

How Multiracial Individuals Are Addressed in Diversity Courses in Counselor Master's Degree Programs: A Mixed Methods Content Analysis

by

Patrick Murphy

A dissertation submitted to the Graduate Faculty of
Auburn University
in partial fulfillment of the
requirements for the Degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

Auburn, Alabama
August 4, 2018

Keywords: Multiracial, Biracial, Mixed Race, Mixed Heritage

Copyright 2018 by Patrick Devin Murphy

Approved by

Amanda Evans, Chair, Associate Professor
Chippewa Thomas, Associate Professor
Nicholas Derzis, Assistant Clinical Professor
Jessica Tyler, Assistant Clinical Professor

Abstract

People who identify as Multiracial are a growing population in the United States and they now account for up to 10% of all new births (Pew Research Center, 2015; Root, 1996). While inclusion of Multiracial Individuals has expanded over the years, there is also a tendency for Multiracial Individuals to be under-represented, misidentified, or ignored as a population (Aguirre & Turner, 2011; Davis, 1991). The American Counseling Association (ACA) and Council for Accreditation of Counseling Related-Education Programs (CACREP) have updated their ethics codes and competencies standards to further highlight the need for and expectation of multicultural competencies (ACA, 2014; CACREP, 2016). However, this comes from a monoracial prospective and competencies around Multiracial groups were not specifically identified until 2015 by the Multi-Racial/Ethnic Counseling Concerns. Additionally, despite the growing movement to develop multicultural competencies in counselors, there is not agreement regarding specific guidelines on how to do so (Carter, 1995; Carter, 2001; Carter, 2003; Helms & Cook, 1999; Sue, 2001). This is especially true with reference to those persons who identify as Multiracial. To understand how this group is being addressed, this study is a mixed method content analysis to explore the content of syllabi, textbooks, and supplemental readings from Social and Cultural Diversity courses of counseling Master's degree programs. An exhaustive search of ninety-nine syllabi resulted in a total of thirty-three syllabi and eleven textbooks that mentioned Multiracial Individuals. Examination of these resulted in three emergent themes

based on the multicultural counseling competences: (1) Knowledge, (2) Skills, and (3) Self-awareness.

Acknowledgments

The amount of support provided by my family, friends, cohort and faculty has been immeasurable during this process and instrumental to my success. Their encouragement and support has been wonderful and a great motivator for me during this process. First, I would like to acknowledge my family. My mom, brother, and in-laws have been supportive through out this process and always willing to listen, even when they had no idea what I was talking about. I would also be remiss if I did not acknowledge my dad. Even though he passed before I started this process, he instilled the drive and determination in me that carried me through this process. I would also like to thank my friends for keeping me engaged and helping me balance my life.

My wife, Kendra, thank you for being the stability in my life through these last four years. I can not begin to describe the level and amount of support you have given without asking as I embarked on and worked through this milestone. You are everything and none of this would have been possible without you.

I also want to thank my cohort and the new friends I made through the doctoral program. Having a group of people to go through this process together is have been beyond helpful. You helped make sure I “kept swimming” and have continued to be a source of support, even after people began moving away and starting new chapters in this process.

Finally, I would like to thank the Auburn University faculty for their encouragement and guidance throughout the program. I would like to especially acknowledge my chair, Dr. Amanda Evans. Your guidance and support throughout this process has been incredible. Thank

you for keeping me on track in many ways and going out of your way to help me proceed. I have appreciated your mentorship more than I can express.

Table of Contents

Abstract	ii
Acknowledgments.....	iii
List of Tables	v
Chapter 1	1
Multiracial Individuals in the United States	3
Social and Cultural Issues Social and Cultural Issues in Counselor Education	4
Counseling Pedagogy and Multicultural Competencies	8
Chapter 2	14
Content Analysis	14
Purpose	16
Data Collection	16
Data Analysis	17
Trustworthiness.....	18
Chapter 3	21
Content Analysis.....	21
Data Collection	24
Data Analysis	31
Results.....	32
Emergent Themes of Textbooks	45

Chapter 4	54
Social and Cultural Standards in Master’s Level Counseling Programs	55
Multicultural Competences	59
Limitations	61
Recommendations	62
Chapter 5	65
References	100
Appendix 1	108
Appendix 2	109

List of Tables

Table 1	33
Table 2	35
Table 3	36
Table 4	39

Chapter I

People who identify as Multiracial are a growing population in the United States and they now account for up to 10% of all new births (Pew Research Center, 2015; Root, 1996). The Pew Research Center (2015) found that of those surveyed who identified as Multiracial, 50% identified as American Indian and White, 12% African American and American Indian, 11% Multiracial Hispanic, 11% African American and White, 6% White, African-American, and American Indian, 5% other and 4% White and Asian American. While inclusion of Multiracial Individuals has expanded over the years, there is also a tendency for Multiracial Individuals to be under-represented, misidentified, or ignored as a population (Aguirre & Turner, 2011; Davis, 1991). This is evident in how the United States collects data about this population, not adding the option to mark more than one category on the Census until 2000. Historical views of race have also contributed to this as Multiracial Individuals are often labeled as monoracial due to ideas such as the “One Drop Rule,” whereby a Multiracial Individual who has at least one known ancestor of African descent is viewed as African American instead of their full racial/ethnic identity (Davis, 1991).

Despite the continuous growth of this population, the field of counseling has been slow in identifying clear guidelines in working with or educating counselors-in-training about this population. Counseling as a field acknowledged multiculturalism as being the fourth force in counseling approximately eighteen years ago (Sue et al, 1992; Pederson, 1991). Both the American Counseling Association (ACA) and Council for Accreditation of Counseling Related-Education Programs (CACREP) have updated their ethics codes and competencies standards to further highlight the need for and expectation of multicultural competencies (ACA, 2014; CACREP, 2016). Specifically, this is grounded in honoring and considering the unique

backgrounds of the clients that counselors may serve and the need to make sure that counselors-in-training have an understanding of unique cultures different from their own as well as an understanding of how their own personal biases can impact the counseling relationship. However, this comes from a monoracial perspective and competencies around Multiracial groups were not specifically identified until 2015 by the Multi-Racial/Ethnic Counseling Concerns.

Despite the growing movement to develop multicultural competencies in counselors, there is not agreement regarding specific guidelines on how to do so (Carter, 1995; Carter, 2001; Carter, 2003; Helms & Cook, 1999; Sue, 2001). This is especially true with reference to those persons who identify as Multiracial. Due to this dearth of consensus and the growing population of Multiracial Individuals, it is important that we understand the pedagogy used to teach counselors-in-training about multiculturalism, in general, and how the topic of those who do not fit into monoracial categories are addressed, in specific.

The purpose of the proposed study is to explore how counselor education programs are teaching counselors-in-training about Multiracial Individuals and their future counseling relationships with those individuals. The study will do so by using a descriptive content analysis of syllabi and associated materials of Social and Cultural Diversity classes in CACREP-accredited counselor education programs. In addition, the study seeks to determine the amount of exposure and nature of training given to students regarding Multiracial Individuals. By doing so it is intended to help counselor education programs recognize whether they are adequately addressing Multiracial Individuals and whether counselors-in-training are being satisfactorily trained and educated about working with individuals who identify as Multiracial. It is posited that it is important that counselors are aware of the unique experiences and needs of Multiracial

Individuals and how that may differ when compared to the more traditional teaching of the experiences and needs of monoracial individuals.

Multiracial Individuals in the United States

Multiracial Individuals have a long and difficult history in the United States. Those identifying as Multiracial have been documented in the United States as early as the 17th century (Root, 1996). However, the relationships and the Multiracial children who came from them were not looked upon favorably and were illegal until recently (Douglas, 2001). This was fueled by beliefs that interracial marriages were fundamentally wrong and would lead to the creation of children who would have problems due to them being Multiracial (Nash, 1999). Supporters argued against such beliefs, held the position that making such relationships illegal was against their rights during the abolitionist movement and challenged such laws as early as 1786 (Moulton, 2015).

Despite this, no real progress was made on this front until 1843, when states such as Massachusetts struck down laws banning these relationships (Nahs, 1999). However, the Supreme Court did not rule against these anti-miscegenation laws until 1967 in the Loving v. Virginia case. Several states held on to anti-miscegenation laws much longer than that, with Alabama being the last state to formally overturn such laws in November of 2000. While this has been a documented group of people since the 17th century, we did not add this as a category to the United States Census until 2000 (Perlmann & Waters, 2002). For this reason, it is difficult to provide documentation of exact numbers of those who identify as Multiracial over time, though it is believed there was an increase in Multiracial Individuals after the Supreme Court ruling (Jones & Bullock, 2012). Research does indicate that the number of interracial marriages

in 2013 was 6.3% (Wang, 2015). Additionally, in 2013 10% of all births were of parents of different races (Pew Research Center, 2015).

While a Multiracial Individual can be defined as any person who identifies as having biological ancestry of more than one racial group, the focus in the United States has predominantly been on White and African American individuals (Gonzalez-Barrera, 2015). This is especially true for the purpose of categorization and laws. Due to the stigma associated with being non-White through much of United States history, social constructs such as the One Drop Rule have been utilized. The One Drop Rule relates to the classification of an individual with a single known ancestor of African descent as being African American, rather than Multiracial, often as a means of taking rights away and labeling the person as being inferior (Davis, 1991). Even today, measures of “blood quantum” or the percentage of Indian blood, a concept created under the Dawes Act of 1887, is used to designate who, by law, is included in official measures of whether a person is or is not Native American for purposes of government records and benefits (Aguirre & Turner, 2011).

The evident growth of this population, challenging history, misidentification and representation demonstrates why this is a group that needs to be included in counselor educator literature as we continue to move toward increasing multicultural awareness in the field.

Social and Cultural Issues in Counselor Education

In the 1980s, multiculturalism became a stronger force and saw increased acceptance due to the Civil Rights and Women’s Movements of the previous decades (Sue & Sue, 2008). As a result, both the Association for Counseling and Development (AACD) and the American Psychological Association (APA) updated their ethical guidelines in 1981. These guidelines

required that clinicians have formal training on cultural differences (Sue et al., 1992). Also, in 1988, multiculturalism was deemed the fourth force in psychology (Pederson, 1991). While progress was being made, Sue et al. (1992) noted that counselors still tended to be trained in and work from a monocultural perspective, though there was a push by a number of professionals to include multiculturalism in training and counseling standards of practice. This included incorporating multiculturalism into official standards and ethical guidelines (Pedersen, 1991; Sue et al., 1992).

The 1988 ethical standards of ACCD, which later became the American Counseling Association (ACA), included very general suggestions of incorporating multiculturalism and diversity awareness in practice (Sue et al., 1992). In 1977, McFadden and Wilson conducted a curriculum survey in which they found that fewer than 1% of graduate programs required the study of ethnic and racial minorities. Additionally, a national survey of counselor education programs by Ibrahim, Stradler, Arredondo, & McFadden (1986) found that only 33% of the 58 programs surveyed required a course in cross-cultural counseling of any kind. This demonstrates that while increased conversations about the topic of multiculturalism were happening, programs were not fully incorporating these new ideas or standards.

Wyatt and Parham (1985) indicated that a reason multiculturalism was not incorporated into more programs at the time was due to uncertainty regarding how to incorporate such training into classes. Program directors were requesting guidance about how to do so. Additionally, the AMCD at the time stated that there was not an effective way to measure the incorporation of multiculturalism in coursework (Sue et al., 1992). As the push to further include multiculturalism continued, in 1991 a special issue of the *Journal of Counseling Development* entitled “Multiculturalism, the Fourth Force of Counseling” was published. The articles within

called for the redefining of counselors' understandings of race, including considerations of how race-labeling impacted identity and conceptualization, as well as corollary gender-related issues (Dobbins & Skillings, 1991; Davenport & Yurich, 199; Speight, Myers, Cox, & Highlen, 1991). 1992 also saw the publication of "Multicultural Counseling Competencies and Standards: A call to the Profession" by the Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development. Again, this called on the profession to have a defining set of standards and incorporation of multicultural competencies. This article was deemed important enough to the field that it was also published in the Journal of Counseling and Development, with the hopes of it reaching a broader professional audience (Sue et al., 1992).

More recently, the profession has continued to try to further define and provide clear guidance into incorporating multiculturalism in both practice and training, possibly with limited efficacy. In 2014, the ACA Code of Ethics was updated to include, among other things, a preamble that called for "honoring diversity and embracing a multicultural approach in support of the worth, dignity, potential, and uniqueness of people within their social and cultural contexts" (p. 3). It also gives guidance for teaching about multiculturalism in section F.7.c., specifically stating that "educators infuse material related to multiculturalism/diversity into all courses and workshops for the development of professional counselors." While this acknowledges the need to incorporate multiculturalism in training, an obvious critique would be that it offers no specific guidelines or indications on how to do so. This trend continues in multiple other sections in the ACA Code of Ethics.

Section E.5.b. encourages counselors to recognize the effects of culture on clients' experiences and to consider this when diagnosing. Section E.8. cautions counselors to be aware of multicultural issues as related to testing and assessment. Reiteratively, this is just promoting

awareness, not providing specific standards or practices. Section F.11. is more specific to Social and Cultural Diversity competence in counselor education and training programs, but primarily focuses on encouraging the recruitment and retention of diverse faculty and students. Again, when competencies and practices are mentioned, it is done vaguely with statements such as “actively infuse Social and Cultural Diversity competency in their training and supervision practices. They actively train students to gain awareness, knowledge, and skills in the competencies of multicultural practice” (F.11.C., 2014). While the more direct inclusion of these topics in the Code of Ethics is an improvement on previous iterations, they leave a great deal of room for interpretation of what it means to be multiculturally competent and how to go about training counselors to be such.

In 2016, the Council for Accreditation of Counseling Related-Education Programs (CACREP) listed social and cultural diversity as one of the eight common core areas of foundational knowledge (CACREP, 2016). CACREP is an independent agency recognized by the Council for Higher Education Accreditation as the accrediting body for Master’s degree-granting programs in mental health counseling and school counseling. Accreditation of a program by CACREP offers assurance of the quality of instruction and compliance with set standards (Murray, 2001). CACREP further elaborates on the common core area of social and cultural diversity, stating that it should contain: multicultural and pluralistic characteristics within and among diverse groups nationally and internationally, theories and models of multicultural counseling, cultural identity development, and social justice and advocacy, multicultural counseling competencies, the impact of heritage, attitudes, beliefs, understandings, and acculturative experiences on an individual’s views of others, the effects of power and privilege for counselors and clients, help-seeking behaviors of diverse clients, the impact of

spiritual beliefs on clients' and counselors' worldviews, and strategies for identifying and eliminating barriers, prejudices, and processes of intentional and unintentional oppression and discrimination (CACREP, 2016).

Further, the Multicultural Counseling Competences were revised in 2015 and are now the Multicultural and Social Justice Counseling Competencies. This shows both the continued evolution of the incorporation of standards related to multiculturalism in counseling and its importance (Ratts, Singh, Nassar, McMillan, Butler, & McCulough, 2015). It is also of note that the ACA recognized and endorsed the Competencies for Counseling the Multiracial Population that were created by the Multi-Racial/Ethnic Counseling Concerns (MRECC) in 2015.

Counseling Pedagogy and Multicultural Competencies

With the further push to improve multicultural competencies as counselors and the adoption of ACA, CACREP and MRECC standards, training programs have increasingly attempted to identify the best ways to provide such training. As such, courses focusing on multiculturalism are more integrated into the curriculums of counselor training programs, as well as those in other helping professions (Abreu et al., 2000). Due to the vagueness previously noted in these standards, how to approach doing so has become varied amongst programs. Sue et al. (1982) identified attitudes, beliefs, knowledge, skills and action as key components of cultural competency and training. Researchers also agree that developing as a multiculturally competent counselor is a multifaceted process that requires counselor trainees to gain knowledge related to their clients' cultural backgrounds, increase their personal awareness and apply appropriate skills and interventions when working with diverse clients (Coleman 2004; Sue et al. 1992).

Smith et al.'s (2006) meta-analysis indicated that multicultural training is associated with increased racial awareness and cultural sensitivity. Other studies have indicated at least a medium effect size for therapeutic outcomes when counselors use culturally sensitive interventions in therapy (Griner & Smith, 2006). This underpins the overall themes in the research beyond the advocacy being encouraged by ACA and CACREP, that multicultural training is important and ultimately necessary for counselors. Research also indicates that counselors-in-training are lacking in these areas and that many lack efficacy when working with diverse clients as well (Holcomb-McCoy & Myers, 1999). While there is not a great deal of research on quantifying best practices in training these competencies, there have been some attempts to do so. However, research has shown that specific courses dedicated to multicultural competencies can improve such competencies. Most researchers agree that due to the nature of the topic it cannot be solely acquired through one course (Carter, 1995; Carter, 2001; Carter, 2003; Helms & Cook, 1999; Sue, 2001). Instead there is the thought that this is something that should be integrated throughout a training program and ultimately throughout the counselor's entire professional career. This viewpoint is also supported by the ACA and MRECC standards and guidelines. Despite this, most counseling training programs do have one specific class in their curriculum to address this topic, though many argue that the concepts are integrated throughout.

A course entitled "Cross-Cultural Counseling Laboratory" was developed by Sam Johnson in which he sought to teach multicultural competency by using small group structured interviews. The intent was to increase cultural awareness of both self and others (Carter, 2003). Carter later developed his own model base after noting that the limitations of a course such as Sam Johnson's were its focus on awareness of the trainees' worldview and experiences of the

minority individual (Carter, 2003). Carter's model was called the Racial-Cultural Counseling Competence (RCCC) and it focused on the person as a counselor (Carter, 2001). RCCC views every counselor-in-training as bringing with them personal beliefs and what they were taught about themselves a racial/cultural person (Carter, 2001). The goal of this model was to heighten the awareness of the ideas, behaviors, and feelings and to understand how this both helps and hurts the counseling relationship. Despite these studies, very little research has examined pedagogy and interventions that multicultural courses utilize to meet CACREP standards and competences.

Classroom interventions such as experiential activities, reflective activities like journaling, videos, class discussions, and outside speakers are commonly used in counselor training (Neville et al., 1996; Sammons & Speight, 2008). A 2015 study by Barden and Greene found that a reconceptualization of pedagogy regarding this subject was needed, with a focus on incorporating more direct involvement and experiences with culturally diverse people and encouragement of direct interaction. To further highlight the need to examine the pedagogy related to teaching multiculturalism in courses, historically it has been demonstrated that such courses had a tendency to focus on the preparation of White students to work with clients with different racial/ethnic backgrounds from their own as opposed to preparing counselors from all backgrounds (Shorter-Gorden, 2009). This is based on the assumption that counselors who identify as White would be less culturally competent than their counterparts who identify as being of other race/ethnic backgrounds. In addition, the research about multicultural competencies of counselors-in-training are typically drawn from self-reports on multicultural counseling competence and multicultural counseling self-efficacy (Barden & Greene, 2015).

Due to the limitations of using self-report and their potential lack of reliability, more structured methods of instruction and evaluation are needed to assess competency. Additionally, this is problematic as it does not take into account the growing Multiracial population and other forms of intersection that may occur. Along these lines, there seem to be arguments from a perspective labeled as traditionalist that there should be a focus on only four traditional minority groups: African- Americans, Asian- Americans, Latinos, and Native Americans (Lentin, 2005). The argument was that the expansion beyond this has diluted the focus by including statuses such as gender and sexual orientation. However, this approach, in practice, can lead to the lack of acknowledgement of the impact that a much larger scope of racial/ethnic identities and intersections among these traditional four can have on an individual. Additionally, this could contribute to siloing of identities, as well as not honoring the preferred identities of clients, including Multiracial identities.

This and the previous research reinforce the idea that this is a complex and complicated topic. However, a beginning in unraveling this knot is to review the ways that Multiracial competencies are being taught in programs currently. While we have policies written in handbooks and other forms of guidelines, the empirical data about how the implementation of these policies and the actual engaged practices have been lacking. Once we have the formal knowledge regarding how these competencies are being dealt with in counseling programs, we can take stock of them and, hopefully, formulate a best practice model for the most effective means to be sure that counselors-in-training are being trained in the ways that will best prepare them to interact with Multiracial clients in the future.

Purpose of Study

The purpose of this descriptive content analysis was to explore how counselor education programs are addressing Multiracial Individuals and the provision of counseling services. The study analyzed syllabi and associated materials of Social and Cultural Diversity classes in CACREP-accredited counselor education programs. Additionally, the study sought to determine the amount of exposure and nature of training given to students regarding Multiracial Individuals. Ultimately, it is hoped that the findings will assist counselor educators and counselor education programs in training and education recommendations in working with individuals who identify as Multiracial. It is important that counselors are aware of the unique experiences and needs of Multiracial Individuals and how that may differ when compared to the more traditional teaching of the experiences and needs of monoracial individuals.

