseling graduates have reported feeling ill-prepared in their graduate programs to offer sufficient and effective services to diverse populations (Arthur & Achenbach, 2002; Barden & Cashwell, 2014).

Underutilization of mental health services and inadequate care amongst diverse populations are problematic for a host of reasons. Underrepresented individuals are more likely than white European-Americans to experience higher levels of culturally driven stress, including but not limited to poverty, racism, prejudice, discrimination, traumatic stress and a sense of belonging (Cokely, McClain, Enciso, & Martinez, 2013; Kim & Lyons, 2003; Sue & Sue, 2008). Mental health distress experienced by immigrants is likely linked to acculturative stress such as leaving friends, family and familiar cultural norms, adjusting to a new cultural environment, and in some cases prejudices and discrimination (Rogers-Siren et al., 2015). The aforementioned factors (i.e., acculturative stress) have been associated with a higher risk of psychiatric symptoms (Alegria et al., 2007; Sue & Sue, 2016).

Purpose of the Study

The aim of this study was to examine: (1) the extent to which the counseling literature focuses on international experiences in counselor education programs; (2) the extent to which the outcomes of literature on international travel are applicable to multicultural development; and (3) the nature of the implications and proposed recommendations for future research regarding international experiences and the development of multicultural counseling competencies through transformative learning. It's important to understand how international experiences, which have been found to facilitate multicultural learning, development and competency (Barden & Cashwell,

2014; Cunningham et al., 2011; DeRicco & Sciarra, 2005; McDowell, Goessling, & Melendez, 2012; Prosek & Michel, 2016; Ribeiro & Ribeiro, 2005) have been addressed in literature related to the counseling profession, especially if these experiences can lead to increasing the efficacy in which counselors-in-training develop these competencies.

Method

Content analysis is an effective approach in exploring important content within a variety of texts (Buboltz, Miller, & Williams, 1999), illuminating developments within a discipline (Barrio-Minton, Morris, & Yaites, 2014) and examining professional trends, gaps in the literature, and recommendations for future research (Berrios & Lucca, 2006). Content analysis was an appropriate methodology for this study, as the objectives were to examine trends, gaps in the literature, and recommendations for future research within the counseling literature as they relate to the transformative learning process associated with international experiences in counselor education programs and the development of multicultural counseling competencies (MCCs).

Data Collection

This study was conducted to provide data from a thorough content analysis of top counseling journals to determine trends in the professional counseling literature that addressed multicultural counseling development through international experiences in counselor education programs. The initial step in this content analysis was to decide an appropriate timeframe for collecting data. 1991 was chosen as a starting point due to the an increase in awareness and focus on the importance of multiculturalism in the counseling profession as the result of Pederson's (1991) work referring to multicultural practice as the 4th force of counseling. Following the identification of a timeframe for

data collection, journals were selected for targeted inclusion. Using Berrios and Lucca's (2006) data collection method, the criteria for inclusion requires that articles must (a) have a diverse scope (i.e., general, specialized, clinical, academic) and (b) have a wide circulation. Journals were selected because of their influence and accessibility to counseling professionals. The twenty-two journals in Table 1 are available online to current American Counseling Association (ACA) and ACA division members through the Wiley Online Library. Journal content is digitized back to Volume 1, Issue 1, for each of the twenty-two journals. Current ACA and division members have free electronic access to these journals, as well as the digital archive.

Table 1

Overview of American Counseling Association (ACA) and ACA-Published Counseling Journals Included in Data Collection

Journal	Circulation	First Volume	Acceptance Rate
<i>Adultspan Journal</i>	Biannually	1999	45%
<i>Career Development Quarterly (CDQ)</i>	Quarterly	1986	20%
<i>Counselor Education and Supervision (CES)</i>	Quarterly	1961	20%
<i>Counseling Outcome Research and Evaluation (CORE)</i>	Biannually	2010	NR
<i>Counseling and Values Journal (CVJ)</i>	Biannually	1973	15%
<i>Journal of Addictions & Offender Counseling (JAOC)</i>	Biannually	1990	35%
<i>Journal of Child and Adolescent Counseling (JCAC)</i>	Biannually	2015	NR
<i>Journal of College Counseling (JCC)</i>	Triannually	1998	18%
<i>Journal of Counseling & Development (JCD)</i>	Quarterly	1984	14%
<i>Journal of Creativity in Mental Health (JCMH)</i>	Quarterly	2005	50%
<i>Journal of Employment Counseling (JEC)</i>	Quarterly	1964	40%
<i>Journal of Humanistic Counseling</i>	Triannually	2011	15%

<i>(JHC)</i>			
<i>Journal of LGBT Issues in Counseling</i>	Quarterly	2006	50%
<i>Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development (JMCD)</i>	Quarterly	1985	13%
<i>Journal of Military and Government Counseling (JMGC)</i>	Triannually	2013	NR
<i>Journal of Mental Health Counseling (JMHC)</i>	Quarterly	1979	20%
<i>Journal for Social Action in Counseling and Psychology (JSACP)</i>	Triannually	2007	NR
<i>Journal for Specialists in Group Work (JSGW)</i>	Quarterly	1981	53%
<i>Measurement and Evaluation in Counseling and Development (MECD)</i>	Quarterly	1968	14-15%
<i>Professional School Counseling</i>	Quarterly	1998	11-13%
<i>Rehabilitation Counseling Bulletin (RCB)</i>	Quarterly	1999	21-30%
<i>The Family Journal (TFJ)</i>	Quarterly	1993	38%

Note. Journal information acquired from Cabell's Directory (2014); NR = Not Reported

Trustworthiness

The first author contacted my university's institutional review board and was informed that no protocol was needed to submit for review in this study, as human subjects were not be included. To achieve stability (i.e., intra-rater reliability), the primary researcher coded the data collected using the identified coding procedure for this study and two weeks after the initial coding procedure, recoded 25% of the data collected. If later coding judgments matched earlier coding judgments, the coding for this study was considered stable (Mackey & Gass, 2005; Potter & Levine-Donnerstein, 1999). To achieve reproducibility (i.e., inter-rater reliability), an Auburn University Counselor Education and Supervision doctoral student was recruited to analyze 25% of the data collected, selected at random, using the study's identified coding procedure. The

criteria for agreement between coders was established using the percentage agreement formula of $PA = A/n \times 100$, where PA = percentage agreement, A = number of agreements, and n = number of segments coded. If the recruited coder and primary researcher's coding patterns met an 80% level of agreement, the coding for this study could be considered reproducible (Potter & Levine-Donnerstein, 1999). Finally, the primary researcher recruited an Auburn University Counselor Education and Supervision doctoral student to serve as an external auditor to establish validity. This student was a separate individual from the doctoral student recruited to serve as an additional coder for establishing reproducibility, as the individual recruited for establishing reproducibility could be knowledgeable about the study's coding scheme but could not be aware of emergent themes identified by the primary researcher in the constructed codebook. The external auditor was asked to provide feedback on the inclusionary criteria and appropriateness of the data collected for this study. This student also reviewed the codebook to ensure that coding was not the result of personal research bias.

Data Analysis

This content analysis reviewed the twenty-two ACA and ACA division-published counseling journals, as available on counseling.org. As previously mentioned, the final list of journals included *JCD*, *Adultspan Journal*, *CDQ*, *CVJ*, *CES*, *JAOC*, *JCC*, *JEC*, *JHC*, *JMCD*, *CORE*, *MECD*, *TFJ*, *JCAC*, *JCMH*, *Journal of LGBT Issues in Counseling*, *JMHC*, *JMGC*, *JSACP*, *JSGW*, *Professional School Counseling*, and *RCB*. In addition to selecting these 22 counseling journals, a list of keywords related to international experiences and multicultural development were developed using an a priori design. Neuendorf (2002) recommended the use of research questions to create and

operationalize definitions or keywords through an a priori framework. For the purpose of this study, “international experiences” was defined by four keywords that include: *immersion*, *international service learning*, *international travel*, and *study abroad*.

To understand the extent to which the counseling literature has focused on international experiences in counselor education programs, it is important to add specificity to the term “international experiences.” *Immersion* can be defined as opportunities that engage individuals in meaningful, direct cross-cultural interactions with others (Tomlinson-Clarke & Clarke, 2010). *International service learning* combines classroom instruction and community service in a foreign environment through collaboration with indigenous individuals (Burnett et al., 2004; Smith-Augustine et al., 2014). *International travel* can be defined as individuals or groups traveling abroad for reasons that may include formal and informal educational, work-related, volunteer, religious, cross-cultural, and/or recreational experiences (Stebbleton et al., 2013). *Study abroad* is the participation in a college or university travel program in which students participate alongside individuals from their native country, host country, both native and host country, or that involves a thematic focus, training or study project (Williamson, 2008).

