# Research Based Teaching Strategies for Teaching Multilingual Learners: A Qualitative Case Study of Mainstream, ESL and General Music Teachers 

by<br>Anne-Marie Patrick

A dissertation submitted to the Graduate Faculty of
Auburn University
in partial fulfillment of the
requirements for the Degree of
Doctor of Philosophy
Auburn, Alabama
August 5, 2023

Keywords: Multilingual Learner (ML), English language skills, mainstream teacher, ESL teacher, general music teacher, research-based teaching strategies

Copyright 2022 by Anne-Marie Hall Patrick

Approved by
Dr. Jane Kuehne, Chair, Associate Professor of Music Education
Dr. Guy Harrison, Associate Professor of String Music and Music Education
Dr. William C. Powell, Professor and Director of Choral Activities
Dr. Jamie L. Harrison, Associate Professor of English for Speakers of Other Languages


#### Abstract

The purpose of this qualitative multiple case study was to compare evidence-based teaching strategies in the mainstream classroom, the ESL classroom, and the elementary music classroom that assist Multilingual Learners (ML) in developing English language skills. Observational and interview data helped answer three research questions that guided this study. Those research questions are: a) what evidence-based teaching strategies are evident in the mainstream, ESL, and music classroom to assist the Multilingual Learner (ML) with English language skills? b) what differences in evidence-based teaching strategies are evident in the mainstream, ESL, and music classroom to assist the Multilingual Learner (ML) with English language skills? c) how does the mainstream, ESL, and music classroom teacher acquire the knowledge and skills to use effective teaching strategies to assist the Multilingual Learner (ML) with English language skills?

Participants were selected through purposeful sampling to gain multiple perspectives in research-based teaching strategies in assisting MLs with English language skills. Data collection methods included direct observations, documents, artifacts, articles, field notes, and semistructured interviews. This study found that teachers are utilizing various strategies to teach all students in the classroom setting, especially ML students. The interview results concluded that each participant used personal experience during their teaching career to discover strategies that assist ML students with English language skills. The participant's lived experiences played a crucial role in the strategies used to teach ML students in each participant's classroom. The overarching conclusion is that each participant believes and understands that strategies that help and assist ML students with English language skills also help all students in the classroom become successful students and individuals.


## Acknowledgements

I have so many people along the way that have helped me with this research document and degree endeavor. However, this opportunity was orchestrated by the One who "knows the plans" made for me (Jeremiah 29:11) and "fearfully and wonderfully" made me (Psalm 139:14). God the Father opened this door for me to start this degree through Auburn University, where I yelled WAR EAGLE as a small child during Tiger Walk and football games. He also placed specific people in my path as professors and mentors, ALL of which served on my committee. The Lord gave me Dr. Jane Kuehne as my advisor and committee chair, and a simple "thank you" is not enough for this amazing person and how she has helped me along the way. All the honor and glory go to God, and I trust Him in what He has in store for my future.

My family also deserves a large thank you. Kevin, thank you for constantly encouraging me and being my best friend through this process. I love you and am so grateful for you. Mom and Dad, thank you for being the role models I needed from an early age. You showed me the definition of "hard work" and cheered me on in each new season. To the rest of my supportive family, thank you for the many times you encouraged me and the times that you spent babysitting. I could not have completed this without your help.

To my former teachers, community, and professors, thank you for laying the foundations needed for me to earn this degree. I still stay in contact with many of you, and YOU played a role in this doctoral degree through the prayers you said for me and the encouraging words you sent my way. You all made an impact on my life, and this degree is proof of that.

To my students, this was also for you. I want you to see that your teacher loves you so much that I want to keep learning more and more so that I can teach you to be the best musicians
and citizens wherever you are planted in life. You can ALWAYS accomplish what you desire with hard work, dedication, and passion.
"For from him and through him and to him are all things. To him be glory forever. Amen." Romans 11:36

## Table of Contents

Abstract ..... 2
Acknowledgements ..... 3
List of Tables ..... 9
List of Figures ..... 10
Chapter 1 Introduction ..... 11
Need for the Study ..... 12
Purpose for the Study ..... 14
Limitations and Delimitations. ..... 14
Chapter 2 Literature Review ..... 16
Brain Research in Language Development ..... 16
Brain Research and Music ..... 17
Connections: ML Students, English Language Development, and Teacher Views ..... 19
ML Students and English Language Development in Public Schools ..... 19
Teacher Perspective of ML Students ..... 20
Teacher Strategies and English Language Development for ML Students ..... 22
Positive Learning Environment ..... 22
Gestures and Visual Cues ..... 23
Repetition and Skill Practice ..... 24
Visuals, Props, and Manipulatives ..... 25
Music in Public Schools and English Language Development for ML Students ..... 25
Cultivating a Positive Learning Environment ..... 25
Music Classroom Teaching for ML Student Language Skill Development ..... 29
Singing Songs and Language Skills ..... 29
Focus Listening Skills ..... 31
Target Listening Skills ..... 32
Gestures and Specific Movement. ..... 32
Social and Cultural Learning. ..... 33
Digital Media. ..... 34
Classroom Climate ..... 34
Chapter 3 Methods ..... 36
Researcher's Role ..... 38
Researcher's Perspective/Positionality ..... 39
Participants. ..... 41
Data Collection ..... 42
Direct Observations ..... 42
Artifacts and Documents ..... 43
Interviews ..... 43
Research Question and Data Alignment ..... 44
Data Analysis ..... 45
Trustworthiness ..... 46
Chapter 4 Findings ..... 47
Direct Observations ..... 47
Demographics ..... 49
Candace ..... 49
Bethany ..... 49
Ashley ..... 50
Jamie ..... 50
Emma ..... 51
Observation Results ..... 51
Teaching Strategies Similarities and Differences Theme 1: Climate and Physical Learning
Environment. ..... 52
Teaching Strategies Similarities and Differences Theme 2: Academic Learning ..... 63
Teaching Strategies Similarities and Differences Theme 3: Language Opportunities ..... 76
Interview Results ..... 79
Education Theme 1: Pre-Career Experience with MLs ..... 81
Education Theme 2: Pre-Career Education Experiences with MLs ..... 83
Career Theme 1: Classroom Experience with MLs ..... 85
Career Theme 2: Training/PD on Teaching Strategies for MLs ..... 89
Career Theme 3: Current Classroom with MLs ..... 91
Schoolwide Environment Theme: Collaboration with Colleagues ..... 94
Chapter 5 Discussion ..... 96
Education ..... 103
Career ..... 103
Schoolwide Environment ..... 107
Implications ..... 107
Recommendations for Future Research ..... 109
Conclusion ..... 110
Chapter 6 Importance in Music Education, Recommendations, and Conclusions ..... 111
Importance in Music Education ..... 111
Recommendations ..... 113
Conclusions ..... 114
References ..... 116
Appendix A: Internal Review Board Approval Email ..... 123
Appendix B: Interview Protocol for Participants ..... 124
Appendix C: Interview Transcripts ..... 126
Candace ..... 126
Bethany ..... 140
Ashley ..... 153
Jamie ..... 164
Emma ..... 173

## List of Tables

Table 1 Framework Analysis ..... 37
Table 2 Data Collection Alignment with Research Questions ..... 44
Table 3 Participant Backgrounds ..... 47
Table 4 Teaching Strategies Similarities and Differences Themes and Supporting Codes ..... 52
Table 5 Teaching Strategies Similarities and Differences Theme 1:
Climate and Physical Learning Environment. ..... 53
Table 6 Teaching Strategies Similarities and Differences Theme 2: Academic Learning ..... 64
Table 7 Teaching Strategies Similarities and Differences Theme 2: Academic Learning ..... 65
Table 8_Teaching Strategies Similarities and Differences Theme 3: Language Opportunities ..... 76
Table 9 Education Themes and Supporting Codes ..... 80
Table 10 Career Themes and Supporting Codes ..... 81
Table 11 Schoolwide Environment Theme and Supporting Codes ..... 81

## List of Figures

Figure 1 Illustration with Research Based Strategies Departmentalized .................................... 112
Figure 2 Illustration with Research-Based Strategies as the Support for
Learning in All Classrooms ................................................................................................... 112

## Chapter 1

## Introduction

Children's first school experiences can be scary. During their first years in school, children learn the required material to help them reach the next grade level. The transition from home to a classroom setting is a difficult task for some children. However, these difficulties become magnified for a Multilingual Learner (ML) student because of a language barrier. ML students can enroll in a public school at any age and often placed in an immersion-style classroom where students must figure out the language as they roll along (Miranda, 2011). Some school districts place ML students in a dual language or two-way immersion classroom setting where all students learn a language while developing the first language. Other schools and school districts have specialized teachers, known as English as a Second Language (ESL) teachers, who work with ML students for a specific amount of time per day or week based on each student's abilities (Abril, 2003). The enrollment process for students at any age can be frightening and overwhelming. It can be even more daunting for students who may feel out of place, overwhelmed, and intimidated.

Music can serve as a universal bridge between people with many backgrounds from many varying places across the globe. Frances Clark said it best, "There is no medium so attractive, sure and efficacious for this need as Music. There is nothing so universal in its appeal as Music. Through Music, we can meet every newcomer to our shores on common ground" (Clark, 1920, p. 14). Claudson (1969) reiterates that statement by saying music develops the whole person.

United States public school teachers strive each day to teach content that should align with their state's learning standards. This task becomes challenging for teachers who have little
professional development in teaching ML students (Diarrassouba, 2018). Schools with a higher number of ML students utilize the ESL teacher as much as possible. The ESL teacher's role includes testing ML students on their ability level when entering the school, creating and implementing an individual teaching plan for each student, and monitoring each ML student as they progress through their academic content. The problem for most ESL teachers is time. The number of ML students in public schools continues to increase, and the ESL teacher has a challenging task trying to find time to serve each ML student (Diarrassouba, 2018). The issue is then passed to the mainstream teacher with strategies that may help students learn English skills faster in the specific classroom content (Conkling \& Conkling, 2018; Diarrassouba, 2018; Lee, Butler, \& Tippins, 2007, Miranda, 2011; Paquette \& Rieg, 2008). Another issue is that implicit teacher beliefs about ML students can sometimes not be as positive due to the overwhelming job description of being a teacher (Harrison \& Lakin, 2018). Harrison's and Lakin's (2018) research suggests that implicit beliefs about the ML student are somewhat negative. These beliefs lead to the question, can teaching strategies used by the music teacher in the general music classroom help teach English skills to ML students? The answer to this question could alleviate pressure from the already overwhelmed mainstream teacher and ESL teacher if music is a valuable teaching strategy in the mainstream or music classroom.

## Need for the Study

There is much potential for developing the intersection between mainstream general education, ESL, and general music classrooms. Music and arts educators teach subjects that have the power to motivate and stimulate their students and those around them. Music provides students from all backgrounds the opportunity to understand the world around them in new and different ways. Music teachers work with all school students in most school environments,
regardless of student background (Collins, 2014; Conkling \& Conkling, 2018; Jellison, 2015; Miranda, 2011). Music teachers also use various teaching strategies to teach their students, depending on what works best at any given moment.

Many studies have detailed teaching strategies in the general education, ESL, and general music classrooms to assist ML students with English language skills. However, few studies have investigated research-based strategies utilized by teachers in all three classrooms simultaneously. Conkling and Conkling (2018) expressed a need for collaboration among teachers to help create a continuous learning environment for students. This collaboration involves common planning time to discuss lessons and research-based strategies that can help students, especially ML students. Collaboration among teachers can also promote a positive work environment for the school employees and a positive learning environment for the student population.

Hoffman (2012) utilized a culturally-based curriculum where middle school teachers created a learning environment that highlighted the various cultures found in the school. All teachers participating in this curriculum collaborated to share lessons, ideas, and teaching strategies that would make the presentation of the material to the students more uniform. The students participating in this study received exposure to different content. However, the teaching strategies used to teach the content were similar or the same.

Case studies in elementary education, music education, and ESL education separately have documented many research-based strategies for teaching ML students. While these studies examined research-based strategies in their field, there has been little research that simultaneously expresses the similarities and differences in all three fields. Also, little research has expressed how teachers learn or acquire the knowledge and skills to use these research-based strategies. We can better understand the nuances of the lived experiences of each of these
teachers by observing them utilize research-based teaching strategies to assist ML students with English language skills and interview these teachers to see how they acquired the knowledge and skills to practice these teaching skills. Music teachers and other educators could collaborate on strategies found in the music classroom to assist ML students with English language skills. Also, music educators can collect strategies used by the general mainstream classroom teacher and the ESL teacher to assist ML students in the music classroom.

## Purpose for the Study

The purpose of this qualitative multiple case study was to compare evidence-based teaching strategies in the mainstream classroom, the ESL classroom, and the elementary music classroom that assist Multilingual Learners (ML) in developing English language skills. The following questions were addressed in the research:

1. What evidence-based teaching strategies are evident in the mainstream, ESL, and music classroom to assist the Multilingual Learner (ML) with English language skills?
2. What differences in evidence-based teaching strategies are evident in the mainstream, ESL, and music classroom to assist the Multilingual Learner (ML) with English language skills?
3. How does the mainstream, ESL, and music classroom teacher acquire the knowledge and skills to use effective teaching strategies to assist the Multilingual Learner (ML) with English language skills?

## Limitations and Delimitations

Research reveals many terms in education to label or describe the population of students who receive English language assistance. The resources in the literature review for this study
utilized various terms including English Learner (EL), English Language Learner (ELL), Emergent Bilingual (EB), English as a Second Language (ESL), English for Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL), English as a Foreign Language (EFL), English as an Additional Language (EAL), English as an Additional Language or Dialect (EAL/D), and Multilingual Learner (ML). Multilingual Learner (ML) is the term that most current literature uses to encompass students from various backgrounds learning new skills in a new language. With this in mind, ML is the utilized term throughout this study to refer to language learners.

A delimitation was that I chose participants from the same school district. There were two mainstream classroom teachers, an ESL teacher, and two elementary general music teachers selected for this study and each had at least one ML student in their classroom during my observations. Participant selection occurred in early Fall 2022. A limitation due to this selection was that instruction schedules and requirements for teachers could not be determined until just before I wanted to begin collecting data. I had to wait to create an observation schedule and plan to meet the minimum requirements until the school administration personnel were set and teacher's schedules were created. I also determined observation number (and length) based on the teachers' schedules as well as my own teaching schedule.

## Chapter 2

## Literature Review

Chapter Two provides a discussion and organization of related literature in the following four sections. The literature in the first section provides an overview of brain development and its connection to language and music. The second section outlines teacher views and perspectives toward ML students. The third section reviews research-based teaching strategies used in the mainstream, ESL, and general music classrooms to assist ML students. The final section reviews teaching strategies in the music classroom to assist ML students with language development.

## Brain Research in Language Development

The brain is a complex organ that begins forming while a fetus is in its mother's womb. The brain develops, and the different brain parts are assigned essential roles during this time frame. Hearing forms during the last trimester of pregnancy, and the fetus may react to certain vowel sounds (Johansson, 2008). The infant's ear becomes progressively in tune with certain sounds and stresses in the language after birth and as it continues to grow. (Berken, Gracco, \& Klein, 2016; Johansson, 2008). The infant utilizes the right ear (left hemisphere) for speech and the left ear (right hemisphere) for music (Johansson, 2008). A baby's speech has progressed into vowel structures of the child's native language by six months. A baby can distinguish between words of their native language by approximately age one (Berken, Gracco, \& Klein, 2016). Phonetic tuning occurs before age one and impacts the process of language sounds (Berken, Gracco, \& Klein, 2016). Vidal, Lousda, and Vigario (2020) express that developing phonological skills as early as three years old is essential because of the relationship between these skills and reading disabilities. This phonological awareness development is essential for acquiring the child's first language and later learning a second language. A strong correlation between the
child's social interaction and their family plays a vital role in the child's native language development (Berken, Gracco, \& Klein, 2016; Jentschke, 2016). Therefore, if the native language of an ML child is poorly developed, the child will face more difficulties learning a second language (Berken, Gracco, \& Klein, 2016).

The brain is adaptable and can change with incoming stimulation and activities. Brain neuroplasticity refers to the neural reconfiguration that occurs when conditions for particular motor behaviors and cognitive skills are prompted (Berken, Gracco, \& Klein, 2016). Developmental plasticity suggests that people learn to sing and talk while receiving art and music exposure (Johansson, 2008). Unlike developmental plasticity, which requires no specific training, training/learning-induced plasticity requires a specific training format when "reading, writing, and playing an instrument" (Johansson, 2008, p.415). Enhanced exposure to language leads to similar proficient outcomes in both learned languages. The brain can adapt and streamline the differences between the two languages because of plasticity (Berken, Gracco, \& Klein, 2016; Johansson, 2008). Learning a second language can occur. However, the later a person begins learning a language, the more limited the neuroplastic change will appear (Berken, Gracco, and Klein, 2016). When a child receives early childhood bilingual experiences, connections between the left and right hemispheres occur, resulting in an increase in language skills in the brain. The better chance the child has in practicing skills to differentiate the two languages if exposure occurs earlier in the child's development (Gullifer et al., 2018).

## Brain Research and Music

Jentschke (2016) defines language as "a symbolic medium for communication, with a lexicon of meanings and syntax for organizing its propositions" (p.350). The brain uses music elements to develop the relationship between the realm of music and language during brain
development. Thus, the brain can practice collecting and organizing the rhythm and syntax associated with language and music. Exposing a ML student to music in and out of the classroom allows the brain to acquire and practice valuable skills that can promote English language skills (Mobbs \& Cuyul, 2018). An ML student's long and short-term memory skills improve when exposed to regular musical experiences. Also, enhancement in memory storage and retrieval skills occurs (Collins, 2014). The brain exercises more to understand the similarities and differences between musical and language context through music training. Collins (2014) explains that "music education has been found to encourage high levels of plasticity in the auditory cortex (where we process sound information) and frontal cortex (where we process many other executive functions such as the ability to predict consequences, moderate emotional reactions, and determine similarities and differences)" (p. 6). Higher levels of creativity and thinking may occur because of this plasticity development. Music activities can encourage auditory, motor, and language skills. Therefore, spelling and phonological skills subsequently increase (Jentschke, 2016; Vidal, Lousada, \& Vigario, 2020).

Although music exposure can increase language skills, some popular music learning theories lack stability when working for all children, especially ML students. The Mozart Effect became popular in the 1990s, and the researchers assumed that exposure to the Classical music of Mozart would increase students' education performances (Carney, 2020; Rauscher, Shaw, \& Ky, 1993). This phenomenon created an economic impact through the sales of books and educational material associated with the theory; however, Mozart's music showed little to no gains in the progress of a child's academic success. Active exposure and participation in music can stimulate the brain's development. This development argues that music is as equally important as reading and writing (Sacks, 2008).

Collins (2014) makes the connection between music experiences and language skills. Her research suggests that music education promotes melodic memory, and the brain translates this into language (Collins, 2014). Johannsson (2008) reiterated that point by explaining that the brain and language have a connection that could develop early childhood literacy skills. The connection between brain development and music demonstrates that music can impact learning for children of all ages, especially those labeled ML.

## Connections: ML Students, English Language Development, and Teacher Views

It is important to understand teacher views about students who are learning content in schools, while also learning in a new language. Literature falls into two broad areas that include public school developments and teacher perspectives.

## ML Students and English Language Development in Public Schools

Some people misuse the term Multilingual Learner in the world of education. ML students are students whose first language is not English. "They may be born in an Englishspeaking country raised by parents or extended families whose members do not speak English. Or, they may be from other non-English-speaking countries around the world" (Myles, 2015, p.1). Byfield (2019) based research on the assumption that an increase of enrollment of students from diverse backgrounds is occurring in schools across the United States each year.

Teachers must explore ways to adapt to each ML student's specific learning needs with the influx of diversity entering the classroom. Upon enrolling into a new school, the ML student must participate in tests that display what English language skills already exist and what English language gaps need addressing within the first 30 days of enrollment and 10 days after enrollment during the school year (EL Resource Guide 2022-2023, p.16). The ESL teacher with the school or district receives the task of administering these tests (Byfield, 2019; EL Resource

Guide 2022-2023; English Learner Toolkit for State and Local Education Agencies (SEAs and LEAs) 2017; Harrison \& Lakin, 2018; Myles, 2015). The ESL teacher will create an Individual Education Language Plan (IELP) for the ML student from the data of the administered tests (Abril, 2003). The mainstream teacher will receive the information from the student's plan, and the teacher must implement teaching strategies that will help the ML student progress in meeting the required standards for the grade level. Depending on the English language proficiency level of the ML student, they may spend some of their academic time with an ESL teacher. The ESL teacher uses this small group interaction time to give the ML student more devotion and attention to meet their academic needs. An ESL teacher is in high demand or non-existent in most school districts. Therefore, students may receive smaller amounts of individualized time with an ESL teacher, and the ML student will then learn in a submersion style setting (Abril, 2003; Myles, 2015). In this setting, students learn the language and the content simultaneously (Abril, 2003; Freeman \& Freeman, 2014). The result is the placement of more stress on the mainstream teacher, who also must meet the needs of the other students in the classroom.

## Teacher Perspective of ML Students

As any person entering a new environment for the first time, most school-age students have a sense of nervousness and fear when entering a place identified as a school in an unfamiliar country. Often fear sets in for these students who have only heard their native language, which is not English. Furthermore, the student may not be able to communicate with the other students around them or the mainstream teacher whose class they are in. Miranda (2011) calls this the "non-verbal stage," where communication by the student may only occur through forms of pointing or gesturing (p. 18). This form of communication can be frustrating to the teacher and can lead to negative explicit and implicit teacher beliefs toward the student.

Therefore, the negative beliefs toward the child and the situation could lead to a negative learning environment for the student (Harrison \& Lakin, 2018; Lee, Butler, \& Tippins, 2007). The negative learning environment can result in the ML student feeling a sense of alienation and an increase in anxiety (Abril, 2003).

Teaching the required material can be difficult for most mainstream teachers when specific beliefs toward the ML student do not fit the specific student's diversity. Byfield (2019) researched how the mainstream teacher perceives ML students. The research demonstrated that teachers viewed ML students as "Hispanic" or "Latino," and many of the teachers categorized students by "markers other than language or academic competence" (Byfield, 2019, p. 71-72). Mainstream teachers often feel that they have not been through enough professional development addressing the inclusion of ML students in their classrooms, which leads to more frustration (Diarrassouba, 2018). Harrison and Lakin (2018) found that most teachers had negative beliefs toward ML students because of the lack of professional development for teaching ML students and little to no background in working with ML students. Personal beliefs and feelings coupled with lack of training in strategies to teach an ML student can escalate quickly, amounting to the overwhelmed teacher having the task of teaching the ML student and the other students in the classroom. All of this occurs while the ML student sits waiting to learn.

The ML student in many school districts participates in specialized classes such as art, music, and physical education alongside the other students in their class. Because of this, the specials teachers have opportunities to use specific strategies to teach in a whole group format (Abril, 2003; Conkling \& Conkling, 2018). The ML student's IELP require the meeting of their specific needs. However, Arts teachers display many strategies and activities that can teach English language skills to the ML student. Cooperation between the mainstream teachers and the
music teacher can help maximize the possible academic success of the ML student. The mainstream and music teachers can collaborate during "common planning time" regarding different teaching strategies and specific IELPs for each ML student (Conkling \& Conkling, 2018, p. 522). Thus, the music teacher can create lessons that implement practicing English language skills taught by the mainstream teacher. The ML student can progress in their academic success if repetition in learning English language skills exists.

## Teacher Strategies and English Language Development for ML Students

Teachers have a variety of different strategies for helping ML students learn content while also developing skills in a new language. These include positive learning environment, gestures and visual cues, repetition and skill practice, and visual props and manipulatives.

## Positive Learning Environment

Before effective learning can begin, teachers must create a classroom environment where students feel empowered to learn and be engaged in the learning process (Freeman et al., 2016; Shen \& Byfield, 2018; Soltero, 2011). Lightbown and Spada (2013) explain that teachers can contribute to student motivation to learn when the classroom is the safe space where students are excited to come "because the content is interesting and relevant to their age and level of ability, the learning goals are challenging yet manageable and clear, and the atmosphere is supportive" (p. 88). This environment begins with the teacher making a specific effort to familiarize themselves with the ML student and their specific learning needs (Abril, 2003; Freeman et al., 2016; Shen \& Byfield, 2018; Soltero, 2011). The teacher should respect and value the ML student's cultural background and exhibit a willingness to learn about the ML student's culture. The learning environment should not suppress the native language of the ML student. Instead, a curriculum centered around "translanguaging" implements the ML student's use of multiple
languages to integrate and express their academic growth (Nordmeyer, Boals, McDonald, \& Westerlund, 2021, p. 63).

Curriculum and activities in the classroom should enhance the curiosity, creativity, and diverse experiences of the ML student (Freeman et al., 2016; Nordmeyer, Boals, McDonald, \& Westerlund, 2021; Soltero, 2011). Teachers can also cultivate a positive learning environment through understand the learning process of the ML student. Each ML student processes input given by the teacher differently. Therefore, the teacher should allow the appropriate wait time for the ML student to prepare output (Shen \& Byfield, 2018). Sufficient and adequate teacher feedback is also essential to confirm or respectfully adjust the student's insight. This learning environment should allow students to make mistakes without fear of judgment and promote the problem-solving process within lived experiences of the ML student.

## Gestures and Visual Cues

Teachers convey meaning by gestures, facial expressions, and vocal tone (Freeman \& Freeman, 2014). Gestures and visual cues given by the teacher play a vital role in the English acquisition process of ML students. Facella, Rampino, and Shea (2005) explain that visual gestures such as pointing to objects or thumbs up or down are great communication tools used when working with a ML student. It is critical to understand that crafting purposeful gestures is essential since the ML student is watching closely. Rosborough (2014) discovered that students were engaged when the teacher picked bodily positions and gestures that assisted with transforming the activity.

The ML student will utilize different types of gestures in class activities. Physical gestures through songs, poems, or chants help to teach vocabulary and the context behind the
vocabulary (Abril, 2003; Facella, Rampino, \& Shea, 2005; Hugo \& Horn, 2013; Shin, 2017). Many gestures used in stories can illustrate the context of vocabulary.

## Repetition and Skill Practice

Students learning a new language must develop skills to comprehend and produce the sounds of that language (Freeman \& Freeman, 2014; Freeman et al., 2016). Repetition by the teacher helps students practice routines and schedules, and it allows ML to practice learned skills and use new language skills often. Repetition in classroom activities helps ease a ML student's comfort level, creating more learning opportunities. Children who hear concepts regularly will be more motivated to begin using the new language on their own (Facella, Rampino, Shea, 2005; Freeman et al., 2016; Soltero, 2011).

The building of vocabulary plays a vital role in narrowing the achievement gap for ML students. Tamimi and $\mathrm{Sa}^{\prime} \mathrm{d}$ (2016) discovered that students were more involved in their learning when teachers used context behind vocabulary and repetition of the words in sentences. These students felt that it was the role of the teacher to reinforce English vocabulary and context through the exposure of the vocabulary and consistent repetition.

Repetition of oral skills through songs, poetry, stories, and other repetitive activities helps reinforce phonetic skills necessary to language development. It is essential to create activities that enhance students' communication fluency, allowing them to practice English language development. Practice should be interactive, meaningful, and focus on task-essential forms (Lightbown \& Spada, 2013). These activities should center around the student performing a task often to practice necessary English language skills (Concannon-Gibney, 2021; Facella, Rampino, \& Shea, 2005; Freeman et al., 2016; Hugo \& Horn, 2013; Paquette \& Rieg, 2008; Shin, 2017; Soltero, 2011). Facella, Rampino, Shea (2005) gives the example of reading stories that repeat
specific words or phrases then provide further opportunities for students to practice the words or phrases in a dramatic play or post-reading activity.

## Visuals, Props, and Manipulatives

Teachers use a variety of resources when teaching content in the classroom. Teachers use visuals and hands-on resources to reinforce vocabulary skills and enhance the context of vocabulary. Visuals can include posters, pictures, digital media, props, or manipulatives held or used by the ML student. Many teachers feel that students are more engaged in the learning process when they can see or feel a concrete object representing the reoccurring vocabulary (Facella, Rampino, \& Shea, 2005). Teachers also feel that using props and visuals strengthens the comprehension skills of the ML student (Concannon-Gibney, 2021).

Visuals can also be digital representations. Captioning refers to "the use of an electronic representation of the language being spoken, thereby allowing people to see the words being uttered" (Ingraham, 2014, p. 375). Closed captioning services allow language students to access the listening domain of their language learning and the visual domain. Captioning options help enhance comprehension skills in the ML student (Ingraham, 2014). Many digital devices (i.e., TV) and educational resources such as YouTube contain closed captioning services.

## Music in Public Schools and English Language Development for ML Students

Research exists on music and English language development. It falls into two overarching areas that include cultivating a positive environment and specific approaches within music classrooms for supporting English language development with ML students.

## Cultivating a Positive Learning Environment

Music teachers in most school environments have the opportunity to work with all students despite their ethnicity or background (Collins, 2014; Conkling \& Conkling, 2018;

Hoffman, 2012; Miranda, 2011). In many cases, the music teacher takes on the challenge of working with students "whose native language is not English" (Miranda, 2011, p. 17). Like any student entering a new learning environment for the first time, a sense of nervousness and fear may be present. In some cases, anxiety sets in for these students who have only heard their native language. Furthermore, the student may not be able to communicate with the other students or the music teacher whose class they are entering. The only communication that may occur is through the children pointing to or visually seeing something that makes a connection in their minds during this "non-verbal stage" (Miranda, 2011, p. 18). This phase can last several months, but it is a crucial learning period for the student. An ML student is cognitively engaged, trying to understand the perceived new language during the non-verbal period (Abril, 2003). An ML student may exhibit behavior by observing other students intently, listening to conversations, and copying motions made by other students or the teacher (Abril, 2003; Miranda, 2011). Abril (2003) reiterated to not interpret this behavior as a learning disability or a lack of social skills by the student.

Entering a music classroom for the first time should grant any student with a sense of ease. Communication by the teacher through facial expressions, smiles, tone of voice, enthusiasm, patience, and reactions set the tone of the learning environment for the ML student (Abril, 2003; Miranda, 2011). Students enrolled in most general music classrooms are learning in an inclusive format where students learn content in a whole group style (Abril, 2003). The ML student may use this experience to formulate the learning environment of the music classroom. According to Abril (2003), "Music and arts educators are fortunate to teach a subject that has the power to motivate and stimulate" (p. 39). The student feels motivated to their highest learning
potential when a music teacher creates a positive learning environment for students, especially those considered ML.

Sacks (2008) says, "Music forms a significant and, on the whole, pleasant part of life for most of us" (p. 32). When creating a positive learning environment for the music classroom, a music teacher must recognize that all students' cultures and backgrounds will be different. All students classified as White (or Caucasian) have many cultural differences. In the same way, all Hispanic cultures are distinct. Each culture has different customs, dialects, nationalities, races, and ethnicities (Abril, 2003). Hoffman (2012) understood the concept of creating a safe learning space for students and created an art-based curriculum project where students learned the cultures and backgrounds of other students within the middle school. The cultural themes connected disciplines, content areas, and people within the school and community, all while establishing a comfortable environment where students learned from each other.

The social climate in the classroom plays a role in students' academic success, especially those labeled ML. "If children are not respected as individuals and treated equally among their peers, they may feel ostracized, and their achievement will most likely suffer" (Abril, 2003, p. 40). The music classroom should be the place where students feel comfortable collaborating with each other and the teacher. Even so, this type of communication can be stressful and frightening for an ML student, especially if no other student in the class speaks the same language. Miranda (2011) explains that part of creating a positive learning experience for the ML student does not mean suppressing their native language. "The goal of understanding how to support second language learning is not to replace a child's first language but to find ways to address the challenges of these children...in a way that promotes holistic development" (Miranda, 2011, p. 17). The concern for many teachers in the public-school setting is creating and maintaining an
environment where all students respect and learn from each other's cultures and backgrounds (Hoffman, 2012). A profound and lasting effect occurs when students have a positive or negative experience in the classroom environment (Abril, 2003). Paquette and Rieg (2008) explain that growth and development of the early childhood learner occurs when there is a foundation of mutual respect and trust while cultivating creativity with each other. Music, whether in the mainstream or music classroom, can transform an environment to be pleasant and positive "where children thrive emotionally, socially, and academically" (Paquette \& Rieg; 2008, p. 227).

A positive learning environment begins when a student enters the classroom. However, the atmosphere must be a continual event in which the student feels stimulated to learn each time they cross into the music classroom. Therefore, the classroom needs to be visually and cognitively stimulating, where the student can learn English language skills as they experience music. Accomplishing this goal requires educators to adapt music content focused on meeting music standards while also incorporating English language instruction. "Curriculum planning and within its school vision, mission, and syllabi should be formed in response to not just global tendencies but also local needs" (Rodriguez-Bonces, 2017, p. 204). The music teacher in most public schools is one of very few educators to teach each student year to year. Some music teachers may have the same student from their elementary age through their secondary years. With this opportunity, the music teacher can create a vertical curriculum where students learn music skills while building upon English language skills each year (Abril, 2003; Miranda, 2011; Rodriguez-Bonces, 2017).

The ML student will feel more at ease to begin a phase of participation if exposure to a positive learning environment has occurred. The student may try to communicate with telegraphic or formulaic speech during this phase. Telegraphic speech refers to the student using
single words to respond to questions or identify an object (Miranda, 2011). An example of this form of communication in the music classroom might be as simple as the student responding with the word "Ta" when the music teacher claps a simple rhythm using "Ta" and "Ti-Ti." The student demonstrates formulaic speech when they use phrases heard or seen by the teacher or other peers. Simple lyrics to a song or common phrases by the music teacher are examples of formulaic speech. However, presentation and maintenance of the positive learning environment must be present so that the ML student feels comfortable enough to explore English language skills (Abril, 2003; Miranda, 2011; Salmon, 2010). Strategies in the classroom do not stand alone, and the classroom environment (whether positive or negative) is a critical factor for all students (Miranda, 2011).

## Music Classroom Teaching for ML Student Language Skill Development

What an educator teaches is important. However, how they teach the material is vital for the student's learning of the information. A teacher's strategies to implement a lesson can dictate whether or not a student retains information useful for their academic success. The same is true for the ML student, who is already at a disadvantage because of little to no English language skills. The music classroom utilizes many strategies and activities to help the ML student be academically successful. Children learning a new language need "meaningful, purposeful, and culturally relevant activities that interest them and encourage them to express themselves in English" (Shin, 2017, p. 23).