Research Questions

1. Are Multiracial Individuals included in CACREP-accredited masters counseling program syllabi and course materials?
2. What readings and assignments are included in CACREP-accredited masters counseling program syllabi and course materials that include Multiracial Individuals?

Significance of Study

Research indicates that the Multiracial population is continuing to grow. Because of this, counselors need to be able to provide competent and adequate counseling to Multiracial Individuals. In order to do so, counselors need to understand the unique characteristics and

needs of this growing population. It is currently estimated that by 2050, 20 percent of the population of the United States will be Multiracial (Lee & Bean, 2004). Due to this, it is much more likely that counselors will encounter or work with someone who identifies as part of this group. Those who identify as Multiracial experience a wide range of unique issues due to their ethnic backgrounds, which makes it important for counselors to understand how this identity may affect them and the counseling relationship (Henrikson & Maxwell, 2016).

While multicultural competency has been identified as the “fourth force” in counseling and competencies have been developed by ACA and CACREP to meet this identified need, counselor education programs tend to focus on monoracial groups. Additionally, there is a paucity in the research related to training counselors to work with this population, despite the competency standards set by CACREP, ACA, and, MRECC. In light of this, this study sought to identify both to what extent and how Multiracial groups are being addressed in Social and Cultural Diversity classes. This was intended to help identify whether there is a gap with this subject within counselor education programs as well as highlight the pedagogy utilized when it is addressed, thus contributing to the literature about multicultural training in general, as well as further clarifying how the competencies identified by CACREP and ACA are expressed in these training programs.

Chapter II

The current study used a mixed method content analysis to explore the syllabi and their associated textbooks and other course readings to determine how Master's degree Social and Cultural Diversity classes are addressing the development and facilitation of multicultural counseling competencies specifically for the Multiracial population. The literature and research indicating the importance of multicultural competencies is vast, but little focus has been given to the ever-growing Multiracial population and how counselor's competencies with this group are being addressed through multicultural training courses. The purpose of this content analysis is to determine if and how counseling training programs are addressing competences related to Multiracial clients, as opposed to the more traditional monoracial view point, in the syllabi and course materials. In this section content analysis has been described as a research methodology in general and as the specific methodology employed to analyze the extent to which and how Multiracial Individuals are discussed in multiculturalism and diversity classes in CACREP-accredited Master's degree training programs. The data collection process, analysis, and trustworthiness have also been discussed.

Content Analysis

This dissertation study is a descriptive content analysis that combines both quantitative and qualitative methodology. Research indicates that content analysis can be used to analyze a variety of texts and can provide an accurate way of highlighting developments within a given discipline (Buboltz, Miller, & Williams, 1999; Barrio-Minton, Morris, & Yates, 2014). The quantitative analysis was based on the post positivism paradigm (Berg & Lune, 2012). This

speaks to the assumption that the extent to which the Multiracial population is represented in Social and Cultural Diversity courses in counselor education programs can be discussed in quantitative terms. That this was done by identifying the presence of specific mentionings of Multiracial Individuals in the syllabi and textbooks associated with multicultural courses counted and measured using quantitative methodology. This information is important as it provides a way to measure the magnitude to which Multiracial Individuals are visible and highlighted within CACREP-accredited counselor education programs. However, without also including a qualitative component to this design, the overall idea of how Multiracial Individuals are addressed within these courses would not be complete.

The paradigm underlying the qualitative portion of this study is social constructionism. This paradigm emphasizes the cultural context of meaning-making and has the assumption that human experience is essentially subjective and mutable (Hays & Wood, 2011). In the context of this study, it describes how counselor educators and counseling students discuss and agree on the perception of Multiracial Individuals in the forum of these courses. This allowed for the diverse ways that counselor educators communicate to students to be addressed and understood and for the extent to which Multiracial Individuals were integrated and addressed in counselor education to be reviewed. The qualitative analysis also provided a basis for the analysis of how multicultural competences specifically regarding Multiracial Individuals are being addressed in the courses. Additionally, qualitative analysis contributed to the understanding of how counselors-in-training are encouraged to develop skills related to this population. By combining both quantitative and qualitative methodology in this study, a fuller description of not only whether but how this group is being addressed in Social and Cultural Diversity courses was achieved.

Purpose

The purpose of the conducted descriptive content analysis was to identify whether counselor education programs are teaching counselors-in-training in Social and Cultural Diversity classes about Multiracial Individuals. The study analyzed syllabi and associated materials of Social and Cultural Diversity classes in CACREP-accredited Master's counselor education programs. Additionally, the study sought to determine the amount of exposure and nature of training given to students regarding Multiracial Individuals. Ultimately, the findings are intended to assist counselor educators in recognizing whether counselors-in-training are being trained and educated about working with individuals who identify as Multiracial. It is important that counselors are aware of the unique experiences and needs of Multiracial Individuals and how that may differ when compared to the more traditional teaching of monoracial individual's issues.

Data Collection

This study was executed by conducting a thorough content analysis, both quantitatively and qualitatively, of syllabi and related course materials for Social and Cultural Diversity courses from CACREP-accredited Master's degree programs. There are currently 778 CACREP-accredited Master's degree programs, representing 386 individual universities. These programs are made up of clinical mental health counseling, school counseling, rehabilitation counseling, community counseling, and marriage, couple and family counseling programs. Convenience sampling was utilized with a goal of sampling 25% of universities with CACREP-accredited Master's programs, for a total of at least 97 universities. While qualitative analysis is based on saturation of themes, analyzing a sample size of at least 25% will allow for greater generalization

to the entire population of graduate programs with a confidence level of 0.90 and a margin of error of 0.05 (Kalla, 2009). These syllabi were collected by identifying the current CACREP-accredited programs, as identified on the CACREP website. These programs' syllabi were collected via emails to request the syllabi for their current Master's degree level Social and Cultural Diversity courses, as well as the retrieval of syllabi from the American Counseling Association syllabi repository, and online search. See appendix B for example syllabi. In addition, the associated textbooks and readings required for each course, as identified on the syllabi, were collected electronically by the researcher and utilized as part of the larger qualitative analysis to determine the extent and context in which Multiracial Individuals are addressed.

Data Analysis

This study analyzed the data in two major ways. The first was by document review and the identification of the number of times that Multiracial Individuals were mentioned or referenced in the text body of the syllabi and textbooks associated with each as part of the quantitative analysis. This spoke to the magnitude to which this subject matter is mentioned in the materials associated with these classes. Secondly, a qualitative analysis of syllabi and text were conducted using open coding. Open coding is the process of identifying concepts and then defining and developing categories based on their properties (Berg & Lune, 2012). Open coding allows for the building concepts from the text-based data sources. While the research was guided by the previously denoted research questions, this type of coding allows for the researcher to remain flexible in discovering relationships, ideas and concepts not conceptualized prior to the data collection process (Hays & Singh, 2011). Since multiple terminologies are used in identifying those that this study labels as Multiracial Individuals, multiple terms were searched

for within the text of the documents and counted as reference to this group. The terms searched for were biracial, mixed race, Multiracial, and mixed heritage. These were selected based on the terms identified and endorsed by ACA, as identified by the Competencies for Counseling the Multiracial Population (MRECC, 2015).

For the purpose of the qualitative analysis, open coding was used in order to identify tentative labels for the data related to the topic of coverage of Multiracial Individuals in the reviewed syllabi. Open coding is based in grounded theory and is an analytic process by which codes describing and classifying the identified topic are created as they are identified to observe data such as text (Corbin, 1990 & Strauss, 1987). Following this, axial coding was used to identify the relationship between the identified open coding themes in order to provide an easier categorization of the data and to lend toward the identification of achieving saturation in regard to themes. Axial coding is defined as process of relating codes and concepts to each other by a combination of inductive and deductive thinking, thus identifying the basic framework of the relationships and themes (Corbin & Strauss, 1990). Additionally, saturation was sought to be met through this analysis. Saturation is recognized as being the point in analysis and coding of data through a qualitative research methodology at which there is enough information obtained that both a repetition in information is found and no new themes are able to be identified (Fush & Ness, 2015).

Trustworthiness

Due to the methodology identified as the framework for this study, trustworthiness must be considered alongside the reliability of the mixed methods study. The primary researcher submitted the study to the Auburn University Institutional Review Board for review. This study

did not require a full review as it does not include human subjects. In addition, the researcher's own biases were considered and held accountable as the primary research instrument. This was done through both bracketing and the use of an audit trail. While there are sometimes conflicting definitions of bracketing, in general it is the process in qualitative research by which the researcher mitigates the potential effects of unacknowledged preconceptions related to the research topic to increase the rigor of the study (Tufford & Newman, 2010).

While the researcher did not have a direct personal connection to the research topic, self-interrogation was still necessary to be aware of any potential biases and how they might have impacted interpretation of the data. As part of the mitigation of potential biases, an audit trail was also maintained throughout the data collection and analysis process. In qualitative research an audit trail is a methodology by which the researcher maintains a record including raw data, data reduction and analysis process, reconstruction and synthesis of data, process notes, instrument development information, and materials relating to disposition and intentions (Halpern, 1983). For this study, the audit trail primarily focused on the raw data, data reduction and analysis process, reconstruction and synthesis of data, and process notes with the intention of having thorough documentation of the process so that it could be critiqued and potentially recreated to increase validity.

In addition, the use of both intercoder reliability and an external auditor were used to raise both the reliability and validity of the study. Intercoder reliability is the process by which the level of agreement between two or more coders is examined. This specifically speaks to the interrater reliability, or ability to achieve reproducibility in the coding (Potter & Levine-Donnerstein, 1999). To do so, a doctoral student in the Counselor Education and Supervision program at Auburn University was recruited for the purpose of analyzing a random portion of the

collected data for the purpose of comparison. The use of an external auditor to ensure validity when conducting qualitative analysis is an additional way of increasing trustworthiness (Creswell, 2012). For this purpose, an instructor from the University of Memphis was recruited to be the external auditor for this study. She was asked to provide feedback on the criteria and coding procedure utilized for this study. The purpose was to check for consistency in the coding and review of potential biases of the researcher. All written feedback and correspondence between the other coder, external auditor, and primary researcher were included as part of the audit trail.

Chapter III

Results

This study consisted of a descriptive content analysis of syllabi, textbooks, and supplemental materials of selected Counsel for the Accreditation of Counseling and Related Educational Programs (CACREP)-accredited counseling Master's degree programs' Social and Cultural Diversity courses. The purpose of this content analysis was to determine if Multiracial Individuals are included in the course materials and in what contexts they were represented in course materials associated with CACREP counseling Master's programs to meet the Social and Cultural Diversity standards. A total of ninety-nine (n=99) syllabi were collected through email requests, retrieval from the American Counseling Association syllabi repository, and targeted online searches. Syllabi were collected and then thoroughly reviewed to identify the required textbooks (n=32) and course supplemental materials. Following an exhaustive search of the collected syllabi, textbooks, and supplemental materials, the data were carefully analyzed by this researcher to identify descriptive information and thematic codes. The results from this study can be found below.

Descriptive Content Analysis

This dissertation study is a descriptive content analysis that combines both quantitative and qualitative methodology. Research indicates that content analysis can be used to analyze a variety of texts and can provide an accurate way of highlighting developments within a given

discipline (Barrio-Minton, Morris, & Yates, 2014; Buboltz, Miller, & Williams, 1999). The quantitative analysis is based on the post positivism paradigm (Berg & Lune, 2012). The post positivism paradigm is the viewpoint that the purpose of scientific study is get a close approximation to reality, because it is not definitively knowable (Berg & Lune, 2012). This means that context has to be taken into account rather than just available data. This links to the idea that in order to accurately discuss information regarding Multiracial Individuals representation, the context of how they are mentioned is as important as if they are mentioned. This also underpins the argument that the extent to which Multiracial Individuals are represented in these courses can be determined by examining the course material for them being mentioned and the context in which it happens. This speaks to the assumption of the extent to which the Multiracial population is represented in Social and Cultural Diversity courses in counselor education programs can be discussed in quantitative terms.

For this type of content analysis, documents are analyzed for inclusion of specific terminology. In this case, the terminology was biracial, mixed race, Multiracial, and mixed heritage. This information is important as it provides a way to measure the magnitude to which Multiracial Individuals are visible and highlighted within CACREP-accredited counselor education programs (Dempsey & Balandin, 2012). Magnitude is defined as the number of times the selected sources included specific terms (Dempsey & Balandin, 2012). For the purposes of this analysis, those terms are the four identified previously that relate to Multiracial Individuals. This quantitative analysis provides the initial identification of whether Multiracial Individuals are being addressed in these counseling courses. By also adding a qualitative analysis, a fuller picture of the context and themes around discussing Multiracial Individuals is provided.

The paradigm underlying the qualitative portion of this study is social constructionism (Hays & Wood, 2011). Social constructivism emphasizes the cultural context of meaning-making and has the assumption that human experience is essentially subjective and mutable (Hays & Wood, 2011). In the context of this study, this method intends to present themes related to Multiracial Individuals found the syllabi and materials associated with these courses and the frequency they are discussed. The qualitative analysis also illustrates how multicultural competences are being addressed in the courses, specifically those related to development regarding the Multiracial group. Additionally, qualitative analysis will contribute to understanding how counselors-in-training are encouraged to develop skills related to this population. By combining both quantitative and qualitative methodology in this study, it allows for a fuller description of not only if but also how this group is being addressed in Social and Cultural Diversity courses.

Open coding was used to identify themes for the data related to the topic of Multiracial Individuals in the textbooks and supplemental materials identified in the syllabi. Open coding, based in grounded theory, is an analytic process by which codes describing and classifying the topic of a study are created. For the purposes of this study, the qualitative strategy used was based on Grounded Theory. Grounded Theory design is a methodology in which the researcher derives a general, abstract theory of process or interaction related to the data in the study (Creswell, 2009). Data analysis based on Grounded Theory consists of searching for concepts behind the constructs identified within the research questions. Strauss and Corbin (1990) describe there being flexible guidelines for coding data within this methodology, centered around open and axial coding. This is an identified way to observe and analyze textual data (Corbin, 1990 & Strauss, 1987). Following this basic open coding, further axial coding was then used to

designate the relationship between the identified open coding themes to provide an easier categorization of the data and to lend toward the identification of saturation in regard to themes. Axil coding is defined as the process of relating codes and concepts to each other via a combination of inductive and deductive thinking. This allows for the identification of the basic framework of the relationships and themes (Corbin & Strauss, 1990).

Data Collection

For this study, convenience sampling was utilized, with a goal of sampling 25% of universities with CACREP-accredited counseling Master's programs, for a minimum of ninety-seven (97) universities. This percentage was selected because analyzing a sample size of at least 25% allowed for greater generalization to the entire population of graduate programs with a confidence level of 0.90 and a margin of error of 0.05 (Kalla, 2009). Margin of error is important as it speaks to how reliable the results are (Kalla, 2009). This study's final dataset included ninety-nine (99) individual schools, equaling 25.6% of current schools with CACREP accreditation, and thus meeting the minimum threshold identified within the literature (Smith, 2013). In addition to a thorough syllabi review, a descriptive review of textbooks and supplemental materials identified within the syllabi were conducted to provide additional information on the inclusion of Multiracial Individuals in CACREP-accredited graduate program course materials. This resulted in the review of twenty-three textbooks and forty-two journal articles. Of the twenty-three textbooks, eleven (43%) were found to include mentions of Multiracial Individuals. Additionally, none of the journal articles were found to contain references to Multiracial Individuals.

Syllabi were collected via three methods. CACREP-accredited counseling Master's degree programs were emailed asking for the syllabi associated with the program's Social and Cultural Diversity training class for counseling Master's degree students. See Appendix B for the email sent to programs requesting syllabi. A total of seventy-five emails were sent, with thirty-two programs responding, resulting in a response rate of 42.7%. Nineteen syllabi were collected by using the ACA Syllabi Repository found at <https://www.counseling.org/knowledge-center/clearinghouses/syllabus-clearinghouse/social-cultural-diversity>. Finally, forty-eight syllabi were found via online search. This was done by utilizing the Google search engine and searching for the terms "multicultural counseling syllabus," "diversity counseling syllabus," and "cultural diversity counseling syllabus." These syllabi were then reviewed to determine appropriateness for inclusion in the study.

Inclusionary Criteria

To be included in this study, all syllabi were reviewed to ensure that the counseling graduate programs from which they were acquired were CACREP-accredited. This was done by accessing the CACREP directory online and verifying that the program associated with the school was CACREP-accredited. Due to the fact that syllabi came from various years, the length of time the school was CACREP-accredited was also verified to make sure the year the syllabi were used aligned with the time period that the school has been accredited. The number of years each program was accredited was available and retrieved from the CACREP directory website (CACREP Directory, 2018). This was done by looking up each school on the CACREP directory website and identifying their current accreditation status and the number of years they have been accredited.

There are currently 778 CACREP-accredited counseling Master's degree programs in the United States, embedded within 386 individual colleges and universities (CACREP Directory, 2018) as of the retrieval of this information from <https://www.cacrep.org/directory/> on May 4, 2018. These programs include clinical mental health counseling, marriage, couple, and family counseling programs, rehabilitation counseling, and school counseling programs (CACREP Directory, 2018). CACREP accreditation for counselor education programs is a continual process, with an accreditation cycle of two or eight years (CACREP, 2018). In order to achieve CACREP accreditation, programs must comply with the CACREP guidelines and submit to reviews, site visits, and final approval by the CACREP Board of Directors (CACREP, 2018). Once a program has achieved CACREP accreditation, they are required to submit annual reports regarding updates to the program and statistical reports on program student and faculty numbers and demographic information. Additionally, programs are required to submit a Mid-Cycle Report that is larger and more in-depth than the annual report four years into the eight-year review cycle (CACREP, 2018).

CACREP accreditation provides guidelines and set standards for counseling programs to follow. Additionally, in most states, graduating from a CACREP-accredited program helps stream line the licensure process for students. A student who graduates from a CACREP-accredited program is simply required to submit a transcript proving that they did so. However, a student who graduated from a program that was not CACREP-accredited would be required to submit syllabi and course descriptions to verify that the program meets the required standards (ACA, 2018). Ohio and Tennessee are examples of states in which graduating from a CACREP-accredited program accelerates the process for license-seeking counselors (Counselor-License, 2018). Furthermore, students in a CACREP program are able to take the National Counseling

Exam (NCE) before they graduate which provides the National Certified Counseling Credential upon graduation of their counseling Master's program. Thus, CACREP-accredited programs in the United States are the preferred training programs for licensing and credentialing boards and streamline the education-to-career process for many graduates (CACREP, 2018).

Determining Inclusion of Syllabi

Once syllabi were obtained from CACREP-accredited counseling Master's programs, they were categorized into one of two categories: inclusion or exclusion. Syllabi that included one or more of these terms in the body of the text were added to the inclusion category. Those syllabi that were identified as not using any of the abovementioned terminology were labeled as being in the exclusion category. This was done by searching the text of the syllabi, via Control Find and manually, for the identified terms referencing Multiracial Individuals. The syllabi were collected electronically either in Adobe .pdf or Microsoft Word .doc or .docx document formats. The Control Find function was used initially to search for one of the four keywords. Additionally, the researcher then physically reviewed the syllabi to confirm that was the only mentioning of Multiracial Individuals.

For this study thirty-three of the syllabi, 33%, comprised the inclusion category. Sixty-six, 66%, of the syllabi were assigned to the exclusion category. Those in the exclusion category were no longer referenced for additional data. Syllabi identified in the inclusion category are those which, in the text of the document, specifically mentioned Multiracial Individuals or one of the four identified key words (i.e., biracial, mixed race, Multiracial, and mixed heritage). Those put into the category of exclusion made no mention of Multiracial Individuals in the text of the syllabi. Since multiple terminologies are used in identifying those who this study labels as

Multiracial Individuals, multiple terms were searched for within the text of the documents and counted as reference to this group. The terms searched for were biracial, mixed race, Multiracial, and mixed heritage (MRECC, 2015). These terms were used as they are identified as the most common terms when referencing Multiracial Individuals as identified in the Competencies for Counseling the Multiracial Population (MRECC, 2015).

Validation

Validity in research references how accurately a study measures what it is attempting to measure (Miller, 1986). Within qualitative research, content validity is often the most common kind of validation. Content validity is the ability to generalize about the construct of interest and that it is actually being measured by the instrument (Smith, 2007). Additionally, for qualitative research, validity is further broken down into four main aspects. These are credibility, transferability, dependability, and confirmability (Miller, 1986; Smith, 2007; Whittemore, Chase, & Mandle, 2001).