These identified keywords were searched in the online database of all 22 counseling journals using Academic Search Premier, Education Resources Information Center (ERIC), and Wiley-Blackwell Journals. These databases contain extensive literature in the fields of counseling and counselor education. The usefulness of these resources allowed for accessible means to collect literature from the aforementioned counseling journals. If a journal could not be found through the utilization of Auburn

University's online database, the missing journal's publication abstracts from 1991 to 2016 were reviewed through the journal's website. If journal publications could not be accessed electronically, the publication was requested through Auburn University's interlibrary loan program.

After counseling articles were identified, criteria were developed to determine the relevance of the articles to international experiences and multicultural development. Articles that did not include international experiences in counselor education programs as the primary focus were excluded from further review. For example, articles that focused on immersion or service learning experiences in counselor education programs within the United States did not meet the identified inclusionary criteria.

For this content analysis, only full-length articles were included. Results that included book reviews, interviews or announcements were excluded from this study. When publications were selected, they were identified as *research* or *nonresearch* (i.e., theoretical or conceptual article). For this content analysis, a research article is identified as an empirical article in which data were actively collected and analyzed. Further analysis of identified research articles relevant to international experiences and multicultural development was conducted for research design and categorized as *qualitative*, *quantitative* or *mixed methods*. For this study, a qualitative design is one in which descriptive textual analysis was present, whereas a quantitative design is one in which data analysis relied on statistics. A *mixed methods* design is one in which both qualitative and quantitative approaches were used in research analysis. Additionally, the identified publications were analyzed for journal affiliation, authorship, and author affiliation. Finally, identified articles were analyzed for content and emerging themes.

An audit trail is recorded in the appendices section to document all procedural steps of the data collection and analysis of this study. The use of an audit trail provides an accurate reflection of the quality of a qualitative research study and allows for a clear understanding of the procedures, decision-making, and findings of the researcher (Akkerman, Admiraal, Brekelmans, & Oost, 2006; Koch, 2006). Additionally, a record will be kept of excluded articles in the appendices section of this study.

Results

The purpose of this qualitative content analysis was to examine: (1) the extent to which the counseling literature focuses on international experiences in counselor education programs; (2) the extent to which the outcomes of literature on international travel are applicable to multicultural development; and (3) the nature of the implications and proposed recommendations for future research regarding international experiences and the development of multicultural counseling competencies through transformative learning.

International Travel and Counselor Education

Findings of this content analysis suggest that there are few published articles ($n = 8$) that address international experiences for counselors in the development and facilitation of multicultural counseling competencies. Only 18.2% ($n = 4$) of the top counseling journals contained published content on international experiences in counselor education over the past 25 years. No articles that addressed international experiences in counselor education programs were published in *JCD*, *Adultspan Journal*, *CDQ*, *CVJ*, *JAOC*, *JCC*, *JEC*, *JHC*, *CORE*, *MECD*, *JCAC*, *JCMH*, *Journal of LGBT Issues in Counseling*, *JMHC*, *JMGC*, *JSACP*, *Professional School Counseling*, and the *RCB*. Of

the eight publications that met inclusionary criteria for the purpose of this study, none of the resulting journal articles were published before the year 2005. 12.5% (n = 1) of the resulting articles were published in 2005, 12.5% (n = 1) were published in 2009, 12.5% (n = 1) were published in 2010, 25% (n = 2) were published in 2014, and 37.5% (n = 3) were published in 2015. Of the eight resulting publications, 62.5% (n = 5) of publications were coded as research articles (i.e., quantitative, qualitative, or mixed methods). More specifically, 50% (n = 4) of the resulting publications were coded as qualitative research studies and 12.5% (n = 1) were coded as a quantitative research study. The remaining 37.5% (n = 3) of the resulting publications were coded as nonresearch articles (i.e., theoretical or conceptual). More specifically, the three publications coded as nonresearch articles were coded as conceptual publications.

Table 2

Overview of Counseling Journals That Addressed International Experiences in Counselor Education

Journal; Acceptance Rate	Year	Author(s)	Design
CES; 20%	2015	Shannonhouse, Barden, & Mobley	Research (Qualitative)
CES; 20%	2014	Smith, McAuliffe, & Rippard	Research (Qualitative)
CES; 20%	2005	Alexander, Kruczek, & Ponterotto	Conceptual
JMCD; 13%	2015	Choi, VanVoorhis, & Ellenwood	Research (Qualitative)
JMCD; 13%	2014	Barden & Cashwell	Research (Qualitative)
JMCD; 13%	2010	Tomlinson-Clarke & Clarke	Conceptual

JSGW; 53%	2015	Barden, Shannonhouse, & Mobley	Research (Quantitative)
TFJ; 38%	2009	Canfield, Low, & Hovestadt	Conceptual

Note. CES = Counselor Education and Supervision; JMCD = Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development; TFJ = The Family Journal; JSGW = Journal for Specialists in Group Work

Authorship and Affiliation

Two of the eight (25%) publications were co-authored by two researchers and six (75%) publications were co-authored by three researchers. At the time of publication, authors held ten various professional designations (e.g., doctoral student, adjunct assistant professor, clinical professor, assistant professor, associate professor, full professor, program coordinator, program director, senior director of strategic alliances and outreach, and vice president of student affairs). Additionally, at the time of publication, authors were affiliated with 13 various institutions.

Table 3

<i>Authorship</i>				
Author	Lead	Second	Third	Total
Sejal M. Barden	N = 2	N = 1	N = 0	N = 3
Keith A. Mobley	N = 0	N = 0	N = 2	N = 2
Laura Shannonhouse	N = 1	N = 1	N = 0	N = 2
Charlene M. Alexander	N = 1	N = 0	N = 0	N = 1
Brian S. Canfield	N = 1	N = 0	N = 0	N = 1
Kyoung Mi Choi	N = 1	N = 0	N = 0	N = 1
Jayne E. Smith	N = 1	N = 0	N = 0	N = 1
Saundra M. Tomlinson-Clarke	N = 1	N = 0	N = 0	N = 1
Craig S. Cashwell	N = 0	N = 1	N = 0	N = 1
Darren Clarke	N = 0	N = 1	N = 0	N = 1
Theresa Kruczek	N = 0	N = 1	N = 0	N = 1
Lori Low	N = 0	N = 1	N = 0	N = 1

Garrett McAuliffe	N = 0	N = 1	N = 0	N = 1
Richard W. VanVoorhis	N = 0	N = 1	N = 0	N = 1
Audrey E. Ellenwood	N = 0	N = 0	N = 1	N = 1
Alan Hovestadt	N = 0	N = 0	N = 1	N = 1
Joseph G. Ponterotto	N = 0	N = 0	N = 1	N = 1
Kelly S. Rippard	N = 0	N = 0	N = 1	N = 1

Emergent Themes

Six themes were identified during the analysis of publication content: (1) critical reflection, (2) cultural interaction, (3) cultural sensitivity, (4) relationships, (5) disorienting dilemma, and (6) critical consciousness. All eight publications analyzed for this study encompassed at least one of the six themes. Frequencies of themes in order from most frequently coded to least frequently coded is as follows: (1) critical reflection (n = 202), (2) cultural interaction (n = 176), (3) cultural sensitivity (n = 84), (4) relationships (n = 72), (5) disorienting dilemma (n = 47), and (6) critical consciousness (n = 18). Themes were coded 599 times throughout the eight publications included in this qualitative content analysis.

Critical reflection describes strategies used to develop a new way of interpreting the meaning of one's experiences in order to guide future actions (Kuennen, 2015). Critical reflection was coded 202 times (33.7%) and was identified as a theme in all eight publications (n = 8). Coding of the theme "critical reflection" was considered present with the occurrence of the following terms: reflect, reflection, process, processing, and continued thinking.

Cultural interaction describes direct engagement with local people from diverse backgrounds (Choi et al., 2015). Cultural interaction was coded 176 times (29.4%) and was identified as a theme in all eight publications (n = 8). Coding of the theme "cultural

interaction” was considered present with the occurrence of the following terms: cultural engagement, engagement, interact, interaction, visits, initiated dialogue, dialogue, direct encounters, in vivo contact, communicate, and communication.

Cultural sensitivity describes being aware that cultural differences and similarities exist and have an effect on values, learning and behavior (Robinson, Bowman, Ewing, Hanna, & Lopez-De Fede, 1997). Cultural sensitivity was coded 84 times (14%) and was identified as a theme in 87.5% (n = 7) of publications. Coding of the theme “cultural sensitivity” was considered present with the occurrence of the following term: intercultural sensitivity.

Relationships describe the building of genuine connections between individuals who differ from one another as it relates to culture (Shannonhouse et al., 2015). Relationships were coded 72 times (12%) and were identified as a theme in 87.5% (n = 7) of publications. Coding of the theme “relationships” was considered present with the occurrence of the following terms: friendships, partnerships, and connections.