Singing Songs and Language Skills. "Music is a language of learning that eventually involves children in talking, reading, drawing, and writing" (Salmon, 2010, p. 937). Salmon (2010) explains that a natural connection exists between language, music, and thinking. Singing music can help ML students learn English sounds and words. Shen (2009) expresses that "lyrics
are characterized by the use of rhythms, conversational speech and poetic expressions" (p. 88). Children strengthen their accenting and syllabication skills when learning a new rhythmic pattern (Hugo \& Horn, 2013; Shin, 2017). Also, when students learn a new song, they enhance their memorization and comprehension skills (Paquette \& Rieg, 2008; Perez Niño, 2010; Shin, 2017). Simple songs help with practicing oral skills needed for the ML student to reinforce English language skills, and students will retain the information by the repetition of the song (Shin, 2017). Students are enhancing communication skill fluency by singing songs. For the ML student, a song can demonstrate a variety of skills, including sentence patterns, vocabulary, pronunciation, rhythm, and parts of speech (Paquette \& Rieg, 2008; Perez Niño, 2010). Oral stories through music rather than actual speech synthesizes both linguistic and musical information. Songs can help develop pronunciation skills that children need to develop language, especially a new one (McCormack et al., 2018).

Singing songs also serve as an aid to support literacy development and vocabulary skills needed for communicating with others (Hugo \& Horn, 2013; Mashayekh \& Hashemi, 2011; Perez Niño, 2010; Paquette \& Rieg, 2008). "Music can be naturally integrated throughout all curricular to develop and to extend vocabulary and comprehension skills" (Paquette \& Rieg, 2008, p. 228). Mobbs and Cuyul (2018) believe that using songs in the classroom "can improve listening comprehension and provide pronunciation practice" for the ML student (p. 23). Singing simple songs with repetition is suitable for younger ML students. Examples of such songs include "Bingo" or "Old MacDonald Had a Farm" (Paquette \& Rieg, 2008, p. 228). The teacher can use visual aids or pictures to associate visuals with the English words sung in these songs (Hugo \& Horn, 2013; Lems, 2018; Paquette \& Rieg, 2008; Salmon 2010).

It is essential to engage in thinking activities to help ML students use expressive language in their native and second languages (Mashayekh \& Hashemi, 2011; Lawson-Adams \& Dickinson, 2019; Salmon, 2010; Vidal, Lousada, \& Vigario, 2020). Abril (2003) suggests selecting a variety of songs to use as teaching aids. The author also recommends selecting songs with non-sense syllables to allow the ML students to be on the same learning path as the other students in the classroom. Another suggestion is for the teacher to allow the ML student to sing a song in their native language. Also, teaching the whole class a song in a very different language that is new to every class member allows the ML student to feel a part of a group (Abril, 2003). "When activities with words are introduced in a musical setting, they become musical rather than literal (Abril, 2003, p. 42). The song selection process is essential in promoting essential English language skills that assist in the overall academic success of each student (Hugo \& Horn, 2013; Paquette \& Rieg, 2008; Salmon, 2010; Shin, 2017).

Focused Listening Skills. Lems (2018) explained that music is a valuable resource to help bring focus in noisy environments. When a student enters a room, he or she may hear numerous conversations and other background noises. Walking into the same room with clusters of noise can be overwhelming and confusing for the ML student who is still learning English language skills. "Hearing speech in noise is especially important for those learning a new language" (Lems, 2018, p. 16). The English language contains many words that sound the same except for minor vowel differences found in such words as beg and big. A common strategy is to use music to practice focus skills on the phonetics of words. The real world and the classroom are both noisy places. ML students need a foundation as they progress through their academic years, mastering skills to help them focus on English language skills such as phonetics and word formation (Lems, 2018).

Target Listening Skills. Listening encompasses most of the time of any classroom, mainstream, ESL, or music (Gonzalez et al., 2015; Hugo \& Horn, 2013). Elements of music help to enhance listening skills. Hugo and Horn (2013) reiterated this by saying, "The ability to hear is not the same as the ability to listen" (p. 65). Humans are born with the ability to hear. However, listening is a taught skill. Listening means focusing on the presented information. As ML students develop English language skills, they develop the abilities to speak and listen with understanding both together (Hugo \& Horn, 2013).

Listening skills are essential in developing language skills because faulty listening can lead to defective learning. In their research, Gonzalez et al. (2015) discovered that students retain information through target listening. The majority of the teachers in their study developed a teaching style that practiced these skills over time in order for the students to retain the target information presented (Gonzalez, et al. 2015). Music intervention can have a positive influence on listening skills in English as a second language. Academic success for these students could increase by enhancing these skills (Hugo \& Horn, 2013).

Gestures and Specific Movement. The movement that is associated with music may also benefit the learning process of the ML student. A song's context and vocabulary will enhance engagement and learning the new language when movements or gestures exist in a song (Shin, 2017). Dancing to a song may bring a feeling of excitement. However, addition of the meaning of words in a song enhances the specific movements or gestures. Abril (2003) suggests that the teacher demonstrates the use of gestures and English terminology. "The physical involvement in the learning process may maintain their focus and engagement; the visual symbol links the word to the concept" (Abril, 2003, p. 42). This movement often occurs as the music teacher demonstrates rhythms or high-low sounds. The ML student connects the English word to
that movement once demonstration of the gesture occurs. The teacher can allow the students to create a gesture for an English word or phrase once students understand the meaning of specific movements to words. This participation allows the ML student to be a part of the learning process while connecting English words to the movement (Abril, 2003).

Other examples of a movement that aids in learning English language skills are clapping, stomping, and dancing. These movements can demonstrate represented fast and slow tempos in spoken English, aiding in learners collecting new words and idiomatic expressions from songs; thus, enhancing cognitive and language learning for the ML student (Hugo \& Horn, 2013).

Social and Cultural Learning. The music classroom brings a social aspect to the learning process of the ML student. Most music classrooms are inclusive, and students can interact with each other and learn from each other's lived experiences. Students learn about each other's backgrounds when participating in activities that promote sharing individual cultural experiences through music (Abril, 2003; Hoffman, 2012; Shin, 2017). This learning activity allows the ML student to share their native language, customs, and values and other members of the class sharing likewise. An example of this learning experience could be the teacher creating an activity where students change the lyrics of a song to match their culture. Shin (2017) suggests taking songs such as "Old MacDonald Had a Farm" and changing it to a version that would fit the diversity of the classroom (p.17). Including the music of various cultures represents the universal aspect of music (Abril, 2003). "Using music as a teaching tool is a way to bring the class together and inspire interest in the lesson" (Mobbs \& Cuyul, 2018, p. 28).

Using songs in the classroom benefits ML students in linguistic development, exposure to various cultures, and experience with multiple ways of communicating with others (Mobbs \& Cuyul, 2018). Abril (2003) suggests using cooperative-learning groups to motivate and create a
learning environment where students learn from their peers rather than the teacher. "Hispanic children generally work well and are motivated when they work in small groups. From an early age, they are acculturated to achieve and succeed for acceptance, the family, and peer-group solidarity---in contrast to achievement for personal gain" (Abril, 2003, p. 41). Miranda (2011) observed this behavior when observing the child named "Maria" in her research. The ML student used time with her peers to discuss the taught material. This discussion time gave Maria clarity in the material and encouragement from her peers in the learning process (Miranda, 2011).

Digital Media. Implementation of music in the $21^{\text {st }}$-century classroom in various ways helps to assist all children's learning process, especially ML students. Digital media can be a helpful teaching aid when working with ML students, whether through Google to find songs or YouTube to find music. "An unquestionable benefit of the digital revolution is our greater access to music, not only music from our own culture but also music from around the world" (Lems, 2018, p. 16). We have musical performances and song lyrics at our everyday disposal through such media outlets as YouTube. We can use this opportunity to learn about the cultures of new artists and song creations. Also, we can bring the cultural experiences of the ML student into the classroom for others to learn. Student use karaoke to practice reading fluency in a fun and creative experience. Students are practicing reading skills such as pronunciation, annunciation, rhyming, and tracking through singing while reading words (Lems, 2018). Watching sound stories or songs through media that have visuals allows ML students to visualize words or phrases in the English language. Music allows children to activate their mental imagery (Salmon, 2010).

Classroom Climate. Emotionally, music can be calming and reduces stress. Music provides a climate of relaxation and recreation (Shen, 2009). "Music has the power to soothe
people's emotions, refresh their minds, and to unlock their creativity" (Shen, 2009, p. 89). Music also adds energy and excitement to any activity (Shin, 2017). Lems (2018) advocates crafting an environment where music heightens the attention, creating an environment for the ML student conducive to learning. Rhythm and tempo in music helps set the mind to focus on various activities (Lems, 2018; Mobbs \& Cuyul, 2018; Paquette \& Rieg, 2008; Salmon, 2010; Shen, 2009; Shin, 2017).

## Chapter 3

## Methods

The purpose of this qualitative multiple case study was to compare evidence-based teaching strategies in the mainstream classroom, the ESL classroom, and the elementary music classroom that assist Multilingual Learners (ML) in developing English language skills. This qualitative study utilized a multiple case study design. Case studies involve studying real-life events within a specific time and place (Creswell \& Creswell, 2018; Ravitch \& Carl, 2016). The time frame of a case study can range from a short period to several years (Bhattacharya, 2017). Tracy (2020) describes case studies as "in-depth contextual analyses of one of few instances of a naturalistic phenomenon, such as a person, an organization, a program, an event, a geographical location, or a decision" (p. 61). Data collection sources within a case study include direct observations, interviews, documents, artifacts, and other sources (Ravitch \& Carl, 2016).

The multiple case study design allows the researcher to select an issue or problem to explore, defines what the case would look like, and selects multiple cases to investigate the issue (Bhattacharya, 2017). Multiple case studies can include a single participant or multiple participants with the focus on providing "analytical insights on things that are similar and different" between each case in the research study (Bhattacharya, 2017, p. 110).

The concept for my study is the research-based teaching strategies used by the mainstream classroom teachers, the ESL teacher, and the general music teachers. The conceptual framework for this study is based on framework analysis because of its structure and systematic approach. The five steps in framework analysis include "(1) data familiarization, (2) identifying a thematic framework, (3) indexing all study data against the framework, (4) charting to
summarize the indexed data and mapping and (5) interpretation of patterns found within the charts" (Goldsmith, 2021, p. 2062). Table 1 describes each step of the framework analysis.

## Table 1

Framework Analysis

| Step | Description |
| :--- | :--- |
| 1.Data <br> Familiarization | Provides researcher with initial and purposeful understandings of the <br> data. The researcher begins to find major themes in the data through <br> immersion and making notes about key ideas. This step will continue <br> until the researcher arrives at a reasonable understanding of the data. |
| 2. Framework | This iterative process refers to identifying abstract concepts that provide <br> a framework for the analysis and interpretations. Grouped themes and <br> concepts address the focus of the study. Other themes and concepts will <br> come from subdivision of major themes and concepts. |
| 3. Indexing | Systematic application of the selected framework to all the data in the <br> study. The researcher can use any approach to link the study data and the <br> framework using a coding process. |
| 4. Charting | Ordering the indexed study data to be systematically examined. This <br> occurs through creating charts that summarize the study data and looks <br> like ordered rows and columns with the units of analysis and framework <br> components. Charting allows the research the opportunity to revisit and <br> enhance decisions regarding analysis units, framework components, level <br> of data abstraction, and framework adequacy for the data. |
| 5. Mapping andThe researcher combines the learnings from the previous steps and <br> comparisons across units of analysis and framework components. <br> Interpretation |  |
| Comparisons include examining variations across the entire data set and <br> within subgroups and subthemes. The researcher will also examine for <br> clusters of data and review, condense, or combine charts and data to tell <br> a story about the structures and patterns in the data. |  |

This research study utilized the theoretical framework referred to as a tacit theory.
Ravitch and Carl (2016) refer to tacit theories as being "the informal and even unconscious ways that you understand or make sense of the world" (p.35). Intentional reflection helps to speak and know these ways. Tacit theories grow from personal attitudes, perspectives, ideologies, and values.

My qualitative case study used purposeful sampling to gain multiple perspectives in research-based teaching strategies in assisting Multilingual Learners (MLs) with English language skills. This type of sampling refers to the researcher purposefully choosing the participants for the study based on specific reasons that tie back to the research purpose and research questions (Ravitch \& Carl, 2016). Teaching field, employment, and number of MLs taught in the classroom determined the five participants for this study. All participants work in the same school district, in the same state, and teach a minimum of one ML student during the whole group setting. Participants included two mainstream elementary teachers (a Kindergarten and First Grade teacher), an ESL teacher, and two general elementary music teachers.

Data collection methods for this study included direct observations, documents, artifacts, articles, field notes, and semi-structured interviews. Each participant was observed for a minimum of thirty minutes and a maximum of forty-five minutes for three consecutive teaching days. During the observations, I took fieldnotes of what I saw and heard from the teacher in the classroom. My focus was on research-based strategies seen that assist MLs with English language skills. I also requested copies of lesson plans, manipulatives, artifacts, and visuals seen during each direct observation. In part two of this research study, teachers participated in a semiformal interview to discover how they acquired the knowledge, skills, and training to implement research-based strategies.

## Researcher's Role

My worldview is pragmatic. Creswell and Creswell (2018) explain that this worldview "arises out of actions, situations, and consequences rather than antecedent conditions" (p. 10). The concern is with attitudes towards solutions and applications that work. Pragmatism also allows the researcher freedom to choose methods, techniques, and research procedures best
suited for their purpose. Pragmatists look at things realistically based on what is practical (Creswell \& Creswell, 2018). As a researcher, I hope to create change in general music education due to this study.

My role as the researcher is that of an interpreter and describer. Ravitch and Carl (2016) refer to the researcher as the "primary instrument in qualitative research" (p. 10). Tracy (2020) furthers this point by saying the researcher absorbs and sorts through the world through "observation, participation, and interviewing" (p. 3). The researcher studies and interprets the data to the best of their ability. To best interpret the data, I must view the results free from bias and without expectations. My role as the researcher is to remember the purpose of the study and answer the research questions based on the reality discovered in the data.

## Researcher's Perspective/Positionality

I am currently an elementary music teacher and a graduate student in choral music education. I have worked as an elementary music teacher in the same school and school district for nine years. The school where I teach is a Title 1 school, with over $1 / 3$ of our student population receiving English language assistance. Because of this number, every classroom within our school has at least one student who receives English language assistance as part of their Individual Education Language Plan (IELP).

I grew up in a family of educators, and the school district that I attended had a large percentage of ML students. My mother was a $9^{\text {th }}$ grade English Language Arts teacher who then became an elementary assistant principal. She moved to be a high school assistant principal when I was in middle school, and she finished her career in education working as a curriculum coordinator. My father started and finished his career as an Agri-business teacher. My aunt was a $3^{\text {rd }}$-grade mainstream classroom teacher who would eventually become an elementary principal. I
watched and listened to my mother, father, and aunt as they would discuss effective teaching strategies when working with students from various cultures and backgrounds.

Throughout my high school and college years, I participated in sports, clubs, and music activities that allowed me to travel across my state and around the country. I have worked with and performed with musicians with various language abilities from many different backgrounds. Music was the common ground that allowed each of us to learn new skills and language together.

Fast forward to my first teaching job. I found myself working closely with the ESL teacher at my school and the mainstream classroom teachers to nurture the learning environment for all the students in our school. I have watched the enrollment of MLs to our school increase each year in the nine years I have worked at my school. I have worked with the ESL teacher to uncover strategies that I could use in my music classroom to convey the content better to each student, and I have worked alongside the students to learn pieces of their native languages and cultures to create a positive learning environment.

In 2019, I had a student enroll in our school two weeks before the end of the year Kindergarten program. The ESL teacher explained that this student had little to no English language skills and was new to the overall American school environment. I gave the student a choice to participate in practices for the end-of-year performance. I watched the student open up and participate more and more each day as we practiced for the final program. Two weeks later, I watched as this student could sing every lyric to each song in the Kindergarten production. The student may not have understood the context of what they were singing. However, they were participating!

I began my graduate studies at Auburn University in the following summer, hoping to uncover research and ideas on how the elements of music can assist MLs with English language
skills. I utilized each class course load to help research literature to investigate this phenomenon, and I adapted what I learned from each course to prepare for this research study. I also practiced research skills to begin narrowing down what I was trying to uncover from the view of a music educator in a public-school setting.

To further my positionality as a researcher, I must also list how other groups view me. I am an American, white, female, Christian, educated music teacher who speaks her native language and knows some phrases of Spanish. I have taught for nine years in the same classroom and the same school. However, I have worked with a variety of different mainstream teachers in different grade levels. Through my studies and literature review, I have learned to view my positionality as a researcher from multiple sides to recognize possible limitations and bias in the research.

The ML students that I teach are majority Hispanic/Latino. I am from a white family environment. The community I grew up in was majority white, African American, and Hispanic/Latino. ML students can be from many backgrounds and cultures. However, the ML students I grew up with and those I currently teach are predominantly from the Hispanic/Latino culture. Countries represented in this culture include Mexico, Puerto Rico, Columbia, Guatemala, Honduras, Cuba, and Peru.

## Participants

This multiple case study focused on five participants and utilized purposeful sampling to select the participants. Purposeful sampling allows the researcher to purposefully choose the participants for specific reasons tied to the study's purpose and research questions (Ravitch \& Carl, 2016; Tracy, 2020). Two participants were mainstream general education teachers (a Kindergarten and a First-Grade teacher), an ESL teacher, and two general music elementary
teachers. All five participants are from the same school district, in the same state, and had a minimum of one ML student in the whole group teaching at the time of the researcher's observations. Each participant has been given a pseudonym in all data reporting.

## Data Collection

The first step in any research is to gain permission to conduct the study at the study site(s) through the site gatekeeper, which is followed by an internal review board (IRB). The gatekeeper allows this permission. Tracy (2020) explains that this person has the power to grant access to the particular field for this study. The gatekeeper for this study was the district superintendent. Once consented by the gatekeeper, the principal and teachers in the school(s) also gave consent. For this study, data sources included direct observations, documents, artifacts, articles, field notes, and semi-structured interviews. It is essential to note that the gatekeeper and principal(s) were not present during the data collection phase of this study.

## Direct Observations

The purpose of the observations was to gain information about research-based teaching strategies used in the mainstream, ESL, and general music classrooms to assist ML students with English language skills. I conducted the observations of each teacher for three consecutive teaching days. Each observation occurred during the teacher's whole group instruction time to ensure all students receiving various specialized services were present. Each observation occurred for a minimum of thirty minutes and a maximum of forty-five minutes, depending on the instruction schedule of the individual teacher during the specific school year. I took field notes of strategies seen by the teacher and any other valuable information during the observation useful for data analysis. Field notes were kept in a locked drawer on my personal desk.

## Artifacts and Documents

I requested lesson plans and copies of worksheets or written documents used by the participant during the instruction block. I asked each participant for personal field notes created or reflections that the participant used for teaching instruction along with lesson plans. I also requested copies of visuals or manipulatives and any other resource used by the participant during the instruction. I used the camera feature on my personal iPad to take photos of any artifacts such as posters, pictures, or other valuable visuals utilized by the participant. I used each artifact and copy during the data analysis phase of the research study. All documents and artifacts remained in a locked drawer on my personal desk.

## Interviews

Each participant participated in a semi-formal interview. The ZOOM conferencing platform on my personal laptop and the Voice Memo application on my personal iPad recorded all interviews. My personal laptop, iPad, and Auburn University Box folder storage securely kept all ZOOM recordings and Voice Memos. All devices and the Auburn University Box folder storage are password protected.

The overarching topic of the interview is the knowledge and skills acquired to assist ML students with English language skills. Questions in the interview pertained to the participant's personal background (where they are from, how they were raised), their education (certificates and degrees), specific training geared toward working with ML students, years of experience teaching, and current Professional Development and resources provided by the school district to assist ML students with English language skills. See Appendix A for the interview protocol for each participant.

## Research Question and Data Alignment

Table 2 shows how the research questions align with data collection. More specifically, since this study included observations, artifacts, and interviews, this table shows the questions that were asked during the interview and their alignment with the data collected through artifacts and observations.

## Table 2

## Data Collection Alignment with Research Questions

| Research Question | Data | Interview Protocol Questions |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1. What evidencebased teaching strategies do teachers utilize in the mainstream, ESL, and music classroom to assist the Multilingual Learner (ML) with English language skills? | observations, researcher field notes, participant field notes and reflections, lesson plans, manipulatives, visuals | Explain the training or professional development have you had in these roles focusing on JUST teaching strategies for your current teaching position. Describe the pieces of training themselves and how they prepare you for your current role as a teacher in your field. <br> Tell me about your collaboration or planning with other teachers in the school who teach a ML student in your classroom. <br> a. Do you have opportunities to meet with the music, art, P.E., library, or other specials teachers to talk about teaching strategies? If so, describe those interactions. When do they occur? For how long? <br> b. If the participant says no to the having opportunity to meet with the specials teachers: In your opinion, would it be beneficial to work with these teachers to collaborate on teaching strategies that could help ML students? Why? <br> c. Do you have an ESL teacher in your school or district? Do you get to meet with the ESL teacher to talk about specific teaching strategies when working with ML students? If so, how often? |

2. What differences in evidence-based teaching strategies do teachers utilize in the mainstream, ESL, and music classroom to assist the Multilingual Learner (ML) with English language skills?
observations, Explain the training or professional development have you had in these researcher field roles focusing on JUST teaching strategies for your current teaching notes, participant field notes and reflections, lesson plans, manipulatives, visuals position. Describe the pieces of training themselves and how they prepare you for your current role as a teacher in your field.
Tell me about your collaboration or planning with other teachers in the school who teach a ML student in your classroom.
a. Do you have opportunities to meet with the music, art, P.E., library, or other specials teachers to talk about teaching strategies? If so, describe those interactions. When do they occur? For how long?
b. If the participant says no to the having opportunity to meet with the specials teachers: In your opinion, would it be beneficial to work with these teachers to collaborate on teaching strategies that could help ML students? Why?
c. Do you have an ESL teacher in your school or district? Do you get to meet with the ESL teacher to talk about specific teaching strategies when working with ML students? If so, how often?

| 3.How does the mainstream, ESL, and music classroom teacher acquire the knowledge and skills to use effective teaching strategies to assist the Multilingual Learner (ML) with English language skills? | interviews with participants | Tell me about where you are from. <br> Was anyone in your family in education? If so, what role did they play? <br> What is your degree(s)? Where did you receive your degree(s)? Tell me about your teaching career, starting with your first job. <br> Explain the training or professional development have you had in these roles focusing on JUST teaching strategies for your current teaching position. Describe the pieces of training themselves and how they prepare you for your current role as a teacher in your field. <br> In your current role, do you have ML students in your classroom? If so, approximately how many? <br> Tell me about your collaboration or planning with other teachers in the school who teach a ML student in your classroom. <br> a. Do you have opportunities to meet with the music, art, P.E., library, or other specials teachers to talk about teaching strategies? If so, describe those interactions. When do they occur? For how long? <br> b. If the participant says no to the having opportunity to meet with the specials teachers: In your opinion, would it be beneficial to work with these teachers to collaborate on teaching strategies that could help ML students? Why? <br> c. Do you have an ESL teacher in your school or district? Do you get to meet with the ESL teacher to talk about specific teaching strategies when working with ML students? If so, how often? 8.Is there anything you would recommend about working with ML students that could better help other teachers who work with these students? |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |

## Data Analysis

I collected data for each participant over three consecutive teaching periods for each participant. Data included observations, artifacts and documents, and interviews. A locked drawer on my personal desk housed the observational data, field notes, artifacts, and documents, and a password-protected computer file secured interview data transcripts and analyses.

Interviews ranged from twenty-three to forty minutes and occurred in November 2022. Specific timing depended on the participants' schedules and instruction requirements.

Once all data was collected, I used the five steps of the framework analysis for data analysis. The initial goal of this research was to discover research-based teaching strategies that teachers in different fields are using to assist ML students with English language skills. I also
completed a narrative about the lived experiences of each participant as it relates to knowledge and skills to teach ML students.

## Trustworthiness

Validity refers to "the ways that researchers can affirm that their findings are faithful to participants' experiences" (Ravitch \& Carl, 2016, p. 186). A researcher must establish a valid and trustworthy study to maintain trustworthiness in qualitative research. For this study, I used validation procedures, including triangulation and participant validation. Triangulation allows the researcher to use multiple types of data sources and collection methods to examine the current reality of the research (Ravitch \& Carl, 2016; Tracy, 2020). Participant validation, also known as member checking, refers to connecting with the participants about various aspects of the research "to see how they think and feel about various aspects of the research process" (Ravitch \& Carl, 2016, p. 197). This member checking process uses feedback in the data analysis process. Participants received copies of transcripts and field notes created in the observations.

## Chapter 4

## Findings

The purpose of this qualitative multiple case study was to compare evidence-based teaching strategies in the mainstream classroom, the ESL classroom, and the elementary music classroom that assist Multilingual Learners (ML) in developing English language skills. Data collection occurred over three consecutive teaching periods for each participant, including observations, artifacts and documents, and semi-formal interviews. Findings are presented in two main sections based on the direct observation and interview results. These results, while valuable, are only applicable to the participants in this study and not generalizable to a larger population.

## Direct Observations

Five participants $(N=5)$ were selected for this study using purposeful sampling. All participants worked in the same school district, in the same state, and taught at least one ML student during the whole group observation. Participants included two mainstream elementary teachers (a Kindergarten and First-Grade teacher), an ESL teacher, and two general elementary music teachers. All five participants identified as female, with four of the five participants being white and one participant being Guatemalan-American. Pseudonyms were created for all participants per APA guidelines, and those along with general information are in Table 3.

## Table 3

## Participant Backgrounds

| Pseudonym | Role | Experience (Yrs.) | Pronoun | Ethnicity |
| :--- | :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Candace | ESL Teacher | 28 | She/Her | Guatemalan-American |
| Bethany | $1^{\text {st }}$ Grade Mainstream Teacher | 4 | She/Her | White |
| Ashley | Kindergarten Mainstream Teacher | 8 | She/Her | White |
| Jamie | Elementary General Music Teacher | 23 | She/Her | White |
| Emma | Elementary General Music Teacher | 14 | She/Her | White |

I observed each participant for three consecutive teaching days. Each observation occurred during the participant's whole group instruction time to ensure all students receiving various specialized services were present. Each observation occurred for a minimum of thirty minutes and a maximum of forty-five minutes, depending on each participant's instructional schedule. I took field notes on strategies participants used along with any other valuable and/or helpful information I observed. In addition, my field notes for each observation recorded each participant's teaching strategies during the observation periods. Finally, I requested copies of artifacts used to prepare for their lessons and items they used during their whole group lessons. Specifically, artifacts included curriculum guides, lesson plans, manipulatives, and personal notes the participant wrote.

I analyzed artifacts and field notes taken during the participant observation to determine differences and similarities in teaching strategies used to assist ML students with English language skills within the whole group setting in the observation block. I analyzed and handcoded observation data using the framework analysis five-step process (as outlined in Methods). I also used member checking feedback for the observation data analysis process. Participants received copies of field notes created in the observations and data analysis notes and were able to provide additions if they wished. None of them asked for corrections, edits, or additions. As a reminder, I interviewed the five participants who all worked in the same school district, in the same state, and taught at least one ML student during the whole group observation. Pseudonyms were created for all participants per APA guidelines. I analyzed and hand-coded the interview data using the framework analysis five-step process (as outlined in Methods). Participants received copies of interview transcripts and data analysis notes and were able to provide additions if they wished. One participant requested corrections to her interview transcripts. None
of the other participants asked for corrections, edits, or additions. The first Findings section discusses participants' lived experiences related to knowledge and skills to teach ML students.

## Demographics

## Candace

Candace is a Guatemalan-American female who has 28 years of teaching experience. She taught at a private school for five years, then transitioned to a public school where she taught high school math and Spanish for a year. This school district then offered her the English Language (EL) Specialist position for three years. Candace then took a job with her current school district, where she has been the ESL facilitator and teacher for eleven years.

Candace was born in Guatemala, and her parents enrolled her in a school that would help her be proficient in German, English, and Spanish by the time she graduated high school. Candace was able to come to Alabama as a foreign exchange student during her junior year of high school. She received a scholarship after high school to attend a college in Austria, where she attended school for her first year. Candace completed the rest of her college education at a four-year university in Alabama. She graduated with her undergraduate degree in Spanish and German Secondary Education and has Masters degrees in Spanish Education, ESL/Bilingual Education, and Instructional Leadership. She has also completed her Education Specialist (Ed. S.) degree in ESL and Bilingual Education and is working on completing her doctorate in education.

## Bethany

Bethany is a white female who began her career teaching sixth grade at a private school where she taught for a full academic year and three months of the next school year. She has been
in her current role for three years, teaching first grade. Bethany has four years of total teaching experience.

Bethany was enrolled in two different school districts during her childhood years. She attended one school district from Kindergarten through sixth grade. The elementary school she attended was a lower-income school with fewer resources and enrollment than the school she attended for high school. Her seventh through twelfth-grade years were spent in a larger school district with more resources and a higher enrollment. Bethany received her Bachelor's in Elementary Education and is working toward her Master's in Elementary Education from the same four-year university in Alabama.

## Ashley

Ashley is a white female who has been teaching Kindergarten for eight years, all with the current school district used in this study. She filled a leave of absence in first grade in another school district before her current role.

Ashley grew up in a small town in Alabama and attended the same school district from Kindergarten through twelfth grade. She completed her basic coursework from a community college before transferring to a four-year university in Alabama. Ashley has completed her Bachelor's and Master's degrees in Elementary Education from two different four-year universities in Alabama.

## Jamie

Jamie is a white female who has taught in three different school districts and one university. She has twenty-three total years of experience with academic levels taught ranging from Pre-K to undergraduate college-level courses. She taught for four years as an assistant band director and choir director at her first school district. Her second school district is the same
district she is currently employed. She taught middle school and high school bands and traveled to three schools in the district. She left this school district to be the band director at a nearby school district, where she taught beginner band at two elementary schools and the seventh through the twelfth-grade band at the high school. Jamie moved back to her current district, where she teaches Kindergarten through Fourth-grade elementary music.

Jamie attended two different school districts during her childhood. She lived in a medium-sized city where she attended school through her eighth-grade year. She moved to a larger school district near the middle part of Alabama for her ninth through twelfth-grade years. Jamie attended her undergraduate degree in Music Education from a four-year university in Alabama. She completed her Master's in Administration from another four-year university in Alabama and has completed hours toward her Education Specialist (Ed. S.) degree.

## Emma

Emma is a white female who has taught in two different school districts for fourteen years, teaching Pre-K through twelfth-grade students. She worked as a band director for a rural school district for six years and as an elementary music teacher in her current job for eight years. Emma grew up in a small town near her current teaching district. She attended the same school district from Kindergarten through twelfth grade. She completed her Bachelor's and Master's in Music Education from the same four-year university in Alabama.

## Observation Results

Each participant was observed for three consecutive teaching days during the teacher's whole group instruction time to ensure all students receiving specialized services were present. Each observation occurred for a minimum of thirty minutes and a maximum of forty-five minutes, depending on the instruction schedule of the individual teacher. Artifacts and field notes
taken during the participant observations were analyzed to determine differences and similarities in teaching strategies used to assist ML students with English language skills within the whole group setting during the observation block. I analyzed and hand-coded the data per the framework analysis (Goldsmith, 2021), then created themes based on the data. For teaching strategies similarities and differences, three themes emerged. See Table 4 for themes and supporting codes.

## Table 4

Teaching Strategies Similarities and Differences Themes and Supporting Codes

| Supporting <br> Code | Climate/Physical <br> Learning Environment | Academic Learning | Language Opportunities |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 1 | Room Design | Curriculum | Read Aloud |
| 2 | Instruction Style | Teacher/Student Interactions | Peer Learning |
| 3 | Inclusion of Language/Culture | Gestures and Visual Cues | Academic/Social Language |
| 4 |  | Listening Skills | Shared Reading and Writing |
| 5 |  | Repetition/Skill Practice |  |
| 6 |  | Visuals/Manipulatives |  |
| 7 |  | Simple Songs |  |
| 8 | Digital Media |  |  |

## Teaching Strategies Similarities and Differences Theme 1:

## Climate and Physical Learning Environment

All participants created learning spaces that incorporated their personalities and the purpose of the classroom setting. The overall learning environment in each classroom setting demonstrated similarities and differences that promote all students' learning and socialization, including ML students. One theme emerged from the observation data demonstrating the climate and physical learning environment; three supporting codes reinforced this theme. See Table 5 for themes, supporting codes, and examples.