Credibility involves establishing that the results of the qualitative research being conducted are believable (Smith, 2007; Whittemore, Chase, & Mandle, 2001). This also references that the results of the study actually reflect the construct being studied (Onwuegbuzie, & Leech, 2007). This is typically determined by the participants or researcher themselves when the study does not involve participants directly. Due to this being more subjective in qualitative research, triangulation is often used to verify credibility. One method of triangulation is the use of an appropriate external auditor (Whittemore, Chase, & Mandle, 2001). This is when a person other than the researcher examines the same information the researcher did to ensure that results are both consistent and accurate. This is the methodology utilized by this study to ensure

credibility. An external auditor who is familiar with qualitative research was provided with the data, methodology and codebook. They then took a sample of the data set and analyzed it to ensure that their results were consistent with the researchers.

Transferability refers to the degree to which findings can be transferred to other contexts, meaning that the results of the study are generalizable and can potentially be applied to other populations or settings (Miller, 1986; Smith, 2007; Whittemore, Chase, & Mandle, 2001). This typically involves the researcher providing thorough descriptions of the contexts and steps of the research process to assist others with being able to make such generalizations (Whittemore, Chase, & Mandle, 2001). In the case of this study, this was done by fully describing the steps that were taken to obtain the data studied and how it was examined. This includes discussing where the syllabi in this study came from, how they were obtained, and what they contained. Additionally, this was done through explaining how the results of the study were arrived at and the rationale behind the analysis.

Dependability refers to the consistency with which the results of a study could be repeated and result in similar findings (Miller, 1986; Smith, 2007; Whittemore, Chase, & Mandle, 2001). Increased dependability of the results is important as it gives legitimacy to the research method and study. However, due to the nature of qualitative research, this is difficult to achieve as the researchers themselves are the instrument (Onwuegbuzie, & Leech, 2007). Because of this it is vital that the researcher documents the context and how the data was collected. One methodology for doing so is the use of an audit trail, which was employed by this study to increase dependability. This includes documenting when and how actions involving this research study took place, including any occurrences that could have impacted the findings.

Confirmability refers to the degree by which the results confirmed or corroborated by others (Miller, 1986; Smith, 2007; Whitemore, Chase, & Mandle, 2001). In qualitative research, it is assumed that a researcher brings a unique perspective to the study, meaning that their own assumptions, biases, and viewpoints may influence their results (Smith, 2007). There are several strategies for managing these issues and enhancing confirmability. One that was used in this study was the documentation of the procedures for checking the data. This was done by maintaining an audit trail. Additionally, bracketing can be used to attempt to take into account the built-in bias that the researcher may bring to the data analysis process. Lastly, another researcher can review the results for potential issues. This was addressed in this study by the use and analysis of an external auditor.

Additionally, saturation was also sought and met through this analysis. This was done by searching the text for all mentions of the four identified keywords. Saturation is identified as the point in analysis and coding of data through in which there is enough information obtained that both a repetition in information is found and no new themes can be identified (Fush & Ness, 2015). For this study, saturation was obtained in two ways. The first was that no new textbooks were identified as used in the syllabi. Secondly, and more importantly, no new themes were identified through axial coding beyond those of knowledge, skill, and self-awareness.

To account for the potential influence of this researchers on this research study, an external auditor was utilized. The external auditor of this dissertation is a faculty member from the University of Memphis Sociology Department who has completed advanced research courses and also currently teaches research classes. Having served as an auditor in other studies, this external auditor has experience in reviewing both quantitative and qualitative data. The external auditor was provided with thirty-three syllabi and eleven textbooks that were identified by the

researcher as containing reference to Multiracial Individuals. They were also given the Microsoft Excel document containing the indication of the number of times each text mentioned one of the four identified keywords, what words were used, and where in the text those words were found. This was done for both the syllabi and textbooks. Additionally, the external auditor was provided with both the open coding and axial coding utilized in the analysis of the content of the textbooks in the form of a Microsoft Word document. The external auditor then selected a sample of the syllabi and textbooks to review. These were then provided in electronic format by the researcher. If a disagreement was identified between the external auditor and the researcher, it was noted and then discussed to resolve any identified discrepancies. The external auditor was able to replicate the frequency and terms within the sampled syllabi. Additionally, the external auditor's review aligned with the three emergent themes identified by the researcher.

Data Analysis

Data were analyzed using a priori design, with four keywords searched for within both the collected syllabi, textbooks and supplemental readings. Keywords identified were biracial, mixed race, Multiracial, and mixed heritage as these were the terms listed in the Multiracial Competencies as identified by the MRECC and endorsed by the ACA (MERCC, 2015). The data were coded to identify if Multiracial Individuals are represented in the available counseling syllabi and textbooks. Specifically, this was done by examining the text of the syllabi for the aforementioned specific four keywords: biracial, mixed race, Multiracial, and mixed heritage (MERCC, 2015). The syllabi were collected electronically either in Adobe .pdf or Microsoft Word .doc or .docx document formats. The Control Find function was used initially to search for each of the four keywords. Additionally, the researcher then physically reviewed the syllabi to confirm that was the only mentioning of Multiracial Individuals. It was documented by this

researcher which syllabi contained at least one of the four words and how many of the words were found. Additionally, it was documented what textbooks and supplemental materials were required for the course based on the information provided in the syllabi.

Textbooks identified from the syllabi were collected electronically. These documents were also searched through the Control Find function for the four keywords identified above. Those textbooks that were identified as containing at least one of the four words were then examined for content and for the context in which Multiracial Individuals were mentioned (Corbin & Strauss, 1990). The textbooks identified within the syllabi were thematically coded to identify emergent themes. Themes were identified by content analysis of the texts related to Multiracial Individuals via open coding, to identify the general themes, which were then categorized and coded into the three identified themes using axial coding (Corbin & Strauss, 1990). This process was also applied to the reading lists found on the syllabi.

Additionally, it was also noted if syllabi contained any additional reading lists (i.e., supplemental materials) beyond the textbooks. Of the 33 syllabi used in this study, 90% included supplemental materials. These articles were then examined for relevancy toward the topic of Multiracial Individuals. These articles were then collected electronically and searched through the Control Find option for mention of the four keywords.

Results

This section presents the results of the study regarding the extent to which Multiracial Individuals were represented in the ninety-nine (99) syllabi and in the textbooks and supplemental materials identified within those syllabi. In total, ninety-nine syllabi were collected for this study. These syllabi represented a total of 99 universities of the 386 current universities, or 25.6% of universities offering CACREP-accredited counseling Master's degree

programs in counseling within the United States. In this section, descriptive information on the syllabi and thematic information identified from the supplemental materials will be presented.

Syllabi and Counseling Program Information

Syllabi from a total of ninety-nine graduate-level counseling, Master’s academic institutions were collected for this study; however, thirty-three syllabi met the inclusionary criteria and were included in this study. Of those thirty-three schools, five (6.6%) offered one counseling graduate program, fourteen (42.4%) offered two programs, and fourteen (42.4%) offered three. In total twenty were school counseling programs, thirty-two clinical mental health, sixteen rehabilitation, and four family counseling programs. Table 1 summarizes the universities represented by the syllabi collected and counseling programs that they offer.

Table 1 Syllabi that Met Inclusionary Criteria

University Name	Program(s) Offered
Agrosy University, Washington	Clinical Mental Health & School
Auburn University	Clinical Mental Health, School & Rehabilitation
Ball State	Clinical Mental Health, School, & Rehabilitation
Boise State	Clinical Mental Health, Rehabilitation, & Family
California State University, Fresno	Clinical Mental Health, Rehabilitation, & Family
Clemson University	Clinical Mental Health & School
George Mason University	Clinical Mental Health & School
Jacksonville State University	Clinical Mental Health & School
Mercer University	Clinical Mental Health, School, & Rehabilitation
Messiah University	Clinical Mental Health, Family, & School
Northern Arizona State	Clinical Mental Health & School
Northern Illinois University	Clinical Mental Health, School, & Rehabilitation
Regis University	Clinical Mental Health
Seattle University	Clinical Mental Health & School
St. Bonaventure University	Clinical Mental Health & School
Texas A&M University, Texarkana	Clinical Mental Health
The Citadel	School
University of Alaska, Fairbanks	Clinical Mental Health & School
University of Arkansas	Clinical Mental Health, School, & Rehabilitation
University of Florida	Clinical Mental Health
University of Houston, Victoria	Clinical Mental Health & Rehabilitation
University of Massachusetts, Boston	Clinical Mental Health & Rehabilitation
University of Memphis	Clinical Mental Health, School, & Rehabilitation
University of Montana	Clinical Mental Health & School

University of North Carolina	Clinical Mental Health, School & Rehabilitation
University of North Texas	Clinical Mental Health, School & Rehabilitation
University of Northern Colorado	Clinical Mental Health, Rehabilitation, & Family
University of South Florida	Clinical Mental Health & Rehabilitation
University of Texas, Tyler	Clinical Mental Health, School, & Rehabilitation
Virginia Commonwealth University	Clinical Mental Health
Wake Forest	Clinical Mental Health & School
Wayne University	Clinical Mental Health, School & Rehabilitation
Xavier University	Clinical Mental Health & School

Of the thirty-three syllabi included in the analysis, they ranged in years from 2009 to 2018, with the majority of them (10) being from the last four years (2013-2017). Seven of the syllabi contained no information about the date they were used. Additionally, twenty-six of the syllabi indicated what semester they were being utilized for. Sixteen (48.5%) of the courses were being offered in the Fall semester, nine (27.3%) in the Spring semester, and one (3.3%) during the Summer Semester. Seven (21.2%) of the syllabi did not include a specific semester associated with the course. The Fall semester courses had two (12.5%) courses that were fifteen weeks in length and fourteen (87.5%) that had sixteen-week semesters. The Spring semester classes had one (11.1%) course that was sixteen weeks in length and eight (88.9%) that were fifteen weeks. The single Summer course was twelve weeks in length. Two of the syllabi included in the study indicated they were for school counseling programs, while the other thirty-one did not indicate a particular program being associated with the syllabi. All thirty-three were classes specifically designated as being Social and Cultural Diversity classes. The average length of the syllabi was nine pages, with a range of six to fourteen pages. Furthermore, analysis revealed that all thirty-three syllabi provided a description of the assignments and activities associated with the class. In examining the assignments, none of the assignments appeared to specifically mention Multiracial Individuals. Table 2 shows which universities were included within these thirty-three syllabi and corresponding descriptive data discussed above.

Table 2 Universities in Inclusion Category

University Name	State	Region	Year	Semester
Agrosy University, Washington	WA	Northeast	2013	Fall
Auburn University	AL	South	2017	Spring
Ball State	IN	Midwest	2013	Spring
Boise State	ID	Midwest	2009	Fall
California State University, Fresno	CA	West	2010	N/D
Clemson University	GA	South	2018	Fall
George Mason University	VA	South	2015	Spring
Jacksonville State University	MS	South	2012	Fall
Mercer University	GA	South	N/D	N/D
Messiah University	PA	Northeast	2014	Fall
Northern Arizona State	AZ	West	N/D	N/D
Northern Illinois University	IL	Midwest	2009	Fall
Regis University	MA	Northeast	2015	Spring
Seattle University	WA	West	2015	Spring
St. Bonaventure University	NY	Northeast	2017	Fall
Texas A&M University, Texarkana	TX	South	2016	Fall
The Citadel	SC	South	2016	Fall
University of Alaska, Fairbanks	AK	West	N/D	N/D
University of Arkansas	AR	South	2017	Spring
University of Florida	FL	South	2015	Spring
University of Houston, Victoria	TX	South	2009	Fall
University of Massachusetts, Boston	MA	Northeast	N/D	N/D
University of Memphis	TN	South	2016	Fall
University of Montana	MT	West	N/D	N/D
University of North Carolina	NC	South	2014	Fall
University of North Texas	TX	South	2016	Spring
University of Northern Colorado	CO	West	2017	Fall
University of South Florida	FL	South	2015	N/D
University of Texas, Tyler	TX	South	2015	Summer
Virginia Commonwealth University	VA	South	N/D	N/D
Wake Forest	NC	South	2016	Spring
Wayne University	MI	Midwest	2017	Spring
Xavier University	OH	Midwest	N/D	N/D

*note: N/D indicates that the syllabi did not disclose this information.

Though syllabi were gathered from all regions of the United States, programs in the South (n=17) 51% made up the largest part of the sample, followed by the West (n=7) 21.2%, Midwest (n= 5) 15.1% and the Northeast (n=4) 12.1%.

Further analysis of the syllabi revealed that all syllabi (n=33) directly referenced the CACREP standards and listed them in beginning of the document. Specifically, two CACREP

standards were identified as being used in these syllabi: the 2009 standards and the 2016 standards. Twenty-three (69.7%) of the programs used the 2009 standard and eleven (30.3%) used the 2016 CACREP standard. Table 3 lists which programs' syllabi used which CACREP standard on the collected syllabi.

Table 3 Universities and CACREP Standard Used

University Name	CACREP Standard Used
Agrosy University, Washington	2009
Auburn University	2016
Ball State	2009
Boise State	2009
California State University, Fresno	2009
Clemson University	2016
George Mason University	2009
Jacksonville State University	2009
Mercer University	2009
Messiah University	2009
Northern Arizona State	2009
Northern Illinois University	2009
Regis University	2009
Seattle University	2009
St. Bonaventure University	2016
Texas A&M University, Texarkana	2016
The Citadel	2016
University of Alaska, Fairbanks	2009
University of Arkansas	2016
University of Florida	2009
University of Houston, Victoria	2009
University of Massachusetts, Boston	2009
University of Memphis	2016
University of Montana	2009
University of North Carolina	2009
University of North Texas	2016
University of Northern Colorado	2016
University of South Florida	2009
University of Texas, Tyler	2009
Virginia Commonwealth University	2009
Wake Forest	2016
Wayne University	2016
Xavier University	2009

The syllabi typically identified specific course objectives that corresponded to the CACREP standards or made direct reference to the ACA Code of Ethics. Additionally, the

syllabi contained some iteration of a course description. In general, these descriptions include a reference to the multicultural competencies as described in the research; attitudes, beliefs, knowledge, and skills (ACA, 2015). These descriptions typically informed students that the focus of the class would be to increase both awareness and knowledge related to the topics included in the course. These statements were then typically linked to the CACREP standards to which the course was adhering. Since many of the syllabi were not from the current year, the CACREP directory was consulted to verify that the program had accreditation at the time each syllabus was used. The number of years each program was accredited was available and retrieved from the CACREP directory website. This all indicated that the majority of syllabi adhered to a specific CACREP standard and then tied these, as well ACA codes, to the objectives of the course.

Frequency of Multiracial Individuals Included in Syllabi

Through analysis, this researcher found that sixty-six syllabi did not include Multiracial Individuals in any part of their course syllabi. Of these sixty-six syllabi, seven syllabi (7%) did not address race or ethnicity at all. They instead identified the CACREP standards associated with the course, contact information, and assignments. The other fifty-nine syllabi contained mentions of monoracial groups, sexuality, and/or spirituality.

Thirty-three (33.3%) syllabi included Multiracial Individuals. The most common terminology used was Multiracial at 87.9% (n=29), followed by biracial at 12.1% (n=4). No syllabi used the terms mixed race or mixed heritage although these are endorsed terms in the MRECC (2015). Of the thirty-three (33) syllabi in which this was true, twenty-nine (29%) listed this as topic of discussion for a specific day in class. All of those that did devote an entire day or

an entire class to Multiracial Individuals did so after talking about monoracial groups. This was done either in the tenth week (n=20) of class or eleventh week (n=9) of the 16-week semester. However, four (4%) included this group within the discussion of another monoracial group. This was done by combining the lecture day with discussing Latinos (n=1) or Arab Americans (n=3). Of note, one of the syllabi that included the topic of Multiracial Individuals on the same day as another topic occurred during a summer semester. This same syllabus had no weeks that contained discussions of a race group that were not combined with another group.

Textbooks

Textbooks were collected by electronic library database or by renting electronically with three of the textbooks being rented; Cultural diversity: A primer for the human services by Diller and published in 2011, Case studies in multicultural counseling and therapy written by Sue and Gallardo and published in 2014 and Counseling the culturally different: Theory and practice written by Sue and Sue and published in 2013. These were rented electronically through the Amazon website for a fee. Examination of the textbooks was conducted via the found word option in pdf and then was verified by physically reading that section.

Twenty-three textbooks were identified within the 33 syllabi as required for the Master's level counseling programs' Social and Cultural Diversity classes. Initially, the twenty-three textbooks were examined for inclusion of the four previously discussed keywords: biracial, mixed race, Multiracial, and mixed heritage. Textbooks were placed into one of two categories: inclusion or exclusion. Those classified as being in the inclusion category were found to have at least one of the four identified keywords in the body of the text. Those classified in the exclusion category did not appear to include mention of any terms related to Multiracial

Individuals in the text, including the index of the text. Table 4 shows the list of textbooks in alphabetical order and lists how many schools used the textbook, the frequency of use by the Social and Cultural Diversity course, as well as if that text mentioned Multiracial Individuals.

Table 4 Textbooks Used in Multicultural Counseling Courses

Author	Text Book	Year Published	Universities Utilizing the Textbook	Multiracial Individuals Mentioned
Baruth, L. G., & Manning, M. L.	Multicultural counseling and psychotherapy: A lifespan approach. Routledge.	2011	2	Exclusion
Diller, J.	Cultural diversity: A primer for the human services. Nelson Education.	2010	5	Exclusion
Duan, C., & Brown, C.	Becoming a multiculturally competent counselor. SAGE Publications.	2015	2	Inclusion
Hayes, D. G., & Erford, B. T.	Developing multicultural counseling competence: A systems approach. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Pearson Education, Inc	2013	2	Inclusion
Kivel, P.	Uprooting Racism-: How White People Can Work for Racial Justice. New Society Publishers.	2017	1	Exclusion
Lee, C. C.	Multicultural issues in counseling: New approaches to diversity. John Wiley & Sons.	2013	1	Inclusion
Manning, M. L., Baruth, L. G., & Lee, G. L.	Multicultural education of children and adolescents. Taylor & Francis.	2008	1	Exclusion
McAuliffe, G.	Culturally alert counseling: A comprehensive introduction. Sage.	2012	1	Exclusion
McGoldrick, M., & Hardy, K. V.	Re-visioning family therapy: Race, culture, and gender in clinical practice. Guilford Press.	2008	1	Inclusion
McGoldrick, M., Giordano, J., & Garcia-Preto, N.	Ethnicity and family therapy. Guilford Press.	2005	1	Inclusion
Hardy, Cornish, Schreier, Nadkarni, Metzger, & Rodolfa,	Handbook of Multicultural Counseling Competencies	2010	1	Inclusion
Pedersen, P. B., & Carey, J. C.	Multicultural Counseling Schools: A Practical Handbook. Allyn & Bacon.	2002	2	Exclusion

Pedersen, P. B., Lonner, W. J., Draguns, J. G., Trimble, J. E., & Scharron-del Rio, M. R.	Counseling across cultures. Sage Publications.	2007	1	Exclusion
Pope-Davis, D. B., & Coleman, H. L.	Multicultural counseling competencies: Assessment, education and training, and supervision.	1996	2	Inclusion
Ratts, M. J., & Pedersen, P. B.	Counseling for multiculturalism and social justice: Integration, theory, and application. John Wiley & Sons.	2014	1	Inclusion
Ridley, C. R.	Overcoming unintentional racism in counseling and therapy: A practitioner's guide to intentional intervention (Vol. 5). Sage.	2005	2	Exclusion
Robinson-Wood, T.	The convergence of race, ethnicity, and gender: Multiple identities in counseling. Sage Publications.	2012	2	Inclusion
Schmidt, J. J.	Social and cultural foundations of counseling and human services: Multiple influences on self-concept development. Pearson/Allyn and Bacon.	2005	4	Exclusion
Schwarzbaum, S. E., & Thomas, A. J.	Dimensions of multicultural counseling: A life story approach. Sage Publications.	2008	1	Exclusion
Smith, T. B.	Practicing multiculturalism: Affirming diversity in counseling and psychology. Allyn and Bacon.	2003	2	Exclusion
Sue, D. W., & Sue, D	Counseling the Culturally Diverse: Theory and Practice	2015	31	Inclusion
Sue, D. W., Gallardo, M. E., & Neville, H. A.	Case studies in multicultural counseling and therapy. John Wiley & Sons.	2013	1	Inclusion
Thomas, A. J., & Schwarzbaum, S. E.	Culture and identity: Life stories for counselors and therapists. Sage Publications.	2016	2	Exclusion

For this section, textbooks will be referred to by their authors' names. Of the thirty-two identified textbooks, 34% (n=11) were found to include Multicultural Individuals in their text through Control Find. This was identified by searching the text of the textbooks electronically, including the Tables of Contents and indices for the use of the previously identified terms

referring to Multiracial Individuals; biracial, mixed race, Multiracial, and mixed heritage. The Sue and Sue textbook was used by 33% (n=33) of the ninety-nine courses. This made it the most commonly utilized textbook within this data set. The 11 textbooks identified within the syllabi are described in greater detail below.