Disorienting dilemma describes an event where one changes their perspectives or mindsets into a more open or inclusive way of thinking in order to develop more justified beliefs to guide one’s actions (Hubbs & Brand, 2005). Disorienting dilemma was coded 47 times (7.8%) and was identified as a theme in 87.5% (n = 7) of publications. Coding of the theme “disorienting dilemma” was considered present with the occurrence of the following terms: culture shock, being “other,” discomfort, outsider, and minority.

Critical consciousness describes the core ability to reflect on one’s biases to gain a deeper understanding of complex social issues and to take action to advocate for social justice in multicultural learning (Choi et al., 2015). Critical consciousness was coded 18

times (3%) and was identified as a theme in 25% (n = 2) of publications. Critical consciousness was considered a theme due to its frequency (n = 16) in Choi et al.'s (2015) research study.

Table 4

Overview of Publications That Addressed International Experiences in Counselor Education: Content and Themes

Author(s)	Content Area	Themes	Type
Shannonhouse, Barden, & Mobley	Cultural immersion in Central America	Critical reflection, Relationships, Cultural interaction, Disorienting dilemma, and Cultural Sensitivity	Consensual Qualitative Research
Alexander, Kruczek, & Ponterotto	An international cultural immersion model	Cultural interaction, Critical reflection, Relationships, and Cultural Sensitivity	Conceptual
Smith, McAuliffe, & Rippard	Student learning during and after study abroad in Ireland	Critical reflection, Cultural interaction, Relationships, and Disorienting dilemma	Grounded Theory
Choi, VanVoorhis, & Ellenwood	Cross-cultural immersion in South Africa	Cultural interaction, Critical consciousness, Critical reflection, Disorienting dilemma, and Cultural Sensitivity	Phenomenological
Tomlinson-Clarke & Clarke	A community-centered service immersion model	Cultural interaction, Critical reflection, Relationships, Disorienting dilemma, and Intercultural sensitivity	Conceptual

Barden & Cashwell	The impact of international immersion on counselor development	Critical reflection, Relationships, Cultural interaction, Disorienting dilemma, Cultural sensitivity, and Critical consciousness	Consensual Qualitative Research
Canfield, Low, & Hovestadt	A cultural immersion experience assignment	Cultural interaction, Critical reflection, Cultural sensitivity, Disorienting dilemma, and Relationships	Conceptual
Barden, Shannonhouse, & Mobley	Cultural sensitivity from international immersion	Intercultural sensitivity, Critical reflection, Cultural interaction, Relationships, and Disorienting dilemma	Quasi-Experimental

International Travel and Multicultural Development

All eight publications noted the impact transformative learning experiences through international travel has on counselor trainee multicultural development. Canfield et al. (2009) supported the utilization of a cultural immersion experience (CIE) activities as an effective strategy to increase cultural awareness and sensitivity in counselor trainees. Shannonhouse et al. (2015) suggested that multicultural growth is fostered when facilitators make conditions favorable for students to critically reflect on their immersion experiences. Additionally, Smith et al. (2014) suggested that study abroad programs with an intentional focus on social conflict, resolution, and time for reflection has the potential to strengthen counselor professional identity in terms of being

social change agents. During international travel experiences, cultural knowledge is gained through engagement with communities (Choi et al., 2015) and furthermore, these direct cross-cultural interactions expose students to cultural realities of everyday life, which facilitates the development of multicultural counseling competencies (Tomlinson-Clarke & Clarke, 2010). Shannonhouse et al.'s (2015) study noted that establishing meaningful relationships with members of the host country enriches an environment that fosters transformative growth and multicultural development.

Implications and Recommendations

Each publication (n = 8) provided implications for the counseling profession and proposed recommendations for future research. Two publications (25%) addressed the impracticality of international immersion for many counselor trainees and programs. Shannonhouse et al. (2015) implied that although international immersion is not realistic for all counselor trainees and programs, the multicultural development experienced by counselor-trainees in a 3-week cultural immersion course in Central America can be replicated in locally based immersion activities that are intentionally structured and provides opportunities for comprehensive, sustained immersion. Choi et al. (2015) recommended that it might be beneficial for counselor educators to coordinate affordable cross-cultural immersion opportunities such as community involvement with a local subcultural group for an extended period of time, given the costly and time-consuming nature of internationally focused programs. Similarly, Alexander et al. (2005) suggested that communities within the United States could be involved in ensuring that counselor trainees have an opportunity to receive a culturally diverse practicum experience that differs significantly from the university's environment. The authors emphasized the

importance of counseling students being allowed sufficient time to be exposed to all aspects of the host community (e.g., work and leisure) during an immersion experience. Furthermore, Canfield et al. (2009) implied that a structured cultural immersion experience assignment could be used across formats (i.e., traditional, study abroad and online).

Tomlinson-Clarke and Clarke made a number of programmatic suggestions in their conceptual article about an immersion model implemented in South Africa that incorporates culturally focused community-centered service as an experiential approach. The authors' suggestions regarding implementation of similar immersion experiences include: (a) the development of meaningful relationships and maintaining consistent contact with the host country; (b) the duration of the immersion experience must be long enough to allow for adjustment to culture shock; (c) the importance of diversity in the racial-ethnic composition of participants and group facilitators; (d) implementing pre-departure multicultural training workshops and seminars that encourage active learning and the use of reflective journaling throughout the process; and (e) debriefing throughout the international experience utilizing guided reflection, which includes allowing adequate time for the processing of feelings, thoughts and behaviors related to the experience. Barden and Cashwell (2014) suggested that counselor educators consider developing instructional strategies that allow students the feeling of being an outsider and being immersed in a culture where cultural norms are different than their own. According to the authors, creating activities where counselor trainees are outsiders and engage with diverse populations for extended periods provide them with the feeling of being outside the majority population as an important step to developing cultural empathy. Alexander

et al.'s (2005) study noted that although there are no clear guidelines on how and when to implement international immersion opportunities, the authors suggested implementation after the first year of basic counseling courses but most importantly, there has to be an integrative commitment to multicultural counseling practice, even when institutional barriers exist. All eight publications implied that utilizing transformative components (e.g., disorienting dilemmas, critical reflection, developing meaningful relationships) in international travel experiences is critical for counselor trainee multicultural development.

Finally, all eight (100%) publications recommended and noted the benefits of using more rigorous methodological designs in future research studies. Examples of future quantitative and mixed methods research foci included: comparison of critical factors (e.g., demographics, duration, group dynamics, previous experiences, developmental levels of cultural sensitivity) that lead to counselor trainee development (Barden et al., 2015; Shannonhouse et al., 2015); comparisons and outcome data of learning through a variety of course formats (i.e., study abroad, traditional, and online; Alexander et al., 2005; Canfield et al., 2009; Smith et al., 2014); the extent to which international immersion enhances empathy, listening skills, political-awareness, and self-awareness (Choi et al., 2015); comparison between groups who have and have not had international cultural immersion experiences (Tomlinson-Clarke & Clarke, 2010); and pre- and post-experimental designs to increase generalizability and assess the short- and long-term impact of international immersion for counselor trainees (Barden & Cashwell, 2014).

Discussion

As the demographics in the United States begin to reflect a population of individuals representing diverse and racial ethnic backgrounds, it is imperative that the counseling profession utilizes approaches that better prepare counselors to work effectively with those of diverse backgrounds, specifically those of an international population. The underutilization of mental health services and inadequate care provided to international populations by professional counselors beckons an increased attention towards more effective approaches in training counseling students to work more effectively with individuals of an underserved international population. This is why the examination of how the literature has focused on international experiences in counselor education programs as a training approach is imperative to the advancement of multicultural pedagogy and practice.

In response to this inquiry, this content analysis study indicated that there is a paucity of literature in the counseling profession that focuses on international experiences for counseling students in the development and facilitation of multicultural counseling competencies through transformative learning. Although the literature available pertaining to international experiences in the American Counseling Association (ACA) and ACA division's journals over the past 25 years is limited, the available literature recognizes the impact these experiences have on multicultural development for counselor trainees (Alexander et al., 2005; Barden & Cashwell, 2014; Barden et al., 2015; Canfield et al., 2009; Choi et al., 2015; Shannonhouse et al., 2015; Smith et al., 2014; Tomlinson-Clarke & Clarke, 2010). Additionally, the emerging themes from this study's analysis imply that transformative learning is an impactful component of multicultural

development in counselor trainees, as the literature that focuses on international experiences in counselor training programs reflects every phase of Mezirow's (2000) transformative learning process.