## Table 5

Teaching Strategies Similarities and Differences Theme 1:
Climate and Physical Learning Environment

| Participant <br> Examples | Supporting Code 1: Room Design | Supporting Code 2: Instruction Style | Supporting Code 3: Inclusion of Language/Culture |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Candace | Rolling tables and chairs (tables adjusted differently for each observation); large visuals; word fonts easy to read; students had clear view of screen/teacher; assigned seating (boys/girls different sides of table/chair formation); teacher to student praise and affirmation; students same opportunities to share work and ideas | Teacher to student and student to student interactions; teacher worked alongside students; teacher to student praise and affirmation; teacher modeling (Graphic Organizer, sentence starters, phonetic word breakdown); monitored student interactions (walked around the room during lessons and activities); consistent teacher feedback (redirecting, fixing mistakes, suggestions, praising); strategic student pairing; prompting questions; corrected student language; context of words in English and Spanish; learning targets; allows student to address ideas/concerns; students same opportunities to share work and ideas (called on by teacher and student volunteering) | Decorations; asking/ answering questions in Spanish and English; context of words in English and Spanish |
| Jamie | Students U-shape around screen/teacher; ML student close proximity to teacher; ML student near peer helper; colorful environment; warm lights; shag carpet; visuals easy to find/read; low lights to see visuals on screen; all students access to same materials; teacher to student praise and affirmation; students' same opportunities to share work and ideas (called on by teacher and student volunteering) | Teacher to student interactions; teacher monitoring during lesson/activities; prompting questions; allows student to address ideas/concerns; students same opportunities to share work and ideas (called on by teacher and student volunteering); consistent teacher feedback (redirecting, fixing mistakes, suggestions, praising); teacher modeling (playing instruments, posture, dynamics); learning targets; teacher to student praise and affirmation | Thanksgiving/ Christmas in various cultures |


| Emma | Assigned student seating; equity sticks; students' same opportunities to share work and ideas (called on by teacher and student volunteering); all students access to same materials; visuals easy to find/read; low lights to see visuals on screen; teacher to student praise and affirmation; upbeat music for transitions | Teacher to student interactions; teacher monitoring during lesson/ activities; prompting questions; allows student to address ideas/concerns; students same opportunities to share work and ideas (called on by teacher and student volunteering); consistent teacher feedback (redirecting, fixing mistakes, suggestions, praising); monitored student progress (walked around the room during lessons and activities); teacher modeling (playing instruments/rhythm patterns, posture, dynamics); learning targets; teacher to student praise and affirmation | Thanksgiving in various cultures |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Ashley | Two areas for whole group learning (tables and carpet); clearly defined centers; all students' access to same materials; students' same opportunities to share work and ideas (called on by teacher and student volunteering); visuals easy to find/read; low lights to see visuals on screen; assigned spots at tables and carpet; teacher to student praise and affirmation; teacher recognizes student achievement to group; calming music for transitions | Teacher to student and student to student interactions; teacher modeling (sentence starters, phonetic word breakdown, phonetic skill practice, reading sentences/book, expectations for activities); consistent teacher feedback (redirecting, fixing mistakes, suggestions, praising); monitored student interactions during lessons and activities; strategic student pairing; prompting questions; learning targets; allows student to address ideas/concerns; students same opportunities to share work and ideas (called on by teacher and student volunteering) | Connection of academic words/phrases/ ideas to student background knowledge and cultural awareness |
| Bethany | Two areas for whole group learning (tables and carpet); clearly defined centers; students' same opportunities to share work and ideas (called on by teacher and student volunteering); all students access to same materials; visuals easy to find/read; low lights to see visuals on screen; assigned spots at tables and carpet; teacher to student praise and affirmation; teacher recognizes student achievement to group; sang class song for transition | Teacher to student and student to student interactions; teacher modeling (sentence starters, phonetic word breakdown, phonetic skill practice, reading sentences/book, expectations for activities); consistent teacher feedback (redirecting, fixing mistakes, suggestions, praising); monitored student interactions during lessons and activities; strategic student pairing; prompting questions; learning targets; allows student to address ideas/concerns; students same opportunities to share work and ideas (called on by teacher and student volunteering) | Connection of academic words/phrases/ ideas to student background knowledge and cultural awareness |

Each participant created a physical environment promoting academic learning and child safety. Jamie had warm lights and lamps that helped to create a positive atmosphere and a feeling of ease. She had fun shag carpets and colorful posters with quotes around her room. She placed her desk in the front of the classroom, and students sat in a U-shaped formation, allowing everyone to see and hear the teacher. Emma assigned seats on the floor and utilized her countertops to display materials used in music class. Materials included supply boxes for students, instruments, and cleaning supplies for recorders. She had a low light setting for the entirety of each observation, creating a calming environment for students. The low light classroom setting made projected visuals on the screen brighter, helping students to better see each visual during the lesson.

Bethany's classroom environment had strategically designed centers arranged in her room that promoted the overall purpose of that center. The reading center had a carpet with chairs and cushions beside the bookshelf. The Smart Board area had a carpet with manipulatives to be used by the students and teachers during various activities.

Ashley had a painted chair next to the reading block's bookshelf. Like Bethany, she had a reading corner with a carpet and seats for the students. Ashley also played calming music for the transition between activities. Both Bethany and Ashley had tables instead of desks for student learning. Ashley assigned four to five students to sit at each table, two students on each side of the table and a person on the end. Bethany had long tables set up in L-shaped formations, with students on both sides of each L-shaped table setting. Each formation allowed students to work academically and socialize with one another when given the opportunity.

All five participants decorated walls with visuals used as resources. Jamie used the dynamic posters around her screen as references during her lessons. Emma had recorder
reference posters directly above her screen that third and fourth-grade students could use for help with the recorder instrument. Candace had decorations that promoted the various cultures of the students she taught. Bethany and Ashley had resource posters of math and reading academic vocabulary that could easily be accessed. All five participants displayed learning targets for each lesson and referred back to them throughout the observations.

Each participant strategically assigned seats for all students in the classroom. Bethany, Ashley, and Candace used different seating charts for different lessons and activities. Bethany and Ashley utilized a carpet seating arrangement for one part of the observation and a table seating arrangement for other parts. Candace utilized tables and chairs with wheels that could easily be arranged for different activities and grade levels. She had tables in the middle with chairs on the outside for two observations and tables on the outside with chairs in the middle for another observation. She also arranged for girls to be grouped on one side of the seating arrangement and boys to be grouped on the other.

Ashley and Bethany also strategically placed their ML students with specific people, depending on the activity. Ashley wanted her ML students to be able to peer share for shapes and numbers for one observation, and she paired them with English-speaking students for the reading activities on the other observation days. For the carpet lessons and activities, Ashley sat ML students near other ML students but partnered them differently during "turn and talks" for peer learning purposes. Bethany strategically paired her students similar to Ashley. Bethany allowed her ML students to sit beside other ML students on the carpet for each of her lessons, but she paired them for peer conversations with English-speaking partners.

Emma gave each student an assigned spot on the floor in her classroom. Each participant observation only had one ML student present during the whole group observation. Each student
had a direct view of the teacher, the screen, and other students, but the ML students did not have other students who spoke the same language in the whole group setting to help them if needed. Emma did utilize her classroom space and promoted transitions with creative, upbeat music. Jamie strategically placed her ML students directly in front of her desk and the screen. She tried to place a student next to her ML students that spoke the same language as the ML, but sometimes this was not possible. Students did not transition in Jamie's classroom as much as in the other classrooms, but she tried to allow them time to move and socialize between activities.

Each classroom promoted an overall sense of inclusion. All students received the same supplies for each activity in the lessons and were given opportunities to share their knowledge and mindsets. All five participants utilized their screens and projectors so students could clearly see the visuals and content being taught. The participants sat or stood where students could see and hear them at all times and walked around observing student progress during certain parts of each observation. Jamie, Bethany, and Ashley pointed to students to answer academic questions out loud to the whole group. Each participant asked different students to answer questions, trying not to call on the same students each time. Emma used equity sticks in all three observations when asking the question of the day. Numbers were written on the sticks, and the student sitting on that number answered the question. Jamie would allow students to raise their hands to answer questions and pick on more than one student to answer a question, giving different student points of view. Candace presented questions to her classes, but she asked in English and Spanish, incorporating the language of her ML students.

The participants used varying strategies during the observations that allowed students to answer questions. All five participants asked prompting questions to the whole group and called on students randomly to answer questions. They also used prompting questions to access
previous knowledge or the context of a topic. This type of questioning can also be used to allow students to make connections on their own about the material rather than the teacher telling them the correct answer.

Ashley used this strategy when reading the Clifford book about Thanksgiving. She read a phrase or line and then asked the group, "What does $\qquad$ mean?" or "Why did $\qquad$ say that?" Candace frequently asked what English words or phrases meant in both English and Spanish. Bethany asked students about the definition of academic vocabulary clues and gave them context clues when needed. Emma asked prompting questions about note names on the treble clef staff. She pointed and said, "Is this a line or a space?" Similarly, Jamie pointed to phrases in the Christmas songs and asked, "Now, what did we say this meant last week?"

Each teacher demonstrated a different teaching style, depending on the content taught. All five used a teacher-led teaching approach, where the teacher interaction consisted of the teacher doing most of the teaching while the students followed along in the learning process. Each participant utilized whole-group questioning, asking a question to the entire group and allowing them to answer. Bethany, Ashley, and Candace utilized student-to-student interaction more than Jamie and Emma throughout their lessons. In student-to-student interaction, the teacher allowed the students to learn from each other about academic content. Jamie and Emma used teacher-to-student interaction to teach the content and observe the student's recall throughout the lessons. Very little student-to-student learning occurred in Jamie and Emma's classroom observations, but this does not indicate zero learning by the students.

The critical similarity between the all participants' teaching styles was their monitoring of student learning. Each used their learning targets and directed students to those targets throughout the lessons. Candace was the participant who utilized her learning target the most,
reminding the students to refer to it throughout the various activities. Also, all five participants monitored their students during each activity in the lessons. Ashley and Bethany redirected students who were socializing during student-to-student activities. In addition, they helped clarify misunderstood directions and redirect the students to complete the activity.

Candace was the participant who included ML student language and culture the most. She asked questions in both English and Spanish (the primary language of all the ML students during the participant observations) and allowed them to answer questions in either or both languages. When reading a story or directions, Candace asked the students to give the Spanish word for an English word and vice versa. She also taught a lesson to a group of students utilizing breakfast food in Guatemala and the comparison to American breakfast food.

All five participants utilized modeling in each participant observation. Modeling allows the teacher to show the students how to perform a skill or task. Jamie and Emma used modeling when demonstrating how to play the recorder. Both teachers showed students how to hold the recorder and play each note. After each modeling moment, Jamie and Emma then asked the students to copy them. They would continue this modeling strategy for finger placements on the recorder and different rhythm patterns on each note. With modeling, Jamie and Emma fixed incorrect playing and modeled the correct behavior again before moving to the next part of the lesson. Emma also modeled how to play ostinato patterns using clapping, rhythm sticks, and instruments. Bethany and Candace modeled sentence starters for their students. They demonstrated how to answer a question to the whole group or in peer opportunities. For example, Bethany wanted her students to discuss what they heard in the light and sound video with a partner. She said to the class, "Say to your partner, 'I heard __..' Once you have told your partner what you heard in the video, let them tell you what they heard." Candace demonstrated how to
start a sentence for the graphic organizer students were creating. She showed the class how to start their first sentence. "In case of a fire,... OR In case of an intruder..."

Modeling was seen in each observation, but it was used differently depending on the content taught. Jamie and Emma used modeling when demonstrating how to correctly play instruments. Jamie also modeled how to sing a phrase or lyric in a song correctly. She spoke the phrase and then asked the students to repeat it. Similarly, Bethany and Ashley gave the correct sounds of letters in a word, emphasizing the sounds of each letter in a word. They then had students repeat the sounds back to them. Bethany also said a vocabulary word and then said to the students, "All right, say it with me this time." She modeled the word and then observed as the students said it back to her. This occurred with many academic vocabulary words in the lesson about the academic vocabulary word fantasy. Candace modeled completing the graphic organizer by displaying the visual through her projector. She also modeled the correct pronunciation of English words when an ML student did not phonate the word's sounds correctly.

All five participants used modeling by reading a piece of text during the observation. Candace, Ashley, and Bethany used this strategy more frequently. Bethany read a decodable to the group as they tracked along with their fingers on their text copy. She stopped occasionally, asked prompting questions about that part of the story, then had the students repeat the sentence with her. Ashley read a book about a school bus. She read some sentences with inflection in her voice to demonstrate a particular emotion. Students then copied the exact inflection used with the word or phrase. Candace read a story about breakfast. Like Bethany, she asked prompting questions and then had students repeat a sentence back to her. Emma and Jamie read passages less often, but their modeling was geared toward hands-on instrumentation. Jamie did model lyrics of songs and corrected and then emphasized problem areas.

All five participants used praise and affirmation during participant observations. Jamie praised one of her music classes for their singing techniques. Emma praised one of the students for their behavior during the lesson. Candace applauded and affirmed that a student made a connection between the English and Spanish translation of a word. Ashley recognized all the students in her class who had achieved a reading milestone. Bethany praised a student during the math block for his "genius" way of showing his work on a math equation. She then displayed his work on the screen and allowed him to share his steps with the group.

I observed a few apparent differences in the overall climate and physical learning environment. Each participant had to have one ML student present during the observation, and all five participants worked for the same school district, in the same state. Each participant had a different number of ML students present during the observations. Jamie and Emma had only one ML student receiving language services present during each participant observation. Also, Emma had no other student that spoke the same language as her ML student to serve as a peer helper. Jamie had bilingual students who could sit with her ML student to translate or clarify material when needed. Ashley and Bethany had multiple ML students in their classrooms and bilingual students who could act as peer helpers when needed. Candace had all ML students who received language services because she is one of two people at her school campus providing language services.

Another essential learning environment difference was the whole group number of students in each setting and the time the participant sees these students each week. Candace had the least number of students during the whole group observations, ranging from two to nine students. Emma, Jamie, Bethany, and Ashley each had approximately twenty students during each whole group observation. Candace utilized more one-on-one interactions with her students
because of the class size compared to the other four participants. Ashley, Bethany, and Candace see each of their students daily, whereas Jamie and Emma see their students once a week for forty-five minutes.

Another notable difference was the frequency of specific strategies seen by the participants. Each individual utilized prompting questions. Candace, Ashley, and Bethany used this strategy the most because of the lessons and activities in each lesson. Each one of these participants taught lessons heavy with academic vocabulary in reading and math. Some of this vocabulary was new, and some was content taught in previous lessons. Jamie and Emma taught new vocabulary, but the vocabulary observed in each observation connected to something that must be played in music. Emma taught the definition of ostinato then the students practiced this academic skill continuously throughout the lesson. She used more prompting questions before teaching the term, then used the rest of the class time to demonstrate and allow the students to practice. Jamie and Emma did take more time during their lessons to review notes and other elements of music before teaching new content. Bethany and Ashley used prompting questions as a "check-in" during a lesson or activity to observe if the students understood and to clarify any confusion.

Modeling was another strategy that was used differently for each observation. Emma and Jamie used modeling to demonstrate playing instruments, a hands-on item. Ashley, Bethany, and Candace were not demonstrating how to play an instrument but were demonstrating expectations for academic and social opportunities. Candace used modeling to demonstrate the context of words in her activities, making connections between the English and Spanish languages when possible. Bethany and Ashley utilized modeling when phonating letter sounds. Throughout the
observation, I noticed both participants participating in the letter sound activities and demonstrating tracking of words in directions or sentences on the screen.

The final difference in the overall climate and physical learning environment was the teaching approaches presented by the participants. Ashley, Bethany, and Candace utilized student-to-student learning more than Emma and Jamie. Student-to-student learning occurred through "turn and talks," "number talks," and "neighbor talks." Jamie did use "neighbor talks" to allow students to discuss the vocabulary word feasting with the person directly beside them, but she quickly brought the classroom attention back to the lesson. Emma allowed students to socialize while singing and collecting their materials but did not use a peer learning strategy during the observations. Students were learning with each other and from each other during their music time. An example included students looking at the person next to them, checking to see the correct finger placement on the recorder or the correct posture when playing handheld instruments.

## Teaching Strategies Similarities and Differences Theme 2: Academic Learning

Participants all created an environment filled with academic learning. The academic learning taking place in each classroom setting during each participant observation expressed similarities and differences. A theme emerged from the observation data demonstrating academic learning, and eight supporting codes reinforced this theme. See Table 6 and 7 for themes, supporting codes, and examples.

## Table 6

Teaching Strategies Similarities and Differences Theme 2: Academic Learning

| Participant <br> Examples | Supporting Code 1: Curriculum | Supporting Code 2: Teacher/Student Interactions | Supporting Code 3: Gestures/Visual Cues | Supporting Code 4: <br> Listening Skills |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Candace | ELL <br> Curriculum Books/Wor kbooks | Teacher-to-student and student-tostudent interactions; teacher worked alongside students; monitored student interactions (walked around the room during lessons and activities); teacher to student praise and affirmation; consistent teacher feedback (redirecting, fixing mistakes, suggestions, praising); teacher modeling; explanation of academic vocabulary; prompting questions; reiteration of academic context; teacher used Spanish and English; peer learning opportunities; teacher shared student work | Points/tracks with finger words when reading on screen/learning target; circles words/phrases; pointed to pictures/visuals | Rang bell for attention getter; teacher modelstudent repeat; English pronunciation of words; Spanish/English meaning of Words; |
| Jamie | Quaver <br> Music; <br> self- <br> created <br> content; <br> Music K-8 | Teacher-to-student interaction; few peer learning opportunities; teacher to student praise and affirmation; consistent teacher feedback (redirecting, fixing mistakes, suggestions, praising); teacher modeling; explanation of academic vocabulary; prompting questions; reiteration of academic context | Verbal and physical cues when playing instruments; plays instrument with one hand and tracks music with other hand; tracks lyrics; hand/arm gestures for dynamics; circles/highlights problem spots in music; points/references posters; references learning target; recorder posture; Roll Call (solfège) | Activity loud/soft sounds; Roll Call (solfège); shush claps |
| Emma | Quaver <br> Music; <br> Self- <br> created <br> content; <br> Music K-8 | Teacher-to-student interaction; teacher to student praise and affirmation; monitored student interactions (walked around the room during lessons and activities); consistent teacher feedback (redirecting, fixing mistakes, suggestions, praising); teacher modeling; explanation of academic vocabulary; prompting questions; reiteration of academic context | Demonstrates ostinato with clapping and rhythm sticks; verbal and physical cues when playing instruments; plays instrument with one hand and tracks music with other hand; tracks words/music on screen with finger; circles/highlights problem spots in music; points/references posters; references learning target; recorder posture; | Call and <br> Response (welcome to music, rhythm stick activity, ostinato); Call and Response to notes on recorder with various note and rhythm patterns; listened to teacher demo of recorder song |


| Ashley | Reading and Math curriculum guides | Teacher-to-student and student-tostudent interactions; teacher to student praise and affirmation; consistent teacher feedback (redirecting, fixing mistakes, suggestions, praising); teacher modeling; explanation of academic vocabulary; prompting questions; reiteration of academic context; peer learning opportunities; teacher/students shared student work | Points/tracks with finger words when reading on screen/learning target; circles/underlines words/phrases; pointed to pictures/visuals; hands to sound out words and letter sounds; zig-zag demonstration; dance moves that mimic words in simple songs; number talk hand signs; students/teacher trace letters/shapes in air | Thumbs up/down expectations; T-sound activity; bus story facts activity |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Bethany | Reading and Math curriculum guides | Teacher-to-student and student-tostudent interactions; monitored student interactions (walked around the room during lessons and activities); teacher to student praise and affirmation; consistent teacher feedback (redirecting, fixing mistakes, suggestions, praising); teacher modeling; explanation of academic vocabulary; prompting questions; reiteration of academic context; peer learning opportunities; teacher/students shared student work | Points/tracks with finger words when reading on screen/learning target; circles/underlines words/phrases; pointed to pictures/visuals; hands to sound out words and letter sounds (choppers, skywrite); body movement to mimic sound (ch); clap out syllables | Give me 5; teacher asked question before reading text; students track words with finger while teacher reads text |

## Table 7

Teaching Strategies Similarities and Differences Theme 2: Academic Learning

| Participant | Supporting Code 5: <br> Repetition/Skill Practice | Supporting Code 6: <br> Visuals/Manipulatives | Supporting Code 7: <br> Simple Songs | Supporting Code 8: <br> Digital Media |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Candace | Teacher model-student | Learning target; visuals of | NA | Google Translate |
|  | repeat; steps during | content for |  |  |
|  | activities consistent; | lesson/activities; large <br> teacher/students read | paper to write on; graphic <br> organizers; anchor charts; |  |
|  | content multiple times; | student dry erase boards <br> referred back to learning <br> and markers; index cards; <br> directions/materials |  |  |
|  | target | projected on screen |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |


| Jamie | Reading/emphasizing difficult lyrics; loud/soft activity; repetition of academic vocabulary; practicing music after corrections; reading music week to week; teacher modeling (I do, you do); Roll Call (solfège); shush claps; referred back to learning target | Learning target, visuals on screen (songs, lyrics, notations, activities, video clips); dynamic posters; recorders | Jingle Bells, <br> Rudolph the Red <br> Nose Reindeer, We <br> Wish You a Merry <br> Christmas, Turkey <br> Bones, Thankful <br> for the USA, <br> Monster Attack, <br> Forte/Piano | All Simple Songs had lyrics on screen or karaoke style wording; closed captioning for commentary of John Williams clip; recorder warm-up had karaoke style notation. YouTube for recorder warm-up, Turkey Bones, Thankful for the USA, John Williams clip; Quaver curriculum for Monster attack and loud/soft activity |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Emma | Reading/emphasizing difficult notations; rhythm stick and ostinato activity; repeat sign/double bar line chant; repetition of academic vocabulary; note naming activity; practicing music after corrections; reading music week to week; teacher modeling (I do, you do); Musictheory.net for note naming (visual with note pitch) | Learning target, visuals on screen (songs, lyrics, notations, activities, video clips, content for lessons); dynamic posters; recorder posters; recorders; rhythm sticks; instruments | Welcome to Music, Turkey Tango, Fruit Rhythms, Ostinato SongQuaver, Hot Cross Buns-Quaver, My Recorder-Quaver, Clean-up SongYouTube | Quaver Curriculum songs contained closed captioning karaoke style lyrics (Welcome to Music, Hot Cross Buns, My Recorder), Clean-Up song (YouTube) and Turkey Tango (YouTube) had closed captioning karaoke style lyrics; <br> Musictheory.net for note naming (visual with note pitch) |
| Ashley | Sound recognition in words (sky write, listen for sound, over emphasis of word/ sound); strategies to reiterate academic concept (sky write, turn and talks, number talks); teacher modeling (I do, you do); academic vocabulary connection and context throughout lessons; songs to reinforce academic concept; referred back to learning target | Learning target; visuals of content for lesson/activities; letter Tt handheld visual; White board for drawing/writing; shape handheld visuals; dot cards; Thanksgiving book | Wheels on the Bus; Shape Song; Pumpkin Pie Song | YouTube (Wheels on the Bus; Shape Song; Pumpkin Pie Song) with karaoke style closed captioning; reading curriculum for Wheels on the Bus Book |
| Bethany | Sound recognition in words (sky write, listen for sound, over emphasis of word/sound); strategies to reiterate academic concept (sky write, turn and talks); teacher modeling (I do, you do); academic vocabulary connection and context throughout lessons; teacher/student repeat academic content multiple times; referred back to learning target | Learning target; visuals of content for lesson/activities; decodable book; math supplies for students (bears, teacher weight, pencil, paper, clipboard, worksheet); ten frame on White Board | Line Up Song | Light and Sound video (reading curriculum); math curriculum PowerPoint; Berdie the Bird "er" sound (reading curriculum) |

All five participants used the curriculum to guide the lessons and activities during the observations. Ashley and Bethany used grade level curriculum called Open Court for reading instruction and iReady Math for math instruction. Both curriculums provide teachers with materials for the students, script suggestions, digital software, visuals, and the context of the taught content. Bethany and Ashley used the teacher's curriculum guide as a tool and glanced at the hard-copy text guides if needed. The school district adopted Open Court as this academic year's new reading program. iReady Math has been utilized by the district prior to this academic school year, and teachers have continued to utilize the curriculum to teach students.

Candace utilizes various curriculum guides for her ML students, depending on the grade level and each ML student's language proficiency level(s). She used Finish Line for ELLs 2.0 for grades two and three, one for the second-grade ML students and the other for the third-grade ML students. She has a new group this year called the Newcomers class. Newcomer ML students are students who are new to the United States and new to the school. These ML students have the lowest language proficiency levels and receive a more specialized class to meet their language needs. Candace has created her curriculum for these students based on her professional knowledge and experience working with ML students. Because of this, she creates her lessons and activities based on the WIDA Standards each week and uses books and other resources for support. The original acronym WIDA was based on the three states involved in the original grant (Wisconsin, Delaware, and Arkansas). WIDA has broadened to represent forty-one other states, territories, federal agencies, and international schools (Board of Regents of the University of Wisconsin System, 2023).

Jamie and Emma use a curriculum bought by the district called Quaver Music. Quaver Music provides the participants with materials for the students, script suggestions, digital
software, activities, visuals, and content context. Jamie and Emma also use a resource called Music K-8 for different singing songs in their classroom. Jamie and Emma use Quaver Music and Music K-8 as guides and tools to aid student learning. They also utilize different tools and lessons they have created based on teaching experience and suggestions by other music educators to teach music content connected to state and national standards.

All five participants demonstrated positive interactions that promoted student learning with their students. Each participant used modeling to teach a skill or reinforce previously taught material. Participants also consistently provided students with feedback by redirecting or fixing mistakes, giving suggestions, and praising correct answers and positive behavior. Participants observed academic progress and used prompting questions during lessons and activities.

Participants took time to teach academic vocabulary and its context, emphasizing and reiterating academic language throughout lessons and activities.

A notable difference in teacher interaction was seen in the observations. Candace worked alongside her students in her Newcomers class. She sat at the table with the students and modeled her task expectations during activities. She also completed the graphic organizer alongside the students during another observation and even became a partner to a student during a peer learning activity. Ashley and Bethany used a teacher-led approach to guide and teach the instruction to the students while monitoring student engagement in the process. Candace, Ashley, and Bethany also had more student-to-student interactions, where students were learning from each other and collaborating about their learning process. Jamie and Emma had little or no student-to-student partnering or interaction during the lessons. However, both participants participated in the teaching process by demonstrating, playing, and singing alongside their students during the participant observations. Candace also incorporated both Spanish and English
in asking and answering questions. She connected the context and background of English words to Spanish and vice versa.

Participants used gestures and visual cues throughout the observations and asked students to mimic their movements when applicable. All five participants tracked words with their fingers or hand in the learning targets and various texts. Participants pointed to essential words or sounds in words and circled or highlighted new or troubled areas. Candace physically gestured to the learning target throughout her lessons, pointing out important vocabulary to the students. She also circled essential directions or phrases on her graphic organizer for students to reference during activities. Each participant also gestured to visuals, pointing out specific features for the students to see. Jamie and Emma tracked notes in the music with their finger, often while they played an instrument with the other hand. Both participants gave verbal cues for music directions, including dynamics, rests, posture clues, and instrumentation. Jamie also used groupstyle gestures during class roll call. She sang "Where is $\qquad$ ?" in the solfège pattern sol, mi, sol, mi. Students would use the gestures for sol, mi, sol, mi and sing back, "Here I am." Each participant gestured to visuals displayed on their screens and other poster resources in the classroom.

Teacher and student gestures occurred while observing Ashley, Bethany, Emma, and Jamie. Ashley and Bethany used various hand techniques when practicing sounds in words. Ashley broke "broom" into two parts, "b" and "room." Students said the sound for "b" holding out one hand and then "room" with the other hand, finishing by clapping the one complete word in front of their body. She also directed them to demonstrate the sound of " Tt " by chopping one hand to the palm of the other. Ashley and the class also demonstrated how to write letters or
draw shapes by "skywriting," where students drew in the air with their fingers. Another group gesture was by sky drawing a "zig-zag."

Bethany utilized similar gestures to Ashley when sounding out letter sounds in words. She used the skywriting technique when reinforcing "-er" blends with the class and "touching the sounds" in words as another engagement reinforcer tool. Bethany also used hand gestures similar to Ashley's when breaking apart and putting together sounds in words. She referred to this technique as "choppers," where students would put their hands together and chop sounds in words. Bethany also used movement to mimic the blend "ch," putting her fist in the air and pulling it down while saying the "ch" sound.

Ashley and Jamie showed movements to words and phrases in simple songs. Ashley used songs found on YouTube that had a person demonstrating dance moves to mimic words. For example, one song talked about wheels on a bus, and students rotated their fists and hands around in a circle formation. Jamie demonstrated the meaning of various dynamics by showing a finger over the lip for a quiet dynamic and pumping her hands for a loud dynamic.

Listening skills, focus and target, were seen during each participant's observations. Candace rang a bell to signal that time was over for peer learning activities. Similarly, Jamie used "shush" echo claps to redirect the students back to her for directions. Bethany grabbed student attention by holding her hand high and asking students to "give her five." Bethany also used target listening to ask the students a question before reading a text. Students were to listen for the answer, and she would allow student response to the questions once the text reading was complete.

Bethany, Ashley, and Candace practiced focused listening by emphasizing specific letter sounds in words and asking students to repeat precisely how they phonated the sound. These
three participants also did this with academic vocabulary and phrases. Jamie and Emma performed a similar call-and-response listening technique to aid in target listening in their observations. Jamie sang the class roll using solfege and utilized activities for students to recognize loud versus quiet sounds. Emma sang call-and-response songs, played repeated patterns with instruments and rhythm sticks, and taught an ostinato pattern. Jamie and Emma played note patterns on their recorder and asked students to repeat the exact notes and rhythms.

The strategies seen to aid in listening skills also were used for repetition and skill practice. Each participant taught academic vocabulary and context using repetition in their lessons and activities to practice skills. All five participants modeled an expectation and asked the students to repeat the expectation. Examples included word or letter sounds being modeled and then repeated by the students, emphasis and repetition of academic vocabulary and context, referring back to learning targets, and using the same student activities (hand gestures, visuals, or manipulatives) to practice a skill.

Each participant used repetition to practice skills in order to scaffold new material. Participants observed their students, fixed mistakes, then repeat the skill or activity to reinforce corrections. Because Jamie and Emma teach the students once a week, both participants create lessons that review previously learned material and incorporate new material quickly. Both participants used activities that repeated the new vocabulary and skill by application. For example, Jamie used a listening activity with various visuals and sounds. Students had to identify if the object made a loud or soft sound. Emma taught ostinato, a repeated pattern of notes to one group. Jamie and Emma reviewed and reinforced recorder note names before and during the recorder lessons.

Ashley repeated and emphasized the "t" sound when teaching the letter "Tt." She overemphasized the sounds in words when reading a text. Bethany repeated words similarly to Ashley while making a point to reinforce connections between the text and student background knowledge. She read a phrase, "They yawned and went out." She then discussed it with the students, and they concluded that this meant they had fallen asleep. Other examples of repetition used by all five participants included consistent praise and affirmation to the students, reviewing directions and expectations for activities, and asking various prompting questions to a student or the class.

Each participant displayed and utilized their learning targets in their classrooms. Participants used various visuals for their lessons and activities. Bethany and Ashley used the software visuals provided by their curriculum guides in reading and math. They both used PowerPoints that had pictures and videos. Candace used her Elmo and projector to display the graphic organizer students worked on and the book used during her lesson. She also wrote English words on index cards and displayed the cards on an anchor chart. Candace utilized big sticky note papers to write emergency words discussed by the whole group. She then displayed these sticky note sheets in her room. She created her own PowerPoint visuals for her lessons based on the content and the curriculum guides. Each PowerPoint slide had visuals and text that were easy to see and read.

Bethany, Ashley, and Candace also utilized their dry-erase boards at the front of the room. Ashley wrote math vocabulary words to compare 3D and 2D shapes. She drew a zig-zag line as a reference for the students. Bethany used a ten frame on her whiteboard to demonstrate adding numbers. She wrote the numbers and equations in black ink and colored the circles in the frame in yellow and red, one color for each number in the equation. Candace used her dry-erase
board to display learning targets in black writing, and she underlined and circled essential words in the learning target with blue markers.

Ashley used handheld visuals during both reading and math lessons. She displayed a physical copy of the letter Tt while projecting the same visual on the screen. Ashley used handheld shape cards and dot cards for math and a hard copy of the Thanksgiving book she read to students.

Jamie and Emma utilized visual content through Quaver Music, Music K-8, YouTube, and personal Word or PowerPoint creations. Both participants displayed visuals of music, videos, and activities using their screens at the front of the room. Jamie had dynamic posters she referenced during one of her lessons, and she referred to the learning target written on a poster near her screen. Jamie and Emma displayed all music and visuals in activities in large print so that students could see and read. Emma displayed recorder posters above her screen to help third and fourth-grade students with recorder notes. Emma also used PowerPoint to teach all the content in her lessons, and each slide had large, easy-to-read visuals. Emma used a website called MusicTheory.net to practice note naming for the third-grade students. Students saw the note and matched the note to the correct letter name.

All participants used classroom manipulatives during the observations. Candace utilized index cards for students to write down English words and definitions. She had student notebooks where students documented words and definitions. For another group, Candace used personalsize dry-erase boards and markers in an activity for students to brainstorm. Students then used a graphic organizer to create sentences for a paragraph.

Emma and Jamie used instruments as manipulatives. Both participants used recorders for third-grade students. Emma used rhythm sticks for her first-grade classes to reinforce patterns
and teach ostinato rhythms. She transitioned to classroom percussion instruments to reinforce ostinato patterns in a song.

Bethany used manipulatives in her reading and math lessons. All students used a reading decodable to track along while Bethany read a passage. Students also used a worksheet during whole-group math. Students and Bethany used manipulatives during the math activity, including counting bears, a weight scale, and individual ten frames.

Jamie and Emma used simple songs to reinforce concepts more than the other participants. Jamie taught songs that reinforced academic vocabulary. She used the songs Monster Attack and Forte Piano to introduce and reinforce dynamics in music. Jamie also used songs during the observation to incorporate the season. She sang Thankful for the USA to discuss the vocabulary term "grateful." Students also sang through a Thanksgiving song and Christmas tunes for a concert. Emma sang a call-and-response song at the beginning of music class and multiple songs throughout the lesson to reinforce elements of music. Students sang and danced to Turkey Tango to introduce students to the ostinato pattern. After teaching ostinato, Emma transitioned to the Austin Otto song from Quaver Music. Third-grade students played Hot Cross Buns to reinforce notes B, A, and G in a song. All grade levels sang a clean-up song before dismissing.

Ashley and Bethany also used simple songs as a teaching strategy. Ashley showed a song after each reading and math lesson to reinforce taught material and made connections to the discussed academic vocabulary. Students sang and danced to Wheels on the Bus after reading about a school bus and discussing academic vocabulary, and students sang a shapes song to reinforce the shapes they learned in math. After reading about Thanksgiving, students sang about pumpkin pie and other foods eaten at American Thanksgiving. Bethany sang a lineup song for
students to clean up materials and line up to leave the room. Candace was the only participant that simple songs were not seen during any observation.

Digital media was used in each classroom to assist all students. Candace and her Newcomer students utilized Google Translate to find the definition of English words. She made her PowerPoints for her other lessons, using the curriculum guides for each grade level. Ashley, Jamie, and Emma used closed captioning or karaoke style that highlighted text in their classrooms' simple songs. Ashley used YouTube as a resource and turned on the closed captioning option for students to see the words. The other videos that Ashley used through YouTube already had highlighted text embedded in the video while students sang and danced.