Becoming a Multicultural Competent Counselor

Becoming a Multicultural Competent Counselor was written by Changming Duan and Chris Brown. The book was published in 2016 by Sage Publishing. It was found to be in use by two of the programs in this study. Biracial and Multiracial were the keywords identified within the text. This text has a section about Multiracial Individuals entitled Biracial and Multiracial Identity Development. This section is one page in length and is included in a chapter on identity development.

Developing Multicultural Counseling Competence: A Systems Approach

Developing Multicultural Counseling Competence: A systems approach was written by Danica G. Hays and Bradley T. Erford. The book was published in 2013 by Pearson. It was found to be in use by two of the programs in this study. Multiracial was the keyword identified within the text. This textbook contains a full chapter on Multiracial Individuals entitled Individuals and Families of Multiracial decent. The chapter is thirty-three pages in length.

Multicultural Issues in Counseling: New Approaches to Diversity

Multicultural Issues in Counseling: New Approaches to Diversity was written by Courtland C. Lee. It was published in 2013 by the American Counseling Association. It was found to be in use by one program in the study. Multiracial was the keyword identified within

the text. It has a chapter dedicated to Multiracial Individuals entitled Counseling the Multiracial Population that is twenty-three pages in length.

Re-visioning Family Therapy: Race, Culture, and Gender in Clinical Practice

Re-visioning Family Therapy: Race, Culture, and Gender in Clinical Practice was written by Monica McGoldrick and Kenneth V. Hardy. It was published in 2008 by Guilford Press. It was found to be in use by one of the programs in the study. Multiracial and Biracial were the keywords identified within the text. Additionally, one section within the textbook makes reference to a mixed family. It has three sections related to Multiracial Individuals: Discovery of my Multicultural Identity, Our Iranian-African American Interracial Family, and Biracial Legitimacy: Embracing Marginality.

Ethnicity and Family Therapy

Ethnicity and Family Therapy was written by Monica McGoldrick and Joe Giordano. It was published in 2005 by Guilford Press. It was found to be in use by one program within the study. Multiracial and Biracial were the keywords identified within the text. This textbook does not contain a chapter or section on the topic of Multiracial Individuals. It includes mention of this group in a discussion of demographic trends. It also mentions Multiracial Individuals in the chapter dedicated to African Americans twice.

Handbook of Multicultural Counseling Competencies

Handbook of Multicultural Counseling Competencies was written by Jennifer A. Erickson Cornish, Barry A. Schreier, Lavita I. Nadkarni, Lynett Henderson Metzger, and Emil R. Rodolfa. It was published in 2010 by Wiley publishing. It was found to be in use by one program in this

study. Multiracial and Biracial were the keywords identified within the text. The book contains a chapter on Multiracial Individuals that is thirty-six pages long.

Multicultural Counseling Competencies: Assessment, Education and Training, and Supervision

Multicultural Counseling Competencies: Assessment, Education and Training, and supervision was written by Donald B. Pope-Davis and Hardin L. K. Coleman. It was published in 1997 by Sage Publishing. It was found to be in use by two programs in this study. Multiracial and Biracial were the keywords identified within the text. The book does not contain a chapter or section on the topic. It does include discussion of the group in context of demographic information of the United States.

Counseling for Multiculturalism and Social Justice: Integration, Theory, and Application

Counseling for Multiculturalism and Social Justice: Integration, Theory, and Application was written by Manivong J. Ratts and Paul B. Pedersen. It was published in 2014 by the American Counseling Association. It was found to be used by one program within the study. Multiracial and Biracial were the keywords identified within the text. The book contains a chapter on Multiracial Individuals titled Counseling Multiracial Individuals and Families. The chapter is seventeen pages in length.

The Convergence of Race, Ethnicity, and gender: Multiple Identities in Counseling

The Convergence of Race, Ethnicity, and Gender: Multiple Identities in Counseling was written by Tracy Lynn Robinson-Wood. It was published in 2017 by Sage Publishing. It was found to be used by two programs in this study. Multiracial and Biracial were the keywords

identified within the text. The book contains a chapter on Multiracial Individuals titled Converging Biracial and Multiracial Identities. The chapter is twenty-two pages in length.

Counseling the Culturally Diverse: Theory and Practice

Counseling the Culturally Diverse: Theory and Practice was written by Derald Wing Sue and David Sue. It was published in 2013 by John Wiley and Sons. It was found to be in use by thirty-one of the programs in the study. This is the most commonly used text by a substantial margin. Multiracial and Biracial are the keywords identified within the text. The textbook contains a chapter on Multiracial Individuals titled Counseling Individuals of Multiracial Descent. The chapter is thirteen pages in length.

Case Studies in Multicultural Counseling and Therapy

Case Studies in Multicultural Counseling and Therapy was written by Derald Wing Sue and Miguel E. Gallardo. It was published in 2014 by John Wiley and Sons. It was found to be in use by one of the programs in the study. Multiracial and Biracial were the keywords identified within the text. It contains a chapter on Multiracial Individuals titled Clinical Applications with Individuals of Multiracial Descent. It contains two case studies of clients who are Multiracial. The chapter is seventeen pages in length.

Analysis of the eleven textbooks identified as including Multiracial Individuals ranged from full chapters on Multiracial Individuals to sentences. Nine (81.8%) textbooks had full chapters and two (18.2%) contained mentions of one of the four keywords in three to five sentences within another chapter. The following textbooks contained full chapters: Sue, and Sue; Ratts, and Pedersen; Pope-Davis, and Coleman; Lee; Hayes & Erford; Sue, Gallardo, & Neville; Robinson-Wood; and McGoldrick and Hardy. The following textbooks contained

sentences about Multiracial Individuals within other chapters: Duan, C., and Brown, C.; and McGoldrick, M., Giordano, J., & Garcia-Preto, N. These were typified by discussions of current demographic trends in the United States, identifying Multiracial Individuals as a racial group in the United States, as included in the Census, and as a growing population. For example, the Atkison textbook included Multiracial Individuals only in its discussion of the monoracial group Asian Americans, stating that it is common for Asian American to be Multiracial in that they are likely to identify with multiple Asian ethnicities.

Some of the thirty-three syllabi contained supplemental reading lists consisting of journal articles. In total there were forty-two unique articles identified on the syllabi. These articles were downloaded electronically from the article database through the library at Auburn University. Articles were searched for the four keywords identifying Multiracial Individuals. This was done by the Control Find function. None of the articles examined contained references to Multiracial Individuals, nor were keywords found within them. 21% (n=9) of the articles were addressing sexuality. 40% (n=17) were addressing monoracial groups. 21% (9) were addressing religion and spirituality. Finally, 16% (n=7) were addressing gender issues. As none of the articles were identified as making reference to or including keywords related to Multiracial Individuals, they were not included in further analysis to identify emergent themes.

Emergent Themes of Textbooks

Emergent themes are concepts that are identified from data through qualitative analysis (Given, 2008). They assist in categorizing a smaller set of ideas into a larger category or theme (Given, 2008). Themes can be larger labels based on the smaller ideas found through coding techniques such as open and axial coding (Richards, 2005). Open coding is the process by which

codes describing and classifying the topic of a study are created (Strauss & Corbin, 1990). This was used to identify the general concepts being discussed in the sections found to include references to Multiracial Individuals. Specifically, this was done by reading the sections of the textbooks related to Multiracial Individuals and identifying general themes within the text through chunking, categorizing, and comparing the topics and ideas discussed within the data. Following this basic open coding, axial coding was utilized. Axial coding is used to designate the relationship between the identified open coding themes to provide an easier categorization of the data and to lend toward the identification of saturation in regard to themes (Strauss & Corbin, 1990). In a study such as this one, this process helps to provide richer context of the data and what is identified within it beyond the frequency of mentions of a set of keywords. In this study, the categories and general concepts identified through the open coding process were examined for themes and relationships between what was observed to develop more condensed themes. The research indicates that the steps to do this in the axial coding process are to generate general concepts from the open coding data and then regroup these concepts into higher order commonalties (Allan, 2003). To help provide a framework around generating these commonalties, competences related to multicultural counseling were employed.

Each of the textbooks identified as incorporating contents related to Multiracial Individuals was analyzed through open coding of the content specifically related to Multiracial Individuals. Based on the relationships and emergent ideas identified through the open coding, themes were identified via axial coding of the initial data by collapsing the initial open codes. Themes that emerged within these domains were then analyzed to determine what ideas were being conveyed about Multiracial Individuals in the data set.

Open coding was conducted on the eleven textbooks identified as containing information related to Multiracial Individuals. This, again, was based on the inclusion of terminology referencing Multiracial Individuals: biracial, mixed race, Multiracial, and mixed heritage (MRECC, 2015). These terms were used as they are identified as the most common terms when referencing Multiracial Individuals as identified in the Competencies for Counseling the Multiracial Population (MRECC, 2015). The coding process was started by reading the sections of the identified materials that contained mention of the four keywords. Upon reading this material, meaning units were created based on the main ideas presented in the text. Then these units were condensed into a core meaning, creating a theme. Content analysis coding is inherently a reflective process with no direct linear progression (Erlingsson & Brysiewicz, 2017). In order to provide more structure in this study, the sections of the textbook were initially analyzed by identifying what the text stated its objective to the reader was. This was then linked back to the multicultural competencies as identified by the Association for Multicultural Counseling and Development (2015) to solidify the emergent themes.

Three primary themes were found as the results of collapsing the open coding through the axial coding process. These themes were knowledge, skill, and self-awareness. Knowledge as a domain related to multicultural counseling is defined as the specific knowledge and information about the group that a counselor seeks to work with according to the Association for Multicultural Counseling and Development (2015). Skill as a domain related to multicultural counseling is defined the ability to engage in both verbal and nonverbal helping skills and interventions that are appropriate for the client and environment they are working with according to the Association for Multicultural Counseling and Development (2015). Self-awareness as a domain related to multicultural counseling is defined as how aware counselors are of their own

cultural background and experiences and how that can impact their perception of others according to the Association for Multicultural Counseling and Development (2015).

These themes relate directly back to the domains identified as the three primary competences for multicultural competencies (Ahmed, Wilson, Henriksen, & Jones, 2011; Arredondo, P., 1999; CACREP, 2016; & MERCC, 2015). Of the three themes, Knowledge was the most prevalent found in textbooks, with eleven (100%) of the textbooks having this theme. The skill theme was the second most prevalent theme, with six (54.5%) of the eleven textbooks contained this theme. Self-Awareness was the least identified them, with two (18.2%) of the eleven books containing it. This appearing to indicate a greater focus on Knowledge than the other two themes, based on the frequency in which it was found. Additional information regarding the themes can be found below.

Knowledge

Knowledge as a domain related to multicultural counseling is defined as the specific knowledge and information about the group that a counselor seeks to work with according to the Association for Multicultural Counseling and Development (2015). More specifically, this relates to knowledge of the life experiences, cultural heritage, and historical background of their culturally-different clients and how these can influence the client and counseling relationship (Ahmed, Wilson, Henriksen, & Jones, 2011). Competency of knowledge is the domain most addressed by the textbooks that have information about Multiracial Individuals as part of their text as this domain was covered by all eleven (100%) textbooks that were identified as discussing Multiracial Individuals. This information was then categorized based on three major subthemes. These were demographic information, history, and mental health needs. Eight of the

textbooks included chapters on Multiracial Individuals, such as the Sue and Sue textbook, as well as the Robison-Wood textbook. Two of the textbooks mention Multiracial Individuals within an overall discussion of demographics or within the discussion of a specific monoracial group. One example of this in which Multiracial Individuals are discussed within the chapter on Asian Americans in Pope-Davis and Coleman.

Whereas Multiracial Asian Americans have generally grown up in the United States, Americans are mixed-race Asians who were born in Asia; many of them are children of U.S. Military men. (Pope-Davis & Coleman, 2007, p 231).

This is in contrast with the Robinson textbook, which has a twenty-page chapter titled “Converging Biracial and Multiracial Identities.” This chapter explains definitions, demographic information, and discussion of historical issues such as the One Drop Rule. This includes such information as providing basic definitions for terms such as biracial, interracial, interracial family, monoracial, bicultural, and Multiracial. The Sue and Sue, McGoldrick and Hardy, and the Vac, DeVaney, and Brendal textbooks take similar approaches to Multiracial Individuals in that they also review the topic via a specific chapter and providing knowledge on demographic statistics, historical context as well as identifying Multiracial Individuals as a stand-alone group.

Skill

Skill as a domain related to multicultural counseling is defined the ability to engage in both verbal and nonverbal helping skills and interventions that are appropriate for the client and environment they are working with according to the Association for Multicultural Counseling and Development (2015). Additionally, this is related to the concept that helping styles and approaches may be culturally-bound and that this can impact how and when interventions should

be used (Ahmed, Wilson, Henriksen, & Jones, 2011). The skill domain is the second most addressed area within the textbooks in this data set. Textbooks were identified as providing information in this domain if they included specific information on working with clients with Multiracial backgrounds. This included discussions of identity development models, case examples specific to Multiracial clients, and specific recommendations for working with this population. These built into the subthemes of identity development and counseling recommendations, that ultimately merged into the skills theme. The following are examples via quotes from the textbooks that show the skills domain being examined.

When working with Multiracial clients, avoid stereotyping. Like interracial relationships, all of us have been culturally conditioned to believe certain things about racially mixed people. In general, these images are based on mistaken beliefs that deny the mixed-race heritage of the person, and his or her uniqueness.

See Multiracial people in a holistic fashion rather than as fractions of a person. This means being careful when dealing with the “What are you?” question. In most cases, it is important to emphasize the positive qualities of the total person rather than seeing the person as parts. (Sue & Sue, 2013, p. 401)

Like treatment and interventions with Multiracial children, treatment and intervention with Multiracial adolescents require a solid working alliance built on trust and cultural sensitivity. (Lee, 2013, p.113)

Of the eleven textbooks that specifically addressed Multiracial Individuals, six (54.5%) showed evidence of this theme. These were the textbooks by Sue and Sue, Robison-Wood, Vac, DeVaney, and Brendal, McGoldrick and Hardy, Cornish, Schreier, Nadkarni, Metzger, and

Rodolfa, and France, Rodriguez, and Hett. With this theme primarily being addressed by the discussion of identity models and implications sections, it was evidenced in all six of the textbooks listed above.

Self-Awareness

Self-awareness as a domain related to multicultural counseling is defined as how aware counselors are of their own cultural background and experiences and how that can impact their perception of others according to the Association for Multicultural Counseling and Development (2015). This includes recognizing sources of discomfort with differences that exist between themselves and others in regard to concepts such as race, cultures, and sexuality (Ahmed, Wilson, Henriksen, & Jones, 2011). Self-awareness was the third overall theme found within the textbooks, but was the least represented within the textbooks. This theme was identified by information, typically questions, being presented to the reader for the purpose of encouraging them to examine their own beliefs and potential biases about Multiracial Individuals. This was done primarily through rhetorical questions presented to the reader in the body of the text or in specialized chapter questions. These questions were either listed among general questions found at the end of every chapter in the textbook or in specialized activities highlighted in a given chapter. One example of this was in the Robinson-Wood, textbook and was identified within the “Pause & Ponder” boxes that contained questions or scenarios. The following are examples:

When did you realize you belong to a particular race or ethnic group?

Is your racial/ethnic identification of a singular racial/ethnic group?

Did you experience external or internal pressure to choose your racial/ethnic group?
(Robinson-Wood, 2017, p. 232)

What are messages you received from family, media, community, and peers about skin color and skin tone? (Robinson-Wood, 2017, p. 239)

Additionally, another example of self-awareness is in the Vac, DeVaney, and Brendal textbook. The authors specifically provided an “awareness index” at the beginning of their chapter dedicated to Multiracial Individuals. This consisted of true & false questions meant to encourage the reader to gauge what their thoughts, beliefs, and expectations about Multiracial Individuals are prior to reading the chapter. “Mulatto is an acceptable term for biracial individuals. According to Census data, most Multiracial Individuals are part white. (pg. 141)” is an example of this.

The theme of self-awareness was found in two textbooks (18.2%). Those were the Robinson-Wood and Vac, DeVaney, and Brendal textbooks. Both books specifically stated that the activities highlighted above were included with the intent to encourage the reader to think about their values, beliefs and, opinions related to this group. This is reinforced as well by the context in which the questions and statements are presented. While other books may have intended sections within them to promote self-awareness, this was not directly evident in the text of the document.

Summary

The analysis of this dataset shows that while Multiracial Individuals are being addressed in the syllabi of some Social and Cultural Diversity courses in CACREP-accredited counseling Master’s degree programs, the group is not being discussed directly in the majority of them, 66 (66%). Analysis indicated that this group was only addressed in 33% (n=33) of the ninety-nine syllabi examined. Additionally, of the ninety-nine syllabi, 47% (n=47) also did not include additional resources that referred to or included information about Multiracial Individuals. It is

of note that, of the twenty-three textbooks identified within the syllabi, only eleven made specific mention of Multiracial Individuals that warranted qualitative analysis. Qualitative analysis of the textbooks identified within the syllabi, revealed three major emergent themes being addressed about Multiracial Individuals. The three major themes identified were knowledge, skills, and self-awareness with all eleven (100%) of the textbooks containing the knowledge theme, six (54.5%) containing the skills theme, and two (18.2%) containing the self-awareness theme.

Chapter IV

Discussion

This content analysis of syllabi, textbooks, and supplemental materials was conducted to determine if Multiracial Individuals were included in CACREP-accredited Master's counseling program's Social and Cultural Diversity courses. The results of this study indicated that some CACREP-accredited Master's counseling program's Social and Cultural Diversity course syllabi include Multicultural Individuals, though this was true of less than half of the syllabi examined. Additionally, it was found that a small percentage of the textbooks utilized contained mentions of Multiracial Individuals and that none of the supplemental materials specifically addressed Multiracial Individuals. While the course syllabi and readings mentioning Multiracial Individuals was limited, the content analysis of the textbooks revealed three emergent themes: Knowledge, Skills, and Self-awareness. The results of this study will be further discussed below.

Multiracial Individuals in Counselor Education

With Multiracial Individuals comprising an ever-growing portion of the demographics of the population of the United States, it is important that the counselor educators are fully informed about the topic of Multiracial Individuals in their training to better enable counselors to work with this population (Henrikson & Maxwell, 2016; Lee & Bean, 2004). Multiracial Individuals comprise a population that has unique counseling needs and who often tend to underutilize mental health services (Henrikson & Maxwell, 2016). The literature supports that this is an underrepresented group in counseling and training counselors and specifically addresses the requirement for further training to meet this group's needs (Henrikson & Maxwell, 2016; Lee & Bean, 2004; Perlmann & Waters, 2002). Although researchers highlight the importance of

recognizing Multiracial Individuals and the provision of counseling services, there is currently a paucity in the literature on how to do this. It is proposed that counselor educators and the counseling profession consider how they can better address the needs of Multiracial Individuals in training and coursework.

This content analysis indicated that the reviewed syllabi, textbooks and supplemental materials did not adequately cover Multiracial Individuals in Social and Cultural Diversity counseling courses. Of the ninety-nine syllabi that were examined in this study, only thirty-three specifically included Multiracial Individuals. Additionally, of the twenty-three textbooks that were used in these courses, eleven contained information regarding Multiracial Individuals. The literature states that multicultural training for counselors results in increased awareness, cultural sensitivity and better treatment outcomes (Coleman 2004; Griner & Smith, 2006; Smith et al., 2006; Sue et al. 1992). Thus, it is important for there to be increased coverage of Multiracial Individuals in counseling courses and associated materials.

Social and Cultural Diversity Standards in Master's Level Counseling Programs

The literature indicates that while there are standards developed by CACREP for counseling programs, there is not a set way to teach Social and Cultural Diversity courses (Barden & Greene, 2015; Sue et al., 1982). There is no agreement about what diverse populations should be addressed in counseling courses and frequently monoracial populations are included to the exclusion of Multiracial or multiethnic populations (Lentin, 2005). This seems to align with the findings of this study. There appears to be lack of inclusion of Multiracial Individuals as only thirty-three percent of syllabi address this group. It could be

inferred from these syllabi that the Social and Cultural Diversity courses in this study are typically not designed with the counseling needs of Multiracial Individuals at the forefront.

Appropriate Terminology and Multiracial Individuals

The literature supports four primary terms being used when identifying Multiracial Individuals (MERCC, 2015). These are biracial, mixed race, Multiracial, and mixed heritage and are part of the Multiracial competencies endorsed by the American Counseling Association. When examining which syllabi did contain mention of Multiracial Individuals, two terms were most commonly used, Multiracial and biracial. This may demonstrate a preference of counselor educators in using these two terms. Additionally, the use of the term biracial appears to support the literature's indication of the simplification of Multiracial Individuals' identities (Gonzalez-Barrera, 2015, Pew Research Center, 2015). No other related terms were noted as being used in the syllabi.