Implications for Counselor Educators

Counseling graduates have reported feeling underprepared in their graduate programs to offer sufficient and effective services to diverse populations (Arthur & Achenbach, 2002; Barden & Cashwell, 2014). As demographics in the United States continue to trend towards an increase in ethnic and racial diversity (Colby & Ortman, 2015; Humbert et al., 2012), it is imperative that counselor educators continue to explore more effective approaches in training counseling students to become culturally competent professionals.

The eight articles examined in this study noted the efficacy of utilizing international experiences in counselor training programs to increase multicultural counseling competency (MCC) in counselor trainees (Alexander et al., 2005; Barden & Cashwell, 2014; Barden et al., 2015; Canfield et al., 2009; Choi et al., 2015; Shannonhouse et al., 2015; Smith et al., 2014; Tomlinson-Clarke & Clarke, 2010). International experiences for counselor trainees is effective in increasing awareness, knowledge, and reflectivity about their own cultural identity (Choi et al., 2015; Shannonhouse et al., 2015) and has been found to facilitate a process that allows trainees to move from ethnocentric viewpoints to more culturally relative conceptualizations, as international immersion experiences encourage trainees to examine their assumptions that guides their actions, attitudes and insights (Alexander et al., 2005). These international experiences have implications for clinical practice in terms of strengthening counselor

self-efficacy, empathy, awareness and cultural sensitivity of contextual factors relevant to working with diverse clients (Barden & Cashwell, 2014; Canfield et al., 2009).

Furthermore, Barden and Cashwell (2014) provide support that international immersion for counselor trainees have a sustained influence on multicultural development over time.

Additionally, the literature examined in this study supports that a transformative learning process is achieved through international experiences in counseling programs (Barden & Cashwell, 2014; Choi et al., 2015; Shannonhouse et al., 2015; Smith et al., 2014). Various cognitive and emotional processes (e.g., excitement, openness, connection, confusion, anxiety, etc.) experienced through international immersion play significant roles in multicultural transformative learning (Choi et al., 2015). During international experiences for counselor trainees, engaging with others and building relationships served critical roles in fostering transformative learning. For example, building relationships through direct engagement with international community members provided opportunities for counselor trainees to personalize their understanding of ethnocentrism and emphasize the importance of becoming more culturally relativistic (Smith et al., 2014). Transformative learning is an effective method of moving students from a simple desire to serve ethnic minorities to a deeper commitment to social action and human rights (Barden & Cashwell, 2014). Without utilizing the most effective methodologies in multicultural training, counselors will continue feeling ill-prepared to work with the culturally diverse and as a result, members of international and other diverse populations will continue to receive inadequate mental health services.

Limitations

One of the primary limitations to this study is that a single researcher who had previously participated in international experiences conducted it. Although, this sole researcher was responsible for all of the data collection and analysis for the study, steps were taken to limit researcher bias (e.g., the use of an external auditor, ensuring trustworthiness of the study). Despite attempts to limit research bias, some may still remain. It is important to note that the terms *immersion*, *international service learning*, *international travel*, and *study abroad* were selected for this review; it is possible that other terminology not used in this study may have yielded additional relevant publications. Additionally, excluded publications likely contained information pertinent to the purpose of this study but were not examined because the participants were not identified as counseling students (e.g., adult education learners, nutritionists, etc.). Finally, although only eight publications related to international experiences in counselor education programs were collected by examining the top 22 ACA and ACA division's journals from 1991-2016, it is probable that the counseling profession has addressed transformative learning through international experiences in counselor training experiences in other journals related to the counseling profession, specifically internationally-focused counseling journals. Examining the literature of various counseling journals and across disciplines may have impacted and further informed the results of this study. The aforementioned limitations may have had a substantial impact on the data presented in this study.

Recommendations

The findings of this study reveal that there is a paucity of research available in the most influential and accessible journals of the counseling profession, as it relates to the utilization of transformative learning through international experiences in counselor education programs to facilitate multicultural development. However, the available literature provides consistent recommendations across publications in regards to effectively utilizing transformative learning through international experiences to facilitate multicultural development in counselor trainees.

The literature notes the impact of transformative learning experiences through international travel on counselor trainee multicultural development (Alexander et al., 2005; Barden & Cashwell, 2014; Barden et al., 2015; Canfield et al., 2009; Choi et al., 2015; Shannonhouse et al., 2015; Smith et al., 2014; Tomlinson-Clarke & Clarke, 2010). Although international immersion is not practical for all counselor trainees and programs (Canfield et al., 2009; Shannonhouse et al., 2015), the multicultural development experienced by counselor trainees as the result of international immersion can be replicated in locally-based immersion activities that are intentionally structured and provide opportunities for comprehensive, sustained immersion (Alexander et al., 2005; Canfield et al., 2009; Choi et al., 2015). Counselor educators should consider coordinating affordable cross-cultural immersion opportunities such as community involvement with a local subcultural group for an extended period of time, given the costly and time-consuming nature of internationally focused programs. Alexander et al. (2005) supports increased involvement between counselor education programs and local

communities, which would provide counselor trainees an opportunity to receive a culturally diverse experience that differs significantly from the university's environment.

Additionally, structured cultural immersion experience assignments that reflect the critical components of international immersion experiences could be utilized in various pedagogical formats (i.e., traditional on-campus courses and online courses). Activities that catalyze emotional reactions and intimate communication, sustain contact with members of the host community, and strategically allow time for guided reflection activities (e.g., journaling, group processing) would be beneficial (Shannonhouse et al., 2015; Smith et al., 2014). Another example, supported by Choi et al. (2015), is to implement a multi-method approach (e.g., traditional courses, group discussion, cross-cultural immersion trips, community service activities) to help students learn about MCC concepts and theories in the classroom and participate in experiential learning activities to maximize the learning outcomes of multicultural learning.

Future research should utilize more rigorous methodological designs when examining the efficacy of international experiences in counselor education programming, as it relates to multicultural development for counselor trainees. 87.5% (n = 7) of identified publications in this study were classified as either qualitative research or conceptual articles. Future quantitative and mixed methods research studies should focus on identifying and comparing the impact of critical factors (e.g., demographics, duration, group dynamics, previous experiences, developmental levels of cultural sensitivity) that lead to counselor trainee development. It would also be beneficial for future research to explore the impact previous international experiences have had on the multicultural development of counselor trainees who are participating in an additional international

immersion experience compared to those whom have never traveled abroad. Finally, future research should examine multicultural learning through immersion experiences across pedagogical formats (i.e., study abroad, traditional course, online course). If counseling professionals are going to meet the needs of the ever-growing international population within the United States, it is imperative to further explore how counselor education programs can effectively integrate these critical components of transformative learning throughout various pedagogical formats in order for counselors-in-training to effectively develop multicultural counseling competencies.

References

- Abe-Kim, J., Takeuchi, D. T., Hong, S., Zane, N., Sue, S., Spencer, M. S., ...
Alegria, M. (2007). Use of mental health-related services among immigrant and
us-born asian americans: Results from the national latino and asian american
study. *American Journal of Public Health, 97*(1), 91-98.
doi:10.2105/AJPH.2006.098541
- Abreu, J. M., Chung, R. H., & Atkinson, D. R. (2000). Multicultural counseling
training: Past, present and future directions. *The Counseling
Psychologist, 28*(5), 641-656. doi:10.1177/0011000000285003
- Addleman, R. A., Nava, R. C., Cevallos, T., Brazo, C. J., & Dixon, K. (2014). Preparing
teacher candidates to serve students from diverse backgrounds: Triggering
transformative learning through short-term cultural immersion. *International
Journal of Intercultural Relations, 43*, 189-200.
doi:10.1016/j.ijintrel.2014.08.005
- Akkerman, S., Admiraal, W., Brekelmans, M., & Oost, H. (2008). Auditing quality of
research in social sciences. *Quality and Quantity: International Journal of
Methodology, 42*(2), 257-274. doi:10.1007/s11135-006-9044-4
- Alegria, M., Sribney, W., Woo, M., Torres, M., & Guarnaccia, P. (2007). Looking
beyond nativity: The relation of age of immigration, length of residence, and
birth cohorts to the risk of onset of psychiatric disorders for latinos. *Research in
Human Development Special Issue: Social Context, Cultural Processes and*

Mental Health Across the Life Span among Ethnically Diverse Populations, 4(1), 19-47. doi:10.1080/15427600701480980

Alexander, C. M., Kruczek, T., & Ponterotto, J. G. (2005). Building multicultural competencies in school counselor trainees: An international immersion experience. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, 44(4), 255-266. doi:10.1002/j.1556-6978.2005.tb01754.x

Allison, K. W., Echemendia, R. J., Crawford, I., & Robinson, W. L. (1996). Predicting cultural competence: Implications for practice and training. *Professional Psychology: Research and Practice*, 27(4), 386-393. doi:10.1037/0735-7028.27.4.386

American Counseling Association (2014). *ACA Code of Ethics*. Alexandria, VA: Author.