Music used by Emma had highlighted text, whether through YouTube or Quaver Music. Videos used to play recorder music during Emma's observation highlighted words and notes as students played. Emma also used note-naming practice from MusicTheory.net, where students saw the visual of the note and a sound played if the students named the note correctly.

Jamie turned on the closed captioning feature for commentary on a John Williams video, and she used YouTube to play a recorder warm-up where text and notes were highlighted as students played. The song lyrics through YouTube had closed captioning and highlighted text as students sang along. The lyrics for Christmas music were typed on a Word document, but Jamie tracked the words with her finger or computer mouse as students sang.

Bethany and Ashley used the digital media provided by the reading and math curriculums. Both participants used videos and software visuals during each lesson. Ashley used the short video provided by Open Court to teach and reinforce the letter "Tt." She used the same curriculum for the story "Wheels on the Bus," complete with a narrator reading the story and visuals for the students to see. Bethany used the light and sound video provided by Open Court
and the curriculum visuals for academic vocabulary sewn, bowed, and birdbath. Bethany used the PowerPoint provided by the math curriculum to teach the math lesson. Each slide matched the math problems on the student worksheet manipulatives.

## Teaching Strategies Similarities and Differences Theme 3: Language Opportunities

Participants all created a learning environment promoting language opportunities, especially for the ML student. Language opportunities observed in each classroom setting expressed similarities and differences. A theme emerged from the observation data demonstrating language opportunities, and four supporting codes reinforced this theme. See Table 8 for themes, supporting codes, and examples.

## Table 8

Teaching Strategies Similarities and Differences Theme 3: Language Opportunities

| Participant <br> Examples | Supporting Code 1: Read Alouds | Supporting Code 2: <br> Peer Learning | Supporting Code 3: <br> Academic/Social Language | Supporting Code 4: Shared Reading and Writing |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Candace | Teacher read LT, directions, and books aloud; students read book, answers aloud | Peer/Partner learning: one partner writes, the other talks, then switch; partners collaborate to create a sentence; students discuss academic ideas; students address ideas/concerns; students given opportunities to share work and ideas with peers and teacher | Teacher and students asked and answered questions in English and Spanish; academic vocabulary and context; collaborated with partner in English/Spanish to complete task; students address ideas/concerns; peer/partner learning; students given opportunities to share work and ideas with peers and teacher | Students share with group their partners ideas; students collaborate to create a sentence; teacher demonstrates student work; students take turns reading book out loud |
| Jamie | Teacher read song lyrics, directions, and learning target aloud | Turn and talk; ML student with peer helper | Academic vocabulary and context; reiteration of academic vocabulary; students answer prompting questions; students address ideas/concerns; students given opportunities to share work and ideas with peers and teacher; student turn and talks; students socialize with peers in transitions | NA |


| Emma | Teacher read song lyrics, directions, any words displayed on screen for lesson, and learning target aloud | NA | Academic vocabulary and context; reiteration of academic vocabulary; students answer prompting questions; students address ideas/concerns; students given opportunities to share work and ideas with peers and teacher; students socialize with peers in transitions | NA |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Ashley | Teacher reads learning target, directions, and text to book aloud; Wheels on the Bus book read aloud through computer | Turn and talks; student share to Whole Group | Academic vocabulary and context; reiteration of academic vocabulary; students answer prompting questions; students address ideas/concerns; students given opportunities to share work and ideas with peers and teacher; students discuss academic content with peers in turn and talks | NA |
| Bethany | Teacher reads learning target and all directions for activities in lesson; teacher reads book and decodable | Turn and talks; student share to whole group | Academic vocabulary and context; reiteration of academic vocabulary; students answer prompting questions; students address ideas/concerns; students given opportunities to share work and ideas with peers and teacher; students discuss academic content with peers in turn and talks | Teacher displays student work and allows student to share their process to whole group |

Read-alouds are used in teaching to allow students to hear a text being read while individually practicing reading the same text. Each participant read text during lessons and the learning target aloud. Ashley and Bethany read book passages or text in the curriculum guides for students to hear. Jamie and Emma read directions and song lyrics aloud. Candace was the only participant that asked students to read content aloud to the group. Candace and the two students in her newcomer class took turns reading out loud the passage in the book about breakfast food. During one observation, she allowed students to share out loud the sentences created by their partners during a peer learning activity.

Candace, Ashley, and Bethany utilized peer learning for students to engage in the learning process together. Peer learning is used to practice academic and social language simultaneously. During peer learning, students share their academic knowledge with another student using age-appropriate social skills. Ashley used peer learning when students talked to their partners about words that make the " Tt " sound and to describe how numbers were split on the dot cards in math. Bethany used peer learning for students to discuss the academic vocabulary word fantasy, sounds heard in the light and sound video, sharing "-er" words with each other, and solving math equations on the worksheets.

Candace utilized peer learning the most in her lessons. Students were partnered up to brainstorm sentences for the emergency activity. Students were allowed to speak in both English and Spanish, but sentences were written in English. Candace allowed students during another observation to discuss differences in pictures, comparing the visuals and verbalizing the differences in complete sentences.

Jamie used peer learning once to allow students to talk about the Thanksgiving term feasting. Students shared with a partner food they eat at Thanksgiving. The peer learning strategy was not seen during the observations in Emma's classroom, but students were learning from each other. Students were seen looking at each other when playing the recorder and the other classroom instruments during ostinato. Students who seemed off task became engaged in learning after matching peer behavior.

Peer learning aids in practicing the academic and social language, but participants practiced these languages in other ways. Candace asked and answered questions in English and Spanish while allowing students to do likewise. She allowed students in the Newcomers group to practice reading text aloud, helping students with difficult words or phrases. All participants
demonstrated academic vocabulary and context and asked the students to model this language. Participants repeated and reiterated vocabulary and content and recognized students for outstanding work while correcting those who made mistakes in communicating answers. Each participant used prompting questions and sentence starters, allowing students to share ideas and knowledge. Students were given opportunities to socialize in transitions and during peer learning activities.

An important observation was noticed in each classroom that promoted social and academic language opportunities. All five participants allowed the appropriate wait time, allowing students to answer a question without interruption. Each participant used questioning during whole group learning, where students were selected to answer a question during a lesson or activity. Participants allowed the student time to fully answer the question in their own words before redirecting or praising their answer, then selecting another student to share. Allowing the student to answer a question fully practices their language skills and gives the student courage to share out loud with the group.

Candace and Bethany shared student reading and writing during lessons. Candace allowed students to share their partner's sentences with the whole group after a peer learning activity. She also demonstrated student work in a PowerPoint as an example of a well-written sentence. Bethany displayed the math work of a student and allowed that student to share his process for solving the math problem with the class. Shared reading and writing were not seen during the other participant's observations.

## Interview Results

The overarching topic of the interview was the knowledge and skills acquired to assist ML students with English language skills. Questions in the interview pertained to the
participant's personal background (where they are from, how they were raised), their education (certificates and degrees), specific training geared toward working with ML students, years of experience teaching, and current Professional Development and resources provided by the school district to assist ML students with English language skills. See Appendix A for the interview protocol for each participant. I analyzed and hand-coded the data per the framework analysis (Goldsmith, 2021), then created themes based on the data. For education, two themes emerged. For career, three themes emerged. For the schoolwide climate, one theme emerged. See Table 9, Table 10, and Table 11 for themes and supporting codes. I used member-checking feedback for the interview data analysis process. Participants received copies of transcripts and data analysis notes. One participant requested corrections to her interview transcripts. None of the other participants asked for corrections, edits, or additions.

Table 9

Education Themes and Supporting Codes

| Supporting Code | Pre-Career Experiences with MLs | Pre-Career Education Experiences with MLs |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 1 | Childhood Communities | Interactions with MLs on College Campus |
| 2 | P-12 Schools Attended | Pre-Service Training/Courses for Strategies <br> Working with ML Students |
| 3 | Language Courses in P-12 |  |
| 4 | Interactions with ML Students |  |

## Table 10

## Career Themes and Supporting Codes

| Supporting Code | Classroom Experiences <br> with MLs | Training/PD on Teaching <br> Strategies for MLs | Current Classroom <br> with MLs |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 1 | Districts/Schools Employed | Training/PD <br> Provided by Districts | Whole Group <br> Setting |
| 2 | Different ML Experiences | Current Trainings/PDs | Time Teaching <br> ML students |
| 3 |  | Outside District Trainings/ <br> Certifications Opportunities | Utilized Teaching <br> Strategies |

## Table 11

Schoolwide Environment Theme and Supporting Codes

| Supporting Code | Collaboration with Colleagues |
| :--- | :--- |
| 1 | Collaboration with ESL Teacher(s) |
| 2 | Collaboration with Other Teachers (Specials) |

## Education Theme 1: Pre-Career Experience with MLs

Participants were asked about their background education. Two participants, Ashley and Emma, used the term "rural" when describing their hometown. One participant detailed that the community she classified as home was "less than 10 miles away" from where she attended her elementary and high school. These two participants also described their community and school as not having a diverse population of people from different ethnicities. Both participants used the term "predominantly white" when describing enrollment in their schools.

Two other participants, Bethany and Jamie, had a change in school districts during their childhood. Bethany went from a lower economic school district with fewer resources to a school district that had more opportunities to expand her education. She described the first school district she attended as having a "much smaller population" when referring to student enrollment
and the second district as a "much larger school." However, both school districts had very few people that would be considered different in ethnicity and demographics. Bethany explained that she only remembers one student who spoke Spanish, but "she was very fluent in English."

Jamie was enrolled in two different school districts during her childhood and had a different view of the schools in each district. She explains that the demographics of the schools she attended through her eighth-grade school year were "primarily Caucasian" with "very few EL [English Learner] ML [Multilingual Learner] learners" at the schools. She saw a better mix of demographics when she enrolled at a larger school district in the middle of Alabama. She described this school district as "having a better mix of demographics" with a "mix of backgrounds, and different ethnicities, and more EL students in that environment." Jamie explained that though this environment allowed her to interact with other students from different backgrounds, "fewer than five percent" of the school-wide population were considered ML students.

One participant, Candace, went to school in Guatemala, where she was exposed to different languages through her coursework. She explained that her parents "valued education" and wanted to give her "the best educational opportunities." Her parents enrolled her in a school that would help her be proficient in German, English, and Spanish by the time she graduated high school. She described her language experience as "German was taught from K [Kindergarten] through twelve [th grade], and all my subjects were in German. English started in the fourth grade and went all the way through twelfth grade." Candace has the most experience with other languages in her pre-college and college experience of all five participants in this study.

Four participants described their home language growing up and now as English, and the only opportunity they received to learn another language before college was through language courses. Each participant recalled taking language courses for up to "two years" in middle or high school. Bethany, Emma, and Ashley took Spanish, while Jamie took French. These four participants could not recall if these courses were required but felt they were for their diploma track. These four participants also recalled having few interactions with people who spoke other languages while completing college courses for undergraduate and graduate studies. Participants recalled people in their classes who seemed to speak other languages but had few interactions with these individuals. Bethany was the only participant, besides Candace, who had an opportunity prior to her career as a teacher to work with ML students. One of her professors took her and other classmates to a Native American Indian Reservation where she tutored children in reading skills. She explained, "They were fluent in English, but they spoke a native language."

## Education Theme 2: Pre-Career Education Experiences with MLs

During their undergraduate years, Jamie and Emma participated in music ensembles but could only recall a few interactions with students who spoke other languages. Emma recalled interacting with one "foreign exchange" student, but the student seemed "pretty fluent in English." Bethany and Ashley could not recall extracurricular activities or clubs where they interacted with ML students.

Four participants also expressed their lack of pre-service training in strategies specifically focused on working with ML students. Ashley recalled reading about strategies in textbooks, recalling terms such as "differentiated" and "levels of academics." Bethany recalled her clinical and school experiences as being at schools "that did not have a big population of" MLs. She felt that strategies learned "could be tied" to working with ML students, but these strategies were not
solely focused on students who speak multiple languages. Emma expressed that none of the music courses she took or some of the education courses she took talked about teaching strategies in general. However, she felt that none of the education courses were "geared toward my specific classroom, and what I would be doing specifically with music students. It was more of a general education, general classroom type classes."

Jamie said that "several of my courses in undergrad did touch on EL students and strategies, and I had several placements and observations that gave me those opportunities." She did say that she could not recall a course that focused solely on teaching strategies to ML students. Her knowledge and skills teaching students that speak other languages came from her experience learning a new language. She called this experience "the difficulty level of learning a foreign language." She also contributes traveling with her husband as being beneficial to understanding languages. Jamie's husband knows some "German and Danish, and a little bit of Chinese for his work." Her knowledge of cultures traveled to for his job "goes a long way when you're trying to build relationships with businesses and communities."

Candace is the only participant who took courses in her degree programs that taught strategies for working with Multilingual students due to the nature and requirements of her specific degrees. However, she describes her experience as "one of the pioneer EL teachers in the state, as far as our state had never offered EL programs or degrees." Candace and twenty-nine other teachers in Alabama received a federal grant to be the "first EL cohort" at a four-year university in Alabama. She described the coursework as "challenging," and these courses taught her about "language acquisition, which is different from language learning." She describes the differences in that "language acquisition is a natural process that a lot of students go through," and "language learning is when you actually put forth effort to really learn about the grammar
rules." Candace "never thought about myself being an English Learner because I already learned my languages abroad." She explains that she was "really good at understanding language like the listening and the reading...I could even write really well." Candace struggled more with social interactions, referring to the social norms associated with the English language. "I learned proper English. So, I came here, and I didn't really understand your English." The courses that she took under the federal grant taught her about linguistics, the phonetic system of English, cross-cultural issues, and various strategies for working with ML students.

## Career Theme 1: Classroom Experience with MLs

Jamie has taught in three different school districts and one university. She described her first school district as having a "wide range of demographics" with "several EL students there," and students spoke in "every language you can imagine." This district had students "with several different dialects of Chinese and Mandarin-Chinese and Taiwanese...most of them already considered bilingual." In this district, she taught at one school and was the choir director and assistant band director. She traveled to three different schools at her next school district and saw "several EL students" throughout her day. The following school district had the least ML students, "less than five students the whole time" she was at the district. She taught at two elementary schools and a high school in her role with that district. She now teaches elementary music in one of the previous districts, and most ML students she teaches in her current position are Spanish speaking, with other home languages including Chinese and Hindi. Jamie currently teaches the ML students in a whole group music classroom with their peers once a week for forty-five minutes.

Emma has taught at two different school districts. She recalled that the only interaction with ML students at her first school district was with the occasional "foreign exchange student."

Emma remembered one particular student that spoke German whom she "may or may not" have taught in her band courses. She said she could not recall any other students who spoke multiple languages in this school district. Emma teaches "a very small percentage" of ML students at her current district, "around eight to ten" ML students total. She teaches these students music in a whole group setting with their peers for forty-five minutes once a week.

Bethany taught in two different school districts, with her internship being in a third district. She was at her first district for a year and three months of the following year before taking a job with her current school district. Bethany described the district where she completed her internship as having "a lot more parent involvement" with fewer "single-parent homes." She did not recall any ML students during her time with this district.

Bethany then took a full-time teaching position in a private school with "much smaller class sizes" and "the most parent involvement." She describes the students as "on or above grade level" and "very few low-income families." Some students received funds for enrollment through a scholarship program, but this program "had less than ten students in the whole school that qualified for that." She recalled one family of ML students; a sixth, seventh, and eighth grader. These three students were only at her school for a year before transferring to the district she is currently employed. Bethany also recalled, "several pre-K students and Kindergarten students that were EL [English learners]." She worked with a Spanish teacher and secretary who helped the ML students when necessary.

Bethany described her current teaching role as being at a "lower income school" with "lots of single-parent households" and "a much larger population here." She explains that her current school provides "more services for them [ML]," whereas the other schools did not have as many resources for ML students and their families. Bethany has four ML students in her
classroom. Three of these students receive services from an ESL teacher, and one does not receive any language services from an ESL teacher. She called these ML students who do not receive services "NON-PHLOTE" (Primary Home Language Other Than English) because "they do not qualify or they've tested out of" the language assistance services. Bethany teaches each ML student in whole group and small group-type settings within her classroom for most of the academic school day.

Ashley started her career filling a leave of absence in first grade at the school she completed her internship. She described this school as having "few and far between" when referring to ML students. She taught one ML student during her time with this district and would use strategies and techniques "picked up along the way" to work with this "small population" of MLs. Some strategies included "Google translate" and collaborating with teachers who previously taught this student.

Ashley has been a Kindergarten teacher in her current district for eight years, explaining that she has noticed a more significant population of ML students than in her previous educational experiences. She notes that now she has more "supports" and "someone helping you" with the education of her ML students in her classroom. She currently has six ML students, with three receiving language services. She explains, "Three tested out, and three did not." Like Bethany, Ashley teaches each ML student in whole group and small group-type settings within her classroom for most of the academic school day.

Candace's ESL teacher and resource role makes her experience different from the other four participants. Candace has taught in three different districts, but her main focus was working with students needing English language assistance. She began her career working at a private school using her Spanish and German secondary education degree, working with high school
students. She then was hired in a public-school district where she said they had "more of a diverse group of students." She began her teaching role in this district teaching Math and Spanish but later transitioned to EL Specialist when the district started "experiencing an influx of immigrant students." The school district wanted her to be a "second mom" to the ML students because she could "help them [the district] with the culture" and "with the education." She did not have the appropriate degree then but had an extensive "foreign language background."

Candace took a job with her current school district as an itinerant teacher serving nine schools at the time. The school district began hiring more language teachers as the number of ML enrollments increased. She has been the ESL teacher at her current school for eleven years, working with one other ESL teacher. Both teachers "divide up the grade levels kind of equally." Candace services students in second, third, and fourth grade. Her district allows her to create her schedule, but her schedule begins thirty days after the first day of school. "The first thirty days I have to spend doing a lot of assessing students, seeing where/if they need services, having IELP meetings." She explains, "My task is to provide English language development classes based on the WIDA standards." Her schedule is written where she pulls students, "level two and up," twice a week for language services based on their IELP, and she also goes in the mainstream classrooms to help individual students with specific subjects; a term she refers to as "push-in" because she helps these students in their classroom environment. Candace states,
"I would say fifty percent of my day is spent working on pull out settings working on WIDA standards and the other half of the time might be collaborating with teachers talking to teachers to see where I need to plug myself in."

Candace services a total of fifty-five to sixty students each week during the regular school day, and she teaches eleven third and fourth-grade students in an after-school program four days a week for approximately an hour and a half.

## Career Theme 2: Training/PD on Teaching Strategies for MLs

Candace is the participant who has the most Professional Development and training in teaching strategies working with ML students because of her job description. She recalls that the most beneficial experience was during the years of No Child Left Behind. Candace and her supervisor in the school district used the WIDA standards to create an improvement plan for schools because "our students [ML students] were not performing." The first year of professional development focused on the WIDA standards, and the second year focused on SIOP (Sheltered Instruction Observation Protocol) strategies for teachers "because we felt that teachers didn't just want to learn the theory." Candace and her supervisor trained teachers from each school in the district to be "mentors for their peers" on their school campus. She felt that the training had beneficial values noting that "the state came and did walk-throughs" in the classroom and noticed that "everybody was like so excited to see all that engagement from the students...it used to be like quiet classrooms, and no one would say anything. And all of the sudden you will see that kids could talk if given the opportunity to." Candace recalled that the ACCESS testing scores significantly increased that year once the training was complete. The ACCESS test measures student language proficiency in the four domains of English language development that include speaking, listening, reading, and writing.

Bethany and Ashley described having similar Professional Development and training opportunities within their district. Both teachers participate in SIOP training provided by their ESL teachers once a month. This training lasts forty-five minutes and gives teachers "different
strategies" and supports to help ML students in their classrooms. Ashley describes the training as "sitting down and really diving into" strategies for teaching content to ML students. The pieces of training also explain the "language targets" for ML students and how to incorporate those into lessons. Both Bethany and Ashley expressed that a brief overview of SIOP has been discussed with grade-level teachers in previous school years, but this year "is the heaviest training we've gotten." Both participants expressed that they have not participated in any other Professional Development or training outside of the school day and academic year for teaching strategies working with ML students other than training for the new reading curriculum adopted by the school district with "EL strategies in each section."

Jamie and Emma had different Professional Development and training for teaching strategies working with ML students. Jamie recalls attending an annual music educator conference in Alabama and seeing sessions on classroom strategies. However, she could not recall seeing anything specifically focused on working with ML students in the elementary music classroom.

Emma explains, "Most of the professional development that we do is not geared towards my classroom. Most of it is geared towards the general ed. classroom. I'm sure that there are strategies that I could take from that and manipulate them to use in my room." The only other training provided by her district for working with ML students is through an email sent by her ESL teacher in her school. The email contained "things that you could use with ELL [English Language Learners] students specifically." She does explain that much of the training provided by her school discusses ways to include and teach all students. She has received help with working with Special Education students that "would tie into working with the multilingual student."

## Career Theme 3: Current Classroom with MLs

One commonality that all five participants have is teaching ML students in a whole group classroom for a block of time. A whole group teaching format allows the teacher to work with all students in the classroom simultaneously. It allows the students to interact with one another and the teacher in a positive learning environment. The main difference with each participant is the content taught and the amount of time the students are with the teacher in the whole group setting. Also, each teacher has their own set of preferred teaching strategies when working with ML students.

Jamie and Emma both teach their ML students once a week for forty-five minutes. None of the ML students receiving language services are taken during their music time. Occasionally, ML students may not attend music class due to being absent or ACCESS testing.

Bethany and Ashley have students who receive language services. Ashley states that her ML students receiving language services are "pulled once, three times a week for...thirty to forty-five minutes." She continues, "One day might be math and working on language concepts of...counting in English." Other days may be focused on reading skills and social aspects of the English language and culture. The ESL teacher works on specific vocabulary that is beneficial to each student based on their academic progress. Bethany's ML students are "pulled once a week for thirty minutes in the morning and then thirty minutes in the afternoon." She explains that the ESL teacher will sometimes "come in and sit with those students" during whole group lessons to "listen to their interactions with other students, and how they're doing in the whole group setting." Candace teaches her classes for forty-five minutes each day, except for one class. Her Newcomer class is taught each day for an hour.

Each participant was asked about teaching strategies used in their classroom to teach ML students. Jamie talked about teaching recorders to her third and fourth-grade students. She explained that she teaches "whole group learning with rote" for the students to learn a new instrument. Jamie also feels that "proximity is very helpful." She believes this helps her observe the ML student's body language and mannerisms and can adjust her teaching accordingly. Jamie explains that being "positive" and "encouraging" helps the overall experience of the student when they enter her room and "making associations" between the English interpretations and concepts students already know in Spanish. Another helpful strategy Jamie uses is placing the ML student in a strategic spot in her classroom near someone who can translate for them or be a peer helper for the ML student.

Emma uses visuals and repetition the most in her classroom. She explains that she tries to give ML students "something they can look at and see and they're not just having to hear it." She uses repetition, explaining, "I repeat myself several times so that they keep hearing those same words." Emma does not use these strategies solely for her ML students. She explains the strategies she would use when working with ML students "a lot of times help the whole class." Candace reiterates this point by explaining, "EL differentiation is really not that different. Whatever you're going to do for them [ML students] is going to work for all students." Emma and Jamie both feel that observing student behavior is essential. Emma observes her ML students making sure they are "watching and listening," and they are "engaged" in the learning process.

Bethany and Ashley utilize visuals in their classrooms, especially when implementing academic vocabulary introduced by the newly adopted reading program. Ashley uses one specific strategy where she shows students a visual and the academic vocabulary together. Students listen to her explain the visual and its context, allowing her students to hear her
explanation while seeing the object simultaneously. Students will then take the knowledge taught and explain it to their peers. Bethany also uses this strategy, referring to the technique as "turn and talk." Ashley explains that using this strategy is "very beneficial" because "it's student-led," and "they [ML students] don't learn better from anybody else than the kids that they are around." Candace calls this student-led strategy "iPOTS" (Interactive Peer-to-Peer Oral Techniques), and says she is "strategic" when partnering students together. Another strategy Ashley uses is gestures with visuals in a strategy called the "alphabet arc," where students "pull down" letters to match specific sounds."

Emma and Ashley both talked about ML students knowing "more than they can express." Ashley explains, "They [ML students] know so much more than they can express to you." She believes it is up to the teacher "to figure out how can they express it [information]." Emma reiterates this: "They may not be able to express something in the same way as another child, but give them [ML student] a chance."

Bethany's teaching strategies are tied to one overarching theme: "getting to know your students." The mindset of "getting to know your students" means studying and "appreciating that culture," "getting to know their background," and knowing what English language experiences students are having when they leave school each day. Bethany explains this further by saying, "You know it's hard to close those gaps when they don't get anything else besides what's at school."

Candace and Bethany use "sentence starters" to model how a student can start the communication process with their peers. Candace promotes oral language because "it provides a safe environment for them [ML students] to make mistakes." She suggests creating activities using oral language "before you do any written or reading" because this establishes "background
knowledge." Building background knowledge is necessary "because if you don't connect it [academic vocabulary] to something that they already know, they are not going to be able to give you what you want." She uses many forms of visuals and modeling when working with ML students and demonstrates how to use technology when she cannot be physically present to help each student. She explains, "I tell my kids, 'you gotta be able to use a dictionary. Google translate, it's a great tool if you have a device." She models using this software and a physical dictionary copy for ACCESS testing.

Each teacher answered differently about how they acquired the knowledge and skills to work with ML students. Bethany says she implemented "recommendations" from other teachers and used strategies that "worked in the past for my EL students." Ashley recalled receiving strategies and information about her ML students from the ESL teacher and utilizing the current Professional Development with SIOP training. Jamie and Emma could not contribute any Professional Development to strategies for working with MLs in their classroom. Emma recalled being shown strategies she could incorporate for all her students, but not specifically for ML students. Candace uses her language background and experiences with her coursework in order to teach ML students daily.

## Schoolwide Environment Theme: Collaboration with Colleagues

All five participants expressed the benefits of all teachers in the school collaborating on teaching strategies for ML students. Ashley states that her "CPT [Common Planning Time] is usually dominated by different other things." She explains that she may meet with other teachers, "art and music," once a year to collaborate on lessons. She feels that "we could reach a lot more students" if all teachers could have time to share strategies and ideas, especially when working with ML students.

Bethany reiterates the benefits of collaborative discussions with other teachers who work with ML students in the school. She explains that the Specials (Art, Music, STEM, Library, and $\mathrm{PE})$ classrooms hear ML students "talk a lot more, whereas in reading and math they may not be comfortable to share out and talk." Bethany believes talking to the Specials teachers about "conversational skills" being utilized in their classrooms could be "very beneficial." Bethany and Ashley have more opportunities to collaborate with the ESL teacher about strategies for working with ML students. Both participants talk about communications with the ESL teacher about strategies for individual students and strategies learned in SIOP training.

Candace tries to find time to collaborate with each teacher in the school but finds it difficult to allot time to each teacher while "working with three grade levels." She does try to find time "at least once a week" to talk to each grade-level team. Candace has the occasional informal conversation with various teachers, answering questions about ML students. The only time Candace collaborates with non-mainstream, Specials teachers in the school is through email, informal conversations, or the occasional "Data and PD Days" provided by the district.

Emma and Jamie are given no time to collaborate with the ESL teacher in their schools. Emma states, "I'm kind of on my own unless I seek out a time to go meet with somebody [ESL or mainstream teachers]." She explains that she "never really sees" her ESL teacher, and the only communication regarding teaching strategies was through email. Jamie also does not have a designated time to collaborate with other teachers in the school and feels this collaboration would be beneficial for meeting the needs of all ML students, "especially if this is a new student."

## Chapter 5

## Discussion

This study aimed to compare evidence-based teaching strategies in the mainstream, ESL, and elementary music classrooms that assist Multilingual Learners (ML) in developing English language skills. I sought to uncover similarities and differences in strategies found in each participant's classroom and discover how each participant acquired the knowledge and skills to assist ML students with English language skills. I observed five participants for three consecutive teaching periods and collected field notes, artifacts, and other documents. Participants also participated in a semi-formal interview to address the knowledge and skills acquired to assist ML students with English language skills. Questions in the interview pertained to the participant's personal background, education, specific training geared toward working with ML students, years of experience teaching, and current Professional Development and resources provided by the school district to assist ML students with English language skills.

## Similarities and Differences in Evidence-based Teaching Strategies

My primary results for the observations concluded that each participant used strategies in their individual classrooms that assisted ML students with English language skills. One of the main differences was the frequency of the strategies and how they used each strategy to teach their individual content. Each participant created a positive learning environment that promoted student learning. Learning environments contained visually stimulating and welcoming decorations, including rugs, carpets, lights, posters, and bulletin boards. Seating arrangements in each participant's classroom varied, depending on the participant and the lesson or activity. The two mainstream classroom participants had assigned seats for students on the carpet and a different assigned seat for students at tables. The ESL participant had flexible seating
arrangements where she could change the tables and chairs depending on the group and activities embedded in the lessons. Both music participants had assigned seating where students stayed for the entirety of the whole group setting. One music participant, Emma, used floor seating, and the other, Jamie, used chair seating. All students in all classrooms were seated where they had a direct view of the participant and the screen for lessons.

Ashley and Bethany strategically placed their ML students with specific people depending on the activity within the lesson. Ashley wanted her ML students to be able to peer share for the math observation, and she paired them with English-speaking students for the reading activities on the other observation days. For the carpet lessons and activities, Ashley sat ML students near other ML students but partnered them differently during "turn and talks" for peer learning purposes. Bethany strategically paired her students, similar to Ashley. Bethany allowed her ML students to sit beside other ML students on the carpet for each of her lessons, but she paired them for peer conversations with English-speaking partners.

Emma and Jamie had only one ML student during the participant observations. Jamie placed her ML students close to her and the screen, and she always tried to place a bilingual student or peer helper near the ML student. Emma did not have other students who spoke the same language as her ML students, but she gave each ML student an assigned seat near the screen and the teaching area at the front of the classroom.

Each participant promoted inclusion in the classroom. All students were given the same supplies in the lessons and were given various opportunities to share their knowledge and learning. Participants asked questions before, during, and after the content was taught and used prompting questions to access prior knowledge of a topic and direct students toward self-driven conclusions. Questioning was directed to the whole group and individual students. Emma used
equity sticks to ask the question of the day, while others directly called on students to share conclusions and results out loud.

Participants demonstrated different teaching styles. All five participants used a teacherled approach to teach content and whole group questioning to assess progress in the lesson. Throughout their lessons, Bethany, Ashley, and Candace utilized student-to-student interaction more than Jamie and Emma. Jamie and Emma used teacher-to-student interaction to teach the content and observed the student's recall throughout the lessons. Minimal student-to-student learning was observed, but this does not indicate that students were not learning from each other.

Learning targets were used and displayed to direct student learning during each participant's lesson. Candace referred to her target more than the other participants, underlying and circling essential academic vocabulary in each target. Jamie referred to her target, emphasizing words important to the background knowledge taught in her music classroom.

Each participant monitored student progress throughout lessons, using prompting questions and observation to see if students understood the content correctly. Participants also corrected mistakes and redirected students to directions or expectations for an activity. Participants used modeling to demonstrate academic expectations for the students. Ashley, Bethany, and Candace modeled sentence starters and how to communicate with partners in peer learning activities. Ashley and Bethany modeled sounding out words using hand gestures and tracking words in a text. These three participants also modeled sounds in words. Emma and Jamie modeled playing instruments correctly and singing words or phrases in a song.

Participants used visuals in their lessons to assist students with learning content, vocabulary, and background context. Visuals included posters, learning targets, PowerPoints, pictures, simple songs, dry-erase boards, and large text. The text was written and highlighted in
different colors. Candace utilized this strategy to reiterate specific vocabulary in the learning target. Similarly, Emma used different colors to highlight notation phrases in the recorder song, breaking the recorder piece into scaffolded parts for students to practice.

One participant utilized the inclusion of ML student language the most. Candace asked and answered questions in both English and Spanish and allowed the students to do likewise. Candace discussed Spanish connections to English words and phrases in a story and compared cultural differences between Guatemalan and American foods. Students were allowed to participate in peer discussions in both English and Spanish, but Candace promoted connections between the languages during each observation.

All five participants used praise and affirmation during participant observations. Jamie praised one of her music classes for their singing techniques, and Emma praised one of the students for their behavior during the lesson. Candace applauded and affirmed that a student made a connection between the English and Spanish translation of a word. Ashley recognized all the students in her class who had achieved a reading milestone, while Bethany praised a student during the math block for his "genius" way of showing his work on a math equation. She then displayed his work on the screen and allowed him to share his steps with the group.

Participants created learning environments filled with academic learning. All five participants utilized a curriculum to guide the instruction. All curricula used by the participants could be linked to state and national standards. Learning targets in the participant's lessons were linked to the content being taught. Bethany and Ashley followed the teacher curriculum guides closely, and Candace did likewise, except for the Newcomers class. This class is new to the school, and Candace is using resources and supports to help the students meet the WIDA
standards. Jamie and Emma followed their curriculum resources while utilizing other supports to help teach content.

All participants used gestures and visual cues while teaching content. Gestures examples included tracking words with a finger or hand; pointing to pictures or other visuals; and body movement to mimic words, sounds, expectations, or context. In their lessons, Jamie and Emma used gestures and visual cues that gave directions for dynamics and the starting or stopping of sounds. Bethany and Ashley gave gestures and learning cues to break apart words and sounds associated with letters. Candace gave gestures similar to the other four participants that directed students to specific grammar concerns in English and directions for the task being performed.

Each participant promoted listening skills in different ways. Jamie, Candace, and Bethany used attention grabbers to direct focus back to the teacher from activities. Bethany practiced target listening by asking students questions about the text before reading. Bethany, Ashley, and Candace emphasized sounds in words and sound formations. Emma and Jamie used a call and response to sing and play instruments.

Like listening skills, participants used repetition and skill practice throughout lessons to emphasize and practice the content being taught. Each participant taught academic vocabulary and context using repetition in their lessons and activities to practice skills and scaffold new material. All five participants modeled an expectation and ask the students to repeat the expectation. Participants observed their students, fixed mistakes, then repeated the skill or activity to reinforce corrections.