CACREP Standards

The literature states that multicultural counseling courses in CACREP-accredited programs should adhere to the set standards and competencies identified in the CACREP standards (CACREP, 2016). Of the ninety-nine syllabi included in this study, thirty-three syllabi referenced Multiracial Individuals specifically related to the 2009 or 2016 CACREP standards. This inclusion may also be linked to sociopolitical advancements in the recognition of Multiracial Individuals as a distinct population (Jones & Bullock, 2012; Pew Research Center, 2015; Wang, 2015). Furthermore, syllabi that included specific mention of Multiracial Individuals were more likely to be used within the last four years. This would appear to correspond to the changes that have happened in the ACA, CACREP and MRECC standards, as

they occurred during the same time frame (ACA, 2014; CACREP, 2016; MRECC, 2015). This means that newer courses seem to be including a wider coverage of groups, including Multiracial Individuals. If this is the case, it would be interesting to see how social and cultural standards are addressed in counseling Social and Cultural Diversity courses over the next ten years.

Geography and Inclusion of Multiracial Individuals

Other demographic information of note included that the majority of syllabi that included Multiracial Individuals were from schools in the South (51%). This result may be due to the fact that this region has higher rates of Multiracial Individuals as residents (Pew Research Center, 2015). This was then followed by the West (21.2%), which also has a higher proportion of Multiracial Individuals making up its population (Pew Research Center, 2015). This would also be supported by the literature's call for counselors-in-training to develop multicultural competencies to work with a diverse set of clients, but particularly with those with whom they are likely to work (Ratts, Singh, Nassar, McMillan, Butler, & McCulough, 2015).

Supplemental Readings

There, additionally, was a lack of coverage of Multiracial Individuals within the supplemental readings. None of the syllabi included reading materials beyond the textbooks that focused on this group. While many of the syllabi provided, sometimes lengthy, supplemental recommended reading lists, they did not reference supplemental readings specific to Multiracial Individuals. Instead these articles or nonacademic readings tended to focus on further elaboration of monoracial groups, sexuality, gender, or spirituality. Furthermore, examination of the textbooks themselves also appear to support the trend of not covering Multiracial Individuals.

A total of twenty-three unique textbooks were found to be in use by the ninety-nine course syllabi examined. Of those twenty-three textbooks, only eleven were found to make specific reference to Multiracial Individuals. Additionally, those eleven textbooks were only in use by forty-four percent (n=44) of the courses examined. This does mean that there was a higher rate of textbooks that discussed Multiracial Individuals being used than syllabi that specifically identified them as a group. So, while still fewer than half of courses identified are not specifically highlighting Multiracial Individuals in their course plans, more are using reading materials that at least reference the group.

When applying more in-depth scrutiny to the eleven textbooks that were identified as specifically discussing Multiracial Individuals, it was found that the overwhelming majority of these texts dedicate entire chapters and/or sections to this group, with eight of eleven doing so. This seems to indicate that when textbooks do mention this group, it tends to be in a more holistic way, covering multiple competency points. This information and that previously identified regarding textbooks do seem to indicate that while there is still a low percentage of textbooks being used that cover this topic, when they do, it is in a significant way. Additionally, it was determined that the most frequently utilized textbook is Sue and Sue, used by a total of thirty-one of the courses. This textbook provided a full chapter covering multiple layers of information about Multiracial Individuals, which will be discussed more fully later in this chapter. Again, while the majority of courses are not using a textbook that covers this topic, the most heavily used textbook does engage with it fully. There being a limited agreement on a textbook to use for this class also corresponds with the research indicating that there is no agreement on the nature of both material and topics to cover related to this course and CACREP standard (Carter, 2003 & Sue et al., 1982).

Multicultural Competences

The literature states that there are three primary competency domains in regard to multicultural counseling: knowledge, skills, and self-awareness (Ahmed, Wilson, Henriksen, & Jones, 2011; Arredondo, P., 1999; CACREP, 2016; & MERCC, 2015). The content analysis examining the eleven textbooks that included Multiracial Individuals resulted in these three areas being identified as the three emergent themes from the texts. These results also conform to the pedagogical objectives typically found in multicultural research: increased self-awareness and/or increased knowledge (Carter, 2001 & Carter, 2003).

Knowledge

Knowledge as a domain related to multicultural counseling is defined as the specific knowledge and information about the group that a counselor seeks to work with according to the Association for Multicultural Counseling and Development (2015). More specifically, this relates to knowledge of the life experiences, cultural heritage, and historical background of their culturally-different clients and how these can influence the client and counseling relationship (Ahmed, Wilson, Henriksen, & Jones, 2011). Knowledge is the domain most addressed by the textbooks and was covered by all eleven. This is somewhat expected as it is the most standard area addressed in Social and Cultural Diversity courses when discussing a group that is assumed to be “other” than a student’s own identification. Additionally, the literature supports it being typical for students to be educated about insofar as the norms of a group that they might work with in the future. However, when addressing this with Multiracial Individuals, it can create a greater challenge than when covering a monoracial group due to the sheer variety of racial and ethnic combinations that someone who self-identifies as being Multiracial may claim. This led

to an identified trend for many of the chapters about Multiracial Individuals to focus on identity development models as a substantial portion of their knowledge component. This does adhere to the Competencies for Counseling the Multiracial Population that were created by the Multi-Racial/Ethnic Counseling Concerns (MRECC, 2015).

Skills

Skills as a domain related to multicultural counseling is defined as the ability to engage in both verbal and nonverbal helping skills and interventions that are appropriate for the client and environment they are working with according to the Association for Multicultural Counseling and Development (2015). Additionally, this is related to the concept that helping styles and approaches may be culturally-bound and that this can impact how and when interventions should be used (Ahmed, Wilson, Henriksen, & Jones, 2011). The skills domain was the second most commonly found theme, with six of the eleven textbooks including this domain. Skills often seemed to proceed linearly from the knowledge theme. This involved helping clients working with the identity development models, with one text offering a specific list of recommendations for working with this population. Otherwise, most skills were non-specific and often were similar to skills mentioned in chapters focusing on monoracial groups. This is not surprising considering the nature of the topic and potential built-in overlap between monoracial groups and Multiracial groups.

Self-Awareness

Self-awareness as a domain related to multicultural counseling is defined as how aware counselors are of their own cultural backgrounds and experiences and how that can impact their perception of others according to the Association for Multicultural Counseling and Development

(2015). This includes recognizing sources of discomfort with differences that exist between themselves and others in regard to concepts such as race, culture, and sexuality (Ahmed, Wilson, Henriksen, & Jones, 2011). Self-awareness was the least represented theme in this analysis as it was only found in two of the eleven textbooks. This is somewhat unexpected given that increased self-awareness is one of the two primary objectives identified within the pedagogy research previously discussed (Carter, 2001 & Carter, 2003). That being said, increasing self-awareness was primarily done through rhetorical questions built into the chapters or through case studies related to Multiracial Individuals. This allows self-reflection and growth through engagement with the reading as well as providing examples that can be directly pulled into the classroom setting. This is underpinned as well by the context within which the questions and statements were presented, such as following knowledge sections where the reader is asked to contemplate what they have read or in standalone tables where they are accompanied by instructions encouraging the reader to reflect. While other books may have intended sections within their texts to promote self-awareness, this was not directly evident by the text of the document.

Limitations

The limitations of this research study can be related to two primary categories: limitations related to the research methodology of content analysis and those related to the potential bias of the researcher. Beyond the initial counting of occurrences of the identified terms, the interpretation of themes can be influenced by the bias of the researcher of the questions themselves. In the case of this study, this was attempted to be offset by both bracketing and the use of an external auditor.

Additionally, this analysis was limited to only the information presented via text and thus cannot speak to the context in which the information in the syllabi and/or textbooks are discussed in the class. This information could either further increase the education of counselors-in-training on the subject of Multiracial Individuals or could lower the impact of those noted as using materials that do speak to this topic. In a given class, things could happen to enhance or to diminish the coverage of any topic identified as being covered in the syllabus, such as class cancellations or interest levels of individual students within a specific class. Also affecting the coverage would be the training of the instructor and their familiarity with the literature regarding counseling Multiracial Individuals. The amount of deviation from the syllabus or quality of instruction is impossible to judge via this research methodology.

Along these same lines, the syllabi themselves offered varying levels of information regarding the subject matters and how topics would be covered in the class. This is indicative of the overall lack of standardization of syllabi in academia. Some of the syllabi reviewed in this research were very thorough in their explanations of exactly what topics would be covered, the expected length of coverage, and assignments related to those topics. Other syllabi were much briefer and did not contain such detailed information.

Recommendations

While this study appears to produce significant findings that Multiracial Individuals are underrepresented in the presenting of materials and as a topic in Social and Cultural Diversity classes, due to the nature of the research, there is both room for and the need for additional research on this topic. This suggested research would fall into the category of either expanding on what this study started by possibly trying to further mitigate the limitations highlighted

previously, or by gaining further context to widen the ability to generalize about the teaching of this topic.

One logical follow up to this study would be to either survey or interview instructors of these courses in an effort to understand whether this material is being covered thoroughly, both in those courses that make reference to it in their syllabi and/or required readings and in those that do not directly reference it in the syllabi themselves. This would give an increased context to how the material is being taught and help add richness to the themes identified within this study. Additionally, this would allow researchers to gain further information about some of the more ambiguous portions of the syllabi, such as what in-class activities are occurring and what multicultural groups students are being encouraged to explore as part of the assignments given in the classes. This would all help to account for the assumption made by this study that instructors are following the information provided on their syllabi and covering the topic of working with Multiracial Individuals as thoroughly as it is suggested they are by the syllabi and textbooks used.

Additionally, another suggested study could review all courses within a program rather than just the identified Social and Cultural Diversity class. The literature states that multicultural competencies should not be being covered in only one class, and this is supported by the current CACREP standards of integrating this topic. A study such as this would provide further context for the coverage of this topic within counselor education Master's degree programs as well as helping to determine if the current recommendations are being followed by current programs or if the singular class model is still the dominant paradigm.

Conclusion

This study adds to the current research by providing both a description of how the topic of Multiracial Individuals is being addressed by Social and Cultural Diversity classes in CACREP-accredited Master's degree counseling programs as well as providing a snapshot of the materials, textbooks, in particular, assigned within those Social and Cultural Diversity classes. The finding that the majority of Social and Cultural Diversity courses are not covering this group in any capacity both backs up the literature about the lack of coverage of this group and the tendency toward traditional coverage of monoracial groups. Additionally, these findings support the research in indicating that there is no fully agreed upon way to cover multicultural competencies and materials as identified through course syllabi. While this study has limitations, these have been mitigated as much as possible for the methodology employed and it helps provide a basic generalization of the coverage of topics related to Multiracial Individuals within CACREP-accredited Master's degree counseling programs. It also helps provide a basis to justify and call for further research on the topic by supplementing the lack of coverage of this specific group within the multicultural pedagogy research.

Chapter V

Manuscript

People who identify as Multiracial are a growing population in the United States and they now account for up to 10% of all new births (Pew Research Center, 2015; Root, 1996). The Pew Research Center (2015) found that of those surveyed who identified as Multiracial, 50% identified as American Indian and White, 12 % African American and American Indian, 4 % White and Asian American, 11% Multiracial Hispanic, 6% White, African-American, and American Indian, 5% other, and 11% identifying as African American and White. While inclusion of Multiracial Individuals has expanded over the years, there is also a tendency for Multiracial Individuals to be under-represented, misidentified, or ignored as population (Aguirre & Turner, 2011; Davis, 1991). This is evident in how the United States collects data about this population, not adding the option to mark more than one category on the Census until 2000. Historical views of race have also contributed to this as Multiracial Individuals are often labeled as monoracial due to ideas such as the “One Drop Rule,” where by a Multiracial Individual who has at least one ancestor of African descent is viewed as African American instead of their full racial/ethnic identity (Davis, 1991).

Despite the increase of recognition to the unique needs and experiences of Multiracial Individuals, there are no clear guidelines on addressing these populations in clinical populations. Counseling as a field acknowledged multiculturalism as being the fourth force in counseling approximately eighteen years ago (Sue et al, 1992; Pederson, 1991). Both the American Counseling Association (ACA) and Council for Accreditation of Counseling Related-Education Programs (CACREP) have updated their ethics codes and competencies standards to further

highlight the need and expectation of multicultural competencies (ACA, 2014; CACREP, 2016). Specifically, this is grounded in honoring and considering the unique backgrounds of the clients that counselors may serve and the need to make sure that counselors-in-training have an understanding of unique cultures different from their own as well as an understanding of how their own personal biases can impact the counseling relationship. However, this comes from a monoracial perspective and competencies around Multiracial groups were not specifically identified until 2015 by the Multi-Racial/Ethnic Counseling Concerns.

Despite the growing movement to develop multicultural competencies in counselors, there is not agreement regarding specific guidelines on how to do so (Carter, 1995; Carter, 2001; Carter, 2003; Helms & Cook, 1999; Sue, 2001;). This is especially true with reference to those persons who identify as Multiracial. Due to this dearth of consensus and the growing population of Multiracial Individuals, it is important that we understand the pedagogy used to teach counselors-in-training about mutualism, in general, and how the topic of those that do not fit into monoracial categories are addressed, in specific.

The purpose of this study is to explore how counselor education programs are teaching counselors-in-training about Multiracial Individuals and their future counseling relationships with those individuals. The study will do so by using a descriptive content analysis of syllabi and associated materials of Social and Cultural Diversity classes in CACREP-accredited counselor education programs. In addition, the study seeks to determine the amount of exposure given to students regarding Multiracial Individuals. By doing so it is intended to help counselor education programs recognize whether they are adequately addressing Multiracial Individuals and whether counselors-in-training are being educated about working with individuals who identify as Multiracial. It is posited that it is important that counselors are aware of the unique

experiences and needs of Multiracial Individuals and how that may differ when compared to the more traditional teaching of the experiences and needs of monoracial individuals.

Social and Cultural Issues in Counselor Education

In the 1980s, multiculturalism became a stronger force and saw increased acceptance due to the Civil Rights and Women's Movements of the previous decades (Sue & Sue, 2008). As a result, both the Association for Counseling and Development (AACD) and the American Psychological Association (APA) updated their ethical guidelines in 1981. These guidelines required that clinicians have formal training on cultural differences (Sue et al., 1992). Also, in 1988, multiculturalism was deemed the fourth force in psychology (Pederson, 1991). While progress was being made, Sue et al. (1992) noted that counselor still tended to be trained in and work from a monocultural perspective, though there was a push by a number of professionals to include multiculturalism in training and counseling standards of practice. This included incorporating multiculturalism into official standards and ethical guidelines (Pedersen, 1991; Sue et al., 1992).

More recently, the profession has continued to try to further define and provide clear guidance into incorporating multiculturalism in both practice and training, possibly with limited efficacy. In 2014, the ACA Code of Ethics was updated to include, among other things, a preamble that called for "honoring diversity and embracing a multicultural approach in support of the worth, dignity, potential, and uniqueness of people within their social and cultural contexts" (p.3). In 2016, the Council for Accreditation of Counseling Related-Education Programs (CACREP) listed social and cultural diversity as one of the eight common core areas of foundational knowledge (CACREP, 2016).

Further, the Multicultural Counseling Competences were revised in 2015 and are now the Multicultural and Social Justice Counseling Competencies. This shows both the continued evolution of the incorporation of standards related to multiculturalism in counseling and its importance (Ratts, Singh, Nassar, McMillan, Butler, & McCulough, 2015). It is also of note that the ACA recognized and endorsed the Competencies for Counseling the Multiracial Population that were created by the Multi-Racial/Ethnic Counseling Concerns (MRECC) in 2015.

Counseling Pedagogy and Multicultural Competencies

With the further push to improve multicultural competencies as counselors and the adoption of ACA, CACREP and MRECC standards, training programs have increasingly attempted to identify the best ways to provide such training. As such, courses focusing on multiculturalism are more integrated into the curriculums of counselor training programs, as well as those in other helping professions (Abreu et al., 2000). How to approach doing so has become a varied amongst programs. Researchers also agree that developing as a multiculturally competent counselor is a multifaceted process that requires counselor trainees to gain knowledge related to their clients' cultural backgrounds, increase their personal awareness and apply appropriate skills and interventions when working with diverse clients (Coleman 2004; Sue et al. 1992).

Smith et al.'s (2006) meta-analysis indicated that multicultural training is associated with increased racial awareness and cultural sensitivity. Other studies have indicated at least a medium effect size for therapeutic outcomes when counselors use culturally sensitive interventions in therapy (Griner & Smith, 2006). This underpins the overall themes in the research beyond the advocacy being encouraged by ACA and CACREP, that multicultural

training is important and ultimately necessary for counselors. Research also indicates that counselors-in-training are lacking in these areas and that many lack efficacy when working with diverse clients as well (Holcomb-McCoy & Myers, 1999). While there is not a great deal of research on quantifying a best practice in training these competences, there have been some attempts to do so. However, research has shown that specific courses dedicated to multicultural competencies can improve such competencies.

Classroom interventions such as experiential activities, reflective activities like journaling, videos, class discussions, and outside speakers are commonly used in counselor training (Neville et al., 1996; Sammons & Speight, 2008). A 2015 study by Barden and Greene found that a reconceptualization of pedagogy regarding this subject was needed, with a focus on incorporating more direct involvement and experiences with culturally diverse people and encouragement of direct interaction. To further highlight the need to examine the pedagogy related to teaching multiculturalism in courses, historically it has been demonstrated that such courses had a tendency to focus on the preparation of White students to work with clients with different racial/ethnic backgrounds than their own as opposed to preparing counselors from all backgrounds (Shorter-Gorden, 2009). In addition, the research about multicultural competencies of counselors-in-training are typically drawn from self-reports on multicultural counseling competence and multicultural counseling self-efficacy (Barden & Greene, 2015). Due to the limitations of using self-report and its potential lack of reliability, more structured methods of instruction and evaluation are needed to assess competency. Additionally, this is problematic as it does not take into account the growing Multiracial population and other forms of intersection that may occur. Along these lines, there seem to be arguments from a perspective labeled as traditionalist that there should be a focus on only four traditional minority groups: African-

Americans, Asian- Americans, Latinos, and Native Americans (Lentin, 2005). The argument was that the expansion beyond this has diluted the focus by including statuses such as gender and sexual orientation. However, this approach, in practice, can lead to the lack of acknowledgement of the impact that a much larger scope of racial/ethnic identities and intersections among these traditional four can have on an individual. Additionally, this could contribute to siloing of identities, as well as not honoring the preferred identities of clients, including Multiracial identities.

This and the previous research reinforce the idea that this is a complex and complicated topic. However, a beginning in unraveling this knot is to review the ways that Multiracial competencies are being taught in programs currently. While we have policies written in handbooks and other forms of guidelines, the empirical data about how the implementation of these policies and the actual engaged practices has been lacking. Once we have the formal knowledge regarding how these competencies are being dealt with in counseling programs, we can take stock of them and, hopefully, formulate a best practice model for the most effective means to be sure that counselors-in-training are being trained in the ways that will best prepare them to interact with Multiracial clients in the future.

Purpose of the Study

The purpose of this descriptive content analysis is to examine: (1) the extent to which Multiracial Individuals are included in CACREP-accredited masters counseling program syllabi and course materials and (2) what readings and assignments are included in CACREP-accredited masters counseling program syllabi and course materials that include Multiracial Individuals. Ultimately, it is hoped that the findings will assist counselor educators and counselor education

program in training and education recommendations in working with individuals who identify as Multiracial. It is important that counselors are aware of the unique experiences and needs of Multiracial Individuals and how that may differ when compared to the more traditional teaching of the experiences and needs of monoracial individuals.

Significance of Study

Because the portion of the population that identifies as Multiracial continues to grow, counselors need to be able to provide competent and adequate counseling to Multiracial Individuals. To do so, counselors need to understand the unique characteristics and needs of this growing population. It is currently estimated that by 2050, 20 percent of the population of the United States will be Multiracial (Lee & Bean, 2004). Due to this, it is much more likely that counselors will encounter or work with someone who identifies as part of this group. Those who identify as Multiracial experience a wide range of unique issues due to their ethnic background, which makes it important for counselors to understand how this identity may affect them and the counseling relationship (Henrikson & Maxwell, 2016).

While multicultural competency has been identified as the “fourth force” in counseling and competencies have been developed by ACA and CACREP to meet this identified need, counselor education programs tend to focus on monoracial groups. Additionally, there is a paucity in the research related to training counselors to work with this population, despite the competency standards set by CACREP, ACA, and, MRECC. In light of this, this study seeks to identify both to what extent and how Multiracial groups are being addressed in Social and Cultural Diversity classes. This will help identify whether there is a gap with this subject within counselor education programs as well as highlight the pedagogy utilized when it is addressed,

thus contributing to the literature about multicultural training in general, as well as further clarifying how the competencies identified by CACREP and ACA are expressed in these training programs.