American Psychological Association. (2015). *Demographics of the u.s. psychology workforce: Findings from the american community survey*. Retrieved from <http://www.apa.org/workforce/publications/13-demographics/report.pdf>

Anderson, P. H., Hubbard, A., & Lawton, L. (2015). Student motivation to study abroad and their intercultural development. *The Interdisciplinary Journal of Study Abroad*, 26, 39-52.

Arredondo, P., Toporek, R., Brown, S. P., Jones, J., Locke, D. C., Sanchez, J., & Stadler, H. (1996). Operationalization of the multicultural counseling competencies. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development*, 24(1), 42-78. doi:10.1002/j.2161-1912.1996.tb00288.x

- Arredondo, P., & Toporek, R. (2004). Multicultural counseling competencies = ethical practice. *Journal of Mental Health Counseling, 26*(1), 44-55.
doi:10.17744/mehc.26.1.hw2enjvqe2p2tj6q
- Arthur, N., & Achenbach, K. (2002). Developing multicultural counseling competencies through experiential learning. *Counselor Education and Supervision, 42*, 2-14.
doi:10.1002/j.1556-6978.2002.tb01299.x
- Barden, S., & Cashwell, C. (2014). International immersion in counselor education: A consensual qualitative research investigation. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development, 42*, 42-60. doi:10.1002/j.2161-1912.2014.00043.x
- Barden, S. M., Shannonhouse, L., & Mobley, K. (2015). International cultural immersion: Assessing the influence of a group intervention on intercultural sensitivity for counselor trainees. *Journal for Specialists in Group Work, 40*(1), 117-141. doi:10.1080/01933922.2014.992505
- Barrio-Minton, C. A., Wachter-Morris, C. A., & Yaites, L. D. (2014). Pedagogy in counselor education: A 10-year content analysis of journals. *Counselor Education and Supervision, 53*(3), 162-177. doi:10.1002/j.1556-6978.2014.00055.x
- Berrios, R., & Lucca, N. (2006). Qualitative methodology in counseling research: Recent contributions and challenges for a new century. *Journal of Counseling & Development, 84*(2), 174-186. doi:10.1002/j.1556-6678.2006.tb00393.x
- Boateng, A., & Thompson, A. M. (2012). Study abroad ghana: An international experiential learning. *Journal of Social Work Education, 49*, 701-715.
doi:10.1080/10437797.2013.812897

- Buboltz, W. C., Miller, M., & Williams, D. J. (1999). Content analysis of research in the journal of counseling psychology. *Journal of Counseling Psychology, 46*(4), 496-503. doi:10.1037/0022-0167.46.4.496
- Burnett, J. A., Hamel, D., & Long, L. L. (2004). Service learning in graduate counselor education: Developing multicultural counseling competency. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development, 32*(3), 180-191. doi:10.1002/j.2161-1912.2004.tb00370.x
- Cabell's Directories, (2014). Cabell's directories of publishing opportunities in educational psychology and administration. Retrieved from <http://cabells.com/>
- Cabral, R. R., & Smith, T. B. (2011). Racial/ethnic matching of clients and therapists in mental health services: A meta-analytic review of preferences, perceptions, and outcomes. *Journal of Counseling Psychology, 58*(4), 537-554. doi:10.1037/a0025266
- Canfield, B. S., Low, L., & Hovestadt, A. (2009). Cultural immersion as a learning method for expanding intercultural competencies. *Family Journal: Counseling and Therapy for Couples and Families, 17*(4), 318-322. doi:10.1177/1066480709347359
- Chao, R. C. (2012). Racial/ethnic identity, gender-role attitudes, and multicultural counseling competence: The role of multicultural counseling training. *Journal of Counseling & Development, 90*(1), 35-44. doi:10.1111/j.1556-6676.2012.00006.x

- Chieffo, L., & Griffiths, L. (2004). Large-scale assessment of student attitudes after a short-term study abroad program. *Frontiers: The Interdisciplinary Journal of Study Abroad*, *10*, 165-177.
- Choi, K. M., VanVoorhis, R. W., & Ellenwood, A. E. (2015). Enhancing critical consciousness through a cross-cultural immersion experience in south africa. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development*, *43*(4), 244-261. doi:10.1002/jmcd.12019
- Cokley, K., McClain, S., Enciso, A., & Martinez, M. (2013). An examination of the impact of minority stress and impostor feelings on the mental health and diverse ethnic minority students. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development*, *41*(2), 82-95. doi:10.1002/j.2161-1912.2013.00029.x
- Colby, S. L., & Ortman, J. M. (2015, March). Projections of the size and composition of the u.s. population: 2014 to 2060. Retrieved from <http://www.census.gov/content/dam/Census/library/publications/2015/demo/p25-1143.pdf>
- Counsel for Accreditation of Counseling and Related Educational Programs [CACREP] (2016). 2016 standards for accreditation. Alexandria, VA: Author.
- Cranton, P. A. (2002). Teaching for transformation. *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, *93*, 63-71. doi:10.1002/ace.50View
- Creswell, J. W. (2012). *Educational research: Planning, conducting, and evaluating quantitative and qualitative research* (4th ed.). Boston, MA: Pearson Education.

- Cunningham, T., Caldwell, C., & Geltner, J. (2011). A short-term study abroad program for school counseling students. *Georgia School Counselors Association Journal*, 22-25.
- D'Andrea, M., Daniels, J., & Heck, R. (1991). Evaluating the impact of multicultural counseling training. *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 70(1), 143-150. doi:10.1002/j.1556-6676.1991.tb01576.x
- David, E. J. R. (2010). Cultural mistrust and mental health help-seeking attitudes among filipino americans. *Asian American Journal of Psychology*, 1(1), 57-66. doi:10.1037/a0018814
- DeRicco, J. N., & Sciarra, D. T. (2005). The immersion experience in multicultural counselor training: Confronting covert racism. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development*, 33(1), 2-16. doi:10.1002/j.2161-1912.2005.tb00001.x
- Eack, S. M., & Newhill, C. E. (2012). Racial disparities in mental health outcomes after psychiatric hospital discharge among individuals with severe mental illness. *Social Work Research*, 36(1), 41-52. doi:10.1093/swr/svs014
- Fawcett, M. L., Briggs, C. A., Maycock, G., & Stine, E. (2010). Multicultural counseling competency development with a guatemala travel study. *Journal for International Counselor Education*, 2(1), 1-18.
- Fraga, E. D., Atkinson, D. R., & Wampold, B. E. (2004). Ethnic group preferences for multicultural counseling competencies. *Cultural Diversity and Ethnic Minority Psychology*, 10(1), 53-65. doi:10.1037/1099-9809.10.1.53

- Franklin, K. (2010). Long-term career impact and professional applicability of the study abroad experience. *Frontiers: The Interdisciplinary Journal of Study Abroad*, 19, 169-190.
- Guiffrida, D. A. (2005). The emergence model: An alternative pedagogy for facilitating self-reflection and theoretical fit in counseling students. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, 44(3), 201-213. doi:10.1002/j.1556-6978.2005.tb01747.x
- Guth, L. J., McAuliffe, G., & Michalak, M. (2012). Beyond u.s. borders: Impact of a study abroad institute on counselors' multicultural competencies. *VISTAS* 2012, 94, 1-13.
- Holcomb-McCoy, C. C., & Myers, J. E. (1999). Multicultural competence and counselor training: A national survey. *Journal of Counseling & Development*, 77(3), 294-302. doi:10.1002/j.1556-6676.1999.tb02452.x
- Holden, K. B., McGregor, B. S., Blanks, S. H., & Mahaffey, C. (2012). Psychosocial, socio-cultural, and environmental influences on mental health help-seeking among african-american men. *Journal of Men's Health*, 9(2), 63-69. doi:10.1016/j.jomh.2012.03.002
- Hubbs, D. L., & Brand, C. F. (2005). The paper mirror: Understanding reflective journaling. *Journal of Experiential Education*, 28(1), 60-71. doi:10.1177/105382590502800107
- Humbert, T. K., Burket, A., Deveney, R., & Kennedy, K. (2012). Occupational therapy students' perspectives regarding international cross-cultural experiences. *Australian Occupational Therapy Journal*, 59, 225-234. doi:10.1111/j.1440-1630.2011.00987.x