Each participant used a manipulative to assist in learning content. Candace used handheld dry-erase boards, index cards, and books. Bethany used worksheets, decodable books, and math
supplies. Jamie and Emma used instruments. Ashley used books and handheld math cards, but students did not have personal manipulatives in their hands during the observations.

Ashley, Jamie, and Emma used simple songs in lessons to reinforce content and academic language. Bethany used a song to clean up and line up, and Candace used no simple songs during the observations. Jamie and Emma used simple songs the most, mainly because of the content they teach.

All five participants used digital media during the observations. Candace used Google Translate to help Newcomer students find the meaning of English words. Jamie and Emma used highlighted text and notation, and Jamie turned on closed captioning for a video clip through YouTube. Likewise, Ashley turned on the closed captioning feature to the simple songs used at the end of her reading and math lessons. Jamie displayed text to Christmas songs and highlighted text to songs sung through Quaver and YouTube. Most curriculums used by the participants already had highlighted text or closed captioning embedded into the visuals.

A notable difference in strategies used by the participants came during the activities. Candace was the only participant that allowed students to read text out loud in front of their peers. Candace, Ashley, and Bethany also utilized peer learning opportunities more than Jamie and Emma. Peer learning is a strategy that promotes students learning from one another while enhancing social and academic language. Peer learning allows students to discuss content and their learning process. Candace, Bethany, and Ashley used "turn and talks," allowing students to discuss a specific part of the lesson with their partners. Teachers monitored student communication and redirected conversations when needed. Jamie used this strategy once to discuss a Thanksgiving term, while peer learning was not observed in Emma's observations.

Participants promoted academic and social language opportunities through wait time, allowing students time to process and answer a question without interruption. Each participant used questioning during whole group learning, where students were selected to answer a question during a lesson or activity. Participants allowed the student time to fully answer the question in their own words before redirecting or praising their answer, then selecting another student to share. Allowing the student to answer a question fully practices their language skills and gives the student courage to share out loud with the group.

I noticed another difference during the observations involving shared student reading and writing. Candace allowed students to share their partner's sentences with the whole group after a peer learning activity. She also demonstrated student work in a PowerPoint as an example of a well-written sentence. Bethany displayed the math work of a student and allowed that student to share his process for solving the math problem with the class. Shared reading and writing were not seen during the other participant's observations.

## Similarities and Differences in Acquiring Skills and Knowledge to Assist ML Students with

## English Language Skills

My primary results for the interviews concluded that each participant used personal experience during their teaching career to discover strategies that assist ML students with English language skills. Differences in the lived experiences of each participant played a pivotal role in what strategies are used to teach ML students in each participant's classroom. The overarching conclusion is that each participant believes and understands that strategies that help and assist ML students with English language skills also help all classroom students succeed academically and socially. Three primary themes and supporting codes emerged from the interviews: (a) education; (b) career; and (c) schoolwide environment. I will discuss each of
these themes, and I will conclude this section with how I believe the results impact helping ML students with English language skills.

## Education

Each participant grew up in differing circumstances. Ashley and Emma described their hometown as "rural," and Bethany and Jamie moved schools during their childhood. Candace grew up in Guatemala but attended a school where she was exposed to languages in her coursework. Four participants described their home language growing up and now as English and the only opportunity they received to learn another language before college was through language courses. Participants recalled people in their classes who seemed to speak other languages but had few interactions with these individuals.

Undergraduate college years for four of the five participants were also similar. Four participants expressed their need for pre-service training in strategies specifically focused on working with ML students. These four participants also felt that classes or college campus experiences could have given more opportunities to interact with ML students. Candace was the only participant who took courses in her degree programs that taught strategies for working with Multilingual students due to the nature and requirements of her specific degrees. Because of the nature of her degree path, Candace had pre-career training and opportunity that prepared her for working with ML students versus the other participants.

## Career

The five participants currently work for the same school district, but they worked in more than one school district during their teaching careers. Candace and Jamie taught in three different school districts, while the other three participants taught in two districts. Bethany and Ashley expressed that their current school has more ML students than their other districts. Jamie
interacted with more ML students in one of her previous districts than in her current school. Emma interacts more with ML students in her current school than in her previous district. However, she teaches very few ML students compared to other music teachers in her district. Candace is the participant with the most experience working with ML students in every district she has been employed in because of the nature of her job.

A noticeable piece of information about the number of ML students at each school in the participant's district must be addressed. Bethany, Ashley, and Candace work in the same school in the district. This school has a higher population of ML students being serviced by the ESL teachers than the other two participants in the study. Emma and Jamie work at the other two elementary schools in the district, with Jamie's school serving more ML students than Emma's school. Because of this, Ashley and Bethany had more ML students at one time during a whole group setting than Emma and Jamie.

Another essential emergence came when discussing training and Professional Development (PD) with the participants. Ashley and Bethany receive SIOP training with the ESL teachers once a month. One of the ESL teachers and facilitators of this training is Candace. This training supports mainstream teachers in helping ML students in individual classrooms. It allows the teachers to discuss specific student language goals with the ESL teacher in real-time throughout the year. Other schools in the district could be doing similar training, but this one school is the only school known at the time to facilitate this specific training with their mainstream teachers. The SIOP training is also only being offered to mainstream teachers at Ashley and Bethany's school. Other teachers, including Specials teachers, had not received this specific training at the time this study was conducted.

Jamie and Emma had the least training for working with ML students in their classrooms. Emma expressed that most of her current Professional Development are focused on working with students in mainstream classrooms. Professional Developments are more geared toward teaching math and reading content. Emma recalls interactions with her ESL teacher being through email, and she discussed the ESL teacher sending articles and supports through email to the entire school.

All five participants teach ML students in their current classrooms and utilize a whole group teaching setting for academic content. The main difference with each participant is the content taught and the time the group is with the teacher in the whole group setting. Also, each teacher has their own set of preferred teaching strategies when working with ML students. Jamie and Emma teach their ML students once a week for forty-five minutes. None of the ML students receiving language services are taken during their music time. Occasionally, ML students may not attend music class due to being absent or ACCESS testing. Bethany and Ashley have students who receive language services weekly for thirty to forty-five minutes at a time, and the ESL teacher comes into the whole group setting from time to time to assist ML students in math and reading. Candace teaches her classes for forty-five minutes each day, except her Newcomer class is taught each day for an hour.

Each participant was asked about teaching strategies used in their classroom to teach ML students. Participant answers were extremely inciteful, considering many of these strategies were seen during the participant observations. Jamie felt that rote teaching and proximity were conducive when working with her ML students. She felt proximity allowed her to observe the behaviors and body language of the ML student during a lesson or activity. In each observation, Jamie placed this ML student in a specific spot near her and the screen and placed a peer helper
or bilingual student near the ML student. Jamie used rote when teaching concepts and took time to be positive and encouraging to students throughout her lessons.

Emma felt that her favorite strategies involved her visuals and use of repetition. Like Jamie, these strategies were evident during all three observations. Emma used visuals to teach and reinforce concepts, and she used a PowerPoint to stay organized and on task. Each slide contained easy-to-read text and pictures, and her slides scaffolded music vocabulary and concepts throughout her lessons. Emma felt that her strategies that assist ML students actually help the entire group.

Bethany and Ashley agree that peer learning is a great strategy, and both participants use this strategy to allow students to be social while discussing academic vocabulary simultaneously. Candace also finds this strategy beneficial but is very strategic when partnering students with one another. During one of her observations, she partnered herself with a student because she needed him to mimic vocabulary correctly before he could practice with peers.

Emma and Ashley talked about ML students "knowing more than they can express" and the teacher's role in giving these students chances to express their knowledge. Although Candace is an ESL teacher, she modeled a great strategy that could benefit any classroom. Candace allowed students to talk in both languages, and she tried to make connections between Spanish and English words and contexts.

Bethany's teaching mindset is centered around getting to know her students and appreciating their culture. Knowing your students, their backgrounds, home language, culture, beliefs, and family atmosphere is an entire teaching strategy itself. When a teacher gets to know the student as a whole, it establishes a relationship and helps the teacher to understand strengths and weaknesses academically and socially. This strategy is tied to the classroom climate and
promotes a positive learning environment for all students where they feel welcomed and included (Abril, 2003; Freeman et al., 2016; Shen \& Byfield, 2018; Soltero, 2011).

Each participant answered differently about how they acquired the knowledge and skills to work with ML students. Bethany uses teacher recommendations and past experiences that worked well to assist ML students with language skills. Ashley felt the SIOP training and interactions with the ESL teacher throughout her teaching career have been beneficial. Jamie and Emma could not contribute any PD to strategies for working with MLs in their classroom. Candace uses her language background and experiences with her coursework in order to teach ML students daily.

## Schoolwide Environment

All five participants expressed the benefits of all teachers in the school collaborating on teaching strategies for ML students. The reality is that schedules play a role in common planning time among teachers being allotted to mainstream classroom teachers planning together or with the ESL occasionally. The music teachers usually teach the mainstream classroom teacher's students while in the designated common planning time. The result is that all teachers who work with the ML students in the school are not allowed many opportunities to collaborate on the needs of the ML student. The only communications about the ML students being serviced in the school may occur through email or informal conversation in the hallway.

## Implications

This study found that teachers are utilizing various strategies to teach all students in the classroom setting, especially ML students. Evidence of teaching strategies was found in each teacher's observation and planning process. The interview results concluded that each participant used personal experiences during their teaching career to discover strategies that assist ML
students with English language skills. The participant's lived experiences played a crucial role in the strategies used to teach ML students in each participant's classroom. The overarching conclusion is that each participant believes and understands that strategies that help and assist ML students with English language skills also help all students in the classroom become successful students and individuals.

The unfortunate reality is that four participants acquired most of their strategies and skills to assist ML students through teaching experience rather than pre-service training or school PD. The two mainstream participants currently have training at their school, but the two music participants have little to no training. As previously acknowledged, strategies that help ML students academically and socially will help all students. A teaching strategy is a support that can be used in any classroom for any purpose. Schools would see academic growth if all teachers in a school were given similar training to the SIOP training provided to Ashley and Bethany. All five of these participants worked with ML students in their classrooms. Information provided in training like SIOP can give teachers more confidence to help ML students be successful in the classroom and school.

Having common planning time for all teachers who work with ML students in the school could be beneficial for helping each ML student grow academically and socially. This allotted time does not have to be every day or every week. However, time to speak with all teachers in the school working with a ML student could allow teachers to discuss strategies helpful when working with individual ML students. This time could help the ESL teacher discuss the language goals and standards for the individual ML student. If we as educators want to say that what we do benefits all children, we must make mindful decisions that benefit all children, especially our ML students.

Music educators need to be willing also to step out of our comfort zone to help with the overall success of the ML student. We may have to seek PD opportunities or the ESL teacher in our district or school. Conversations may need to be started with the classroom teacher to see the language progress of the individual ML student. Elements and strategies used in music can be helpful to ML students, but music educators can also learn from other classrooms how to assist ML students with language skills.

## Recommendations for Future Research

The literature has shown us strategies used in the classroom that can better assist ML students with language skills. An important reminder from this study is that a teaching strategy is a support that should not be departmentalized into specific classrooms. Strategies used in the music classroom can also be seen and used in the mainstream or ESL classroom and vice versa. Other problems continue to be that many teachers need more experience working with ML students before their first teaching career, and the number of ML students grows in schools across the United States each year. Continued research of related literature and interviews of teachers who work with ML students regularly throughout the school year will enable the development of an education plan that supports all teachers better to assist ML students and all students in the school in becoming successful.

I plan to follow up this study with an in-depth look at other teachers in schools with an increasing number of ML students serviced in the school. This current study is the beginning of future investigations to discover strategies used in various classrooms to assist ML students with language skills. Pre-service education programs are essential in providing future teachers with a foundation and confidence to work with ML students. I also believe that schools need to allot
time for all teachers to work together to discuss and implement individual ML students' language goals and plans.

## Conclusion

Educators want to give all students the best education and experience when entering the classroom. Music teachers have the opportunity to teach all students in a school, and they can establish relationships that last years. The education system accidentally departmentalizes strategies into classroom settings. However, a teaching strategy is a tool used to help students learn in any classroom. All teachers can learn strategies from one another that are beneficial for helping ML students with English language skills. Also, more training is needed on the preservice level and in school districts to give teachers tools and confidence to assist ML students better.

## Chapter 6

## Importance in Music Education,

## Recommendations, and Conclusions

This final chapter will connect why this study is essential for the future of music education and provide various recommendations for training helpful to future and current music educators who service ML students. This chapter will explain why training and professional developments are helpful while promoting schoolwide collaboration to benefit the overall success of ML students. I understand that each school district will have its own situation with many priorities to successfully facilitate learning during each academic year. Recommendations may need to be adjusted to fit the individual school climate.

## Importance in Music Education

ML students will continue to enroll in schools across the United States, and many of these students will enter a school with little to no English language skills. In the past, educators have departmentalized strategies used in the classroom based on the content taught. However, we can only say that what we do is all for our students if we are willing to help ML students entering our music classrooms meet their language goals. Figure 1 shows my view of teaching strategies before implementing this study. This illustration shows the three different classrooms with similar strategies used in each classroom, but each strategy is departmentalized into the designated classroom setting. After observing different classrooms, I discovered that strategies were the same in each classroom. The difference was the use and frequency of each strategy. Figure 2 illustrates how strategies can be used across all areas of learning to better assist ML students with English language skills. As stated in previous chapters, strategies used to assist ML students with language skills will also benefit all students in the classroom.

Figure 1
Illustration with Research Based Strategies Departmentalized


Figure 2
Illustration with Research-Based Strategies as the Support for Learning in All Classrooms


This study is essential to music education for two main reasons. First, it adds validity to why music education is vital in schools. Music teachers are teaching content that correlates with the content taught in other classrooms. Music teachers are also using strategies that are being utilized in other classrooms to help bridge academic gaps. However, this study gives insight into other fields of study's points of view and how we can help assist in the academic success of ML students.

The second reason this study is important to music education is to show the lack of training and support music educators have when working with ML students. Training needs to be provided in the college setting, where students begin to learn about music strategies to use in the real-world music classroom. Training and resources must also be provided to music educators on helpful and current strategies to work with ML students. Pieces of training or resources could range from current articles about strategies used in the music classroom or SIOP training, like some of the participants in this study were involved in.

## Recommendations

Most music educators begin their teaching experience during their college courses as undergraduate students. Education and music education courses have requirements students must meet to complete the degree program. Observations and clinicals play a vital role in the learning experience for future music educators. These opportunities give students a view of the music classroom before their internship and first teaching job. Colleges could use the clinical and observation components in degree programs to advocate for students to see how music educators use strategies that teach music content and assist ML students with English language skills. Because some college campuses may not be near school districts with ML students, a virtual
learning experience may be an option for the pre-service teachers to view a live teaching opportunity.

Research is regularly published by professionals who teach ML students in their classrooms. Current music educators should take the initiative to find read articles that may benefit the music classroom. I encourage music educators to be involved in local, state, and national music educator organizations. These organizations provide conferences and other opportunities that offer training by music professionals passionate about strategies for the music classroom. Also, advocating for SIOP or WIDA training to come into the school could benefit all teachers. Another recommendation would be to meet with the ESL teacher about students in the school or request that the ESL teacher in the school or district facilitate training, emphasizing research-based supports and strategies that could assist ML students with language skills in every classroom.

The last recommendation is networking with other teachers in the school that work with that ML student. This might look like an email strand or a five-minute meeting to discuss what strategies help ML students meet their language goals. The by-product of this collaboration is that teachers can share strategies that work for the ML student and the other students in the classroom. This collaboration could turn into a common planning time and nurture work relationships to promote a positive learning environment for all students.

## Conclusions

ML students continue to enroll in schools across America, with many having little to no English language skills and being fresh to the United States. ML students "know" more than they can express because of the language barrier. The well-being and growth of our students is our priority as music educators. The languages and cultures our students bring into the classroom are
an asset and resource to be used when make meaning of the world. The music classroom is the piece of the puzzle that can serve as a universal bridge between people with diverse backgrounds and academic success.

Before this study, I found a variety of research that documented teaching strategies in the mainstream classroom, the ESL classroom, and the music classroom to help ML students with English language skills. However, only some studies have investigated research-based strategies teachers utilize in all three classrooms simultaneously. Research also indicated that teachers felt overwhelmed with all that goes into teaching students and bridging academic gaps.

The conclusion I came to from this study is that strategies that support ML students should be taught in the college setting before pre-service teachers enter the job force. Strategies like modeling, peer learning, visuals, and others are not only seen in one specific field, but they can be used in music, ESL, and mainstream classrooms. Continued training and research are also pivotal in making teachers feel confident to teach ML students. Training like SIOP seemed helpful to two mainstream teachers in this study. Collaboration is also essential to share strategies that work with ML students to help them meet their language goals. In the ideal world, all teachers would have appropriate planning time to meet with one another. However, this is only feasible for some school districts. Collaboration may need to be through email or scheduling a meeting time to discuss the needs of the ML student.

The following quote is attributed to Dr. William G. Spady. Dr. Spady is often considered the pioneer of Outcome-Based Education. This quote represents my philosophy about education and my purpose in conducting this research study. "Every student can learn, just not on the same day or in the same way (Spady \& Marshall, 1991, p. 67).

## References

Abril, C.R. (2003). No hablo ingles: Breaking the language barrier in music instruction. Music Educators Journal, 89(5), 38-43. doi: 10.2307/3399918

Bhattacharya, K. (2017). Fundamentals of qualitative research: A practical guide. Routledge. Berken, J. A., Gracco, V. L., \& Klein, D. (2017). Early bilingualism, language attainment, and brain development. Neuropsychologia, 98, 220-227.doi: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neuropsychologia.2016.08.031

Board of Regents of the University of Wisconsin System. (2023). Mission and History. WIDA. Retrieved June 28, 2023, from https://wida.wisc.edu/about/mission-history

Byfield, L. (2019). Labeling English learners: Teachers' perceptions and implications. International Journal of Education and Literacy Studies, 7(4), 69-75. doi: http://dx.doi.org/10.7575/aiac.ijels.v.7n.4p. 69

Carney, R. N. (2020). Mozart effect. Salem Press Encyclopedia.
Clark, F.E. (1920). Music appreciation for little children, in the home, kindergarten, and primary school. Camden, New Jersey: Victor Talking Machine Company.

Claudson, W.D. (1969). The philosophy of Julia E. Crane and the origin of music teacher training. Journal of Research in Music Education. 17(4), 399-404.

Collins, A. (2014). Music education and the brain: What does it take to make a change? Applications of Research in Music Education, 32(2), 4-10. doi: 10.1177/8755123313502346

Concanna-Gibney, T. (2021). "Teacher, teacher, can't catch me!": Teaching vocabulary and grammar using nursery rhymes to children for whom English is an additional language. The Reading Teacher, 75(1), 41-50. doi: 10.1002/trtr. 2013

Conkling, S.W., \& Conkling, T.L. (2018). I'm the one who's here: An experienced music teacher, a low-income school, and arts participation as a reform strategy. Music Education Research, 20(4), 517-530. doi: 10.1080/14613808.2018.1445211

Creswell, J.W., \& Creswell, J.D. (2018). Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches ( $5^{\text {th }} \mathrm{ed}$.). SAGE Publications, Inc.

Diarrassouba, N. (2018). No English learner left behind: How can states and teacher preparation programs support content-area practitioners. English Language Teaching, 11(1), 179-188. http://doi.org/10.5539/elt.v11n1p179

EL Resource Guide 2022-2023. Alabama State Department of Education. (n.d.). Retrieved August 19, 2022, from https://www.alabamaachieves.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/09/ASMT_2022919_EL-Resource-Guide-2022-2023_V1.0.pdf

Facella, M.A., Rampino, K.M., \& Shea, E.K. (2005) Effective teaching strategies for English language learners. Bilingual Research Journal, 29(1), 209-221. doi:
10.1080/15235882.2005.10162832

Freeman, D.E., \& Freeman, Y.S., (2014). Essential linguistics: What teachers need to know to teach ESL, reading, spelling, grammar (2 $2^{\text {nd }} e d$. .). Heinemann.

Freeman, Y. S., Freeman, D. E., Soto, M., \& Ebe, A. (2016). ESL teaching: Principles for success. Heinemann, NH.

Gibson, C. (2016). Bridging English language learner achievement gaps through effective vocabulary development strategies. English Learner Teaching, 9(9), 134-138. doi:10.5539/elt.v9n9p134

Goldsmith, L.J. (2021). Using framework analysis in applied qualitative research. The Qualitative Report, 26(6), 2061-2076. doi: 10.46743/2160-3715/2021.5011

Gonzalez, P. F., Ochoa, C. A., Cabrera, P. A., Castillo, L. M., Quinonez, A. L., Solano, L. M., ... Arias, M. O. (2015). EFL teaching in the Amazon region of Ecuador: A focus on activities and resources for teaching listening and speaking skills. English Language Teaching, 8(8), 94-103. doi: http://dx.doi.org/10.5539/elt.v8n8p94

Gullifer, J. W., Chai, X. J., Whitford, V., Pivneva, I., Baum, S., Klein, D., \& Titone, D. (2018). Bilingual experience and resting-state brain connectivity: Impacts of L2 age of acquisition and social diversity of language use on control networks. Neuropsychologia, 117, 123-134. Doi: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neuropsychologia.2018.04.037

Harrison, J. \& Lankin, J. (2018). Mainstream teachers' implicit beliefs about English language learners: An implicit association test study of teacher beliefs. Journal of Language, Identity \& Education, 17(2), 85-102. doi: https://doi.org/10.1080/15348458.2017.1397520

Hoffman, A. R. (2012). Performing our world: Affirming cultural diversity through music education. Music Educators Journal, 98(4), 61-65. doi: https://doi.org/10.1177/0027432112443262

Hugo, A. J., \& Horn, C.A. (2013). Using music activities to enhance the listening skills and language skills of Grade 1, English first additional language learners. Per Linguam: A Journal of Language Learning $=$ Per Linguam: Tydskrif Vir Taalaanleer, 29(1), 63-74. doi: http://dx.doi.org/10.5785/29-1-542

Ingraham, N. (2014). Observations of real-time captioning in the elementary English language learner classroom. TESOL Journal, 5(2), 374-386. doi: 10.1002/tesj. 137

Jellison, J. A. (2015). Including everyone: Creating music classrooms where all children learn. New York, NY: Oxford University Press.

Jentschke, S. (2016). The relationship between music and language. In S. Hallman, I. Cross, \& M. Thaut (Eds.), The oxford handbook of music psychology (pp. 343-355). Oxford, United Kingdom: Oxford University Press.

Johansson, B. (2008). Language and music: What do they have in common and how do they differ? A Neuroscientific approach. European Review, 16(4), 413-427. doi: 10.1017/S1062798708000379

Lawson-Adams, J., \& Dickinson, D. K. (2019). Sound stories: Using nonverbal sound effects to support English word learning in first-grade music classrooms. Reading Research Quarterly, 55(3), 419-441. doi:10.1002/rrq. 280

Lee, S., Butler, M. B., \& Tippins, D. J. (2007). A case study of an early childhood teacher's perspective on working with English language learners. Multicultural Education, 15(1), 43-49.

Lems, K. (2018). New ideas for teaching English using songs and music. English Teaching Forum, 56(1), 14-21. Retrieved from https://search-ebscohost-com.spot.lib.auburn.edu/login.aspx?direct=true\&db=eric\&AN=EJ1181080\&site=edslive $\& s c o p e=$ site

Lightbown, P.M., \& Spada, N. (2013). How languages are learned (4 ${ }^{\text {th }} \mathrm{ed}$.). Oxford University Press.

Mashayekh, M., \& Hashemi, M. (2011). The impact/s of music on language learners' performance. Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences, 30, 2186-2190. doi:10.1016/j.sbspro.2011.10.424

McCormack, B. A., Klopper, C., Kitson, L., \& Westerveld, M. (2018). The potential for music to develop pronunciation in students with English as an Additional Language or Dialect (EAL/D). Australian Journal of Music Education, 52(1), 43.

Miranda, M. (2011). My name is Maria: Supporting English language learners in the kindergarten general music classroom. General Music Today, 24(2), 17-22. doi:10.1177/1048371309359612

Mobbs, A., \& Cuyul, M. (2018). Listen to the music: Using songs in listening and speaking classes. English Teaching Forum, 56(1), 22-29. Retrieved from https://search-ebscohost-com.spot.lib.auburn.edu/login.aspx?direct=true\&db=eric\&AN=EJ1181086\&site=edslive\&scope=site

Myles, J. (2015). Beyond Methodology: English Language Learners, K-12. Information Age Publishing.

National Center for English Language Acquisition (NCELA . (2017, October). English Learner Toolkit for State and Local Education Agencies (SEAs and LEAs). https://ncela.ed.gov/sites/default/files/legacy/files/english_learner_toolkit/OELA_2017_E LsToolkit_508C.pdf. Retrieved June 11, 2022, from https://ncela.ed.gov/sites/default/files/legacy/files/english_learner_toolkit/OELA_2017_E LsToolkit_508C.pdf

Nordmeyer, J., Boals, T., MacDonald, R., \& Westerlund, R. (2021). What does equity really mean for multilingual learners? Educational Leadership, 78(6), 60-65.

Paquette, K., \& Rieg, S. (2008). Using music to support the literacy development of young English language learners. Early Childhood Education Journal, 36(3), 227-232. Retrieved from https://doi-org.spot.lib.auburn.edu/10.1007/s10643-008-0277-9

Pérez Niño, D. F. (2010). The role of music in young learners' oral production in English (El papel de la música en la producción oral en inglés de niños y jóvenes). PROFILE: Issues in Teachers' Professional Development, 12(1), 141-157.

Rauscher, F.H., Shaw, G.L., \& Ky, K.N. (1993). Music and spatial task performance. Nature, 365(3447), 611.

Ravitch, S.M., \& Carl, N.M. (2016). Qualitative research: Bridging the conceptual, theoretical, and methodological. SAGE Publications, Inc.

Rodríguez-Bonces, M. (2017). A basis for the design of a curriculum incorporating music and drama in children's English language instruction. Profile: Issues in Teachers' Professional Development, 19(2), 203-223. doi: https://doi.org/10.15446/profile.v19n2.59583

Rosborough, A. (2014). Gesture, meaning-making, and embodiment: Second language learning in an elementary classroom. Journal of Pedagogy, 5(2) 227-250. doi:
https://doi.org/10.2478/jped-2014-0011
Sacks, O. (2008). Musicophilia: Tales of Music and the Brain, (Rev. ed.). New York, New York: Vintage Books.

Salmon, A. (2010). Using music to promote children's thinking and enhance their literacy development. Early Child Development and Care, 180(7), 937-945. https://doiorg.spot.lib.auburn.edu/10.1080/03004430802550755

Shen, C. (2009). Using English songs: An enjoyable and effective approach to ELT. English Language Teaching, 2(1), 88-94. Retrieved from https://eric.ed.gov/contentdelivery/servlet/ERICServlet?accno=EJ1082242

Shen, X., \& Byfield, L. (2018). Promoting English learner's willingness to communicate in content-are classrooms. The Clearing House, 91(6), 250-257. doi: 10.1080/00098655.2018.1541856

Shin, J. K. (2017). Get up and sing! Get up and move! Using songs and movement with young learners of English. English Teaching Forum, 55(2), 14-25. Retrieved from https://eric.ed.gov/contentdelivery/servlet/ERICServlet?accno=EJ1147117

Soltero, S. W. (2011). Schoolwide approaches to educating ells: Creating linguistically and culturally responsive $K-12$ schools. Heinemann.

Spady, W.G. and Marhsall, K. J. (1991). Beyond traditional outcome-based education. Educational Leadership 49(2), 67-72. https://www.ascd.org/el/articles/beyond-traditional-outcome-based-education

Tamimi Sa'd, S.H., \& Rajabi, F. (2016). Teaching and learning vocabulary: What English language learners perceive to be effective and ineffective strategies. CEPS Journal, 8, 139-163. http://www.fachportalpaedagogik.de/fis_bildung/suche/fis_set.html?FId=1142716

Tracy, S. J. (2020). Qualitative research methods: Collecting evidence, crafting analysis, communicating impact (2nd ed.). Wiley Blackwell.

Vidal, M. M., Lousada, M., \& Vigário, M. (2020). Music effects on phonological awareness development in 3-year-old children. Applied Psycholinguistics, 41(2), 299-318. doi:10.1017/s0142716419000535

## Appendix A:

## Internal Review Board Approval Email

From: IRB Administration irbadmin@auburn.edu
Sent: Friday, July 1, 2022 11:00 AM
To: Anne-Marie Patrick ahp0025@auburn.edu
Cc: Jane Kuehne [kuehnjm@auburn.edu](mailto:kuehnjm@auburn.edu); Paul Fitchett pgf0011@auburn.edu
Subject: Patrick Approval, Exempt Protocol \#22-273 EX 2206, ""Research based teaching strategies for teaching Multilingual Learners: A qualitative case study of mainstream, ESL, and general music teachers"

Use IRB Submission Page for protocol-related submissions and IRBadmin@auburn.edu for questions and information. The IRB only accepts forms posted at https://cws.auburn.edu/vpr/compliance/humansubjects/?Forms and submitted electronically.

Dear Ms. Patrick,
Your protocol titled "Research based teaching strategies for teaching Multilingual Learners: A qualitative case study of mainstream, ESL, and general music teachers" has been approved by the IRB as "Exempt" under federal regulation 45 CFR 46.101 (b)(2). Attached is a copy of your approved request.

Official notice:
This e-mail serves as official notice that your protocol has been approved. By accepting this approval, you also accept your responsibilities associated with this approval. Details of your responsibilities are attached. Please print and retain.

## Expiration:

Continuing review of this Exempt protocol is not required; however, all modification/revisions to the approved protocol must be reviewed and approved by the IRB.

When you have completed all research activities, have no plans to collect additional data and have destroyed all identifiable information as approved by the IRB, please notify this office via e-mail. A final report is no longer required for Exempt protocols.

PLEASE NOTE: If any unfunded, IRB-approved study should later receive funding, you must submit a MODIFICATION REQUEST for IRB review. In the request, identify the funding source/sponsor and AU OSP number. Also, revise IRB-stamped consent documents to include the Sponsor at the top of page 1 and the "Who will see study data?" section of consent documents." (see online template consent documents).

Best wishes for success with your research!

## IRB Admin

Office of Research Compliance
Auburn University
540 Devall Drive
Auburn, AL

## Appendix B:

## Interview Protocol for Participants

1. Tell me about where you are from.
a. Prompts: Your hometown, where you went to school, demographics of your school and community. Did you have any ML in your school or community you grew up?
2. Was anyone in your family in education? If so, what role did they play?
a. Were they a principal, teacher, board member, etc.? Growing up, how often were you around them in these roles? Describe that experience or experiences.
3. What is your degree(s)? Where did you receive your degree(s)?
a. Why were you drawn to this degree or degrees?
b. Did courses in your degree program help you with working with ML students? If so, explain further (i.e., coursework, observations, lessons on specific teaching strategies).
c. Did you have any students in your courses that you would classify as ML? If so, describe the interactions you had with ML students in your courses or school activities.
d. Were you in any extracurricular activities or organizations while in these degree programs? If so, describe the interactions you had with ML students in these extracurricular activities or organizations.
i. Prompts: conversations in class, group or partner projects, club or extracurricular activities
4. Tell me about your teaching career, starting with your first job.
a. Prompts: How many school districts have you worked for or how many schools within those districts? How many grade levels or different types of teaching positions have you held? Did any of your previous schools have ML students? If so, approximately how many?
b. What is your current teaching role?
5. Explain the training or professional development have you had in these roles focusing on JUST teaching strategies for your current teaching position. Describe the pieces of training themselves and how they prepare you for your current role as a teacher in your field.
a. Did any of these pieces of training give insight into working with ML students? If so, in what ways?
b. Did any of these pieces of training give specific information on teaching strategies for assisting ML students with English language skills?
6. In your current role, do you have ML students in your classroom? If so, approximately how many?
a. Do you teach these students in your classroom for instruction for the entire school day?
b. Tell me and describe your favorite teaching strategies you use when working with ML students to help them with their academics.
c. Tell me about how you decide which strategies are working and which are not.
7. Tell me about your collaboration or planning with other teachers in the school who teach a ML student in your classroom.
a. Do you have opportunities to meet with the music, art, P.E., library or other specials teachers to talk about teaching strategies? If so, describe those interactions.
i. When do they occur? For how long?
b. If the participant says no to the having opportunity to meet with the specials teachers:
i. In your opinion, would it be beneficial to work with these teachers to collaborate on teaching strategies that could help ML students? Why?
c. Do you have an ESL teacher in your school or district? Do you get to meet with the ESL teacher to talk about specific teaching strategies when working with ML students? If so, how often?
8. Is there anything you would recommend about working with ML students that could better help other teachers who work with these students?

## Appendix C:

## Interview Transcripts

## Candace

Anne-Marie Patrick: Hello, Candace, how are you?<br>Candace: I'm fine! How are you?

Anne-Marie Patrick: I'm doing great. Thank you so much for being willing to be a participant in this research study about research-based teaching strategies for teaching Multilingual Learners. As you saw in the consent letter. You did receive this consent letter in the first initial email, Correct?

Candace: I did

Anne-Marie Patrick: Okay good
Candace: And $I$ read it, and $I$ signed it.
Anne-Marie Patrick: Oh good. Thank you. Thank you so much. I do want to remind you of a couple of things that we're in that letter. Um, if you change your mind about participating at any point in this research study, you can withdraw at any time before during our after the study as long as your data is connected and identifiable to you, and your decision about whether or not to participate or to stop participating, will not jeopardize your future relations with Auburn University, the College of Education, the Department of Curriculum and Teaching, nor the Music Education program at Auburn University, and as always, if you do not feel comfortable with one of the questions in this interview or um, you don't feel comfortable with a question that pops into my mind, or anything you do not have to part, do not have to answer that question. Just let me know, and if you're ready

Candace: okay

Anne-Marie Patrick: we'll go ahead and get started.
Candace: Yes, ma'am, I'm ready.

Anne-Marie Patrick: So, so Candace, tell me a little bit about your background, where you where you are from, your hometown, what it was like growing up in your hometown, and when did you move to the United States?