Methodology

The study uses a mixed method content analysis to explore the syllabi and the associated textbooks to determine how CACREP-accredited Master's degree Social and Cultural Diversity classes are addressing the development and facilitation of multicultural counseling competencies specifically for the Multiracial population. The literature and research indicating the importance of multicultural competencies is vast, but little focus has been given to the ever-growing Multiracial population and how counselors' competencies with this group are being addressed through multicultural training courses.

The quantitative analysis is based on the post positivism paradigm. The post positivism paradigm is the viewpoint that the purpose of scientific study is to get a close approximation to reality, because it is not definitively knowable (Berg & Lune, 2012). This links to the idea that to accurately discuss information regarding Multiracial Individuals representation, the context of how they are mentioned is as important as if they are mentioned. This also underpins the argument that the extent to which Multiracial Individuals are represented in these courses can be determined by examining the course material for them being mentioned and the context in which it happens. The documents were analyzed for inclusion of specific terminology: biracial, mixed race, Multiracial, and mixed heritage.

The paradigm underlying the qualitative portion of this study is social constructionism in that emphasizes the cultural context of meaning-making and has the assumption that human experience is essentially subjective and mutable (Hays & Wood, 2011). In the context of this

study, this method intends to identify and present themes related to Multiracial Individuals found the syllabi and materials associated with these courses and the frequency with which they are discussed. The qualitative analysis also shows how multicultural competences are being addressed in the courses, specifically those related to development regarding the Multiracial group. Additionally, qualitative analysis will contribute to understanding how counselors-in-training are encouraged to develop skills related to this population. By combining both quantitative and qualitative methodology in this study it allows for a fuller description of not only if but also how this group is being addressed in Social and Cultural Diversity courses.

Data Collection

For this study, convenience sampling was utilized, with a goal of sampling 25% of universities with CACREP-accredited counseling Master's programs, for a minimum of ninety-seven (97) universities. This percentage was selected because analyzing a sample size of at least 25% allowed for greater generalization to the entire population of graduate programs with a confidence level of 0.90 and a margin of error of 0.05 (Kalla, 2009). This study's final dataset included ninety-nine (99) individual schools, equaling 25.6% of current schools with CACREP accreditation, and thus meeting the minimum threshold identified within the literature (Smith, 2013). In addition to a thorough syllabi review, a descriptive review of textbooks and supplemental materials identified within the syllabi were conducted to provide additional information on the inclusion of Multiracial Individuals in CACREP-accredited graduate program course materials. This resulted in the review of twenty-three textbooks and forty-two journal articles. Of the twenty-three textbooks, eleven (43%), were found to include mentions of Multiracial Individuals. None of the journal articles were found to contain references to Multiracial Individuals, so they were excluded from further analysis.

Syllabi were collected via three methods. CACREP-accredited counseling Master's degree programs were emailed asking for the syllabi associated with the program's Social and Cultural Diversity training class for counseling Master's degree students. A total of seventy-five emails were sent, with thirty-two programs responding, resulting in a response rate of 42.7%. Nineteen syllabi were collected by using the ACA Syllabi Repository found at <https://www.counseling.org/knowledge-center/clearinghouses/syllabus-clearinghouse/social-cultural-diversity>. Finally, forty-eight syllabi were found via online search. This was done by utilizing the Google search engine and searching for the terms "multicultural counseling syllabus," "diversity counseling syllabus," and "cultural diversity counseling syllabus." These syllabi were then reviewed to determine appropriateness for inclusion in the study.

Inclusionary Criteria

To be included in this study, all syllabi were reviewed to ensure that the counseling graduate programs from which they were acquired were CACREP-accredited. This was done by accessing the CACREP directory on line and verifying that the program associated with the school is CACREP-accredited. Since syllabi came from various years, the length of time the school was CACREP-accredited was also verified to make sure the year the syllabi were used aligned within the time period that the school has been accredited. The number of years each program was accredited was available and retrieved from the CACREP directory website (CACREP Directory, 2018). This was done by looking up each school on the CACREP directory website and identifying their current accreditation status and the number of years they have been accredited.

Determining Inclusion of Materials for Analysis

Once syllabi were obtained from CACREP-accredited counseling Master's programs, they were categorized into one of two categories: inclusion or exclusion. Data were analyzed using a priori design, with four keywords searched for within the collected syllabi, textbooks and supplemental readings. Keywords identified were biracial, mixed race, Multiracial, and mixed heritage as these were identified as the most common terms when referencing Multiracial Individuals as identified in the Competencies for Counseling the Multiracial Population and endorsed by the ACA (MERCC, 2015). Syllabi that included one or more of these terms in the body of the text were added to the inclusion category. Those syllabi that were identified as not using any of the abovementioned terminology were labeled as being in the exclusion category. The syllabi were collected electronically either in Adobe .pdf or Microsoft Word .doc or .docx document formats. The control find function was used initially to search for each of the four keywords. Additionally, the researcher then reviewed the syllabi to confirm that accuracy. It was documented which syllabi contained at least one of the four words and how many of the words were found. Additionally, it was documented what textbooks and supplemental materials were required for the course based on the information provided in the syllabi.

For this study thirty-three of the syllabi, 33%, comprised the inclusion category. Sixty-six, 66%, of the syllabi were assigned to the exclusion category. Those in the category of exclusion made no mention of Multiracial Individuals in the text of the syllabi and were no longer referenced for additional data.

Data Analysis

This study analyzed the data in two major ways. The first was by document review and the identification of the number of times that Multiracial Individuals are mentioned or referenced

in the text body of the syllabi and textbooks associated with each as part of the quantitative analysis. This will speak to the magnitude to which this subject matter is mentioned in the materials associated with these classes. Secondly, a qualitative analysis of syllabi and texts was conducted using open coding. Open coding, based in Grounded Theory, is the process of identifying concepts and then defining and developing categories based on their properties (Berg & Lune, 2012). Open coding allows for the building concepts from the text-based data sources. While the research is guided by the previously denoted research questions, this type of coding will allow for the researcher to remain flexible in discovering relationships, ideas and concepts not through of prior to the data collection process. (Hays & Singh, 2011).

Following this, axial coding was used to identify the relationship between the identified open coding themes to provide an easier categorization of the data and to lend toward the identification of achieving saturation in regard to themes. Additionally, saturation was sought to be met through this analysis. Saturation is recognized as being the point in analysis and coding of data through a qualitative research methodology at which there is enough information obtained that both a repetition in information is found and no new themes are able to be identified (Fush & Ness, 2015).

Textbooks identified from the syllabi were collected electronically. These documents were also searched through the control find function for the four keywords identified above. Those textbooks that were identified as containing at least one of the four words were then examined for content and context that Multiracial Individuals were mentioned (Corbin & Strauss, 1990). The textbooks identified within the syllabi were thematically coded to identify emergent themes. Themes were identified by content analysis of the texts related to Multiracial Individuals via open coding, to identify the general themes, which were then categorized and

coded into the three identified themes using axial coding (Corbin & Strauss, 1990). This process was also applied to the reading lists found on the syllabi.

Trustworthiness

Due to the methodology identified as the framework for this study, trustworthiness must be considered alongside the reliability of the proposed mixed methods study. It did not require a full review as the study does not include human subjects. In addition, the biases of the researcher were accounted for both via bracketing and the use of an audit trail. Additionally, an external auditor was used to raise both the reliability and validity of the study. An external auditor who is familiar with qualitative research was provided with the data, methodology and codebook. They then took a sample of the data set and analyzed it to ensure that their results were consistent with the researcher's.

Results

The purpose of this descriptive content analysis is to examine: (1) the extent to which Multiracial Individuals are included in CACREP-accredited masters counseling program syllabi and course materials and (2) what readings and assignments are included in CACREP-accredited Master's counseling program syllabi and course materials that include Multiracial Individuals. In total, ninety-nine syllabi were collected for this study. These syllabi represented a total of 99 universities of the 386 current universities, or 25.6% of universities offering CACREP-accredited counseling Master's degree programs in counseling within the United States.

Syllabi and Counseling Program Information

A total of ninety-nine graduate-level counseling, Master's graduate academic institutions were collected. However, thirty-three syllabi met the inclusionary criteria and were included in

this study. Of those thirty-three schools, five (6.6%) offered one counseling graduate program, fourteen (42.4%) offered two programs, and fourteen (42.4%) offered three. In total twenty were school counseling programs, thirty-two clinical mental health, sixteen were rehabilitation, and four were family counseling programs. Table 1 summarizes the universities represented by the syllabi collected and counseling programs that they offer.

Table 1 Syllabi that Met Inclusionary Criteria

University Name	Program(s) Offered
Agrosy University, Washington	Clinical Mental Health & School
Auburn University	Clinical Mental Health, School & Rehabilitation
Ball State	Clinical Mental Health, School, & Rehabilitation
Boise State	Clinical Mental Health, Rehabilitation, & Family
California State University, Fresno	Clinical Mental Health, Rehabilitation, & Family
Clemson University	Clinical Mental Health & School
George Mason University	Clinical Mental Health & School
Jacksonville State University	Clinical Mental Health & School
Mercer University	Clinical Mental Health, School, & Rehabilitation
Messiah University	Clinical Mental Health, Family, & School
Northern Arizona State	Clinical Mental Health & School
Northern Illinois University	Clinical Mental Health, School, & Rehabilitation
Regis University	Clinical Mental Health
Seattle University	Clinical Mental Health & School
St. Bonaventure University	Clinical Mental Health & School
Texas A&M University, Texarkana	Clinical Mental Health
The Citadel	School
University of Alaska, Fairbanks	Clinical Mental Health & School
University of Arkansas	Clinical Mental Health, School, & Rehabilitation
University of Florida	Clinical Mental Health
University of Houston, Victoria	Clinical Mental Health & Rehabilitation
University of Massachusetts, Boston	Clinical Mental Health & Rehabilitation
University of Memphis	Clinical Mental Health, School, & Rehabilitation
University of Montana	Clinical Mental Health & School
University of North Carolina	Clinical Mental Health, School & Rehabilitation
University of North Texas	Clinical Mental Health, School & Rehabilitation
University of Northern Colorado	Clinical Mental Health, Rehabilitation, & Family
University of South Florida	Clinical Mental Health & Rehabilitation
University of Texas, Tyler	Clinical Mental Health, School, & Rehabilitation
Virginia Commonwealth University	Clinical Mental Health
Wake Forest	Clinical Mental Health & School
Wayne University	Clinical Mental Health, School & Rehabilitation
Xavier University	Clinical Mental Health & School

Of the thirty-three syllabi included in the analysis, they ranged in years from 2009 to 2018, with 10 being from the last four years (2013-2017). Seven of the syllabi contained no information about the date they were used. Additionally, the syllabi indicated what semester they were being utilized for. Two of the syllabi included in the study indicated they were for school counseling programs, while the other thirty-one did not indicate a particular program being associated with the syllabi. All thirty-three were classes specifically designated as being multicultural classes. Table 2 shows which universities were included within these thirty-three syllabi and corresponding descriptive data discussed above.

Table 2 Universities in Inclusion Category

University Name	State	Region	Year	Semester
Agrosy University, Washington	WA	Northeast	2013	Fall
Auburn University	AL	South	2017	Spring
Ball State	IN	Midwest	2013	Spring
Boise State	ID	Midwest	2009	Fall
California State University, Fresno	CA	West	2010	N/D
Clemson University	GA	South	2018	Fall
George Mason University	VA	South	2015	Spring
Jacksonville State University	MS	South	2012	Fall
Mercer University	GA	South	N/D	N/D
Messiah University	PA	Northeast	2014	Fall
Northern Arizona State	AZ	West	N/D	N/D
Northern Illinois University	IL	Midwest	2009	Fall
Regis University	MA	Northeast	2015	Spring
Seattle University	WA	West	2015	Spring
St. Bonaventure University	NY	Northeast	2017	Fall
Texas A&M University, Texarkana	TX	South	2016	Fall
The Citadel	SC	South	2016	Fall
University of Alaska, Fairbanks	AK	West	N/D	N/D
University of Arkansas	AR	South	2017	Spring
University of Florida	FL	South	2015	Spring
University of Houston, Victoria	TX	South	2009	Fall
University of Massachusetts, Boston	MA	Northeast	N/D	N/D
University of Memphis	TN	South	2016	Fall
University of Montana	MT	West	N/D	N/D
University of North Carolina	NC	South	2014	Fall
University of North Texas	TX	South	2016	Spring
University of Northern Colorado	CO	West	2017	Fall
University of South Florida	FL	South	2015	N/D
University of Texas, Tyler	TX	South	2015	Summer
Virginia Commonwealth University	VA	South	N/D	N/D

Wake Forest	NC	South	2016	Spring
Wayne University	MI	Midwest	2017	Spring
Xavier University	OH	Midwest	N/D	N/D

*note: N/D indicates that the syllabi did not disclose this information.

Though syllabi were gathered from all regions of the United States, programs in the South (n=17)51% made up the largest part of the sample, followed by the West (n=7) 21.2%, Midwest (n= 5) 15.1% and the Northeast (n=4)12.1%.

Further analysis of the syllabi revealed that all other syllabi (n=33) directly referenced the CACREP standards, listing them in beginning of the document. Specifically, two CACREP standards were identified as being used in these syllabi: the 2009 standards and the 2016 standards. Twenty-three (69.7%) of the programs used the 2009 standard and eleven (30.3%) used the 2016 CACREP standard. Table 3 lists which programs' syllabi were using which CACREP standard on the collected syllabi.

Table 3 Universities and CACREP Standard Used

University Name	CACREP Standard Used
Agrosy University, Washington	2009
Auburn University	2016
Ball State	2009
Boise State	2009
California State University, Fresno	2009
Clemson University	2016
George Mason University	2009
Jacksonville State University	2009
Mercer University	2009
Messiah University	2009
Northern Arizona State	2009
Northern Illinois University	2009
Regis University	2009
Seattle University	2009
St. Bonaventure University	2016
Texas A&M University, Texarkana	2016
The Citadel	2016
University of Alaska, Fairbanks	2009
University of Arkansas	2016
University of Florida	2009
University of Houston, Victoria	2009
University of Massachusetts, Boston	2009

University of Memphis	2016
University of Montana	2009
University of North Carolina	2009
University of North Texas	2016
University of Northern Colorado	2016
University of South Florida	2009
University of Texas, Tyler	2009
Virginia Commonwealth University	2009
Wake Forest	2016
Wayne University	2016
Xavier University	2009

The syllabi typically identified specific course objectives that corresponded to the CACREP standards or made direct reference to the ACA Code of Ethics. Additionally, the syllabi contained some iteration of a course description. In general, these descriptions include a reference to the multicultural competencies as described in the research; attitudes, beliefs, knowledge, and skills (ACA, 2015). These descriptions typically informed students that the focus of the class would be to increase both awareness and knowledge related to the topics included in the course. These statements were then typically linked to the CACREP standards to which the course was adhering. Since many of the syllabi were not from this current year, the CACREP directory was consulted to verify that the program had accreditation at the time the syllabi was used. The number of years each program was accredited was available and retrieved from the CACREP directory website. This all indicates that the majority of syllabi adhered to a specific CACREP standard and then tied these, as well ACA codes, into the objectives of the course.

Frequency of Multiracial Individuals Included in Syllabi

Sixty-six syllabi did not include Multiracial Individuals in any part of their course syllabi. Of these sixty-six syllabi, seven syllabi (7%) did not address race or ethnicity at all. They instead identified the CACREP standards associated with the course, contact information, and

assignments. The other fifty-nine syllabi contained mention of monoracial groups, sexuality, and/or spirituality.

Thirty-three (33.3%) syllabi included Multiracial Individuals. The most common terminology used was Multiracial at 87.9% (n=29), followed by biracial at 12.1% (n=4). No syllabi used the terms mixed race or mixed heritage although these are endorsed terms in the MRECC (2015). The most common context in which Multiracial Individuals were mentioned in the syllabi was the identification of a specific day that this group would be discussed in class, twenty-eight (28%) of the syllabi. Of the thirty-three (33) syllabi in which this was true, twenty-nine (29%) listed this as topic of discussion for that day in class. All of those that did devote an entire day an entire class to Multiracial Individuals did so after talking about monoracial groups. However, four (4%) included this group within the discussion of another monoracial group. This was done in by combining the lecture day with discussing Latinos (n=1) or Arab Americans (n=3).

Textbooks

Textbooks were collected by electronic library database or by renting electronically with three of the textbooks being rented; Cultural diversity: A primer for the human services by Diller and published in 2011, Case studies in multicultural counseling and therapy written by Sue and Gallardo and published in 2014 and Counseling the culturally different: Theory and practice written by Sue and Sue and published in 2013. These were rented electronically through the Amazon website for a fee. Examination of the textbooks was conducted via the found word option in pdf and then was verified by reading that section.

Twenty-three textbooks were identified within the 33 syllabi as required for the Master’s level counseling programs’ Social and Cultural Diversity classes. Initially, the twenty-three textbooks were examined for inclusion of the four previously discussed keywords: biracial, mixed race, Multiracial, and mixed heritage. Textbooks were placed into one of two categories: inclusion or exclusion. Those classified as being in the inclusion category were found to have at least one of the four identified keywords in the body of the text. Those classified in the exclusion category did not appear to include mention of any terms related to Multiracial Individuals in the text, including the index of the text. Table 4 shows the list of textbooks in alphabetical order and lists how many schools used the textbook the frequency of use by the Social and Cultural Diversity course, as well as if that text mentioned Multiracial Individuals.

Table 4 Textbooks Used in Multicultural Counseling Courses

Author	Text Book	Year Published	Universities Utilizing the Textbook	Multiracial Individuals Mentioned
Baruth, L. G., & Manning, M. L.	Multicultural counseling and psychotherapy: A lifespan approach. Routledge.	2011	2	Exclusion
Diller, J.	Cultural diversity: A primer for the human services. Nelson Education.	2010	5	Exclusion
Duan, C., & Brown, C.	Becoming a multiculturally competent counselor. SAGE Publications.	2015	2	Inclusion
Hayes, D. G., & Erford, B. T.	Developing multicultural counseling competence: A systems approach. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Pearson Education, Inc	2013	2	Inclusion
Kivel, P.	Uprooting Racism-: How White People Can Work for Racial Justice. New Society Publishers.	2017	1	Exclusion
Lee, C. C.	Multicultural issues in counseling: New approaches to diversity. John Wiley & Sons.	2013	1	Inclusion
Manning, M. L., Baruth, L. G., & Lee, G. L.	Multicultural education of children and adolescents. Taylor & Francis.	2008	1	Exclusion

McAuliffe, G.	Culturally alert counseling: A comprehensive introduction. Sage.	2012	1	Exclusion
McGoldrick, M., & Hardy, K. V.	Re-visioning family therapy: Race, culture, and gender in clinical practice. Guilford Press.	2008	1	Inclusion
McGoldrick, M., Giordano, J., & Garcia-Preto, N.	Ethnicity and family therapy. Guilford Press.	2005	1	Inclusion
Hardy, Cornish, Schreier, Nadkarni, Metzger, & Rodolfa,	Handbook of Multicultural Counseling Competencies	2010	1	Inclusion
Pedersen, P. B., & Carey, J. C.	Multicultural Counseling Schools: A Practical Handbook. Allyn & Bacon.	2002	2	Exclusion
Pedersen, P. B., Lonner, W. J., Draguns, J. G., Trimble, J. E., & Scharron-del Rio, M. R.	Counseling across cultures. Sage Publications.	2007	1	Exclusion
Pope-Davis, D. B., & Coleman, H. L.	Multicultural counseling competencies: Assessment, education and training, and supervision.	1996	2	Inclusion
Ratts, M. J., & Pedersen, P. B.	Counseling for multiculturalism and social justice: Integration, theory, and application. John Wiley & Sons.	2014	1	Inclusion
Ridley, C. R.	Overcoming unintentional racism in counseling and therapy: A practitioner's guide to intentional intervention (Vol. 5). Sage.	2005	2	Exclusion
Robinson-Wood, T.	The convergence of race, ethnicity, and gender: Multiple identities in counseling. Sage Publications.	2012	2	Inclusion
Schmidt, J. J.	Social and cultural foundations of counseling and human services: Multiple influences on self-concept development. Pearson/Allyn and Bacon.	2005	4	Exclusion
Schwarzbaum, S. E., & Thomas, A. J.	Dimensions of multicultural counseling: A life story approach. Sage Publications.	2008	1	Exclusion
Smith, T. B.	Practicing multiculturalism: Affirming diversity in counseling and psychology. Allyn and Bacon.	2003	2	Exclusion
Sue, D. W., & Sue, D	Counseling the Culturally Diverse: Theory and Practice	2015	31	Inclusion
Sue, D. W., Gallardo, M. E., & Neville, H. A.	Case studies in multicultural counseling and therapy. John Wiley & Sons.	2013	1	Inclusion

Textbooks will be referred to by their authors' names. Of the thirty-two identified textbooks, 34% (n=11) were found to include Multicultural Individuals in their text through Control Find. This was identified by searching the text of the textbooks electronically, including the Tables of Contents and indices for the use of the previously identified terms referring to Multiracial Individuals; biracial, mixed race, Multiracial, and mixed heritage. The Sue and Sue textbook was used by 33% (n=33) of the ninety-nine courses. This made it the most commonly utilized textbook within this data set.