- Jones, J. M., Sander, J. B., & Booker, K. W. (2013). Multicultural competency building: Practical solutions for training and evaluating student progress. *Training and Education in Professional Psychology, 7*(1), 12-22. doi:10.1037/a0030880
- Jurgens, J. C., & McAuliffe, G. (2004). Short-term study-abroad experience in Ireland: An exercise in cross-cultural counseling. *International Journal for the Advancement of Counselling, 26*(2), 147-161.
- Kagnici, D. Y. (2014). Reflections of a multicultural counseling course: A qualitative study with counseling students and counselors. *Educational Sciences: Theory and Practice, 14*(1), 53-62. doi:10.12738/estp.2014.1.1965
- Kearney, L. K., Draper, M., & Baron, A. (2005). Counseling utilization by ethnic minority college students. *Cultural Diversity and Ethnic Minority Psychology, 11*(3), 272-285. doi:10.1037/1099-9809.11.3.272
- Kim, B. S., & Lyons, H. Z. (2003). Experiential activities and multicultural counseling competence training. *Journal of Counseling & Development, 81*(4), 400-408. doi:10.1002/j.1556-6678.2003.tb00266.x
- Koch, T. (2006). Establishing rigour in qualitative research: The decision trail. *Journal of Advanced Nursing, 53*(1), 91-100. doi:10.1111/j.1365-2648.2006.03681.x
- Kohn-Wood, L. P., & Hooper, L. M. (2014). Cultural competency, culturally tailored care, and the primary care setting: Possible solutions to reduce racial/ethnic disparities in mental health care. *Journal of Mental Health Counseling, 36*(2), 173-188. doi:10.17744/mehc.36.2.d73h217l81tg6uv3

- Korman, M. (1974). National conference on levels and patterns of professional training in psychology: The major themes. *American Psychologist*, 29(6), 441-449. doi:10.1037/h0036469
- Kuennen, J. K. (2015). Critical reflection: A transformative learning process integrating theory and evidence-based practice. *Worldviews on Evidenced-Based Nursing*, 12(5), 306-308. doi:10.1111/wvn.12095
- LaVeist, T. A., Nickerson, K. J., & Bowie, J. V. (2000). Attitudes about racism, medical mistrust and satisfaction with care among african american and white cardiac patients. *Medical Care Research and Review*, 57(1), 146-161. doi:10.1177/107755800773743637
- Mackey, A., & Gass, S. M. (2005). *Second language research: Methodology and design*. Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.
- McDowell, T., Goessling, K., & Melendez, T. (2012). Transformative learning through international immersion: Building multicultural competence in family therapy and counseling. *Journal of Marital and Family Therapy*, 38(2), 365-379.
- Merluzzi, T. V., & Hegde, K. (2003). Implications of social and cultural influences for multicultural competencies in health psychology. In *Handbook of multicultural competencies in counseling and psychology* (pp. 420-438). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Mezirow, J. (1997). Transformative learning: Theory to practice. *New Directions for Adult & Continuing Education*, (74), 5-12. doi:10.1002/ace.7401

- Mezirow, J. (2000). Learning to think like an adult: Core concepts of transformative theory. In *Learning as transformation* (pp. 3-33). San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Mezirow, J. (2012). Learning to think like an adult: Core concepts of transformation theory. In *The handbook of transformative learning* (pp. 73-94). San Francisco, CA: John Wiley & Sons.
- Migration Policy Institute. (2016). Frequently requested statistics on immigrants and immigration in the united states. *Migration Information Source*, 1-27. Retrieved from <http://www.migrationpolicy.org/article/frequently-requested-statistics-immigrants-and-immigration-united-states>
- Neuendorf, K. A. (2002). *The content analysis guidebook*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Nohl, A. M. (2015). Typical phases of transformative learning: A practice-based model. *Adult Education Quarterly*, 65(1), 35-49. doi:10.1177/0741713614558582
- Pederson, P. B. (1991). Multiculturalism as a generic approach to counseling. *Journal of Counseling & Development*, 70(1), 6-12. doi:10.1002/j.1556-6676.1991.tb01555.x
- Pieterse, A. L., Evans, S. A., Risner-Butner, A., Collins, N. M., & Mason, L. B. (2009). Multicultural competence and social justice training in counseling psychology and counselor education: A review and analysis of a sample of multicultural course syllabi. *Counseling Psychologist*, 37(1), 93-115. doi:10.1177/0011000008319986
- Ponterotto, J. G., Alexander, C. M., & Grieger, I. (1995). A multicultural competency checklist for counseling training programs. *Journal of Multicultural*

Counseling and Development, 23(1), 11-20. doi:10.1002/j.2161-1912.1995.tb00262.x

Potter, W. J., & Levine-Donnerstein, D. (1999). Rethinking validity and reliability in content analysis. *Journal of Applied Communication Research*, 27(3), 258-284. doi:10.1080/00909889909365539

Prosek, E., & Michel, R. (2016). Transformative learning for counselor trainees: Implementation of the multicultural immersion experience model. *International Journal for the Advancement of Counseling*, 38, 61-76. doi:10.1007/s10447-015-9256-1

Ratts, M. J., Singh, A. A., Nassar-McMillan, S., Butler, S. K., & McCullough, J. R. (2015). *Multicultural and Social Justice Counseling Competencies*.

Ratts, M. J., Singh, A. A., Nassar-McMillan, S., Butler, S. K., & McCullough, J. R. (2016). Multicultural and social justice counseling competencies: Guidelines for the counseling profession. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development*, 44(1), 28-48. doi:10.1002/jmcd.12035

Ribeiro, M., & Ribeiro, D. (2005). Fostering multicultural and identity development in adult learners through study tours. *ADULTSPAN Journal*, 4(2), 92-104. doi:10.1002/j.2161-0029.2005.tb00123.x

Ridley, C. R., & Kleiner, A. J. (2003). Multicultural counseling competence: History, themes, and issues. In *Handbook of multicultural competencies in counseling and psychology*(pp. 3-20). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

- Ridley, C. R., Mendoza, D. W., & Kanitz, B. E. (1994). Multicultural training: Reexamination, operationalization, and integration. *The Counseling Psychologist, 22*(2), 227-289. doi:10.1177/0011000094222001
- Robinson, J. S., Bowman, R. P., Ewing, T., Hanna, J., & Lopez-De Fede, A. (1997). *Building cultural bridges*. Bloomington, IN: National Educational Service.
- Rogers, M. R., & O'Bryon, E. C. (2014). Multicultural training models and curriculum. In *Apa handbook of multicultural psychology, vol. 2: Applications and training* (pp. 659-679). Washington D.C.: American Psychological Association.
- Rogers-Siren, L., Melendez, F., Refano, C., & Zegarra, Y. (2015). Immigrant perception of therapists' cultural competence: A qualitative investigation. *Professional Psychology: Research and Practice, 46*(4), 258-269. doi:10.1037/pro0000033
- Roholt, R. V., & Fisher, C. (2013). Expect the unexpected: International short-term study course pedagogies and practices. *Journal of Social Work Education, 49*, 48-65. doi:10.1080/10437797.2013.755416
- Shannonhouse, L., Barden, S., & Mobley, K. A. (2015). Qualitative outcomes of a homestay immersion with critical reflection. *Counselor Education and Supervision, 54*(4), 302-319. doi:10.1002/ceas.12028
- Shea, M., & Yeh, C. J. (2008). Asian american students' cultural values, stigma, and relational self-construal: Correlates of attitudes toward professional help seeking. *Journal of Mental Health Counseling, 30*(2), 157-172. doi:10.17744/mehc.30.2.g662g5l2r1352198

- Smith, J. E., McAuliffe, G., & Rippard, K. S. (2014). Counseling students' transformative learning through a study abroad curriculum. *Counselor Education and Supervision, 53*, 306-319. doi:10.1002/j.1556-6978.2014.00065.x
- Smith, K., & Curry, K. (2011). Is it worth it? Measuring the long-term effects of an international experience for nursing students in ecuador. *Journal of Community Health Nursing, 28*, 14-22. doi:10.1080/07370016.2011.539080
- Smith-Augustine, S., Dowden, A., Wiggins, A., & Hall, L. (2014). International immersion in belize: Fostering counseling students' cultural self-awareness. *International Journal for the Advancement of Counselling, 36*(4), 468-484. doi:10.1007/s10447-014-9219-y
- Snowden, L. R., & Cheung, F. K. (1990). Use of inpatient mental health services by members of ethnic minority groups. *American Psychologist, 45*(3), 347-355. doi:10.1037/0003-066X.45.3.347
- Sodowsky, G. R., Taffe, R. C., Gutkin, T. B., & Wise, S. L. (1994). Development of the multicultural counseling inventory: A self-report measure of multicultural counseling competencies. *Journal of Counseling Psychology, 41*(2), 137-148. doi:10.1037/0022-0167.41.2.137
- Stebbleton, M. J., Soria, K. M., & Cherney, B. T. (2013). The high impact of education abroad: College students' engagement in international experiences and the development of intercultural competencies. *Frontiers: The Interdisciplinary Journal of Study Abroad, 22*, 1-24.