Candace: Sure. Well, um! I was born in Guatemala and uh, my parents really valued education, so they wanted to give me the best educational opportunities that $I$ could get. So they tried to find a place where I could learn multiple languages. So they enrolled me in a school where I, when by the time $I$ graduated I would be uh proficient in German, in Spanish, and in English. So um! I was a pretty good student. So um in high
school I worked really really hard to keep up my grades, and I applied for a scholarship. Um, and I got the scholarship to go to Austria to attend college in Austria. Um, which is a German speaking place, so I was proficient enough to be able to attend college classes, and that was in German, so um my at my school, Um, I also learned English beginning in the fourth grade. So German was taught from $K$ through twelve, and all my subjects were in German. Um English started in the fourth grade, and went all the way through twelfth grade. And so um. My parents also valued education, and they wanted me, since $I$ was learning languages to get an experience and and go to the United States. Um. So my grandparents found a um, a group called Partners of the Americas, and I ended up um having the opportunity to come to Alabama as an exchange student when $I$ was a junior in high school, and I got to live with $\qquad$ . She was my host sister, and uh, we I was there for six weeks, and at the end of my experience in the United States someone from $\qquad$ , Alabama came to my home and spent six weeks with me, attending school with me and everything. So it was a great experience. Um! So I ended up meeting my husband um, that I've been married to for thirty-three years, and uh we met through $\qquad$ ... You know he he She introduced me to him, and So with the rest is history. Now we're married. We have two kids, and now we're grandparents. So it's been a blessing. So um! That was my high school um education. So um! When I went to college in Austria uh, I had already met my husband, and so um, I had to decide. Okay, Do I finish all my college there and then, if we're still uh together, come and marry him because he proposed to me a year after we started dating. I was really young, you know. And so I, after weighing out all the different options, and I broke my parents heart, and I I chose [husband] over Austria. So, and I ended up moving to the United States. But I already had, uh my freshman year completed, so I was trying to figure out what to do with with the course work that I had already taken. Uh, which was, I was gonna be an interpreter. I was gonna work with languages. Um! A translator, slash interpreter in three languages, and my hope I I wanted to be to work for the UN, or do something like that, because in Austria they have the UN headquarters. So I I had big plans for my life, you know. But at the time when I went to college there was not not even Internet available like It's not like it is today. So I I thought really hard. And I said, I don't think I can use my German over there. If I move to the United States, what am I going to do with it, you know. So I ended up moving here and chose uh education as a career, because I always love being a student and learning, and I thought, well in Alabama people Don't seem to know about foreign languages. Maybe I should become a foreign language teacher and try to impact them the way my teachers impacted me. And so, um! I went to $\qquad$ and majored in Spanish and German secondary education. Then um. I worked at a private school for five years because I couldn't find the Spanish or German teaching position anywhere in the area being such a small town. Um! And then, uh after working at the High School level for five years. Finally, I had the opportunity to go to the public schools, which was my goal all along. I wanted to work in a public school system because they have better benefits, and and you know a more of a diverse group of students. So I I wanted that, and um I ended up um working for for [previous school district], and I taught one year of high school math and one and a, and the position was math and Spanish. So I was doing that for a year. But then they started. Um! It was, I think. Um, I guess it was in nineteen ninety-eight, maybe two thousand. I don't know it was earlier at the end of the nineteen, nineteen nineties earlier,
two thousand. They started experiencing an influx of immigrant students uh in [previous school district location]. So they looked at me, and they had never met anybody like me over there in the county, you know. Uh, they said. Oh, we think you would be perfect for this, Would you, would you be willing to go back to school and get recertified, and um help us with all the all the immigrants students. We don't know what to do with them. So if you accept this position you will be like a second mom to them, because you're going to help them with the culture, with the education, you're going to help us. And I said, Okay. So I took the position. Uh, it was at at [previous school district], and they made me the EL specialist, I guess, without having my degree, just having my foreign language background, um and I was started going to school there, and I worked with them for three years. So when I graduated from um ___ I ended up getting an offer to come work for [current school district]. Once again, I was an itinerant teacher for about um we had nine schools in [current school district] at the time, and then, slowly, as our numbers increased, they started hiring other people, and then I ended up just being at [current school], and after many, many years. Um! I've been at [current school] for eleven years now full time, and then there's another teacher that helps me now uh I've had help, maybe for the past five years or so it used to be just me. And then there's two of us, and we divide up the great levels kind of equally, if possible, the numbers of students. She works with K and One and I work with second third, and fourth. We chart the accountability grades, and um she also helps you with newcomers as well. So that's `em in a nutshell. That's my life.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Thank you for sharing. I want to go back. I did not know that you uh took German courses when you were in elementary school. Can you tell me about that experience? Were you learning German and English at the same time?

Candace: Yes, so from $K$ through through third grade Um, I was learning all my subjects in German, and I also had Spanish Spanish instruction as well. It was bilingual, so it Our school was probably um sixty percent of the day was German courses, and the other forty percent was um Spanish courses, because we had to learn the curriculum or the yeah, the course of study from Austria, because my my teachers were Austrian, but we also were required by law to learn the standards from um Guatemala.

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm
Candace: So we had to learn to have our Spanish literatures and the grammar and the social studies, and all that that was uh in Spanish, but then my music class, my PE all that other stuff was in German, so

Anne-Marie Patrick: wow, that's...
Candace: and then English English started in the fourth grade. So I was learning, I was doing probably sixty percent of the time German uh thirty percent Spanish, and maybe ten percent English. That was the load each day.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Wow, that's I did not know that that's that's great. So I'm going to fast for a little bit. You talked about um your degrees
some. When you went back for your recertification so that you could be able to teach basically ESOL, Um, tell me about that process. Did you do that specifically at $\qquad$ , what were your courses like? And did they give you enough knowledge and practice using strategies with working with Multilingual Learners?

Candace: Well, you know um, I would say I was one of the pioneer EL teachers in the State, as far as our State had had never had offered EL programs or degrees. But I got very fortunate because there was a professor, $\qquad$ who I'm still in touch with, who made a huge impact in my life, you know, and she um was the person that um wrote a grant, and they got this Federal grant to to help a cohort of thirty teachers. We we were all together. Uh, from the State of Alabama. We were the first EL cohort at the $\qquad$ , and it was very, very challenging coursework. It was um very, I mean for me, I had always learned languages, but I had never um thought about myself being an English Learner, because I already, because I learned my languages abroad, so it's a completely different thing to be an English Learner in a different country. Um! Some of the social things, some of the uh, not just the ling well the linguistic things, too, because, like I learned proper English. So I came here, and I didn't really understand your English, or if I had to talk to older people. I really had a hard time. I was terrified of talking on the phone, you know. So, even though I was very proficient in my languages. I was not very good at the social language. So um, yeah. So uh, what was your question again? I think I may have gotten off the tangent.

Anne-Marie Patrick: No, that you're good. Um talking to specifically about the courses that you had to take.

Candace: Oh the coursework,
Anne-Marie Patrick: Yes
Candace: Yes, so you know some of the courses were like on language acquisition, which is different from language learning. Language acquisition is a natural process that a lot of students go through. You don't have to teach them the language. They just pick it up pretty much. Language learning is when you actually put forth effort to really learn about the grammar rules and all that stuff, and I think both have a a place and a role. Uh with younger children, it's mostly language acquisition. But of course we have to teach them the grammar, too, but it when you're in a foreign language uh class, you focus mostly on the grammar and the culture, so it's more the learning. But uh it has to happen together. You know you have to be immersed. You have to to have the opportunity to really produce that language because $I$ was really good at understanding language like the listening and the reading.

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm
Candace: I I could even write really well. I just couldn't talk, you know.
$\qquad$ , I I will say, uh since I have experience the the joy of learning multiple languages, I was able to to look at my role as a learner in a different way, and all the things that have to happen. So a student can master a language, and it's not easy like. Some people think it's just
going to take a year, and maybe yeah, it's going to take a year for them to be able to speak socially like the little kids don't even have an accent when they speak, you know. But the academic learning takes much longer, depending on your background knowledge. So my courses were were very good, because they also taught me um linguistics. So you know, I was able to learn the phonetic system of English, you know. Um. I also had courses on uh cross-cultural issues. So my Professor Um allowed all of us to to go to Venezuela to take two classes abroad one summer, and all the students there had didn't had never been abroad, or had never had the opportunity to be in a new language environment, and they were exposed to they had to do everything on their own. They had to find taxis to get to class and go shop and go eat, and they didn't know the language. So they got to experience that culture shock and the language shock that our students experience. And then we had to write a lot of um journaling uh what we would uh reflect on what we were experiencing, and of course, for me, I had already been there. I had already experienced what it's like to be in another country. So for me that experience wasn't really that shocking. But but it it helped me see what my peers were going through. And so it really was eye opening. And of course, as far as the strategies that we use. Of course we we have many, many courses since it was at the masters and the Eds level, where we learned uh strategies, how to make the language comprehensible, how to make uh the classes more engaging. Um, we've had classes on designing tests. You know how to do create the test. So um! I had to the opportunity to write um I guess a master's thesis when I went through my masters, and it was about writing how how students uh develop genre when they write, you know. So my program was amazing, like I couldn't have asked for a better program, so I feel that I learned a lot.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Well, let's transition into your career now. So you are, you're teaching with [current school district]. You said you've been there for eleven years, um and you've taught at other districts to which you talked about. Um, what would you say is was the best professional development or certification that you've been through while being at [current school district] that has helped you working with Multilingual Learners?

Candace: You know, Um, the role of an EL EL teacher has always been more than just teaching students. So um I remember, Um, there was a time when No Child Left Behind became a really big thing, and they started noticing that we had English Learners in the schools, and that we had to do something about it, because our students were not performing, and people were just ignoring them pretty much, you know. So um um I had the opportunity to uh my my supervisor at the time, it was $\qquad$ , you know,

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm
Candace: He um, we we had to come up with a plan, an improvement plan, and we had to uh tailor our own professional development plan that would help us and help the schools that we were working with, um be successful. So um, the State Department helped us tremendously. Um, I worked with WIDA, which is the organization that writes the WIDA standards. They they had a course where I learned how how to become a coach. And so we basically, gave like, I don't know, I think maybe it was like thirty hours of profess, professional development that year. Uh, we had to pick three
schools that were going to be our pilots. And after we went through all the WIDA training, the second year we decided to do SIOP as uh our strategies for teachers, because we felt that teachers didn't just want to learn the the I guess the theory or or the why they wanted to know what they can do now very practical. And so we we also knew um because we had a lot of uh principal input that if we went to the teachers and we said, we gotta do this um for the EL students, they will immediately reject the idea, just being a new thing, one more thing to do. They don't have time for this or whatever. So they approached it as, okay, first of all, we're we're just going to ask you like you don't have to, like you know we we selected key people that wanted to do it. That was the first thing, and then the second thing we did was um, we we told them that they were gonna be go back to their schools, and they would be the mentors for their peers, you know, and so they were willing to do that. But you know, I remember clearly when the this one teacher from the middle school um came to to the first time we met together with a terrible attitude, and like she was just not happy. So uh I remember $\qquad$ saying something like um, well, you know, if if you don't want to be here, you don't have to be here like, you know if if if you're not open to trying this, why are you here so? And then the other thing that I will never forget was the middle school teacher, the $\qquad$ uh principal the $\qquad$ principal, she said, Okay, what we can't do is tell them this is just good for EL students. We have to tell them this is gonna work with all our students. So once we sort of created our non-negotiables and things that we needed to do um, and everybody understood what the goal was, uh, it was so much easier, So So we worked really, really hard that second year. Uh, we trained teachers, and the teachers went back to school and trained their own peers, and that was the best, because the State came and did walk throughs, and the principals were doing walk throughs, and and everybody was like so excited to see all that engagement from the students. They were um using English like in the past. It used to be like quiet classrooms, and no one would say anything. And all of a sudden you will see that kids could talk if given the opportunity to opportunity to um. They may be a little shy, but you have to find ways to bring that out of them. And so that's how it started, and it was very, very effective. Uh, when we had our ACCESS test the next year, and after implementing it, our scores went up so high we were so excited, because usually speaking and writing tend to be the two lowest domains. But after we incorporated that the speaking went up and the reading went up. Everything went up because the kids were engaged, you know so

Anne-Marie Patrick: Well that leads into my next two questions. The first question that I have has to do with your students. What does your work week look like? Um, I've seen your schedule with my eyes, but can you describe what you do

Candace: yes
Anne-Marie Patrick: if I did not know what an ESL teacher was?
Candace: well, you know, different schools handle it in different ways. I have been blessed that they have sort of since I've been uh very knowledgeable about my field, you know, people sort of have let me do things in the way I see fit, you know. But basically I do have a a
schedule that I get to create. The the first thirty days I have to spend um doing a lot of assessing students, seeing where, uh, if they need services, having IELP meetings. So after those thirty days are up, and I'm ready to start my instruction, then Um, my task is to provide English English language development classes based on the WIDA standards. But also like, if I just did that, I don't think that would be enough, uh because kids are in their classes all day long, and they're some of them are doing well, and some of them are lost, you know. So if I have a a student that is a newcomer, and they're in their um math class, well, maybe they already know a lot of math in Spanish, but the only little barrier that they have is that they don't know what the teacher is saying. Well, so I I tried to also do a lot of push in, and sometimes I may be in the classroom with them, or $I$ may pull them a little bit uh just to a quiet place where I can go over the things that they've been learning in class as well. So I would say, fifty percent of my day is spent um working uh on pull out uh settings working on WIDA standards and the other half of the time might be uh collaborating with teachers talking to teachers to see where I need to plug myself in, because I would love to be in every classroom. But I just also I cannot, because I have too many teachers and to many grade levels. But like this year, Um, it seems to be working that I go um to the newcomer classes like math, and I support them in math every day, and then I I also sometimes go to the language arts, classes in third grade. Um, I I decided that third grade would be a good grade, because we have that literacy law to, and I do a lot of language arts with them, and just communicate like, what What What is the vocabulary that you're learning? Give me that letter that goes home, so I can reinforce that with my students. Um, so recently Um, I also got an opportunity to start teaching after school uh after uh, ___ saw that our data in third grade last year was not that good. He asked me, could I offer um some additional support for students. Um! And I said yes, because uh I think it's very useful, like the kids have loved it. They some of them didn't want to at the beginning, and then they changed their minds. And now they're They're in the class, their parents agreed, and it just seems like our whole school could could be in an after school, a class, and do and do well, I think it's just that we don't have enough spaces. The Title I after school is only fifteen students per grade level. Mine is only eleven students, but still um, you have don't want to keep it too large, because then it defeats the purpose. You you want to keep it small so they can and get be engaged and interact. And you can sort of um have individualized attention. Because if you have twenty students. Then you could do that, you know. The small group is key.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Um how many students, I know you said you teach second through fourth grade. How many students do you give services to per week?

Candace: Um! I tried to see them twice a week if they're levels two and up,

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm
Candace: And I try to see them every day if um if they're newcomers. So I think maybe I have about twenty uh second graders, and about the same number of third graders, and this year I may have about um ten or eleven fourth graders, but you know the numbers vary. Sometimes we lose some. We
gain some new ones. So I'd say $I$ have between fifty-five and sixty overall each week.

Anne-Marie Patrick: What was the process of getting some of those students in the after-school program? I know you said $\qquad$ contacted you. Um. Did a let did you have to hand pick those students based off of test scores? What did that process look like?

Candace: So the main thing they had to be third graders uh or fourth graders, because I mean as long as there's there's not such a huge gap, you know, in the age I can mix the grades because we're going to be working on similar standards. But the process was, Look at our data, see who hasn't grown. Um, who is not already enrolled in the $\qquad$ program or in the $\qquad$ program, Because I don't want to steal kids from those two programs, you know. And so basically I I got whoever was left that needed to attend, and they had to be English Learners, and I had to design my own classes. So what $I$ do is uh I started reading a chapter book with them. They're really loving it because they rarely get an opportunity to to read aloud like I call on them to read aloud, and then we we have a newcomer student there. So when we talk about the book. I tell them to tell me in Spanish what the book said, so that our newcomer can understand. So So they translate, and they're loving it because they're losing their Spanish, you know. And so this gives them, gives them an opportunity to use their Spanish, and uh, we've had some guest teachers like from $\qquad$ . She came the other day, and she taught 'em how to write a letter. So to a teacher, you know. So she she helped me give 'em instruction on how to write a good letter with all the proper uh date, and uh year or such and such, the body, the the goodbye, you know. So she she did a great job. So we did the graphic organizer step, and then they published it and signed it with in cursive. So it was a really good experience, and so we also help them with homework. So I I I still use, Imagine Learning as one of their software programs that they can use. If they don't have any homework, they're on that for a little bit, and then um! Of course, they have iReady, so I alternate one day they do iReady one day, they do Imagine Learning. So, depending on on what day of the week it is because we try to doing both the same day, and it wouldn't work. But basically, my my goal is to see them all in small group at least once during that little time we have in after school, and we do that that book study that we're doing together. So, with that, I think I want to try to do like a book report with them to teach them academically how to do a book report. They probably never done that before, but it's going to help them with their writing and their uh higher order thinking skills. Maybe they can do a little PowerPoint presentation or something, so we'll see.

Anne-Marie Patrick: I want to fast forward. So, we've talked about the students that you service each week. I want to talk about collaboration with other teachers. Do you get the opportunity per week to collaborate with other teachers in the school that work with these multilingual learners? If so, how many times a week, and for how long?

Candace: Yes, so it's kind of difficult working with the three grade levels to find that time that $I$ can be with them every day right. But it, even though I cannot be with them every day, I try to find at least once a week, when when $I$ talk to the second-grade team or a third, or one day a
week, when I'm with the third-grade team, or one day a week when I'm with the fourth-grade team. But um, you know it would be great if I could go attend every day, but $I$ just can't because of scheduling. You know, sometimes the kids that $I$ need to pull is at the time they have CPT. So uh the other teachers have CPT. So I I just can't do that every day. But um, I would say our conversations are a lot of times informal too like in the hallway. Um, or or they'll email me, and they'll say, Hey, can you help me with this? Or they'll text me? So I do try to collaborate um This year I have found that it's been more challenging to to do my CPT time with them. I I don't know what it is, but in the past, when we didn't have um, I don't know it just seems like this year, I I don't understand what's different with the schedule this year that $I$ can't do. So maybe it's the way $P E$ happens and specials happen that $I$ just can't do it. And of course, we change the schedule in the middle of the year. That also help didn't help. So uh it's been difficult.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Do you get to collab
Candace: I don't get to part, uh I don't get to collaborate with with with music or art, like, I saw that was one of your questions. Um PE like I said unless you email me and you ask me for something specific, or unless I'm doing a special school-wide project and you ask me, how can $I$ help you know Uh, normally That's the only time you and I collaborate, which we do a lot on, especially on overcoming that language barrier with the families right. With the art teacher, I don't think we we do it as often. Um, i'm not. She's EL certified, so I don't know if she has a different way she communicates with families, you know. But she doesn't ask me that much and um, but of course she does help me tremendously. If I do a school white project like Hispanic Heritage Month

Anne-Marie Patrick: yeah
Candace: She'll she'll try to incorporate that into her lessons, and let me display all the beautiful art. And uh, with the librarian, in the past I have collaborated like we've written grants together to get bilingual books for the library, and sometimes, if I need her like, there's a new student, and and they're not on the __ program or or there's a problem like $I$ can email her about that. But but there's really not a lot of everyday collaboration. Or you know that I a really valuable time that I spend uh collaborating is when we do those um DATA and PD Days. I get to listen to what what's happening in the whole school, and then I can plug myself in where I need to be plugged.

Anne-Marie Patrick: But you don't get to talk to any of those what we call specials or resource teachers about strategies to use with those Multilinguals?

Candace: No and you know just recently, we we started the my principal asked me could we do the SIOP

Anne-Marie Patrick: yes
Candace: model training all over again. So I asked for resources and $\qquad$ allowed me to get ten books you know it's not a lot

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm,
Candace: but there's on per grade level and um, I guess one to the reading coach, one to the math coach. There was not enough to give one to all of ya'll, either. But um, you know uh we're doing it once a month the first Monday of every month. So I would love if some of you guys could come, if if even if we have to make a special little time for you

Anne-Marie Patrick: yeah
Candace: when you are available because that day that's all we do. and I, uh collaborate that day, and and we don't have the we have little windows, but there's no one there, you know so.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Right. How, in your opinion, would it that would it be very beneficial or not beneficial to work with every teacher in the school to help these students? Would that be beneficial?

Candace: Yes. I think it would be very, very beneficial. Um, if you look at the lesson plans that $I$ shared with you the other day. I don't know if you were able to open it yet, but uh at the very top it tells you. Um. I just mark a little $X$. It's like a like a graphic organizer that says, What language of what classroom are we talking about?

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm
Candace: So the WIDA standards are the the social-instructional language, language of math, language of science, language of social studies, language of language-arts. But then, later on, uh as they developed or refined the WIDA standards even more. They said, Okay, there's some language of music,

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm
Candace: and there's a language of language of uh language of $P E$ and then there's a language of STEM, the so there's every content teacher, no matter what their area of expertise could benefit from knowing EL strategies. Because, like I said, engaging students in oral language, is not just for ELs, but if we don't do it for the ELs, it's very bad. But it, you know the other kids at least get to talk at home to their parents, or you know they they get to use English. But some of our kids don't so if we don't, let them talk during the day, they're never going to learn.

Anne-Marie Patrick: So, I just have two more questions, Candace. You've given me so much information. The first question that $I$ have is Um! What is your favorite go to teaching strategy with working with Multilingual Learners?

Candace: Um, you know, with Multilingual Learners, the main thing is to make content, comprehensible, right? So uh, I would say, one of my favorite things to do is when when they partner up with either another student, or if we call them Ipots [Interactive Peer-to-Peer Oral Techniques], Uh you know it doesn't matter, but you have to be strategic
about how you place that partner right. Uh when you were in my classroom, you may have seen that there was a student that he always got to be my partner right? Well, that was by design, even though it may not have looked like that, but that was a special needs student that needed a lot of extra support, so like. Sometimes I would say so. Tell me what you think, and he might give me one word answers. So then I will restate them in complete sentences, and ask him to repeat and tell him if I call on you, this is what you're gonna say right? So like to give them a lot of coaching on how to respond. Um, So anytime you engage in oral language. Uh, because you know that doing those partner activities, they, if there's a lot of reasons I do that, for example. Um! It provides a safe, safe environment for them to make mistakes, you know. So if you ask them a question, just the the popsicle stick method, which is really good it's equitable, you know, but you haven't given the students an opportunity to practice what they're going to say. Some of them are just not going to do very well, or freeze or get nervous, or they may not want to sound silly, you know. So if you give them a chance, and you go around and listen to them, they're gonna be more willing to speak up, you know. And you got to see a a speaking lesson. Did you see How? How uh the students were so eager to bet their score like when you left Um! We looked at our um data sheets from the from the time before, from the last time thy do the they did the ACCESS test, and we all looked at it, what their score was last year, and to compare how did you do today, and everybody had increased the level at least one one level, you know. So it was really good. So uh, basically just um using oral language in any in before you do any written or reading, or anything like that building background knowledge, showing them a picture. Because if you don't connect it to something that they already know, they're not going to be able to give you

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm
Candace: what what, what you want. So you got to see a lot of visuals. You got to see a lot of um building background activities that I did, and I I also like modeling, you know, just before you let them, let them do it by themselves. Do that 'I do. We do. You do' Um. Yeah. I think that that would sum it up. And then for for when I'm not there, I tell my kids, you know, you gotta be able to use a dictionary. Google translate. It's a great tool. If you have a device, you know. But uh, right now, because testing is quickly approaching. Uh, well, in the Spring, I guess March, I will transition to using the paper version of the Bilingual Dictionary, because they will not, they will not be able to use the online dictionary.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Well I just have one more question. You um. You've answered a lot of the ones that I that I had sent you without me even asking the question. Um, from a new teacher standpoint. If I were a new teacher walking in the school, no matter what grade level I was teaching or what um content I was teaching, what piece of advice would you give me Um with working with the Multilingual Learner students that will be in my classroom?

Candace: Well, I would say, do not be intimidated by the your lack of lang uh language skills. Like, if you don't know their language, it's going to be a little barrier, but don't be intimidated. You can meet them halfway and learn how to say a couple of words in their language that's gonna
break the ice very quickly. I I would say, don't be afraid to ask the families to help you, you know, because a lot of times we assume that they don't know, but they have so much knowledge that think that we wouldn't even think about. Some of our students know how to do, and so use your EL teacher. Use your uh when we have those IELP meetings to to share information with those families. How can they best support you? Because we cannot do it without those parents, you know, and a lot of our EL kids have good parent support. Um, I would say, Um, when you design your lessons, since you have to think about special Ed kids and all that, the EL differentiation is really not that different. Whatever you're going to do for them is going to work for all students. The only thing is to make sure that they understand. Like, so add some some support, whether it be visual support or interactive support or um. I guess, um graphic organizers. Uh my lesson plan has that

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm

Candace: very well specified. What kind of support am I giving? So think of so small supports, and uh, all, all your new textbooks, and all that they come with a wealth of resources. You just gotta know which ones to use and use them appropriately.

Candace: Can't hear you,
Anne-Marie Patrick: Because I mute myself. I try to mute myself when you are answering questions. Um,

Candace: That's fine,
Anne-Marie Patrick: Um i'm going to stop the recording now, and unless you have any other questions you would like to ask me, but I am done with my interview portion. So

Candace: Okay I did want to add something else
Anne-Marie Patrick: yes
Candace: that I meant to say earlier, when you ask me about my education.
Anne-Marie Patrick: yes
Candace: So you know, um my university professor, that I was still telling you about $\qquad$ . She also wanted us to become lifelong learners, and she encouraged all, all of us so much to be become a member of professional organizations, because they she knew that as the EL teacher in our district or in the the building, we would be isolated from the rest of the world, you know. Maybe people wouldn't invite us to be a part of things

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm
Candace: like, you know our school is different, like I am a part of things, you know, but in other places there may be the only person who knows about EL issues. So I have been a member of Um TESOL, which is the Teachers of English to Speaker of Other languages. They have a State
group. They have a an international group, and I've been a member of it for many, many years. Yeah, of course, I also did my National Board Certification

Anne-Marie Patrick: yes
Candace: on ENL English as a New Language is what they call it. So, like, I've been a lifelong learner learner ever since, and I think I probably all had already had it in me, and if you're a teacher you can't just stop learning. You have to make yourself keep learning

Anne-Marie Patrick: Absolutely, that's kind of where $I$ am, too, and you are finishing your doctorate through the $\qquad$ right now. Correct?

Candace: Yes,
Anne-Marie Patrick: so
Candace: yes, and you know this is like out of my element, like I'm pursuing the in a educational administration

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm
Candace: path right now. I don't know what will come up come of it. Like I don't have specific plans, but but $I$ knew that $I$ wanted to do something different, because I mean it's opened my eyes to so many new things that I didn't know. For example, um the advocacy piece, the politics um all the things that principals have to do

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm
Candace: so when when $I$ think of my EL students now I also have to think what, what, what is the principal going to think about this? How is it going to impact all the other students so, and and the teachers too. So I I get to to see what the people above us do, and their job is so hard, and it makes me appreciate them even more.

Anne-Marie Patrick: yes, Well Candace, I'm going to stop the recording really fast, and um I'm going over last minute um things with you. But before I do

Candace: okay
Anne-Marie Patrick: the process that will happen next is $I$ will transcribe this recording and um, $I$ will be a as transparent as $I$ can with you, and I will send you the transcription as well as any of of the coding that $I$ do based off of your lesson plans, observations that I've done um, and at any time, if you feel that you are not portrayed, or your answers were not portrayed accurately, please let me know that's why I want you to look over um what $I$ code. And because you are an amazing teacher, __, and that's for a reason you're an awesome mentor, and that's why I was so excited that you um willingly volunteered to participate in this study. Because you have a plethora of knowledge that um many music educators and
educators in general um would be remiss if they didn't get from you um from this study so um

Candace: well thank you, and $I$ just wanted to add one more thing about,
Anne-Marie Patrick: yes

Candace: you know, when I was growing up music I mean my music teachers changed my life too, and and I'm just so glad that [current school
district] offers that for students from the from the time they're in kindergarten all the way through twelfth grade and and like your job is so amazing like you also make the kids um believe in themselves. Have a safe place to go. If they don't like anything else. If they like music, you know they'll just wanna be at school

Anne-Marie Patrick: yeah

Candace: for that reason, you know. So

Anne-Marie Patrick: They are our students that's for sure. Um, the art teacher will tell you the same thing, they are our you can tell those students love. They learn from visuals, and they love. They learn from just repetitive skills, and that's what music and art is. It's a visual, and it's repetitive, and it's simple. And any kid or any person can get it. So

Candace: yes

Anne-Marie Patrick: let me stop. The recording really quick must be on, and i'll go for a couple more things.

## Bethany

Anne-Marie Patrick: Hi Bethany.
Bethany: Hi!
Anne-Marie Patrick: Thank you so much for being a part of this research study. I'm excited to um get to know you a little better, and um $\operatorname{sent}$ you the questions earlier in the week, so that you kind of would know it in advance. Um, But before we get started, again, I just want to thank you for being a part of this qualitative case study about research based teaching strategies for teaching Multilingual Learners. Throughout the interview today you will hear me say the term Multilingual Learner or English Learner, because that's kind of what we all have been trained with English Learner. The new vocabulary or the new wordage is going to be Multilingual Learners so it's what you'll see in more research documents. But it's okay if you say EL, ELL, or any combination of that. Um, did you You did get this consent document in the first

Bethany: Yes
Anne-Marie Patrick: email correct? Okay
Bethany: yes I did
Anne-Marie Patrick: I I just want to remind you of a couple of things about this study. Um at any time during the entire research study, whether that be through the observations or the interview. If you would like to withdraw um your data is will be connectable and identifiable until, if you withdraw, and then $I$ will delete all the information that ties to you, and at no point if you do withdraw, will it jeopardize your future relations with Auburn University, the College of Education, the Department of Curriculum and Teaching, nor the Music Education program at Auburn University. And at any time during this interview, if I ask you a question, and you just don't feel comfortable answering it, that is perfectly fine. Just let me know. Are you ready?

Bethany: Yes
Anne-Marie Patrick: Okay. Well, the first question that $I$ have for you today is, just tell me a little bit about you and where you're from. Tell me about your hometown. Um, the school you attended, the demographics in your community and your school.

Bethany: Okay, I attended um $\qquad$ . I went from sixth grade to uh my senior year there. Um! Before that, I went to uh $\qquad$ , and I went from kindergarten to fifth grade. Um! It was a big change from my first school to $\qquad$ . Um at $\qquad$ , it was a much lower income school, um, and a much smaller population. And then, when I came to $\qquad$ Um! It was a much higher income uh based school, and then also just a much larger school. Um! I uh graduated from there, and then I started at $\qquad$ um in two thousand and fifteen, which is where I got my degree $\overline{\text { from. }}$

Anne-Marie Patrick: When you were in high school and middle school, were you offered and did you take any classes that were bilingual courses like German, French, Spanish?

Bethany: Yes, so my eighth-grade year we took um Spanish one. Um that was also taught by my chorus teacher. So, we did a lot of singing and cooking um different cultures uh type foods. And then um when I went to high school, I took Spanish two Um with a a lady um who was Hispanic um, and that was where I learned most of my um Spanish from that I (inaudible words).

Anne-Marie Patrick: Were those required, or did you choose to take those courses?

Bethany: Um, I believe that they Spanish one was required. But I don't believe that you had to do both courses, and then they also offered German. But I did not get to take that one.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Oh, cool! So do you speak any other language besides English?

Bethany: Um, no, I would not say that I do. I can pick up a few words here and there, just from working with my students, and what $I$ learned in high school, but I I would not say I'm fluent by any means so.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Do you have any Multilingual Learners in your family?
Bethany: I don't
Anne-Marie Patrick: That's perfectly fine. Um, and did you notice in your school did you have any MLs um within your classes or in your schools, that you remember?

Bethany: Um, from what I remember I do remember one girl that was an ML um are and she spoke Spanish, but she was very fluent in English. Um, and her family was also so Um, I don't ever remember anyone else Um, speaking another language.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Let's talk about your family for just a moment, and why you became a teacher.

Bethany: okay
Anne-Marie Patrick: Is anybody in your family Um a teacher, an administrator, or on the board, worked in the school district anywhere?

Bethany: Um, no one has been a teacher in my family or um like on a board. My mom worked at the High School. She was a lunchroom lady, so she was in the school system, but she has never like taught

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm
Bethany: before.

Anne-Marie Patrick: So why did you want to become a teacher?
Bethany: Um! When I was in high school I got to be the color guard captain, and $I$ realized that $I$ really liked leadership roles. Um being in charge of a group of people. Um got getting to like coordinate practice um and different things like that. Um. And then $I$ also had a librarian in high school, $\qquad$ , and she was absolutely wonderful. Um, and she just basically took me under her wing. I got to be the librarian aid.

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm
Bethany: Um. I got to see how she planned her lessons for library. Um, and how the school system kind of worked

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm
Bethany: um. And then, as $I$ was graduating, $I$ would help out in after school um! And so that, really like, sparked my interest with working with elementary school kids.

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm
Bethany: Which is why I went into elementary education.

Anne-Marie Patrick: What age group? I know you said elementary. But What age group did you work with in after school?

Bethany: That was actually um third and fourth grade

Anne-Marie Patrick: okay

Bethany: students. So it was, it was an upper elementary.
Anne-Marie Patrick: And how were they picked for after school?

Bethany: Um! I believe it was based off of grades and then also, just like um the parents could sign them up for the after school program.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Awesome. Well, we're gonna fast forward a little bit. Um! What is your degree or degrees, you may have multiple, in. And where did you receive those?

Bethany: Um I received my bachelor's degree in elementary education from
$\qquad$ . And then I've gone back to start my masters uh in elementary
education, but I have not finished it, so.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Did you start at ___ in Elementary Ed., and or did you choose another degree and switch?

Bethany: I started in Elementary Ed, and then I got to my sophomore year and wanted to change um before I started, actually. You know, those are like the basic classes,

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm

Bethany: and I thought, you know, this is not for me. Um! And so I spoke with the lady at $\qquad$ , who was in the Education Department. And uh, she said, stick with it, you know. Just get into those education courses and see how you like it. Um! So I did. And then I ended up loving it, and so I did not swap. I stayed the whole four years.