Analysis of the eleven textbooks identified as including Multiracial Individuals ranged from full chapters on Multiracial Individuals to sentences. Eight (35%) textbooks had full chapters and two (8%) contained mentions of one of the four keywords in three to five sentences within another chapter. The following textbooks contained full chapters: Sue, and Sue; Ratts, and Pedersen; Pope-Davis, and Coleman; Lee; Hayes & Erford; Sue, Gallardo, & Neville; Robinson-Wood; & McGoldrick, and Hardy. The following textbooks contained sentences about Multiracial Individuals within other chapters: Duan, C., and Brown, C.; and McGoldrick, M., Giordano, J., & Garcia-Preto, N. These were typified by discussions of current demographic trends in the United States, identifying Multiracial Individuals as a racial group in the United States, as included in the Census, and as a growing population. For example, the Atkison textbook included Multiracial Individuals only in its discussion of the monoracial group Asian Americans, stating that it is common for Asian American to be Multiracial in that they are likely to identify with multiple Asian ethnicities.

Some of the thirty-three syllabi contained supplemental reading lists consisting of journal articles. In total there were forty-two unique articles identified on the syllabi. These articles were downloaded electronically from the article database through the library at Auburn University. Articles were searched for the four keywords identifying Multiracial Individuals. This was done by the control find function. None of the articles examined contained references to Multiracial Individuals, nor were keywords found within them. 21% (n=9) of the articles were addressing sexuality. 40% (n=17) were addressing monoracial groups. 21% (9) were addressing religion and spirituality. Finally, 16% (n=7) were addressing gender issues. As none of the articles were identified as making reference to or including keywords related to Multiracial Individuals, they were not included in further analysis to identify emergent themes.

Emergent Themes of Textbooks

Emergent themes are concepts that are identified from data through qualitative analysis (Given, 2008). They assist in categorizing a smaller set of ideas into a larger category or theme (Given, 2008). Themes can be larger labels based on the smaller ideas found through coding techniques such as open and axial coding (Richards, 2005).

Each of the textbooks that were identified as incorporating contents related to Multiracial Individuals was analyzed through open coding of the content specifically related to Multiracial Individuals. Based on the relationships and emergent ideas identified through the open coding, themes were identified via axial coding of the initial data by collapsing the initial open codes. Themes that emerged within these domains were then analyzed to determine what ideas were being conveyed about Multiracial Individuals in the data set.

Open coding was conducted on the eleven textbooks identified as containing information related to Multiracial Individuals. This, again, was based on the inclusion of terminology referencing Multiracial Individuals: biracial, mixed race, Multiracial, and mixed heritage (MRECC, 2015). These terms were used as they are identified as the most common terms when referencing Multiracial Individuals as identified in the Competencies for Counseling the Multiracial Population (MRECC, 2015). The coding process was started by reading the sections of the identified materials that contained mention of the four keywords. Upon reading this material, meaning units were created based on the main ideas presented in the text that were then condensed these units into a core meaning, creating a theme. Content analysis coding is inherently a reflective process with no direct linear progression (Erlingsson & Brysiewicz, 2017). To provide more structure in this study, the sections of the textbook were initially analyzed by identifying what the text stated its objective to the reader was. This was then linked back to the multicultural competencies as identified by the Association for Multicultural Counseling and Development (2015) to solidify the emergent themes.

Three primary themes were found as the results of collapsing the open coding through the axial coding process. These themes were knowledge, skill, and self-awareness. These themes relate directly back to the domains identified as the three primary competencies for multicultural competencies (Ahmed, Wilson, Henriksen, & Jones, 2011; Arredondo, P., 1999; CACREP, 2016; & MERCC, 2015). Of the three themes, Knowledge was the most prevalent found in textbooks, with eleven of the textbooks having evidence of this theme. The skill theme was the second most prevalent theme, with six (54.5%) of the eleven textbooks contained this theme. Self-Awareness was the least identified theme, with two (18.2%) of the eleven books containing it. This appearing to indicate a greater focus on Knowledge than the other two

themes, based on the frequency in which it was found. Additional information regarding the themes can be found below.

Knowledge

Knowledge as a domain related to multicultural counseling is defined as the specific knowledge and information about the group that a counselor seeks to work with according to the Association for Multicultural Counseling and Development (2015). More specifically, this relates to knowledge of the life experiences, cultural heritage, and historical background of their culturally-different clients and how these can influence the client and counseling relationship (Ahmed, Wilson, Henriksen, & Jones, 2011). Competency of knowledge is the domain most addressed by the textbooks that have information about Multiracial Individuals as part of their text as this domain was covered by all eleven (100%) textbooks that were identified as discussing Multiracial Individuals. This information was then categorized based on three major subthemes. These were demographic information, history, and mental health needs. Eight of the textbooks included chapters on Multiracial Individuals, such as the Sue and Sue textbook, as well as the Robison-Wood textbook. Two of the textbooks mention Multiracial Individuals within an overall discussion of demographics or within the discussion of a specific monoracial group. One example of this in which Multiracial Individuals are discussed within the chapter on Asian Americans.

Whereas Multiracial Asian Americans have generally grown up in the United States, Americans are mixed-race Asians who were born in Asia; many of them are children of U.S. Military men. (Pope-Davis & Coleman, 2007, p 231).

This is in contrast with the Robinson textbook, which has a twenty-page chapter titled “Converging Biracial and Multiracial Identities.” This chapter explains definitions, demographic information, and discussion of historical issues such as the One Drop Rule. This includes such information as providing basic definitions for terms such as biracial, interracial, interracial family, monoracial, bicultural, and Multiracial. The Sue and Sue, McGoldrick and Hardy, and the Vac, DeVaney, and Brendal textbooks take similar approaches to Multiracial Individuals in that they also review the topic via a specific chapter and providing knowledge on demographic statistics, historical context as well as identifying Multiracial Individuals as a stand-alone group.

Skill

Skill as a domain related to multicultural counseling is defined the ability to engage in both verbal and nonverbal helping skills and interventions that are appropriate for the client and environment they are working with according to the Association for Multicultural Counseling and Development (2015). Additionally, this is related to the concept that helping styles and approaches may be culturally-bound and that this can impact how and when interventions should be used (Ahmed, Wilson, Henriksen, & Jones, 2011). The skill domain is the second most addressed area within the textbooks in this data set. Textbooks were identified as providing information in this domain if they included specific information on working with clients with Multiracial backgrounds. This included discussions of identity development models, case examples specific to Multiracial clients, and specific recommendations for working with this population. These built into the subthemes of identity development and counseling recommendations, that ultimately merged into the skills them. The following are examples via quotes from the textbooks that show the skills domain being examined.

See Multiracial people in a holistic fashion rather than as fractions of a person. This means being careful when dealing with the “What are you?” question. In most cases, it is important to emphasize the positive qualities of the total person rather than seeing the person as parts. (Sue & Sue, 2013, p. 401)

Like treatment and interventions with Multiracial children, treatment and intervention with Multiracial adolescents require a solid working alliance built on trust and cultural sensitivity. (Lee, 2013, p.113)

Of the eleven textbooks that specifically addressed Multiracial Individuals, six (54.5%) showed evidence of this theme. These were the textbooks by Sue and Sue, Robison-Wood, Vac, DeVaney, and Brendal, McGoldrick and Hardy, Cornish, Schreier, Nadkarni, Metzger, and Rodolfa, and France, Rodriguez, and Hett. With this theme primarily being addressed by the discussion of identity models and implications sections, it was evidenced in all six of the textbooks listed above.

Self-Awareness

Self-awareness as a domain related to multicultural counseling is defined as how aware counselors are of their own cultural background and experiences and how that can impact their perception of others according to the Association for Multicultural Counseling and Development (2015). This includes recognizing sources of discomfort with differences that exist between themselves and others in regard to concepts such as race, cultures, and sexuality (Ahmed, Wilson, Henriksen, & Jones, 2011). Self-awareness was the third overall theme found within the textbooks, but was the least represented within the textbooks. This theme was identified by information, typically questions, being presented to the reader for the purpose of encouraging

them to examine their own beliefs and potential biases about Multiracial Individuals. This was done primarily through rhetorical questions given to the reader in the body of the text or in specialized chapter questions. These questions were either listed among general questions found at the end of every chapter in the textbook or in specialized activities highlighted in a given chapter. One example of this was in the Robinson-Wood, textbook and was identified within the “Pause & Ponder” boxes that contained questions or scenarios. The following are examples:

Did you experience external or internal pressure to choose your racial/ethnic group?
(Robinson-Wood, 2017, p. 232)

What are messages you received from family, media, community, and peers about skin color and skin tone? (Robinson-Wood, 2017, p. 239)

Additionally, another example of self-awareness is in the Vac, DeVaney, and Brendal textbook. The authors specifically provided an “awareness index” at the beginning of their chapter dedicated to Multiracial Individuals. This consisted of true & false questions meant to encourage the reader to gauge what their thoughts, beliefs, and expectations about Multiracial Individuals are prior to reading the chapter. “Mulatto is an acceptable term for biracial individuals. According to Census data, most Multiracial Individuals are part white. (pg. 141)” is an example of this.

The theme of self-awareness was found in two textbooks (18.2%). Those were the Cornish, Schreier, Nadkarni, Metzger, and Rodolfa and Vac, DeVaney, and Brendal textbooks. Both books specifically stated that the activities highlighted above were included with the intent to encourage the reader to think about their values, beliefs and, opinions related to this group. This is backed up as well by the context within that the questions and statements are presented.

While other books may have intended sections within to promote self-awareness, this was not evident by the text of the document.

Discussion

The results of this study indicated that some CACREP-accredited Master's counseling program syllabi include Multicultural Individuals, though this was less than half of the syllabi examined. Additionally, it was found that a small percentage of the textbooks utilized contained mentions of Multiracial Individuals and that none of the supplemental materials specifically addressed Multiracial Individuals. While the course syllabi and readings mentioning Multiracial Individuals was limited, the content analysis of the textbooks revealed three emergent themes: Knowledge, Skills, and Self-awareness.

Multiracial Individuals in Counselor Education

With Multiracial Individuals comprising an ever-growing portion of the demographics of the population of the United States, it is important that the counselor educators are fully informed about the topic of Multiracial Individuals in their training to better enable counselors to work with this population (Henrikson & Maxwell, 2016; Lee & Bean, 2004). Multiracial Individuals include a population that has unique counseling needs and often tend to underutilize mental health services (Henrikson & Maxwell, 2016). The literature supports that this is an underrepresented group in counseling and training counselors specifically need further training to meet this groups needs (Henrikson & Maxwell, 2016; Lee & Bean, 2004; Perlmann & Waters, 2002). Although researchers highlight the importance of recognizing Multiracial Individuals and the provision of counseling services, there is currently a paucity in the literature on how to do

this. It is proposed that counselor educators and the counseling profession consider how they can better address the needs of Multiracial Individuals in training and coursework.

This content analysis indicated that the reviewed syllabi, textbooks and supplemental materials did not adequately cover Multiracial Individuals in social and cultural counseling course. Of the ninety-nine syllabi that were examined in this study, only thirty-three specifically included Multiracial Individuals. Additionally, of the twenty-three textbooks that were used in these courses, eleven contained information regarding Multiracial Individuals. The literature states that multicultural training for counselors results in increased awareness, cultural sensitivity and better treatment outcomes (Coleman 2004; Griner & Smith, 2006; Smith et al., 2006; Sue et al. 1992). Thus, it is important for there to be increased coverage of Multiracial Individuals in counseling courses and associated materials.

Social and Cultural Standards in Master's Level Counseling Programs

The literature indicates that while there are standards developed by CACREP for counseling programs, there is not a set way to teach Social and Cultural Diversity courses (Barden & Greene, 2015; Sue et al., 1982). There is no agreement about what diverse populations should be addresses in counseling courses and frequently monoracial populations are included at the exclusion of Multiracial or multiethnic populations Lentin, 2005). This finding seems to align with the findings of this study. There appears to be lack of inclusion of Multiracial Individuals as only thirty-three percent of syllabi address this group. It could be inferred from these syllabi that the Social and Cultural Diversity courses in this study are typically not designed with the counseling needs of Multiracial Individuals addressed.

Appropriate Terminology and Multiracial Individuals

The literature supports four primary terms being used when identifying Multiracial Individuals (MERCC, 2015). These being biracial, mixed race, Multiracial, and mixed heritage and are part of the Multiracial competencies endorsed by the American Counseling Association. When examining which syllabi did contain mention of Multiracial Individuals, two terms were most commonly used, Multiracial and biracial. This may demonstrate a preference of counselor educators in using these two terms. Additionally, the use of the term biracial appears to support the literatures indication of the simplification of Multiracial Individuals Identities (Gonzalez-Barrera, 2015, Pew Research Center, 2015). No other terms were noted as being used in the syllabi.

Supplemental Readings

There, additionally, was a lack of coverage of Multiracial Individuals with in the supplemental readings. None of the syllabi included reading materials beyond the textbooks that focused on this group. While many of the syllabi provided, sometimes lengthy, supplemental recommended reading lists, they did not reference supplemental readings specific to Multiracial Individuals. Instead these articles or nonacademic readings tended to focus on further elaboration of monoracial groups, sexuality, gender, or spirituality. Furthermore, examination of the textbooks themselves also appear to support the trend of not covering Multiracial Individuals.

A total of twenty-three unique textbooks were found to be in use by the ninety-nine course syllabi examined. Of those twenty-three textbooks, only eleven were found to make specific reference to Multiracial Individuals. Additionally, those eleven textbooks were only in use by forty-four percent (n=44) of the courses examined. This does mean that there was a higher rate of textbooks that discussed Multiracial Individuals being used than syllabi that

specifically identified them as a group. So, while still fewer than half of courses identified are not specifically highlighting Multiracial Individuals in their course plans, more are using reading materials that at least reference the group.

When applying more in-depth scrutiny to the eleven textbooks that were identified as specifically discussing Multiracial Individuals, it was found that the overwhelming majority of these texts dedicate entire chapters and/or sections to this group, with eight of eleven doing so. This seems to indicate that when textbooks do mention this group, it tends to be in a more holistic way, covering multiple competency points. This information and that previously identified regarding textbooks do seem to indicate that while there is still a low percentage of textbooks being used that cover this topic, when they do, it is in a significant way. Additionally, it was determined that the most frequently utilized textbook is Sue and Sue, used by a total of thirty-one of the courses. This textbook provided a full chapter covering multiple layers of information about Multiracial Individuals, which will be discussed more fully later in this chapter. Again, while most courses are not using a textbook that covers this topic, the most heavily used textbook does engage with it fully. There being a limited agreement on a textbook to use for this class also corresponds with the research indicated that there is no agreement on the nature of both material and topics to cover related to this course and CACREP standard (Carter, 2003 & Sue et al., 1982).

Multicultural Competences

The literature states that there are three primary competency domains in regard to multicultural counseling: knowledge, skills, and self-awareness (Ahmed, Wilson, Henriksen, & Jones, 2011; Arredondo, P., 1999; CACREP, 2016; & MERCC, 2015). The content analysis

examining the eleven textbooks that included Multiracial Individuals resulted in these three areas being identified as the three emergent themes from the text. These results also conform to the pedagogical objectives typically found in multicultural research: increased self-awareness and/or increased knowledge (Carter, 2001 & Carter, 2003).

Knowledge

Knowledge is the domain most addressed by the textbooks and was covered by all eleven. This is somewhat expected as it is the most standard area addressed in Social and Cultural Diversity courses when discussing a group that is assumed to be “other” than a student’s own identification. Additionally, the literature supports it being typical for students to be educated about insofar as the norms of a group that they might work with in the future. However, when addressing this with Multiracial Individuals, it can create a greater challenge when covering a monoracial group due to the sheer variety of racial/ethnic combinations that someone who self-identifies as being Multiracial may claim. This led to an identified trend for many of the chapters about Multiracial Individuals to focus on identity development models as a substantial portion of their knowledge component. This does adhere to the Competencies for Counseling the Multiracial Population that were created by the Multi-Racial/Ethnic Counseling Concerns (MRECC, 2015).

Skills

The skills domain was the second most commonly found theme, with six of the eleven textbooks including this domain. Skills often seemed to proceed linearly from the knowledge theme. This involved helping clients working with the identity development models, with one text offering a specific list of recommendations for working with this population. Otherwise,

most skills were non-specific and often were similar to skills mentioned in chapters focusing on monoracial groups. This is not surprising considering the nature of the topic and potential built-in overlap between monoracial groups and Multiracial groups.

Self-Awareness

Self-awareness was the least represented theme in this analysis as it was only found in two of the eleven textbooks. This is somewhat unexpected given that increased self-awareness is one of the two primary objectives identified within the pedagogy research previously discussed (Carter, 2001 & Carter, 2003). That being said, increasing self-awareness was primarily done through rhetorical questions built into the chapters or through case studies related to Multiracial Individuals. This allows self-reflection and growth through engagement with the reading as well as providing examples that can be directly pulled into the classroom setting. This is underpinned as well by the context within which the questions and statements were presented, such as following knowledge sections where the reader is asked to contemplate what they have read or in standalone tables where they are accompanied by instructions encouraging the reader to reflect. While other books may have intended sections within their text to promote self-awareness, this was not evident by the text of the document.

Limitations

The limitations of this research study can be related to two primary categories: limitations related to the research methodology of content analysis and those related to the potential bias of the researcher. Beyond the initial counting of occurrences of the identified terms, the interpretation of themes can be influenced by the bias of the researcher of the questions

themselves. In the case of this study, this was attempted to be offset by both bracketing and the use of an external auditor.

Additionally, this analysis was limited to only the information presented via text and thus cannot speak to the context in which the information in the syllabi and/or textbooks are discussed in the class. This information could either further increase the education of counselors-in-training on the subject of Multiracial Individuals or could lower the impact of those noted as using materials that do speak to this topic. In a given class, things could happen to enhance or to diminish the coverage of any topic identified as being covered in the syllabus, such as class cancellations or interest levels of individual students within a specific class. Also affecting the coverage would be the training of the instructor and their familiarity with the literature regarding counseling Multiracial Individuals. The amount of deviation from the syllabus or quality of instruction is impossible to judge via this research methodology.

Along these same lines, the syllabi themselves offered varying levels of information regarding the subject matters and how topics would be covered in the class. This is indicative of the overall lack of standardization of syllabi in academia. Some of the syllabi reviewed in this research were very thorough in their explanations of exactly what topics would be covered, the expected length of coverage, and assignments related to those topics. Other syllabi were much briefer and did not contain such detailed information.

Recommendations

While this study appears to produce significant findings that Multiracial Individuals are underrepresented in the presenting of materials and as a topic in Social and Cultural Diversity classes, due to the nature of the research, there is both room for and the need for additional

research on this topic. This suggested research would fall into the category of either expanding on what this study started by possibly trying to further mitigate the limitations highlighted previously, or by gaining further context to widen the ability to generalize about the teaching of this topic.

One logical follow up to this study would be to either survey or interview instructors of these courses in an effort to understand if this material is being covered thoroughly, both in those that make reference to it in their syllabi and/or required readings and in those that do not directly reference it in the syllabi themselves. This would give an increased context of how the material is being taught and help add richness to the themes identified within this study. Additionally, this would allow researchers to gain further information about some of the more ambiguous portions of the syllabi, such as what in-class activities are occurring and what multicultural groups students are being encouraged to explore as part of the assignments given in the classes. This would all help to account for the assumption made by this study that instructors are following the information provided on their syllabi and covering the topic of working with Multiracial Individuals as thoroughly as it is suggested they are by the syllabi and textbooks used.

Additionally, another suggested study could review all courses within a program rather than just the identified Social and Cultural Diversity class. The literature states that multicultural competencies should not be being covered in only one class, and this is supported by the current CACREP standards of integrating this topic. A study such as this would provide further context for the coverage of this topic within counselor education Master's degree programs as well as helping to determine if the current recommendations are being followed by current programs or if the singular class model is still the dominant paradigm.