- Stemler, S. (2001). An overview of content analysis. *Practical Assessment, Research & Evaluation*, 7(17), 1-6. Retrieved from <http://PAREonline.net/getvn.asp?v=7&n=17>
- Stroud, A. H. (2010). Who plans (not) to study abroad? An examination of u.s. student intent. *Journal of Studies in International Education*, 14(5), 491-507. doi:10.1177/1028315309357942
- Sue, D. W., Arredondo, P., & McDavis, R. J. (1992). Multicultural counseling competencies and standards: A call to the profession. *Journal of Counseling & Development*, 70(4), 477-486. doi:10.1002/j.1556-6676.1992.tb01642.x
- Sue, D. W., Bernier, J. E., Durran, A., Feinberg, L., Pederson, P., Smith, E. J., & Vasquez-Nuttall, E. (1982). Position paper: Cross-cultural counseling competencies. *The Counseling Psychologist*, 10(2), 45-52. doi:10.1177/0011000082102008
- Sue, D. W., & Sue, D. (1977). Barriers to effective cross-cultural counseling. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 24(5), 420-428. doi:10.1037/0022-0167.24.5.420
- Sue, D. W., & Sue, D. (2008). *Counseling the culturally diverse: Theory and practice* (5th ed.). Hoboken, NJ: John Wiley & Sons.
- Sue, D. W., & Sue, D. (2016). *Counseling the culturally diverse: Theory and practice* (7th ed.). Hoboken, NJ: John Wiley & Sons.
- Tomlinson-Clarke, S. M., & Clarke, D. (2010). Culturally focused community-centered service learning: An international cultural immersion experience. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development*, 38, 166-175. doi:10.1002/j.2161-1912.2010.tb00124.x

- U.S. Census Bureau. (2001). *Population profile of the united states*. Retrieved from Washington DC: U.S. Government Printing Office website:
<https://www.census.gov/prod/2001pubs/p23-profile2000.pdf>
- U.S. Census Bureau. (2010). *Income, poverty, and health insurance coverage in the united states: 2009*. Retrieved from Washington DC: U.S. Government Printing Office website: <http://www.census.gov/prod/2010pubs/p60-238.pdf>
- U.S. Department of Homeland Security. (2016). *U.s. naturalizations: 2014*. Retrieved from Washington DC: DHS Office of Immigration Statistics website:
https://www.dhs.gov/sites/default/files/publications/Naturalization%20Flow%20Report_2014_508.pdf
- Vázquez, L. A., & Vázquez, E. G. (2003). Teaching multicultural competence in the counseling curriculum. In *Handbook of multicultural competencies in counseling and psychology*(pp. 547-561). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Williamson, W. (2008). *Study abroad 101* (2nd ed.). St. Joseph, MI: Agapy.
- Zalaquett, C. P., Foley, P. F., Tillotson, K., Dinsmore, J. A., & Hof, D. (2008). Multicultural and social justice training for counselor education programs and colleges of education: Rewards and challenges. *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 86(3), 323-329. doi:10.1002/j.1556-6678.2008.tb00516.x

Appendix A

Audit Trail

January 27, 2017 -

Primary researcher utilized Auburn University online database to search the American Counseling Association (ACA) and ACA division journals. These journals included: *The Journal of Counseling & Development (JCD)*, *Adultspan Journal*, *The Career Development Quarterly (CDQ)*, *Counseling and Values (CVJ)*, *Counselor Education and Supervision (CES)*, *The Journal of Addictions & Offender Counseling (JAOC)*, *The Journal of College Counseling (JCC)*, *The Journal of Employment Counseling (JEC)*, *The Journal of Humanistic Counseling (JHC)*, *The Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development (JMCD)*, *Counseling Outcome Research and Evaluation (CORE)*, *Measurement and Evaluation in Counseling and Development (MECD)*, *The Family Journal (TFJ)*, *The Journal of Child and Adolescent Counseling (JCAC)*, *The Journal of Creativity in Mental Health (JCMH)*, *The Journal of LGBT Issues in Counseling*, *The Journal of Mental Health Counseling (JMHC)*, *The Journal of Military and Government Counseling (JMGC)*, *The Journal for Social Action in Counseling and Psychology (JSACP)*, *The Journal for Specialists in Group Work (JSGW)*, *Professional School Counseling*, and *The Rehabilitation Counseling Bulletin (RCB)*.

Three journals, *Journal of Child and Adolescent Counseling*, *Journal of Military and Government Counseling*, and *Journal for Social Action in Counseling and Psychology*, were not available using the selected online databases.

February 1, 2017 -

Primary researcher met with Chair, Dr. Evans, to discuss possible methodological changes before scheduled proposal. She encouraged me to explore whether or not ACA, CACREP or other counseling entities defined “international experiences” to determine the key words chosen for data collection.

Primary researcher explored ACA and CACREP standards and mandates for a definition of “international experience” in the counseling profession but none were found. The final decision was made to keep *immersion*, *international service learning*, *international travel*, and *study abroad* as keywords, chosen because of their utilization in literature pertaining to international experiences in higher education.

February 8, 2017 -

Abstracts of journal publications collected (n = 39) were reviewed. 31 publications were excluded, as they did not meet inclusionary criteria for this study (see Appendix B).

February 9, 2017 -

Primary researcher proposed dissertation to committee. Proposal was approved and primary researcher was given approval to continue with research study.

Minimal feedback was given by committee and was changed following proposal meeting.

February 12, 2017 -

Three missing journals from online database (i.e., *Journal of Child and Adolescent Counseling*, *Journal of Military and Government Counseling*, and *Journal for Social Action in Counseling and Psychology*) were reviewed by reading abstracts of each publication from the years 1991-2016 on journal website.

No publications were found in any of the three missing journals relevant to international experiences in counselor education and the development of multicultural competencies through transformative learning.

February 14, 2017 -

Data analysis begins. Primary researcher categorized various characteristics of publications and created a framework for the study's codebook.

February 15, 2017 -

Further analysis was conducted on publication characteristics (e.g., publication year, research vs. nonresearch, research design, and authorship and affiliation)

February 16, 2017 -

Primary researcher created tables for analysis of results (e.g., keyword frequency, and journal affiliation and research design)

February 17-19, 2017 -

Primary researcher continued writing results section and submitted rough draft to Chair, Dr. Evans

February 24-26, 2017 -

Further analysis was conducted for publication implications, recommendations, content, and themes.

Each publication (n = 8) was thoroughly examined once. Following the first examination of each publication, the primary researcher reexamined each publication and identified emerging themes. If one publication had a predominate theme, this theme was noted in every other publication. Each identified theme was color coded by the primary researcher and a final number was noted for each theme across publications.

February 27, 2017 -

Primary researcher continued analysis of publication themes and received feedback from Chair, Dr. Evans.

Dr. Evans recommended that the primary researcher restructure the results section. She noted that the section needed to be more linearly written, and that more specificity needed to be added to each section of analysis.

March 2, 2017 -
Analysis of publication themes was completed.

Emerging themes included (1) critical reflection, (2) cultural interaction, (3) cultural sensitivity, (4) relationships, (5) disorienting dilemma, and (6) critical consciousness.

March 3, 2017 -
The primary researcher met with the recruited external auditor (EA). The EA was informed of the literature pertaining to this study and we discussed the methodological approach in-depth. The coding procedure, inclusionary criteria, and data collected were also discussed.

The EA recommended restructuring the current codebook for clarity. The codebook was reviewed and the EA agreed that the coding procedure and emerging publication themes identified were not the result of researcher bias. Finally, the EA recommended using terminology directly from the literature of the proposal when defining the terms identified as emerging themes.

March 4, 2017 -
Primary researcher restructured the codebook as suggested by the EA and added sections for theme frequency and definitions.

Primary researcher met with recruited Auburn University doctoral student who would ensure reproducibility of the study. Primary researcher reviewed the coding procedure with recruited coder, provided her with dissertation proposal and randomly selected publications (n = 2), which she would code and discuss her coding with primary researcher in the near future.

March 7, 2017 -
Primary researcher met with EA for final time and discussed definitions for emerging themes of study. The EA agreed that the identification and definition of themes did not result from researcher bias.

March 8, 2017 –
Primary researcher recoding 25% of collected publications (n = 2) to achieve stability for the content analysis study. These coding judgments matched earlier coding judgments, therefore, the study was considered to be stable.

March 7-9, 2017 -
Primary researcher continued revising results section as it related to Chair's previous feedback and recommendations.