Anne-Marie Patrick: In your degree program, did you, were you offered any courses that you would say really helped you with working with Multilingual Learners, like an ESOL course or did any of those course elementary courses Um, really strategically focus on working with MLs?

Bethany: I don't recall any courses that focused on that. Um, I do remember taking one course where it was they mainly talked about

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm

Bethany: Um, IEPs, special education, things like that, and she would bring in some like experience with the ML and the IELPs and things like that. But there, I don't remember a course that just focused solely on that. Um, I got to do a um, it was a trip with one of the professors, and that was my biggest connection to like different cultures. It wasn't with the Hispanic culture. Um they were it was like at a native American reservation, but that was my only experience with like people from different cultures in like a school setting.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Tell me a little bit about that trip. Do, at what point in your undergrad were you and how did that trip come about?

Bethany: Um. So I went my junior year and my senior year with the Professor, and he was um, he worked closely with the Indian Reservation in Oklahoma.

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm

Bethany: Um, he was native American, and he had several of his family members that um had grown up there. Um, and it was a school where the students were taken away from their families

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm
Bethany: Native American children for uh abuse
Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm
Bethany: um drugs, um, you know, like equivalent to our DHR taking children away.

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm
Bethany: Um, and so they lived on the reservation, and then they also went to school on the reservation. And so, while I was there we would tutor the kids. We stayed for a week, so I've gone twice um, and so we would tutor tutor the kids, play games with the kids. Um, and just kind of connect on
that level. Um. So that's kind of my biggest experience with people that are with a different culture.

Anne-Marie Patrick: What did you tutor them on? Was it reading and math? Or were there other subjects?

Bethany: No, it was mainly in reading.
Anne-Marie Patrick: Were you teaching them English? Or were they already fluent in English?

Bethany: Ugh, they were fluent in English but they also did speak um
Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm

Bethany: like a native language

Anne-Marie Patrick: Yeah, um let's talk about your courses at your undergrad and your Masters, if you would like to do that. Um, did any of the course content um focus on strategies or give you opportunities to do clinicals where you got experience working with different demographics, different cultures other than that trip um that really helped you with strategies working with students who don't speak English?

Bethany: Most of my clinicals in undergrad were at school systems that did not have a big population of that. So $I$ feel like $I$ definitely learned strategies that $I$ could tie in that would still help students, um but not like solely for EL students.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Um! Did you have any students that were in that program with you, um that were the same classification as you in school that you would consider as Multilingual Learners?

Bethany: At, in?
Anne-Marie Patrick: At ___ or in your undergrad or masters?
Bethany: I, not off the top of my head, no.
Anne-Marie Patrick: Okay. um, one more question about that. Um, did you do any other extracurricular activities that $\qquad$ besides the elementary education program?

Bethany: Um, as like clubs and
Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm
Bethany: things like that? Um, we did KDP, which was just like an honors um club and organize organization, Um, that's under elementary education. But other than that, no.

Anne-Marie Patrick: what was that? What did that entail?
Bethany: Um! So you have to qualify for, based off of um your GPA

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm

Bethany: and grades, and then you do like community service
Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm

Bethany: projects through that um. And so we did several things like $\qquad$ , which was uh like a prom for the special needs, Um, and we would volunteer different places.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Awesome. All right. Let's talk about your career now. Um,

Bethany: yeah
Anne-Marie Patrick: How many different school districts have you been in, and how many different schools, and for what amount of time at each school?

Bethany: Okay, um, I did my internship in [internship placement], so that was the sixth grade. Um, and $I$ was just there for a one semester, and then I started at [previous school], and I taught there for a year, and then um about three months of the next year. Um! And then now I have been at [current school] for this will be my third year to teach here.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Tell me about the difference in demographics of all three of those that you've noticed.

Bethany: Um, at [internship school], I feel like um there was a lot more parent involvement. Um there was not um as many like single parent homes. Um, the kids came to school more like well-dressed um different things like that. And then $I$ moved to [previous school] and Um, it was much smaller class sizes. Um! That was probably the school with the most parent involvement that I've been at. Um students were typically on or above grade level there. Um! Very little low income families. They did um a scholarship program where students could get funded to go there through um the Catholic Church. But we only had about less than ten in the whole school that qualified for that. And then at [current school] I would say that um, it's a lower income school. Um! Lots of single parent uh households. Um the

Anne-Marie Patrick: (Light went off in classroom) You can keep talking. I'm sorry

Bethany: It's okay. Um, we have a much larger EL population here. Um, and services for them, whereas at the other schools we had not. Um. So yeah.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Uh, that was what my next question was going to be was the difference in EL population. Did you have any um EL students or ML students at [internship school] or [previous school] when you were there?

Bethany: um at [internship school], I don't remember having any at all. At [previous school], I did have um there were three um that $I$ taught um. It
was one family, but they had a sixth, seventh and eighth grader um. They were only there for a year. Um! And then they moved. They actually transferred to [current school] or, not [current school], but [current school district]. Um, and then there were several um pre-k students and kindergarten students that were EL and then we did have a a Spanish teacher there,

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm

Bethany: because all of the students took Spanish from Pre-K up, which I think is great. Um! So they had experience with a different language. But there wasn't as many like EL students actually there.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Did they have a designated ESL teacher, or was the Spanish teacher kinda who they look to for help?

Bethany: That was basically who they look towards. And um like if they had to have um, our secretary was also um Hispanic. And so they were basically our translators with parents

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm
Bethany: that's who the parents would meet with um. They would sit in our our parent teacher conferences and things like that. So that was who the kids worked the closest with for EL services.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Did those students get pulled by her? Those teach those people or anybody else for language assistance?

Bethany: No
Anne-Marie Patrick: Okay, tell me about [current school] now. Um, because you said that there was a higher population of EL students. Do those most of those students receive EL services through the ESL teacher?

Bethany: Yes, all of mine in my classroom. Um! They do receive services with the EL teacher.

Anne-Marie Patrick: And
Bethany: and in my in my past classes all of them have received uh services except the students who are Um, non-floats. Um, who have passed um or qualified out of the program.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Okay,

Bethany: I guess is how you
Anne-Marie Patrick: Can you define non-floats again? I, that's the first time I've heard that term, so I really, I haven't heard that so

Bethany: I believe I'm saying that right. But students that um do not qualify, or they've tested out

Anne-Marie Patrick: of

Bethany: of the speaking, listening. Um, things like that.
Anne-Marie Patrick: Yeah, how many EL students do you have now?

Bethany: I have um four in my class.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Do they all receive services?
Bethany: One does not.
Anne-Marie Patrick: Okay, awesome. Um, let's talk about the teaching strategies that you use with those students. Um, I want to talk about professional development first.

Bethany: okay
Anne-Marie Patrick: In your teaching career as a whole, have you, or in your undergrad that I'll include that, too, because that's kind of Pre-PD in a way. Um. Have you had any training with working with Multilingual Learners? Like strategies, I've taken courses that I feel like, have helped me, any of that?

Bethany: Um. My biggest like PD that I have experienced is at [current school], and we do like the SIOP training each month, and so they've been teaching us different strategies to use um with those students. Um to incorporate in our classrooms.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Tell me a little bit more about that. So you meet once a month. Who do you meet with and for how long?

Bethany: Um we meet with our two EL teachers. Um, the both teachers one teaches $K$ through um, second or $K$ through, Yes, second, and then the other one is third and fourth grade. Um. We meet with them once a month. Um, and they teach us different strategies like uh we did last month the hot potato

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm

Bethany: where everyone has to write down their answer to like an exit ticket. You crumble it up, and they get to toss it around the room. But they all get to practice uh reading each Other's answers

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm

Bethany: um, and then we've talked a lot about like learning targets and incorporating that language target to um help our EL students.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Has your district always given training in the the three years that you've been at this district. Has that school district always giving you training for working with Multilingual Learners?

Bethany: um. I feel like this year is the heaviest training that we've gotten. Um where there's a set aside time where we're working with those EL teachers, and in the past it has not been like that.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Um. So let's talk about your transition from [previous school] to [current school] for just a moment. Prior to, the way I see it, and if I say it wrong, please tell me, the way I am perceiving it is when you came to [current school], that was really the first time you worked with EL students as a whole. Right?

Bethany: Yes
Anne-Marie Patrick: Okay, what was that adjustment for you? Um, first day at [current school], I have all these EL students in my room. Um, what was that adjustment like for you?

Bethany: Um, I feel like it was a big adjustment that $I$ had to learn, and I'm still learning um different things that you don't typically think about with having EL students in your classroom. Um, as far as the difficulty of having parent contact, Um having that, I feel like EL students um in my class I've noticed struggle with multi-step instructions. Um! And so, remembering to give um instructions one at a time for those students, because they're still processing the language Um. And then just tying in um different strategies to help them. That's been a big learning curve for me.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Other than the SIOP training, have you pursued any um PD on your own or certification on your own that would help you to be to work with these ML students?

Bethany: Um, no. Our reading curriculum this year does have um EL strategies at the in each section that we're teaching. So um sentence starters to use, or um adding in the vocabulary in the um videos that connect to it. So I've started using those a lot more, but no like PD on my own.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Um, hm. Um. How did you pick uh on some of the strategies working with EL students over the last three years?

Bethany: Um based off of other teacher recommendations in the building. Um, I have gone and talked to the EL teachers before. Um, we sat down this year and talked about um different strategies based off where they fall on their test scores um with the ACCESS train or ACCESS tests. Um, so you know, small group instruction

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm.
Bethany: Um, still using manipulatives, sentences starters um things like that. So just through like other teacher recommendations, and then just kind of seeing what worked in the past for my EL students and incorporating that again.

Anne-Marie Patrick: So, let's talk about your ELs. Um, that you have. You said three of them are pulled?

Bethany: yes
Anne-Marie Patrick: Okay, those three students, how many times a week are they pulled and for how long?

Bethany: They're typically pulled once a week. Um and I will
(intercom interruption)
Bethany: um! Well, you said how often they're pulled?
Anne-Marie Patrick: (nodded head)

Bethany: They're pulled once a week um typically for thirty minutes in the morning, and then thirty minutes in the afternoon.

Anne-Marie Patrick: okay
Bethany: and then also our EL teacher Um, depending on her schedule, will come in and sit with those students during the lesson. Say, we're on the carpet for math. She may come in once a week and sit with those students

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm

Bethany: and listen to their interactions with the other students, or how they're doing in in the whole group setting.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Alright. Well, let's kind of transition to collaboration within the school. Um, I know that you said that you get to work with the ESL teacher once a month. Do you get to work with her any other time during the day or the week?

Bethany: There's no like set aside time or schedule time, but I do feel like they are here Um if we were to have questions

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm

Bethany: um or concerns about those about our students.
Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm. Does, do they work with you on the IELP or ILEP, some school districts say it different, Um, for each individual student?

Bethany: Yes, we had a meeting at the beginning of the year where we went through each of our students um, and so we mapped out like strategies that that student needed, based off of their beginning of the year diagnostics, and then also based off their ACCESS scores so like where they fell in the speaking, listening Um portions.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Other than the ESL teacher that works with those students, do you get to plan with the other teachers that work with that student in the school, like the PE teacher, the music teacher, the art
teacher, the librarian, the STEM. Um, do you guys get to plan with them on how to help that student with their IELP?

Bethany: no
Anne-Marie Patrick: In your opinion, would it be beneficial if that collaboration were to exist?

Bethany: Yes, I do. I think um, especially in like our specials, they're hearing those children talk a lot more, whereas in reading and math they may not be comfortable to share out and talk um, but like in STEM, music, art those conversational skills Um, I think it'd be very beneficial and tying in the strategies where they're lacking in um reading or math.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Okay, let's talk about. I want to talk about the social for just a second. When you are watching your students, your EL students, um do you feel that they are stronger at their social English skills or their academic vocabulary English skills?

Bethany: It depends on which student I'm talking about.
Anne-Marie Patrick: okay
Bethany: Would you like me to go through each one?
Anne-Marie Patrick: Um, no, just if you'll just give me an example of
Bethany: okay
Anne-Marie Patrick: what you mean.
Bethany: Um, I have a student who is uh he's a repeater, so he's been retained. His academic language is very good, but speaking in conversation to his peers um, sometimes his grammar is out of order still, or he um may explain something, and it's not, it doesn't sound fluent.

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm

Bethany: Um. And then I have another student who she is lower
academically, but she has very good social skills. Um! And she does very well speaking um like with her peers.

Anne-Marie Patrick: That you saying that made me really think about that question. Um, I just have two more questions for you.

Bethany: okay
Anne-Marie Patrick: Um. The last one of the last questions is, is there anything that you would recommend about working with these Multilingual Learners that could better help other teachers with working with Multilingual Learners?

Bethany: Um, I definitely think um tying in strategies like the SIOP training I think it helps not only the EL students, but, like the whole
class, um like turn and talks are big thing that I've tried to start doing in my room just getting them comfortable, using those strategies which I think is, or talking about Um, the skills that we're learning, and I think that's um, the biggest advice that $I$ would give um just learning new strategies because they help all the students, not just the EL students.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Last question. And Um! It'll be a easy one. Um what advice would you give to either the first-year teacher or the brand new teacher to a school that has a lot of EL students, and they feel
overwhelmed. What advice would you give them?
Bethany: Um, the biggest thing I think I have learned this year, Um, that I would want somebody else to do for EL students is coming in and appreciating that culture that's in your room, and also getting to know their background. We did that um at the beginning of this year, and like seeing where those students are from, what um they speak at home, if they hear English at home, and that has really like opened a door for me and my students to see where they're coming from, what their experience is at home, because they may not be getting any help at home that they might. You know It's hard to close those gaps when they don't get anything else besides what's at school. So just getting to know your students. Um! If you have a big EL population, it's my big one.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Well, thank you so much Bethany. You have been great, and it's been fun getting to know you a little bit better.

Bethany: yeah
Anne-Marie Patrick: Um, I've got to see you a little bit in the school setting, but I have not gotten to speak with you as much. So um what the last thing I'll tell you is, I will take this recording, and type up all the information word for word. I will send you a copy of the transcription, and if you see something on the transcription that you feel it did not portray you correctly, please don't hesitate to let me know. Um, in fact, I would, I would love to to know um if something did not, if you want to elaborate a little bit more on something. Um, but I will keep in close contact with you in regards to the rest of this study, and try to be as transparent as possible.

Bethany: Okay
Anne-Marie Patrick: Alright.
Bethany: Thank you
Anne-Marie Patrick: Well, if you don't have any questions for me, that's all I have for you today.

Bethany: okay
Anne-Marie Patrick: Thank you so much Bethany.
Bethany: All right, thank you.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Bye
Bethany: bye

## Ashley

Anne-Marie Patrick: Hi, Ashley, Thank you so much.
Ashley: Hello
Anne-Marie Patrick: thank you for uh wanting to be in this study. So, as you know. Um, this study is a qualitative case study entitled research based teaching strategies for teaching multilingual learners. I'm a in the Phd program at Auburn University and this is the research phase of my um dissertation. So before we begin, I just wanted to make sure that you did receive a copy of this consent form. Um in the first initial, the first initial email sent by me about this study. Correct?

Ashley: I did, yes.

Anne-Marie Patrick: okay, good. And in there it talks about at any time. If If you want to back out or withdraw from this study, whether it be before, during or after the study begins, you may do so, and it will not harm your um or jeopardize your future relations with Auburn University, the College of Education, the Department of Curriculum and Teaching, nor the Music Education Um Department at Auburn University. Um. And if it's okay with you, we'll get started.

Ashley: Yeah, absolutely.
Anne-Marie Patrick: I did send you the interview questions, but I will read word for word, kinda

Ashley: ok
Anne-Marie Patrick: what $I$ sent you. but to get started. Um, it's just simple. Tell me about where you are from, like your hometown, where you went to school. The demographics of your school and your community.

Ashley: Um. So I am from $\qquad$ , Alabama. Um. That is where I graduated High School. We um are were predominantly white um high school. We are rural. I guess you would say. Um, we are city considered a city school, but we really are like a county school. Um! I then went to a small community college for my undergrad um for my basics, and then moved on to for my bachelors. Um finished $\qquad$ with my elementary education degree. Um! It was a very. It was really small. Um, very hands-on. The same girls that I had class with when I started $\qquad$ . I graduated with real small class. It was fabulous. Um. And then I came and did my masters at $\qquad$ , and received my masters all online at um, and then $I$ am still sitting with my masters and looking to get my EDs sometime in the future.

Anne-Marie Patrick: So I'll ask you a little bit about your degrees in just a minute. But $I$ want to go back to um your hometown a little bit. Um, you said you were from a rural, rural community, such a hard word to say.

Ashley: (not audible, giggle)

Anne-Marie Patrick: Um, Did you ever see people in your school or in your community that talked in with multiple languages like Spanish and English, or any other languages? Or is it mainly. Is it more dominant English?

Ashley: It's dominant English? So we did not. Now we had um. We had courses that we could take when we were in um high school. But we were dominant English, big time, and we didn't have any bilingual students um at all that $I$ graduated, or anything with um. Going back and visiting now I know it's very different um from when, even when $I$ have was in college, um going back and doing some obser.. observations and things. But when I was in school it was not.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Yeah, um, And you don't, do you have any multilingual learners in your family?

Ashley: No.

Anne-Marie Patrick: okay, Um. And you talked about having them in your school in your community. Um did you take any of the courses that were offered for, and to be bilingual when you were in high school?

Ashley: I did I took um I took Spanish in seventh grade and eighth grade
Anne-Marie Patrick: cool. Um! Was anyone in your family, in in education in general? Um. I'm kind of transitioning to um Education background was anyone in your family in education?

Ashley: Um not immediate. I have a cousin that teaches in ___ and _um in ___, so she teaches um Pre- K. there. Um! But other than that. It's just me.

Anne-Marie Patrick: So you had No, uh. Did you know anybody that was a principal or a teacher, or were you close with anybody? That was that kind of inspired you to be a teacher?

Ashley: Um! I had a fourth-grade teacher that um was very influential on my um teaching career. Uh, she actually still comes to see me to this day. Um! She came to every basketball, every sporting event that I had um just really involved. Um! And so she still checks on me now, so that that's something that $I$ strive to do in my um teaching careers really be involved with my students.

Anne-Marie Patrick: yeah, So I want to transition now. You talked about, a little bit, about your degrees, and the other the schools that you attended. At any of those schools, and in any of those degree programs post high school, did you take any courses that you feel helped you with working with multilingual learners?

Ashley: I didn't.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Yeah,
Ashley: I did not.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Were they offered?

Ashley: Um. The only things I remember being offered were more along the lines of special education. Um kind of differentiation for that. But as far as bilingual, not that I remembered, and and if they were they I don't, you know I don't remember being advertised. I guess you should say um. It was definitely not a requirement.

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm

Ashley: So, no, I don't remember them.
Anne-Marie Patrick: Okay. Now let's talk about your courses in general that you were required to take.

Ashley: um, hm

Anne-Marie Patrick: Did any of those courses um help you with teaching your future multilingual learners in the classroom setting?

Ashley: (laughter) No,
Anne-Marie Patrick: that's ok.

Ashley: No, Not at all.
Anne-Marie Patrick: No that's good.

Ashley: Like I really didn't. I I I honestly like. You know. You know that those students are out there, and I mean in your head, you know they are. But then, when you actually get in the real world, and you start teaching, and it's like, Oh, wow! Like this is not. It's totally different.

Anne-Marie Patrick: So none of your coursework, or observations that you may have done um lessons on teaching strategies. None of that was geared more toward EL students?

Ashley: No, it was all geared more towards like um level, academic level, so like your your academic, like your high, your low, your um special needs, your impairments, or things like that. It was never, you know. It's never like in like bilingual or anything like that. So, nuh um.

Anne-Marie Patrick: During your time in those courses, whether that be when you first started sch. college or um, once you got into the Ed programs. Did you have students that you would consider multilingual learners?

Ashley: like when $I$ was doing like observations and things

Anne-Marie Patrick: No uh, In your courses like within your degree program?

Ashley: Oh, yes, absolutely.

Anne-Marie Patrick: What were your interactions with them? Did you do group projects with them or?

Ashley: We Um so I at $\qquad$ , I went in class, and I had um I never had to do a group projects, but like sitting in class um, we would have big like discussions, or do discussion boards and stuff like that, and a lot of them. Were kind of lost. Were kind of uh you know how do I, and they almost said, like, uh

Anne-Marie Patrick: keep going. I'm sorry.
Amanda Martin: Yeah, Okay, No, you're fine. Um, you know. It was almost brought to the attention like, well what if, you almost play like the scenario. Well, what if the child is doesn't understand the language? But it's not in the textbook anywhere, so you know, you kinda play like, I guess devil's advocate as like. Well, what if this?

Anne-Marie Patrick: Um hm.

Ashley: Um so but it was never really addressed. I guess you would say.
Anne-Marie Patrick: did you have any particular conversations or interactions with those students that were in your courses? Um! That you felt may help you one day with working with EL students or ML?

Ashley: um
Anne-Marie Patrick: You'll hear me say EL that also is another term for multilingual learners

Ashley: Gotcha yes
Anne-Marie Patrick: ELs in some textbooks, multilingual learner is the new term, so I'm trying to gear my

Ashley: Yes, I was about to say
Ashley: I know it as EL, English Language Learner, ELL. Um, yes I mean just asking. I guess cultural, really cultural. Um questions and like background questions as far as like Um, really just dialogue

Anne-Marie Patrick: yeah
Ashley: and things like, Okay, If I was gonna ask this, what would this mean? Or if $I$ was gonna ask this because we would have to go out and do field experience, and then we would have to come back and have discussions,
Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm
Amanda Kiner: and we would go out to these classrooms and be like, Well, you know. Yeah, I saw all these differentiated, you know, levels of academics, but I'm also seeing X Y and Z, which would be like

Anne-Marie Patrick: right
Ashley: ELL students or multi, you know multilingual students, and what are we doing with them? So I I mean they They were helpful. But it was more interactions with those students than it was like the course work itself.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Yeah, okay, I'm going to transition a little bit. Um Staying on your college campus, whether that being your undergrad or what, did were you in any extracurricular Um did you have any extracurricular opportunities like, were you in a fraternity sorority

Ashley: no
Anne-Marie Patrick: uh did you play sports uh anything like that?

Ashley: $\qquad$ didn't have that. Um,

Anne-Marie Patrick: (giggle)
Ashley: We were real small. (giggle) Yeah, No, they didn't have any of that.

Anne-Marie Patrick: No, we're I'm just trying to establish um. Some rapport mainly to see um if you had any interactions, and before you became a teacher working with multilingual learners, whether that be from your hometown or um in your college courses in general, your classmates Anything like that? Um

Ashley: Not really.
Anne-Marie Patrick: Okay.
Ashley: at all.
Anne-Marie Patrick: We'll go into your um teaching career. So um tell me about um, your teaching career. Where did you start? How many school districts have you been in? How many schools? That stuff.

Ashley: So I um did my student teaching at [internship placement] here in
$\qquad$ . Um! And ended up filling a leave for a year or a half a year there in first grade, and then got hired here in [current school district], at [current school], um in kindergarten, and have been here now. This will be my eighth year, so I've been in Kindergarten for eight years,

Anne-Marie Patrick: so you've been in the same district for eight years,
Ashley: yes, eight years
Anne-Marie Patrick: That's Awesome. and you've taught you could. I would consider you taught in uh first grade, because that's you're student teaching. I mean your teaching But all of your eight years have been with kindergarten. Wow!

Ashley: Kindergarten
Anne-Marie Patrick: Wow! That's that's incredible. Um! Did any of your let's Let's compare your student teaching school to this school, and that you're at now. Did [internship placement] have any multilingual learners?

Ashley: Very few. Um. There were some, but there were, you know, few and far between. Not, nothing like coming to [current school district].

Anne-Marie Patrick: How would you say it's different working with those few versus what you see now?

Ashley: Um, there's so much support here, as suppose to, you're kind of by yourself there, but it's such a small population that you kind of take what you've picked up along the way. Um, and you kind of just have to do what you what you can there. Here, there's such a big population that you have the support to, You have someone helping you.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Um, hm

Ashley: There, you did not.
Anne-Marie Patrick: So what did you do with? Did you have any multilingual learners that you were doing, you were working with the in your student teaching?

Ashley: when $I$ was a doing my student teaching? No. But when $I$
transitioned over to my um own classroom to fill the leave

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm.

Ashley: I had one.
Anne-Marie Patrick: So what did you do like, Where did you find your resources and your strategies?

Ashley: Google (laughter)

Anne-Marie Patrick: Okay, okay
Ashley: Google. Yes, like I would Google translate a lot. Um. And then I would go to the kindergarten teachers that had had the student before me

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm
Ashley: um, and kind of bounce ideas off of them, and see what what helped, cause the child had been there for half the year

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm.
Ashley: in kindergarten.
Anne-Marie Patrick: Okay. Well, I'll move forward, um because it kind of does lead into what we're about to talk about. Describe the training and/
or professional development that you have participate participated in focusing just on teaching strategies in your current position working with multilingual learners.

Ashley: Um. We have done SIOP training um, I think, with $I$ don't think it's every year that I've been here, but it's been we we go over it. Um this year actually, we are sitting down and really diving into, I actually have the book over there. Um like the actual SIOP strategies and looking at um what those strategies are, and what they look like in the classroom.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Right? So do you meet with as a grade level or
Ashley: um

Anne-Marie Patrick: or who leads that?

Ashley: so we meet once a month with our um. We actually have a teacher here that teaches, that is our actual EL, ELL teacher. We have two actually, one is like our main um. __ is our main EL teacher, and then we have ___, and they both do um the the classes and they pull students, so they are teaming together to teach these SIOP like, uh, almost like workshops together. Um! But they do so much here at our school also, like they teach our parents. They do um English classes for our parents that we are welcome to do. They do Spanish classes for the teachers. There's a ton of stuff that they do here, that $I$ didn't even know that we had. But right now, as like a PD. We're getting it with them.

Anne-Marie Patrick: So did that just start this year, the SIOP training?
Ashley: Yes, we have always. We've always had like an overview of it, but it's kind of been like a blow through like. Here's what SIOP is. Here's some strategies you can use ya-da-ya-da-ya-da. This year it is like, let's dive into SIOP. Let's talk about what it means, what it is. Let's go through the strategies. Let's use them. Let's implement them. Um, it's a lot deeper. We're diving a lot deeper in, because we have such a big population.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Okay, So I'm going to ask a question prior to this year. What other supports and resources did you mainly have to find those on your own? Or did you meet with your ESL person on a regular basis, working with those multilingual students?

Ashley: Um! So they pull uh once or twice, maybe three times a week. But they are a huge resource to us, I mean, we we don't really have to pull anything on our own. We, I mean, if we wanted to, we could. But we take like notes and phone calls, and you know, if we have a test or a worksheet, or any kind of activity, we always take it to them. If there is something that one of our students isn't understanding, they either will come in and translate, or give some kind of strategy that would help like a picture or something that you know that that would help with them. So they are a huge resource for us.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Um, working with doing this SIOP training. I assume you guys started in August of this year. What have you taken away so far
that you feel more confident working with these multilingual learners in your classroom?

Ashley: Um, Some of the strategies like the there's a lot of uh like lang. Okay, Um. I always do a learning target. Um, and I have always done like a reading or an academic language or a academic learning target. Well, now with SIOP they want a language target,

Anne-Marie Patrick: uh, hm

Ashley: and, like. I've never thought about that. But if you put it in those like those kind of terms to where they have to use the language to figure out like also like, okay, you're going to have to speak this and use the language to do that. Then. Um! That was a big like that was a big eye opener for me like, Okay, we're gonna go over our math, and we're gonna go over our reading. We're gonna go over our writing. But we're asking you of our language and our speaking, and you know things like that which is so big for that population.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Yeah. So you would say you could tell a difference just from August to now?

Ashley: uh, huh

Anne-Marie Patrick: working with those students?
Ashley: yeah

Ashley: It helps break it down like you think, like. Sometimes it's like, okay, just show them a picture or just talk slower, and you know that's not really what it is. Yeah. So

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, let's talk about your current classroom. Do you have any multilingual learners in your classroom? If so, how many and how many receive services through the ESL program?

Ashley: I have six and three receive services?

Anne-Marie Patrick: okay

Ashley: three tested out, and three did not.
Anne-Marie Patrick: So what is your school day look like with them? Do these students stay? Let's talk about the all six of them. Um! The ones that don't receive services, do they stay in your classroom all day long?

Ashley: They do
Anne-Marie Patrick: and the ones that do receive services? How many times and for what do they get pulled?

Ashley: Um! They get pulled once uh three times a week for a good like forty-five, thirty to forty-five minutes Um! And they so then those three times that one day might be math and working on like um the language
concepts of like just speaking like counting any you know in English and um like numbers like the just really the language part of it, the vocabulary, the the verbiage, $I$ guess of it. And then with reading it's just basically everything like the same cause the because the correlation between our alphabet and their alphabet is so similar,

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm

Ashley: So um, they can really take their alphabet and our alphabet and put them side by side and teach them,

Anne-Marie Patrick: yeah
Ashley: because at the end of the day what they tell us is that they still want them to know their alphabet like they don't want it. We don't want to take that away from them, but they also have to learn ours too. So seeing, the correlation sometimes, they say, helps them to learn ours quicker if they have a good sound in their own. So that's what um I think. That's a big thing that they uh are working on right now.

Anne-Marie Patrick: That's That's a really good point. Actually. Um, we're almost finished. But i'm, i'm still just this SIOP training that you guys are doing is such a great thing, and I kind of want to ask something a little bit more in depth about that because you guys are getting training in that um out of everything you've learned. You kind of shared an example a few minutes ago. But what is your favorite teaching strategy or tool that you gained from that professional development. That's your favorite for working specifically with those ML students in your classroom?

Ashley: Oh, um! So there is a strategy that um they actually shared with us, and it's for um, we do uh our new reading program is heavy on vocabulary. Um. Well with your uh ESL learners, or ELL learners um background knowledge and vocabulary is very hard for them. So pictures and things like that are very um key to them, learning and putting that picture in their head, so something that they showed us was to they work with their table to put the picture and the definition together, and they like will buddy those up and just listening to, because they're listening to their peers talk about it. But they're also having to talk through it with their peers. And then they're seeing those things put together. We um, we did it in SIOP training with our um teachers, and then took it back to the classroom and tried it. And the kids loved it. And like you really, the teacher really isn't doing anything there. You're just kind of like letting them. It's student led. And so, um, you know you have to be real strategic with pairing those tables together,
Anne-Marie Patrick: yeah

Ashley: so that they can work together. But it was really neat to see, and I feel like there was some good learning that went on, because it's peer. I mean they're learning from their peers, and they don't learn better from anybody else than you know their kids that they are around.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Is there ah is any a different strategy that you like to use in your small group when you pull them to your small table for anything math, reading, or anything.

Ashley: Um, I as far as reading. Yeah, they're still learning their alphabet and knowing what it says, so I love the alphabet arc. We use it a lot. Um. And so we'll build words, because a lot of them know the sounds. But they can't. I We They can't pinpoint what that what letter is gonna make that sound. So that visualization of the alphabet arc, they can pull that letter down. Um, and it's usually that group that's still using the alphabet arc. I don't have any more that are still using that. But, um, it's still very beneficial to them.

Anne-Marie Patrick: All right, let's talk about collaboration and planning with other teachers in your school. Um, tell me about that collaboration planning. Um. How does that work? Do you do mainly grade level cooperative planning? Do you get to plan with the ESL teacher every once in a while? Do you get to pull in your specials: Art, music, pe um stem library does and have like a one time a month where you get to work with everybody? How does your planning work when talking about these multilingual students?

Ashley: I would like to say that we have the time to that, and $I$ would like to say that our uh PD Days um are geared towards that, because that would be fabulous. Um, CPT is usually dominated by um different kinds of things. Um. Sometimes we do meet with our ESL um teachers, and we can come in and kind of, but it's it's here and there. Um, Maybe once a year we get to sit down with our special teachers and um for like art music and stuff and try to do a correlation. It sounds great in theory, but nobody really ever wants to put it into practice. Um, if I'm being honest, and if somebody with greater minds would get together and actually think about putting that into practice. I think we could reach a lot more students. Um, but so many different people are going in so many different directions that we are missing the I guess the um bigger picture of what we're looking for. So um I think it's a great theory. I just don't think it's happening like it's supposed to.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Yeah,
Ashley: (giggle)
Anne-Marie Patrick: I think there's a lot which is part of the reason why Um, I'm excited about this this particular research study that you are not the only one who has that um mindset. So

Ashley: yes
Anne-Marie Patrick: well, Ashley, and you answered a lot of questions today, and I know I've taken a lot of your time,

Ashley: oh, you're fine.
Anne-Marie Patrick: but I've learned so much. Um! What the last question I have for you before I do my closing remarks is Um! Is there anything you would recommend about working with multilingual students that actually could better help teachers in the future or teachers that currently work with these students who are just I don't know what I'm doing?

Ashley: Don't count them out. Um, they know so much more then they can express to you. You just have to figure out how can they express it. Is it pictures? Is it drawings? Is it representing it through something like they have a way to tell you. They haven't figured that out yet.

Anne-Marie Patrick: uh, hm

Ashley: It's not going to be through speaking, and and that's been my biggest thing is like, go show me or bring it to me, or you know draw me a picture or something, because they have it. They have it. They just Haven't figured out how to express it. So don't count them out like stay with them because they'll figure out stick with it because they're going to figure out how to tell you.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Well, thank you so much, Ashley. I am going to um work a transcription of this interview up, and once I get it transcribed, and start the coding phase of putting categories together. I will be as transparent that I can

Ashley: yeah
Anne-Marie Patrick: with um what you've answered. And at any time, if you feel that you were not portrayed, or your answers weren't portrayed correctly, please let me know. Um. You have done you are an amazing teacher, and I'm so glad that you have decided to be a part of this study,

Ashley: yes, I am excited

Anne-Marie Patrick: and I will. I will stay in contact with you. But other than that, if you don't have any questions for me. Um! I have answer asked all the questions that $I$ have on my paper.

Ashley: Perfect No, that sounds great,
Anne-Marie Patrick: Alrighty. Well, thank you so much. Ashley.
Ashley: All right, Thank you.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Bye

Ashley: Bye

## Jamie

Anne-Marie Patrick: Hey, Jamie, how are you?