References

- Abreu, J. M., Chung, R. H., Atkinson, D. T. (2000). Multicultural training: Past, present, and future directions. *The Counseling Psychologist*, 28, 641-656.
- Adalberto Aguirre, Jr. and Jonathan H. Turner, *American Ethnicity*, 7th ed. (2011).
- Ahmed, S., Wilson, K. B., Henriksen, R., & Jones, J. (2011). What does it mean to be a culturally-competent counselor. *Journal for Social Action in Counseling and Psychology*, 3(1), 17-28.
- Allan, G. (2003). A critique of using grounded theory as a research method. *Electronic Journal of Business Research Methods*. 2(1).
- American Counseling Association. (2014). ACA code of ethics. Alexandria, VA: Author.
- Arredondo, P. (1999). Multicultural counseling competencies as tools to address oppression and racism. *Journal of Counseling & Development*, 77(1), 102-108.). 2016 standards for accreditation. Alexandria, VA: Author.
- Barden, S. M., & Greene, J. H. (2015). An investigation of multicultural counseling competence and multicultural counseling self-efficacy for counselors-in-training. *International Journal for the Advancement of Counselling*, 37(1), 41-53.
- Barrio-Minton, C. A., Wachter-Morris, C. A., & Yaites, L. D. (2014). Pedagogy in counselor education: A 10-year content analysis of journals. *Counselor Education and Supervision*, 53(3), 162-177.

Berg, B. L., & Lune, H. (2012). *Qualitative research methods for the social sciences*. Boston: Pearson.

Buboltz Jr, W. C., Miller, M., & Williams, D. J. (1999). Content analysis of research in the Journal of Counseling Psychology (1973–1998). *Journal of Counseling Psychology, 46*(4), 496.

Council for Accreditation of Counseling and Related Educational Programs. (2015). CACREP 2016 standards.

Carter, R. T. (1995). *The influence of race and racial identity in the psychotherapy process: Toward a racially inclusive model*. New York, NY: Wiley.

Carter, R.T. (2001). Back to the future in cultural competence training. *The Counseling Psychologist 29* (6), 787-789

Carter, R.T. (2003). Becoming racially and culturally competent: The racial-cultural counseling laboratory. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development 31* (1), 20-30

Coleman, H. L. (2004). Multicultural counseling competencies in a pluralistic society. *Journal of Mental Health Counseling, 26*(1), 56-66.

Creswell, J. W. (2012). *Educational research: Planning, conducting, and evaluating quantitative and qualitative research* (4th ed.). Boston, MA: Pearson Education.

Creswell, J.W. (2009). *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Approaches*.

Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Davenport, D. S. & Yurich, J. M. Multicultural gender issues. *Journal of Counseling &*

Development, 70(1), 64-71.

Davis, F.J. (1991). *Who is Black? One nation's definition*. University Park, PA:

Pennsylvania State University Press.

Dempsey, I., & Balandin, S. (2012). Reporting the magnitude of study findings.

Dobbins, J. E. & Skillings, J. H. (1991). The utility of race labeling in understanding cultural

identity: A conceptual tool for a social sciences practitioner. *Journal of Counseling &*

Development, 70(1), 37-44.

Douglas, R. E. & Brown, N. G. (2001) Evolution of multiracial organizations: Where have we

been and where we are going? In L. I. Winters & H. L. DeBose, *New faces in a changing*

America: Multiracial identity in the 21st century. Los Angeles: CA, Sage.

Erlingsson, C., & Brysiewicz, P. (2017). A hands-on guide to doing content analysis. *African*

Journal of Emergency Medicine, 7(3), 93-99.

Fusch, P. I., & Ness, L. R. (2015). Are we there yet? Data saturation in qualitative research. *The*

qualitative report, 20(9), 1408.

Gonzalez-Barrera, A. (2015) 'Mestizo' and 'mulatto': Mixed-race identities among U.S.

Hispanics. Retrieved from: <http://www.pewresearch.org/fact-tank/2015/07/10/mestizo-and-mulatto-mixed-race-identities-unique-to-hispanics/>

- Griner, D., & Smith, T. B. (2006). Culturally adapted mental health intervention: A meta analytic review. *Psychotherapy: Theory, research, practice, training*, 43(4), 531.
- Halpern, E. S. (1983). Auditing Naturalistic Inquiries: Some Preliminary Applications. Part 1: Development of the Process. Part 2: Case Study Application.
- Hays, D. G., & Wood, C. (2011). Infusing qualitative traditions in counseling research Designs. *Journal of Counseling & Development*, 89, 3, 288-295.
- Hays, D. G., & Singh, A. A. (2011). *Qualitative inquiry in clinical and educational settings*. Guilford Press.
- Helms, J. E., & Cook, D. A. (1999). *Using race and culture in counseling and psychotherapy: Theory and process*. Boston: Allyn and Bacon.
- Henriksen Jr, R. C., & Maxwell, M. J. (2016). Counseling the fastest growing population in America: Those with multiple heritage backgrounds. *Journal of Mental Health Counseling*, 38(1), 1-11.
- Holcomb-McCoy, C. C., & Myers, J. E. (1999). Multicultural competence and counselor training: A national survey. *Journal of Counseling & Development*, 77(3), 294-302.
- Ibrahim, F. A., Stadler, H. A., Arredondo, P., & McFadden J. (1986). *Status of human rights in counselor education: A national survey*. Paper presented at the American Association for Counseling and Development convention, Los Angeles, CA.
- Jones, N. A., & Bullock, J. (2012 September). *The two or more races population: 2010* (Issue

Brief No. C2010BR-13). Retrieved from U.S. Census Bureau website:

<https://www.census.gov/prod/cen2010/briefs/c2010br-13.pdf>

Kirk, J., Miller, M. L., & Miller, M. L. (1986). *Reliability and validity in qualitative research* (Vol. 1). Sage.

Siddharth Kalla (Jan 9, 2009). Margin of Error (Statistics). Retrieved May 23, 2018 from Explorable.com: <https://explorable.com/statistics-margin-of-error>

Lee, J., & Bean, F. D. (2004). America's changing color lines: Immigration, race/ethnicity, and multiracial identification. *Annu. Rev. Sociol.*, 30, 221-242.

Lentin, A. (2005). Replacing 'race', historicizing 'culture' in multiculturalism. *Patterns of prejudice*, 39(4), 379-396.

Moulton, A. D. (2015). *The fight for interracial marriage rights in antebellum Massachusetts*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Murray, F.B., (2001). From consensus standards to evidence for claims: assessment and accreditation in the case of teacher education in Ratcliff, J.L, Lubinescu, E.S & Gaffney, M.A (Eds.), 2001, *New Directions for Higher Education, How Accreditation Influences Assessment*. Jossey-Bass: New York.

Nash, G. B. (1999). *Forbidden love: The hidden history of mixed race America*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

Neville, H. A., Heppner, M. J., Louie, C. E., Thompson, C. E., Brooks, L., & Baker, C. E.

- (1996). The impact of multicultural training on White racial identity attitudes and therapy competencies. *Professional Psychology: Research and Practice*, 27(1), 83.
- Leech, N. L., & Onwuegbuzie, A. J. (2007). An array of qualitative data analysis tools: A call for data analysis triangulation. *School psychology quarterly*, 22(4), 557.
- Pedersen, P. B. (Ed.). (1991). Multiculturalism as a fourth force in counseling [Special Issue]. *Journal of Counseling & Development*, 70 (1), 5.
- Pedersen, P. B. (1991). Multiculturalism as a generic approach to counseling. *Journal of Counseling & Development*, 70(1), 6-12.
- Perlmann, J., & Waters, M. C. (Eds.). (2002). *The new race question: How the census counts multiracial individuals*. Russell Sage Foundation.
- Pew Research Center. (2015). *Multiracial in America: Proud, diverse, and growing in number*. Retrieved from Pew Research Center at:
<http://www.pewsocialtrends.org/2015/06/11/multiracial-in-america/>
- Potter, W. J., & Levine-Donnerstein, D. (1999). *Rethinking validity and reliability in content analysis*.
- Ratts, M. J., Singh, A. A., Nassar-McMillan, S., Butler, S. K., & McCullough, J. R. (2015). *Multicultural and social justice counseling competencies*. Alexandria, VA: Author.
- Root, M.P. (1996). The multiracial experience: Racial borders as a significant frontier in

- race relations. In M.P. Root, *The multiracial experience: Racial borders and the new frontier* (Ed., pp. xiii-xxviii). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Sammons, C. C., & Speight, S. L. (2008). A qualitative investigation of graduate-student changes associated with multicultural counseling courses. *The Counseling Psychologist, 36*(6), 814-838.
- Speight, S. L., Myers, L. J., Cox, C. I., & Highlen, P. S. (1991). A redefinition of multicultural counseling. *Journal of Counseling and Development, 70*(1), 29-36.
- Smith, T. B., Constantine, M. G., Dunn, T. W., Dinehart, J. M., & Montoya, J. A. (2006). Multicultural education in the mental health professions: A meta-analytic review. *Journal of Counseling Psychology, 53*, 132-145.
- Smith, B., & Sparkes, A. C. (2013). *Qualitative research methods in sport, exercise and health: From process to product*. Routledge.
- Strauss, A. L. (1987). *Qualitative analysis for social scientists*. Cambridge University Press.
- Strauss, A., & Corbin, J. M. (1990). *Basics of qualitative research: Grounded theory procedures and techniques*. Sage Publications, Inc.
- Sue, D. W., Arredondo, P., & McDavis, R. J. (1992). Multicultural counseling competencies and standards: A call to the profession. *Journal of Counseling & Development, 70*(4), 477-486.
- Sue, D. W. (2001). Multidimensional facets of cultural competence. *The Counseling*

Psychologist, 29(6), 790-821.

Sue, D. W., & Sue, D. (2008). *Counseling the culturally diverse* (5th ed.). Hoboken, NJ: 79 John

Wiley & Sons.

Tufford, L., & Newman, P. (2010). *Designing qualitative research*.

Wang, W. (2015). *Interracial marriage: Who is marrying out?*. Retrieved from:

<http://www.pewresearch.org/fact-tank/2015/06/12/interracial-marriage-who-is-marryingout/>

Whittemore, R., Chase, S. K., & Mandle, C. L. (2001). Validity in qualitative

research. *Qualitative health research*, 11(4), 522-537.

Wyatt, G. G., & Parham, W. D. (1985). The inclusion of culturally sensitive course materials in

graduate school and training programs. *Psychotherapy*, 22, 461-468.

Appendix 1

Email

Hello, my name is Patrick Murphy and I am a doctoral student at Auburn University. I am conducting a dissertation study about the content of multicultural counseling courses in CACREP-accredited Master's degree programs. My study requires the collection of the syllabi utilized in these courses. I am emailing in hopes that you provide me with an electronic copy of the syllabi that is currently utilized in your programs multicultural counseling course. If you have any questions or are willing to do so, you can respond to this email [email provided]. Thank you very much for your time and assistance.

Appendix 2

Sample Syllabi

University of Arkansas, College of Education and Health Professions

DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATIONAL LEADERSHIP, COUNSELING,
AND FOUNDATIONS

I. Program Affiliation: Counselor Education

Course Number and Title: **CNED 5513: COUNSELING AND HUMAN DIVERSITY**

Course Schedule: Tuesday, 9:30 a.m. to 12:20 p.m.
Graduate Education Bldg. Room 146

Catalog Description: Examination of human and cultural diversity, emphasizing issues of race, class and socioeconomic status, and how they impact the counseling process.

Prerequisite: Graduate standing

Professor: Judith L. Robertson, Ph.D.
Graduate Education Bldg. 245
Office Phone: (479) 575-3329
Office Hours: 2:00 p.m. to 4:00p.m Tuesday, Wednesday,
Thursday and by appointment
E-Mail: jlrober@uark.edu

Teaching Assistant: AdriAnne Johnson

II. Relationship to Knowledge Base: ADVANCED LEVEL Specialty Studies
Counseling, theory, and research necessary to work more effectively with diverse populations.

III. Goals: The goal of the course is to enhance the student's knowledge, understanding and empathy of diverse individuals and groups, by providing an overview of the challenges and processes of counseling persons and groups different from "oneself" in our diverse society.

IV. Competencies:

- A. To explore psychological, social, and lifespan developmental issues of diverse groups, (SP 3)
 - B. To explore scholarship/research relevant to counseling across cultures and lifestyles, (SP 1,3)
 - C. To gain a personal level of multicultural awareness, understanding, sensitivity and acceptance, (SP 3,4)
 - D. To apply principles of multicultural counseling to consulting with individuals, families, and groups, (SP 3,5)
 - E. To explore and analyze literature on diversity and human development to include issues concerning culture, ethnicity, sexual orientation, disability, S.E.S., age, gender, diversity of religion, and others as appropriate, (SP 3,6)
 - F. To expand personal insight and level of acceptance as professional counselors, (SP 2,4,6)
 - G. To continue to develop a respect for the uniqueness of each client or client group, (SP 3)
 - H. To develop an understanding of the dynamics of difference and to begin adopting practical skills to fit each client's or groups' unique context and needs. (SP 7)
 - I. To explore various models of counseling (i.e. multicultural). (SP 2,4)
 - J. To demonstrate, in writing, knowledge of the various models/approaches to counseling within a multicultural/diverse framework. (SP 1)
- V. **Content:** Through class discussion, small group work, lecture, and guest speakers, the following topics will be included in the course:
- A. Introduction to counseling in a multicultural, multi-lifestyle society
 - B. The cultural/diverse identity of the counselor
 - C. Barriers to effective counseling of diverse groups
 - D. Communication and counseling styles
 - E. Counseling specific groups and individuals throughout the lifespan:
 - African American clients
 - American Indian/Native American clients
 - Asian American clients
 - European American clients
 - Hispanic American clients

- Multi-racial clients
- Lesbian, Gay and Bisexual clients
- Clients with disabilities
- Older adults
- F. Professional and ethical issues in counseling within a multicultural context
- G. Various additional topics/current events and human reactions

VI. Evaluation:

Cultural History Paper	100 points
Book Review	100 points
Personal Experience Paper	25 points
Article Review	25 points
Midterm	100 points
<u>Final</u>	<u>150 points</u>
Total	500 point

VII. Grading Scale:

450 – 500	90%	A
400 – 449	80%	B
350 – 399	75%	C
300 – 349	65%	D

VIII. Assignments:

- A. **Cultural History Paper:** For this assignment, each student will focus on his or her own ethnic/cultural background, ancestry and family origin. This paper may require that you ask questions of family members, or do independent research, on your background. The paper should be 3 to 5 typewritten pages in length, APA style, and is worth 100 points. **It is due Tuesday, September 16, 2003.**
- B. **Book Review:** Choose one book from the following list. This assignment is designed to allow you to experience biographical information concerning an individual different from yourself, with different life experiences, through literature. These books are not ordered through the bookstore, but are available in libraries, local bookstores, perhaps Amazon.com. You are to choose a book not being reviewed by another student, so please talk with each other so there are no duplications. You are free to choose one from the list, or find one you like and ask me about it.

Booklist:

Arboleda, T. (1998). *In the shadow of race: Growing up as a multiethnic, multicultural, and Multiracial American*. Lawrence Erlbaum Press.

Crow Dog, M. (1994). *Lakota woman*. Harper Perennial.

Hurston, Z.N. (1937). *Their eyes were watching God*. Chicago: J.P. Lippincott.

Martin, P.P. (1992). *Songs my mother sang to me: An oral history of Mexican American women*. Arizona: University of Arizona Press.

Monette, P. (1992). *Becoming a man: Half a life story*. San Francisco: Harper Collins.

Moon, W. L. H. (1982). *Blue highways: A journey into America*. New York: Fawcett.

Nietzke, A. (1993). *Natalie on the street*. Cornalis, OR: CALYX

Okada, J. (1976). *No-no boy*. Seattle: Univ. of Washington Press.

Sarton, M. (1988). *After the stroke: A journal*. New York: W. W. Norton..

Winterson, J. (1987). *Oranges are not the only fruit*. New York: Atlantic Monthly Press.

Wright, R. (1966). *Native son*. NY: Harper & Row.

The book review will include the student's reaction to the primary character(s)' life and experiences relative to a cultural/diverse perspective. Include a section on the mental health/emotional issues of the primary character, with potential implications of those issues on his/her life satisfaction. Conclude with a summarization of possible effects of these issues on a counseling process. The paper should be three to four pages in length and written in APA style. **It is due Tuesday, October 7, 2003.**

- C. **Personal Experience Visit:** Each student will identify a group, individual, family, or organization that is in some way different or diverse from you. For example, if you are not familiar with the Jewish faith/culture, you might visit a temple or synagogue, speak with a Rabbi or other individual. If you have not had much contact with the Hispanic culture, you might consider researching the counseling services offered to Hispanic families or individuals in the NW Arkansas area, and interviewing a clinician of that culture who provides services to this population.

Prior to the visit, each student will present a written plan, outlining the proposed visit and the concerns or interests that stimulated the visit. This outline will be due the 4th week of class. After the experience, the student will write a short personal reaction paper, that will including the following:

- 1) Your preconceived notions or expectations (if any) about the specific culture, group or individual interviewed and how that might have been altered or supported by your experience,
- 2) What actually happened when you participated in the experience,
- 3) How the experience potentially influenced your ability to work professionally with the particular group or individual with whom you visited,
- 4) Students will share this experience with the class.

Paper is due Tuesday, November 4, 2003.

- D. **Article Review:** The student will write a critique/review of an article from a current (2000 publication date or newer) scholarly journal on a multicultural or diversity issue in the counseling profession. The review will include a short abstract of the article, a statement about why that article was chosen, and a critique of the article's usefulness to counselors. End the review with your personal opinion of the usefulness of the article. Please make a copy of the entire article to hand in with the review; the paper will not be accepted without it. It is due Tuesday, November 25, 2002.
- E. **Midterm Examination:** October 14, 2003
- F. **Final Examination:** Take home examination due December 13, 2003 before 5:00 p.m.
- G. Participation is vital in this course, which is intended to develop insight into personal thoughts and feelings on diversity issues and the counseling process.
- IX. Academic Honesty:** The application of the University of Arkansas Academic Honesty Policy, as stated in the *Student Handbook*, will be fully adhered to in this course. Plagiarism is a serious infraction and may result in a failing grade.
- X. Course Resources:**
- a. Counseling and computer labs
 - b. University library

- XI. Text:** Baruth, L.G. & Manning, M.L. (2002). *Multicultural counseling and psychotherapy: A lifespan perspective*. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Merrill/Prentice Hall.

Bibliography

- Aldarondo, F. (2001). *Racial and ethnic identity models and their applications: Counseling biracial individuals*. *Journal of Mental Health Counseling*, 23, (3), 238-256.
- Arrendondo, P., Topore,, R., Brown, S., Jones, J., Locke, D.C., Sanchez, J. & Stadler, H. (1995). Operationalization of the multicultural competencies. *Journal of Multicultural Counseling & Development*, 24, 42-78.
- Axelson, J. (1985). *Counseling and development in a multicultural society*. Monterey, CA: Brooks/Cole.
- Billingsley, A. (1968). *Black families in white America*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Carter, R. & Parks, E. (1996). Womanist identity and mental health. *Journal of Counseling & Development*, 74, 484-489.
- Casas, J.M. & Vasques, M.J.T. (1989). Counseling the Hispanic client: A theoretical and applied perspective. In P. Pedersen, J. Draguns, W. Lonner, & J. Trimble (Eds.), *Counseling across cultures* (pp. 3-21). Honolulu: Univ. of Hawaii Press.
- Casas, J., Ponteretto, J., & Gutierrez, J. (1986). An ethical indictment of counseling research and training: The cross-cultural perspective. *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 64, 347-349.
- Gregory, D. (1964). *Nigger: An autobiography*. NY: Basic Books.
- Kelly, A., Sedlacek, W., & Scales, W. (1994). How college students with and without disabilities perceive themselves and each other. *Journal of Counseling & Development*, 73, 178-182.
- Nabokov, P. (1991). (Ed.). *Native American testimony*. NY: Viking.
- Pederson, P. (1988). *A handbook for developing multicultural awareness*. Alexandria, VA: AACD>
- Stone, G.L. (Ed.). (1994). Multicultural training. *Counseling Psychologist*, 22, 227-314.
- Sue, W. & Sue, D. (1990). *Counseling the culturally different: Theory and practice*. NY: Wiley.

CNE5513 Course Schedule

Date	
August 26	Introduction
September 2	Chapters 1 & 2
September 9	Chapter 3 & 4
September 16	Chapter 5
September 23	Chapter 6 and quest speaker,
September 30	Chapter 7 and guest speaker James Quinn, M.S., CRC, Member of the Cherokee Nation
October 7	Chapter 8
October 14	Midterm Exam
October 21	Chapter 9 and quest speaker, Mooie Teoh, M.S
October 28	Chapter 10
November 4	Chapter 11 & 12
November 11	Chapter 13 and guest speaker, Susanna Contraras,
November 18	Chapter 14
November 25	Chapter 15
December 2	Chapter 16 and guest speaker, Rob Stevens
December 9	Chapter 17
December 13	Final Exam due