March 10, 2017 -

Primary research submitted revised results section to Chair, Dr. Evans, and made proposed plan for discussion section

March 14, 2017 -

Dr. Evans approved newly revised results section and advised to begin writing discussion section. Dr. Evans also recommended creating additional tables for authorship and affiliation

March 15-26, 2017 -

Primary researcher began formatting and writing discussion section

Primary researcher met with individual recruited to ensure reproducibility for the content analysis study. Primary researcher and individual discussed her coding of randomly selected publications (25%; n = 2). Although certain terms coded by recruited coder were different than those identified as themes by primary researcher, the terms were similar enough in definition and meaning (e.g., cultural dissonance and *disorienting dilemma*). Another example in coding differences is that the recruited individual did not code *critical consciousness* because it only occurred three times in her randomly assigned sample. However, *critical consciousness* was identified as a theme by the primary researcher due to its prevalence in other articles not reviewed by the recruited coder. Once discussed, the recruited coder agreed with the terms identified as emerging themes by the primary researcher. The recruited coder and primary researcher's coding patterns were in agreement, therefore, the coding for this study can be considered reproducible using the identified coding scheme

March 26, 2017 -

Primary researcher submitted discussion section to Dr. Evans for review.

April 2, 2017 -

Dr. Evans approved discussion section and advised to put dissertation into Auburn University Graduate School dissertation format.

April 3-5, 2017 -

Primary researcher formatted dissertation to Auburn University Graduate School format, adding title page, abstract, acknowledgements, table of contents, and appendices.

April 6, 2017 -

Primary researcher submitted dissertation manuscript to Dr. Evans for final review.

Appendix B

Excluded Publications

International experiences were not addressed:

- Anderson, D. J., & Cranston-Gingras, A. (1991). Sensitizing counselors and educators to multicultural issues: An interactive approach. *Journal of Counseling & Development, 70*(1), 91-98. doi:10.1002/j.1556-6676.1991.tb01567.x
- Arnhold, R. M., & Razak, W. N. (1991). Overcoming learned helplessness: Managerial strategies for the 1990s. *Journal of Employment Counseling, 28*(3), 99-106. doi:10.1002/j.2161-1920.1991.tb00398.x
- Carter, R. T. (1991). Racial identity attitudes and psychological functioning. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development, 19*(3), 105-114. doi:10.1002/j.2161-1912.1991.tb00547.x
- Carter, R. T., & Parks, E. E. (1996). Womanist identity and mental health. *Journal of Counseling & Development, 74*(5), 484-489. doi:10.1002/j.1556-6676.1996.tb01897.x
- Carter, R. T., Pieterse, A. L., & Smith, S. (2008). Racial identity status profiles and expressions of anger in black americans: An exploratory study. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development, 36*(2), 101-112. doi:10.1002/j.2161-1912.2008.tb00074.x
- Chang, D. H. (2002). The past, present, and future of career counseling in taiwan. *Career Development Quarterly, 50*(3), 218-225. doi:10.1002/j.2161-0045.2002.tb00897.x
- Evans, M., & Atkins, M. J. (2007). Making meaning using creativity and spirituality. *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health, 2*(1), 35-46. doi:10.1300/j456v02n01_04
- Hipolito-Delgado, C. P., Cook, J. M., Avrus, E. M., & Bonham, E. J. (2011). Developing counseling students' multicultural competence through the multicultural action project. *Counselor Education & Supervision, 50*(6), 402-421. doi:10.1002/j.1556-6978.2011.tb01924.x
- Hipolito-Delgado, C. P., Cook, J. M., Avrus, E. M., & Bonham, E. J. (2013). The lived experience of cultural immersion. *The Journal of Humanistic Counseling, 52*(2), 191-207. doi:10.1002/j.2161-1939.2013.00042.x
- Ishii, H., Gilbride, D. D., & Stensrud, R. (2009). Students' internal reactions to a one-week cultural immersion trip: A qualitative analysis of student journals. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development, 37*(1), 15-27. doi:10.1002/j.2161-1912.2009.tb00088.x

- Ivers, N. N., Ivers, J. J., & Duffey, T. (2013). Second language acquisition: Cultural, cognitive, and clinical considerations for counseling practice. *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health, 8*(3), 219-234. doi:10.1080/15401383.2013.821920
- LeBeauf, I., Maples, M. F., D'Andrea, L., Watson, Z., & Packman, J. (2007). Is affirmative action still necessary? *Journal of Employment Counseling, 44*(3), 98-114. doi:10.1002/j.2161-1920.2007.tb00029.x
- Mahalik, J. R., Pierre, M. R., & Wan, S. S. (2006). Examining racial identity and masculinity as correlates of self-esteem and psychological distress in black men. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development, 34*(2), 94-104. doi:10.1002/j.2161-1912.2006.tb00030.x
- Neville, H. A., Heppner, P. P., & Wang, L. (1997). Relations among racial identity attitudes, perceived stressors, and coping styles in african american college students. *Journal of Counseling & Development, 75*(4), 303-311. doi:10.1002/j.1556-6676.1997.tb02345.x
- Ossana, S. M., Helms, J. E., & Leonard, M. M. (1992). Do "womanist" identity attitudes influence college women's self-esteem and perceptions of environmental bias. *Journal of Counseling & Development, 70*(3), 402-408. doi:10.1002/j.1556-6676.1992.tb01624.x
- Peterson, J. S., & Deusche, C. (2006). A model for supervising school counseling students without teaching experience. *Counselor Education & Supervision, 45*(4), 267-281. doi:10.1002/j.1556-6978.2006.tb00003.x
- Pope-Davis, D. B., Liu, W. M., Ledesma-Jones, S., & Nevitt, J. (2000). African american acculturation and black racial identity: A preliminary investigation. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development, 28*(2), 98-112. doi:10.1002/j.2161-1912.2000.tb00610.x
- Ricco, J. N., & Sciarra, D. T. (2005). The immersion experience in multicultural counselor training: confronting covert racism. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development, 33*(1), 2-16. doi:10.1002/j.2161-1912.2005.tb00001.x
- Scholl, M. B. (2006). Native american identity development and counseling preferences: A study of lumbee undergraduates. *Journal of College Counseling, 9*(1), 47-59. doi:10.1002/j.2161-1882.2006.tb00092.x
- Sciarra, D. T., & Gushue, G. V. (2003). White racial identity development and religious orientation. *Journal of Counseling & Development, 81*(4), 473-482. doi:10.1002/j.1556-6678.2003.tb00274.x
- Vandiver, B. J., Fhagen-Smith, P. E., Cokley, K. O., Cross, W. E., & Worrell, F. C. (2001). Cross's nigrescence model: From theory to scale to theory. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development, 29*(3), 174-200. doi:10.1002/j.2161-1912.2001.tb00516.x
- Watson, J. C. (2009). Native american racial identity development and college adjustment at two-year institutions. *Journal of College Counseling, 12*(2), 125-136. doi:10.1002/j.2161-1882.2009.tb00110.x
- Wilton, L., & Constantine, M. G. (2003). Length of residence, cultural adjustment difficulties, and psychological distress symptoms in asian and latin american international college students. *Journal of College Counseling, 6*(2), 177-186. doi:10.1002/j.2161-1882.2003.tb00238.x

- Winograd, G., & Tryon, G. S. (2009). Counseling expectations among students in an opportunity program: Dispositional and cultural differences. *Journal of Counseling & Development, 87*(4), 438-448. doi:10.1002/j.1556-6678.2009.tb00128.x
- Worrell, F. C., Cross, W. E., & Vandiver, B. J. (2001). Nigrescence theory: current status and challenges for the future. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development, 29*(3), 201-213. doi:10.1002/j.2161-1912.2001.tb00517.x

International experiences for counseling students was not the focus:

- Bikos, L. H., Haney, D., Edwards, R. W., North, M. A., Quint, M., McLellan, J., & Ecker, D. L. (2014). Missionary kid career development: A consensual qualitative research investigation through a social cognitive lens. *The Career Development Quarterly, 62*(2), 156-174. doi:10.1002/j.2161-0045.2014.00077.x
- Christofi, V., & Thompson, C. L. (2007). You cannot go home again: A phenomenological investigation of returning to the sojourn country after studying abroad. *Journal of Counseling & Development, 85*(1), 53-63. doi:10.1002/j.1556-6678.2007.tb00444.x
- Kostohryz, K., Wells, P., Wathen, C., & Wilson, D. (2014). More than a vacation: Exploring the impact of reentry for international sojourners. *Journal of Mental Health Counseling, 36*(4), 315-327. doi:10.17744/mehc.36.4.q485244385814n73
- Rabinowitz, F. E. (1994). The impact of an interpersonal encounter-group class for north american college students studying abroad. *The Journal for Specialists in Group Work, 19*(1), 38-42. doi:10.1080/01933929408413762
- Ribeiro, M. D. (2005). Fostering multicultural and identity development in adult learners through study tours. *Adultspan Journal, 4*(2), 92-104. doi:10.1002/j.2161-0029.2005.tb00123.x

Publication was not a full-length article:

- Neault, R. A. (2009). A review of working world: careers in international education, exchange, and development. *Journal of Employment Counseling, 46*(4), 185-186. doi:10.1002/j.2161-1920.2009.tb00082.x