Jamie: Hi, Miss Patrick I'm good.
Anne-Marie Patrick: Good. Well, I'm so excited that you're You decided to be a participant in this research study. Um Again, I just want to remind you it's about research-based teaching strategies for teaching
Multilingual Learners. Throughout the interview, if you hear me say MLs or Multilingual Learner, that's the same term as EL students ELL um it's just the new terminology that you will see articles and research documents coming out with, but um don't feel obligated to say ML or Multilingual Learner. If you're used to saying EL or ELL feel free to say that it's the same term. And then did you receive this consent letter in the first original email that talked about the study?

Jamie: Yes, I did.
Anne-Marie Patrick: Okay. I just want to remind you that at any time during this interview, if you don't feel comfortable answering the question that is fine, just let me know. You are not obligated to answer any question you do not feel comfortable with. Also anytime in this research study, if you would want to withdraw um, you can, as long as your data is still identifiable. I will be changing your name and the school and the district to pseudonyms. But if you choose to withdraw um, it will not jeopardize your future relations with Auburn University, the College of Education, the Department of Curriculum and Teaching, nor the Music education program at Auburn. Are you ready to begin?

Jamie: I am

Anne-Marie Patrick: Awesome. I did send you the questions beforehand. Um, but I will be just reading straight through them. Um, first off, tell me a little bit about where you are from, where you went to school, the community you grew up in, and the demographics you were surrounded by.

Jamie: Okay, Um. I attended primary and middle school in __, Alabama, Um and I went to $\qquad$ Elementary and Middle School. Um. The demographics of that school were primarily um Caucasian and upper middle class. Um, Very few um EL ML learners at that school. Um! Then I moved to uh $\qquad$ , Alabama, which is south of $\qquad$ uh for ninth through twelfth grade. And uh, that school um was um a a better mix of demographics there, and um a very high, low mix of um backgrounds and um different ethnicities and um more more EL students in that environment. But still I would say, probably fewer than five percent school wide. So

Anne-Marie Patrick: Did you
Jamie: that's over overall though.
Anne-Marie Patrick: Did you take any uh courses in high school, middle school, or even in elementary school that taught you a different language?

Jamie: Yes, $I$ took French in elementary and then two years in high school
Anne-Marie Patrick: Were those requirements or was it electives?
Jamie: Uh the High school were electives, but they were on the advanced diploma which I was on, so they were required to receive an advanced diploma. Um, otherwise you would have received just a basic diploma. So

Anne-Marie Patrick: What is your primary language? And do you speak any other language?

Jamie: We speak English Um, in our family, and we do not speak any other languages um often. But we do speak a little of other language at times, just for, uh, immersion and fun. We we do travel um extensively. My husband speaks um German and Danish, and a little bit of Chinese, and um for his his work. So um

Anne-Marie Patrick: Is he more fluent? Is he fluent in all those languages, or does he just

Jamie: No

Anne-Marie Patrick: know enough to get by?
Jamie: Yeah, just enough to get by and to be um to show in other cultures that he is um respectful of their culture and trying to learn um, you know just that goes a long way when you're trying to build relationships with businesses and communities. So that's what um he's trying he tries to do before he travels. He he kind of dives in studies a little bit. So we kind of study with him. So

Anne-Marie Patrick: So you are a teacher. Um, was anyone in your family, growing up, in education, whether that be administration or a teacher, or just worked with the school district in any capacity?

Jamie: Um. Several teachers in my extended family um classroom teachers, um administrators, a superintendent. Um. My mom was a preschool teacher for twenty-nine years. Um, but she did not start that until I was in high school. So yeah, several I would say probably eight to ten educators in my family. So

Anne-Marie Patrick: So would you say that you grew up kind of in a school environment?

Jamie: Um, not going to a school frequently necessarily, but in that family gatherings the talk was always about school.

Anne-Marie Patrick: So what inspired you to become a teacher, specifically a music teacher?

Jamie: uh my high school band director, $\qquad$ um was who um influenced me, and I wouldn't say he encouraged me to be a band director. But um! His influence was so strong that $I$ just felt pulled in that direction by about tenth grade. Um! My family is either lawyers or educators, and so I had
planned to be um a an attorney. And then by tenth grade $I$ changed my mind and decided to be a music educator. And so um I I credit $\qquad$ with that, $I$ think. Um, but that's that is who influenced me. Um, in a positive way.

Anne-Marie Patrick: So let's talk about your degrees. Um, you graduated high school. Where did you go to college, and what degrees do you hold?

Jamie: Um? I went to the $\qquad$ for my undergrad, and I got a Bachelor of Science in Music Education. Um! And then I taught for several years, and they went back to college Um for my Masters in, I believe I started that in two thousand and four um, and received a Masters in Administration. At that time it was Education, Administration, $I$ know that degree has changed now. But um! And so um I completed that um many, many years ago, and then I have done um hours towards my EDs, but have not completed my EDs, and also hours towards a Masters in Music. Ed. But have not completed that either.

Anne-Marie Patrick: And where did you say that you got your Masters and your Ed or you started your Eds?

Jamie: Oh, $\qquad$
Anne-Marie Patrick: okay
Jamie: $\qquad$ were my masters, and Eds was where that I started.

Anne-Marie Patrick: okay, And what made you want to go in to your Masters in Administration?

Jamie: Um, truthfully, $\qquad$ at the time did not offer classes frequently enough in music education for me to complete it in a timely manner, and I was kind of on a path to get it done quickly. Um! And it would have taken me more than three years, and I could have done my Administration and two, and I had a couple of um uh people in my life at that time that were encouraging me to kind of go that route as well. So, um! I am glad I have it it looking back. Um! But $I$ do want to get my eighteen hours in Music Ed. as well. So uh, but I think that it was it was good timing, you know, for me to go ahead and do that.

Anne-Marie Patrick: So let's talk about the courses that you've taken in any of your degrees. Did any of those courses Um, do you feel helped you with working with multilingual learners? Whether that be through strategies taught in those courses, clinicals, lessons that you participated in, um or anything like that?

Jamie: Um! Several of my courses in undergrad did touch on um EL students and strategies, um, and even I had several placements, observations that gave me those opportunities. Um! But I would not say that I had one course that was specifically um geared towards that. There were, you know, maybe, a section of a book,

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm

Jamie: you know, a a chapter of a book that might have focused on that um. Um and then being Music Ed. too, that kind of put us in a different category. When we were in these elementary music classes, or elementary classes or secondary classes with other people Um, in those areas they were focused on something different than we were. So um uh no whole courses on the subject. Um, my prior experience, I guess, just having had some foreign language Um helped a little bit, just understanding that the difficulty level of learning a foreign language. Um! And then Um my husband and I have traveled abroad a good bit on our own, and so I do understand, you know, uh other cultures, and so I think that that has helped. But, uh, no specific classes.

Anne-Marie Patrick: In your um courses, did you have other classmates that you would consider as Multilingual Learners?

Jamie: None that $I$ can think of. No.
Anne-Marie Patrick: Um. Were you in any extracurricular activities in any of your undergrad, graduate, or Eds courses at the university?

Jamie: Um! What was the question, are their any?
Anne-Marie Patrick: Did were you in any extracurricular activities at in college or Post college?

Jamie: Um, yes, I mean marching band, a few student groups um uh a Music. Ed. um MEA, or what what was it used to be before NAfME. Um, Um. So yes, several of those groups. Yes.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Okay. Let's fast forward. You're in your teaching career. Um! How many different school districts have you been in, and how many different age groups have you taught?

Jamie: Um! I have been in three school systems, and I have taught well, and then one university um, and so I have taught um from Pre-K all the way through college level three hundred level courses.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Uh tell me a little bit about each of those schools, three, you've been in three school districts. Um did you stay at one school in each of those different di districts? Did you travel? Uh what was your occupation?

Jamie: So in my first school district, That was um [previous school district] Um near the $\qquad$ area. I was at one school. (door chime interruption) Sorry that is the chime alerter. Um! I was at one school, and I was an assistant band and choir director, and so I remained at that school all day and taught uh my entire school day there. Um and um! That was just um a very large band and choir program. Um, a lot of uh wide range demographics there. Several EL students um there um as well, and then um my next school system was actually [previous and current district]. Um. I was in previous and current district]and then left, and they came back uh. previous and current district] Um both times I've been here, I have been um at the middle school, and $\qquad$ , and the High School, and now [current school] um! And so, when I was a band director, I
traveled to three schools a day Um! And then now, I'm at [current school], and $I$ just um I'm at one location um and then um again in this school system several EL students throughout the day. Um in many different classes. Um! And then my other school system was [previous school district]. Um. And I was at [previous school] High School, and I traveled to the two elementary schools to teach beginner band there Um a few times a week. It was not a daily travel. Um! And then I was at the High school, which is seventh through twelfth grade, and um uh a um, I'm trying to think I don't know that I had um very many EL students during my time there. I was there for five years. Um! I would probably say less than five students the whole time. So.

Anne-Marie Patrick: That was going to be my next question was, tell me a little bit about the EL experience or Multilingual Learner experience that you had at each school. Um, approximately how many did you teach on a regular basis? And then what were the differences Um, throughout each school district? Did you have more in one place, less than one place, none at some of them? What was your experience?

Jamie: Um. So in [previous school district], even though the demographics of that school, were it it was an upper middle class school. Um, but there was a lot of um, you know it was a wide range of demographics because of just the $\qquad$ area being a Metropolis. Um and so we had, you know, several EL students Um, but the you know, I think, in this area, when we say EL, we think Spanish speaking students primarily. And there it was it was any and every language you can imagine. Um! And so we had students from all over the globe. We had a lot of Asian students Um, with several different dialects of Chinese and Mandarin-Chinese and Taiwanese, and you know, so there was um just a a variety of um languages spoken um. But most of them were already considered bilingual. Um, So either they had come to the States already bilingual, or maybe they had um just been kind of an immersion program, and uh, but most of them were very prepared and on track. Um, then um coming to this area, the primarily what I've seen um in my [current school district] students is um most of my students are uh Spanish speaking, and oh, in in [previous school district], I would say in my four years there, and I that was a huge school. There were twelve hundred students in sixth through eighth grade. Um, I would say probably ten a year at least Um, were um EL students um. And then here in [current school district], I would say I would have about anywhere from five to eight a year. Um, maybe maybe as high as ten. Um! And Spanish speaking is still the primary language that they're um coming from. But we do have students that um have I have a student right now whose home languages is Chinese, and um we have a little girl who's um family is from India. So I mean we do have other languages spoken here, but um still Spanish speaking, and I would say, you know, like ten or less a year here for sure, um for the school of eight hundred and forty to fifty. Um, and then at [previous school district], Um that was seventh through twelfth grade. Um. I cannot remember the school size, but a much smaller school um, you know, graduating class of fifty or so. Um, so kind of give you an idea of the school size. Um, but I would say probably five or less a year. Um! And most of those, if not all, would be Spanish speaking um students.

Anne-Marie Patrick: So let's talk about um professional development for just a moment. Um! What type of professional development have you been offered and taken just on teaching strategies in general?

Jamie: Um, there is a lot offered, um in this school system especially it seems like. Um we've done several different programs system wide Um, we've done Kagan Structures. We've um done the Bambrick Models. Um, I can't remember what came before those two. Um, but those are kind of primary ones, that we've been a a district wide focus in the last few years, um that we've really worked towards um. So just that that's what I can think of. I'm sure, I'm sure there are others.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Have you um participated in any professional development Um, outside of your district that focused on teaching strategies in the music classroom?

Jamie: Yes, um! I attend AME A um well, I did not go this past year, but I, prior to that, had attended yearly for many, many years. Um! So I try, I do try to go to AMEA as often as possible. Um and um I've also attended the either Fall or Spring workshop in ___ Um as part of um the AMEA Elementary Division um several times as well, and those are always really beneficial.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Did any of your training, whether it be for the music classroom or offered by your district, Um, give specific information on teaching strategies for Multilingual Learners?

Jamie: Not that $I$ can remember um in recent years. If if there has been, it would have been, you know, a very, you know, just short little informational piece. But it seems like several years ago there was something offered at AMEA. I don't I did not attend, but it seems like there was something that $I$ think it was geared towards Choral Education um like upper level Choral Education. And so um but that again that was not something for Elementary Ed, and it was, you know not something $I$ would have attended. So.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Um, so let's talk about your classroom. Um, you've kind of already given us some insight into how many Multilingual Learners you teach. How many? What does your weekly schedule look like? How many Multilingual Learners do you have in each class? When do you see each class? And for how long each week?

Jamie: Okay, Um. Most of my classes do not have um a ML student, but it seems like I don't know they just happen to be grouped together. But um all of them fall on Monday, Tuesday or Wednesday this year, and um $I$ see those classes for forty-five minutes, and um there's one to two at the most in a class. Um, and um, then, you know. But of course we do, you know, have another music teacher here, so she has the other half of those students as well. Um! And I think some of hers may spread into Thursday and Friday as well. Um, But so we most of mine this year are all on Monday, Tuesday, and Wednesday for forty five minutes,

Anne-Marie Patrick: And you teach them whole group style?

Jamie: Yes,

Anne-Marie Patrick: okay
Jamie: Whole group style. Um, and our third and fourth grade are, those students are working on recorders this year. Um, they've That's something that we're we've been allowed to go back to. So they've been really focused on whole group instruction with rote, learning an instrument, so that's been new for them as well. So.

Anne-Marie Patrick: So for your Multilingual Learner students, Um do you get to collaborate with the classroom teacher or other teachers in the school, like your ESL, you do have an ESL teacher correct?

Jamie: We do,
Anne-Marie Patrick: okay
Jamie: we do (inaudible)
Anne-Marie Patrick: Um do you get to collaborate with the other teachers that work with those students at any time during the week?

Jamie: There's not a designated time for us to collaborate, but $I$ do touch base with those teachers um as often as needed. Um, especially early in the school year when I find out who I have um on my roster. I make sure I either email or go by those classrooms to kind of talk to the teacher and see um what needs um they know about for that student. If there's anything I should be aware of before um the year gets going. Um, especially fourth graders that might participate in show choir. Um, since that is the after school activity, I want to be aware of how to communicate with parents and make sure that they get what they need, and anything translated. Um, make sure that's translated in time to be sent home with um all the other documents that go home with um the students.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Do you have a favorite teaching strategy that you use with your Multilingual Learners?

Jamie: Um! I would say proximity is very helpful. So then I have a chance I can read a lot on their face, and that tells me whether or not they are with us or um having a some struggles with what we're doing. Um! So if they're closer to me, I can make that assessment better. Um! And then I, if $I$ have another student in that class that is either a good helper or um. I even have another in in one class, specifically. She is bilingual. Her family speaks Spanish, but she has two classmates who are um new um to [current school], and they are both um new to, one of them is has just moved here from Columbia, and so he is very new in speaking English, so she sits on, or they sit on either side of her, or very close to her, and she is very helpful, and um now she doesn't speak Spanish to them, but she um, I think they just listen to her because they know she speaks Spanish, and so. And in the classroom, I think she does translate some academic terms to them as well, and so in music it helps to, they're kind of used to her being um the assistant there, and so she does a good job. But yeah, I always try to have them close to me and then have a helpful child um
nearby um, and just kind of um give them a little a little extra attention, and um make sure they seem like they're participating at the same um level that you would expect um for someone that might be uh new to to an English-speaking classroom. So.

Anne-Marie Patrick: well, I'm down to the final couple of questions, Jamie. Thank you so much again

Jamie: Sure
Anne-Marie Patrick: for participating. But, um, my last question is, is there any piece of advice or recommendation that you would like other teachers to know, whether those be first your teachers or teachers who have been in the classroom for a long time, who have never had Multilingual Learners, but all of a sudden they're given, or they have all these Multilingual Learners in the classroom, and they feel overwhelmed. Is there any piece of advice that you would give those teachers when with working with Multilingual Learners in their classroom setting?

Jamie: Yes, um! I would just say that these students are going to love music just like your English speaking students. Music is the, you know, the most universal language there is. And so you really have the upper hand out of all the academic settings, even out of something like physical ed or recess time. Because this is a language they already speak. They just may have heard it, Um, you know, through a different lens, so to speak, and so you have an opportunity to show them. See, you already know all of these things you just now are gonna learn it in English, too. We're gonna learn your terms in English and make those associations, and they will feel confident leaving your classroom that they know something now that they can go home and say, Hey, look what I can do, or look what we learned, or they'll sing a song in your class that they can sing they can sing something in English that they may not be able they may not understand, they may not translate well, but it is something that builds their confidence, and being able to speak English and um read and write as well. And so you're just you know those baby steps that you're making every week are are building them up. So just be positive. Uh be encouraging um. They're gonna love music. So don't don't treat them differently just you know. Know they're They're there to learn, just like everybody else, and do what you would normally do but help them um in any way that you can. Um. If that means visuals or just extra assistance, then you know, just make it happen for them and make sure that they're included in every way. So

Anne-Marie Patrick: Well, thank you again, Jamie. Um so, as soon as I get this recording transcribed, I will send you a copy that way you can look over it. And if you feel that you are not potray, your answers were not portrayed the way you um feel that they should be, you can give me feedback on that um, and then, if $I$ have any, follow up questions, I will contact you um, and set up another interview time, but I am so excited to see um the data that comes out of this. But $I$ will stay in touch, and if

Jamie: okay
Anne-Marie Patrick: you have any questions before then just please let me know.

Jamie: Great, thank you, Ms. Patrick

Anne-Marie Patrick: Thank you, Jamie. Have a good day,
Jamie: you, too. Thanks,

Anne-Marie Patrick: bye

Jamie: bye

## Emma

Anne-Marie Patrick: Recording on. Alright, Hello, Emma! How are you?
Emma: Oh, I'm doing good.
Anne-Marie Patrick: Good. Well, I know you're you're very busy, so I'll go ahead and get started with you. Um. Thank you so much for being a part of this uh qualitative case study that talks about research based teaching strategies for teaching multilingual learners. And I'm super excited that you um have decided to be a participant. Did you receive you did receive this um consent letter in the first email right that talked about

Emma: Yes, I did.
Anne-Marie Patrick: this study. Okay, and and I want to remind you at any time during this interview. If you want to stop, if you feel uncomfortable with the question, and you want to stop. Please tell me, or at any time um after the study has started, or during the study Um, if you would like to withdraw. That is perfectly fine, all data will be deleted, and it will not jeopardize your future relations with Auburn University, the College of Education, the Department of Curriculum and teaching nor the music education program at Auburn University. So if you don't have any questions, we'll go ahead and get started.

Emma: I think I'm good to go.
Anne-Marie Patrick: Okay well, the first question I have is, I just want to know about your background. Um, tell me about your hometown, where you were from, how you grew up, where you went to school, and the demographics that you kind of grew up in.

Emma: Okay. Um, I am from a very rural community in um $\qquad$ - Um, I actually grew up in um. Oh, a community called__, Alabama and um it's very small. There is literally a um post office and a couple of gas stations. That's about it. There is no school in $\qquad$ . So um! I actually went to high school um or elementary school and high school in ___ which is maybe less than ten miles away. Um! So it again. It's a very rural community. Um, there's not a lot of business or um job opportunities for people really so. Um. Usually the people who live there end up driving to other places or they're farmers chicken houses and things like that. Um! So it is a very rural community. Um! The population is not very diverse. Um, for the most part it was mostly white where I went to school at um. I think that we were one hundred percent white uh white population. There was not. There were no African American students. There may have been a few Hispanic students when um I went to school there, but I really can't remember having any in my class. Um, I don't really remember there being any Hispanic families that lived near me or around me. Um, I was mostly just immersed with my people that were like me looked like me. Talked like me. Were just like me. So

Anne-Marie Patrick: did you have any courses at your high school or middle school that offered another language?

Emma: uh Spanish was the only other, the only course that we could take, or the only language that we could take. I think it was required. So I did take two years of Spanish in high school.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Would you consider yourself a sing, a single language speaker or a

Emma: I am one hundred percent English speaker.

Anne-Marie Patrick: (giggle)
Emma: I can say Ola and uh Kinichiwa,
Anne-Marie Patrick: yeah
Emma: and like a few things, but that's about it.

Anne-Marie Patrick: yeah

Emma: That's as far as I go.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Um! Was anyone in your family involved in education like? Was anyone a teacher, an administrator, or a board member?

Emma: I actually had a lot of family members that were um involved in education. My mother was a high school math teacher. She was my math teacher as a um. Let's see my aunt taught at the elementary school. Um. I became a teacher. My brother became a teacher. My sister in law is a teacher. My aunt works at the Central Office for $\qquad$ as an accountant. So I had a lot of family involved with the education system. So

Anne-Marie Patrick: what inspired you to become a teacher?
Emma: My mother actually told me in my entire life to not teach that it was hard work. And um I started college, and I had no idea what I wanted to do. Um! So I started just taking my basic courses. Um! I joined the band, and really the only thing that $I$ could see myself doing was being a music teacher. So um against what my mother said I became a teacher.

Anne-Marie Patrick: So let's transition to college

Emma: : okay.

Anne-Marie Patrick: for just a second. And what is your degree? Or if you have multiple degrees, what are what are all those degrees? And where did you get those?

Emma: Um. I got both of my degrees from our local university, Um. $\qquad$ . I have a Bachelor's of Science in Education, and a Masters of Arts in Music Education and um. So those are the only two degrees that I have at this time.

Anne-Marie Patrick: So why why were you drawn? Is it. But did you know you wanted to be a music teacher once you got in college? Or did you kind of decide that before? Why were you drawn to that degree?

Emma: (breath) People ask me this sometimes, and I don't really know the answer. It it's I started taking music lessons when I was really young, and that was just kind of my thing like I took piano lessons. I joined the band. Um, I got involved with helping other bands like um. Um! I would go back and help with band camps and things like that while I was in college. So um! It's just kind of what I did at our It became my job when I before I was even out of high school. So it's just what $I$ kind of continue doing um

Anne-Marie Patrick: so while you are in college, whether it be in undergrad or grad school. Um, did you take any courses, whether it be in the educational or music department that you feel have kind of helped you with working with multilingual learners?

Emma: I would say in the music department, No. I don't really remember anything that would Um that really even talked about that at all. I mean we talked about being inclusive and including everyone, but not really any strategies that might help me be um teach students who spoke other languages. Um, in the Education Department, this has been a long time ago now. I'm going to say that Yes, there was at least one course where we talked about it, and then talked about other strategies. I feel like I kind of remember a course, and with my bachelors and masters both. Um! But it was not geared towards like my specific classroom, and what $I$ would be doing specifically with music students. It was more of a general education, general classroom type, um classes

Anne-Marie Patrick: Did. Do you remember? I know it's kind of hard to recall that is...I'm in, $I^{\prime} m$ in your same boat.

Emma: (inaudible words, giggle)
Anne-Marie Patrick: Do you recall any particular lessons or um clinicals, maybe, that were geared specifically toward working with multilingual learners?

Emma: I really don't remember
Anne-Marie Patrick: okay
Emma: any, any of that
Anne-Marie Patrick: No, that's okay. I still want to talk about your courses for just a second um in your courses do you remember any other student that you would consider that was in the course with you as a multilingual learner?

Emma: (pause) I can't remember working with anybody that $I$ would consider to be bilingual or know any other languages. I don't even remember working with any teachers uh that, I think would be bilingual or speak other languages. Um, (pause) I I I I never worked with anybody group

Anne-Marie Patrick: yeah
Emma: like that or anything like that,
Anne-Marie Patrick: yeah

Emma: so...(inaudible words)
Anne-Marie Patrick: Let's go towards the band a little bit. Um, Were you in the choral part, or the instrumental part at $\qquad$ ?

Emma: I was in the instrumental part. I was in the band, and then several other performing ensembles, like the percussion ensemble

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm

Emma: flute ensemble, and um there is, $I$ can't several different ensembles.

Anne-Marie Patrick: yeah
Emma: so

Anne-Marie Patrick: In any of those did you have students who um, you would consider bilingual multilingual?

Emma: We did have a few foreign exchange students.
Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm
Emma: Um! That were part of the band. Um! They were um. Well, there was one that was in the section that $I$ was in um, so I did spend a good bit of time around her. Um! And I don't even remember exactly where she was from. But she was a foreign exchange

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm

Emma: student. Um, so I do. She's had. She was pretty fluent in English.
Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm
Emma: Um! But as far as being around her, I would say, not really. Most everyone again was like me.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Yeah, with her if there was um confusion on like a language barrier. How did you communicate? How did you both communicate with each other to kind of get the point across? or

Emma: I mean usually just keep trying to find other words to use that she might be able to understand Anne-Marie Patrick: Yeah,

Emma: so, keep saying the same thing just in other words

Anne-Marie Patrick: Yeah, okay, let's fast forward. So you're in your teaching career now. Um, how many different school districts and schools have you taught at?

Emma: I've taught at in two different districts, at two different schools. One um was rural [previous school district] at [previous school], and then one is the [current school district] at [current school].

Anne-Marie Patrick: How many years were you at both?

Emma: I was at [previous school] for six years, and then this is my eighth year at [current school].

Anne-Marie Patrick: and in your time as a teacher, how many different grade levels have you taught?

Emma: I have done Pre-K through twelfth grade.
Anne-Marie Patrick: Wow! So you've done the whole
Emma: I've had the whole spectrum.

Anne-Marie Patrick: You've seen a lot, too then

Emma: I have

Anne-Marie Patrick: Um, did any of your previous schools, well [previous school], did it have any multilingual learners while you were there?

Emma: we would occasionally have a foreign exchange student. Um! That would some time. I know I remember we had one from Germany one time. Um! She may or may not have been in my classes. Um! And then, as far as our just general student body (pause) it was (pause) I do not recall students that $I$ had specifically with more that spoke multiple languages.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Um what about now? How many, what's the ratio of

Emma: Now Um, I I do have, and we have about four hundred and fifty students, and out of those students there are, I believe, eight to ten that are speak that speak a different language

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm

Emma: at home. So it's still a very small percentage
Anne-Marie Patrick: Okay. Alright, let's talk about your training working with these students. Describe the training, aka professional development Um, that you have participated in focusing on just teaching strategies for your current position. Have these training and professional development opportunities prepared for the current role you have as a teacher?

Emma: Most of the professional development that we do is not geared towards my classroom. Um! Most of it is um geared towards the general ed classroom. I'm sure that there are strategies that I could take from that and manipulate them to use in my room as well. But um as far as specific to me and what I'm doing, I've unless I go out and look for the training myself. Um, I don't really I'm not really offered that training. Um! I will say that our ELL teacher did send an email to $I$ think it was to the whole school that had a pad, a link to a padlet, and it did have strategies and some websites to things that you could look at. Um that for things that you could use with ELL students specifically. Um, I did glance at it, but I haven't looked at it thoroughly.

Anne-Marie Patrick: yeah so Um, with this professional development and training. Have you ever you said you kind of have to go outside the box and look for stuff yourself. Have you ever done that? Have you ever like taken summer courses, or what what not, just for your profession in general?

Emma: Um. It has been a very long time, but I have attended um some conferences

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm
Emma: geared towards music educators. Um! I've That was probably more, though when $I$ was in the high school world and a band director, $I$ have not done that very much as an elementary teacher.

Anne-Marie Patrick: So with all the professional development you've been offered by both school districts, I assume, and then um what you've done on the side, do you feel that any of them have helped you with working with multilingual learners?

Emma: That's usually not the focus of of it. It's they do talk about, you know, inclusiveness and finding ways to include students. Um, I do get a a fair bit of information about like working with um special education students, which $I$ feel like a lot of the strategies that you would use with special education students would tie into working with the multilingual students. But as far as Um, focusing specifically on students with Uh who speak different languages, I would say that it's not ever geared towards that specifically

Anne-Marie Patrick: So in your role as a music teacher. How many? What is your work week look like? How many times a week do you see each student, and for how long?

Emma: I see every student once a week for forty-five minutes
Anne-Marie Patrick: and how many? Um! Just a general. How many of those students would you say? I think you've already answered it. But how many of those did you say were um?

Emma: There's about eight to ten, and they are scattered throughout, of course, the grade levels and different classes. So um, I say eight to ten, because they're pretty transient. They come and go, and

Anne-Marie Patrick: yeah, and you have um. Do you have 'em in more of a whole group setting, an inclusive setting when they come to music for forty-five minutes?

Emma: (low yes)
Anne-Marie Patrick: Um! Do you ever pull, do you use small groups or anything in your room, and just pull and work with those kids?

Emma: Not often. Sometimes I do um allow other students to work with them and and help um in my room that we do we mostly do whole group instruction.

Anne-Marie Patrick: So with what you've experienced working with these kids. Have you picked up on specific strategies that you like to use when working with those multilingual learners?

Emma: Um, I have learned that they respond to um visual things. Um. So making sure that $I$ um repetition and visual things is probably the thing that I probably focus in on the most,

Anne-Marie Patrick: yeah
Emma: uh, making sure that they is something they can look at and see, and they're not just having to hear it, and then um making sure that $I$ repeat myself several times, so that they keep hearing those same words. Um, I think I already said this, but I've I've learned that whatever strategies that I'm using to help them a lot of times help the whole class as well. So it's not just I I I don't always have them in mind when I I try to do things. But um, I think that I do implement several strategies that will benefit them.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Alright, Well, last group of questions, and then um, I know you're busy, but $I$ want to talk about your planning and your collaboration with other people in your school. So, you talked about your ESL teacher sent out an email. Do you get any opportunities to meet with the other specials teachers like art and library, PE or the ESL teachers during a block planning period during the week? Do you get that at all?

Emma: Not usually. No, um.
Anne-Marie Patrick: Do you get to work with the um classroom teachers any during the week?

Emma: Not really. No, I'm kind of I'm on my own unless $I$ seek out a time to go meet with somebody. But my time is pretty limited, so um I'm your pretty much on my own.

Anne-Marie Patrick: And your interaction with your ESL teacher, um is it more of they will come to you if if there's a student that has a need or um, how does that work? What's your collaboration look like with her or him?

Emma: I I honestly never really see her. Um! She's never been in my room to help me specifically with students.

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm
Emma: Um! I the only reason that she sent me a list of who the students even were, is because $I$ had to email her and ask them.

Anne-Marie Patrick: um, hm
Emma: and ask her who they were. Um. So if I had not emailed her, I'm, I'm not sure that $I$ would even know who all the ELL students were.

Anne-Marie Patrick: yeah Um! And you just have one ESL teacher at your school, right? Okay!

Emma: One that we we split between another school.
Anne-Marie Patrick: Oh, Okay, so is she just there half a day or half a week?

Emma: I'm not even sure. That's why I said, I really don't see her very often.

Anne-Marie Patrick: yeah
Emma: She isn't always here. I don't even know what days that she is here. Those days could change. I know I see her um sometimes in the office. If we have a new student coming in, or something like that, that she needs to be there to translate for like. That's when I see her usually

Anne-Marie Patrick: Well, in your opinion, knowing that information. Do you see it beneficial if you could work with her a little bit more and the classroom teachers when working with these multilingual students? If so, how?

Emma: Sometimes I just feel lost, like I don't know what to do. Um, I don't, I don't speak your language. You don't speak my language. Um, I can do hand motions and and things like that, but it would be beneficial if I were in a situation like that. And um she could, if there was a way that things could be translated for them. Um! That would probably be very helpful, especially for the child.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Well, last quest question, Emma, you've done a great job and and thank you so much for your transparency. Um, my last question is, basically is there anything you would recommend about working with multilingual students that could better help other teachers, whether past or future, or present teachers with working with these students?

Emma: Um, I guess people just always want strategies. What can I do? What's gonna help? Another problem is that even I I have eight to ten students, but they speak different languages. They don't even speak the same language. So it's it needs to be strategies that you can use with any
student who speaks any language not just Spanish, or you know, a very prevalent one. Um, so um,

Anne-Marie Patrick: Would you, Um, is that something that you wish you had more of? Is

Emma: Yeah.

Anne-Marie Patrick: more training in...
Emma: And and I I think that strategies that were going to benefit a multilingual student is going to also benefit other students as well. So it's not something that $u m$, $I$ that those barriers are just kind of, they're hard to get through, you know,

Anne-Marie Patrick: right, yes

Emma: and so any way to get through those is, and as someone who is fluent in that language and understands um how that language works is going to be better at giving me strategies for $u m$, as in like I told you, I say a lot, and that's it. Um. So um coming up with strategies and and being able to like, explain it to me more

Anne-Marie Patrick: yeah
Emma: so I mean sending a a padlet is beneficial. Um, but still like it's sitting down and explaining this is what you should do.

Anne-Marie Patrick: yeah
Emma: This is how you could do it. This is um as the different strategy, you know, like just reading some some articles, is not really the most beneficial thing

Anne-Marie Patrick: yeah

Emma: for me. I don't think

Anne-Marie Patrick: Well, you're highly qualified in your field. Um! What would you say? What piece of advice would you give to the brand new music teacher or teacher in general that's come in her classroom. And she has a multilingual learner sitting out there? What advice would you give her in regards to that student?

Emma: Make a lot of eye contact. Make sure that you don't lose that student. Make sure that they are watching and listening, because I do feel like, even if they don't understand every word you're saying if they're watching you and they're listening, they're still gonna be able to pick up on a lot of um music, especially since um music is the universal language of um the world. So even if they don't understand your words, they should still be able to understand um the music and the the activities and the rhythms and the things that you're doing in the room. Um! And make sure that you you keep them engaged. Keep them involved. Don't exclude them, don't think. Oh, this child can't speak to me. Give them a chance. Um! And
they may not be able to explain something in the same way as another child, but give them a chance. Make sure they're involved to keep them involved the whole time.

Anne-Marie Patrick: Well, Emma, I have nothing else. You've done... You've given me so much information that $I$ can't wait to dive into and and and see um once I print it out. But, um, if you have no other questions for me. I'm just so grateful that you took the time with me today.

Emma: All right.
Anne-Marie Patrick: Well, $I$ will talk to you soon, and after this $I$ will get everything downloaded and typed up. Um, I will be in contact with you. I will send you a copy of the transcription of this recording so that way if if you see something that you feel that wasn't doesn't portray you correctly, you can let me know um. And like I said before, at any time. If you um want to withdraw you just, or you have questions, please feel free to ask them.

Emma: Okay, sounds good.
Anne-Marie Patrick: Thank you, Emma.
Emma: You're welcome

Anne-Marie Patrick: bye
Emma: bye

